Educational Reforms Worldwide

BCES Conference Books are indexed in EBSCO, ERIC, and DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals).

ISSN 1314-4693 (print)
ISSN 2534-8426 (online)
ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print)
ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Educational Reforms Worldwide

BCES Conference Books

Volume 18

EDITORS

Nikolay Popov, Editor-in-Chief
Charl Wolhuter, Editor of Part 1
Louw de Beer, Editor of Part 2
Gillian Hilton, Editor of Part 3
James Ogunleye, Editor of Part 4
Elizabeth Achinewhu-Nworgu, Editor of Part 5
Ewelina Niemczyk, Editor of Part 6

Bulgarian Comparative Education Society

This is a peer reviewed book. The relevant part editor and the editor-in-chief decide which papers are to be reviewed. Each paper is then reviewed by at least two reviewers. Members of the International Advisory Board are also involved in the peer review process. Finally, the seven-member Editorial Board takes decisions on papers to be included in the book.

Educational Reforms Worldwide
BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18
Popov, N., Wolhuter, C., de Beer, L., Hilton, G., Ogunleye, J., Achinewhu-Nworgu, E., Niemczyk, E.
Quire format 70x100/16, Printed quires 18
Book size B5–ISO (17x24 cm)
Paperback, 288 pages
Published by BCES
Printed by Investpress
Sofia, Bulgaria
May 2020

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Contents

Part 3: School Education: Policies, Innovations, Practices & Entrepreneurship

Part 4: Higher Education & Teacher Education and Training

Part 5: Law and Education

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Preface

A Picturesque Mosaic of Educational Reforms Worldwide

This volume contains selected papers submitted to the XVIII Annual International Conference of the Bulgarian Comparative Education Society (BCES) held virtually in June 2020. The XVIII BCES Conference theme is *Educational Reforms Worldwide*.

The Annual International Conference of the Bulgarian Comparative Education Society is a traditional, scholarly, interdisciplinary, high-level event. Education specialists from all over the world every year attend the Conference so as to present their studies. The Conference purposefully keeps to a small size, aiming at organizing the selection of papers of the best quality and providing excellent opportunities for presentations and discussions.

The goal of the XVIII BCES Conference is to provide a platform for in-depth discussions on educational reforms worldwide. The Conference attracts case, international, and comparative studies on reforms at all levels of the educational systems – preschool, primary, lower and upper secondary, postsecondary, and higher education; and in all educational streams – general, vocational, and special education. Authors present their theoretical, methodological or empirical studies on reforms of various educational aspects – aims, priorities, missions, governance, finance, structures, curricula, syllabi, textbooks, teaching and learning styles, innovations, examinations, graduation requirements, academic degrees, etc. Authors also focus on past and present educational reforms.

This year's book includes 38 papers written by 73 authors from 19 countries.

The volume starts with an introductory piece on school reforms in Bulgaria from the 9th to the 21st century written by the keynote speakers Nikolay Popov and Marina Pironkova. The authors present the cornerstones of school reforms during the First, Second, and Third Bulgarian State. They also discuss various cultural, social and political factors determining school development in Bulgaria.

Readers can learn from this introductory piece about the first Bulgarian schools in 'The Golden Age of Bulgarian Letters and Culture' (9th-10th century), the hard blow to the development of education under the Ottoman rule (15th-19th century), the main school reforms from the Liberation (1878) to the 1940s, the educational development during the Socialist period (1944-1989), the latest school reforms in Bulgaria since 1989, and the current school system in Bulgaria.

The other 37 papers are divided into 6 parts: 1) Comparative and International Education & History of Education; 2) International Organizations and Education; 3) School Education: Policies, Innovations, Practices & Entrepreneurship; 4) Higher Education & Teacher Education and Training; 5) Law and Education; 6) Research Education & Research Practice.

Part 1 has 3 papers, forming an introduction to the six parts of the book and to the theme of the conference, namely educational reforms worldwide.

In the first paper, Charl Wolhuter outlines the societal trends defining the 21st century, and the imperatives these trends are directing towards education. The term GERM (Global Education Reform Movement) which has gained currency to describe the education changes effected in response to these societal trends, is examined and found to be far too narrow as a descriptor of these changes. The author relates his vision for the momentous education innovations, presenting a mission for scholars in the field of Comparative and International Education to provide, from their expertise, guidance.

In the second paper, Nikolay Popov and Vera Spasnović in their twelve country comparative research give an outline of the comparative study of school counselling. The recommendation made by Wolhuter, is given a concrete example in the third paper, where Akvilė Naudžiūnienė zooms in on one country, Lithuania, and one subject, History, to show how, in one generation, the hierarchy of values taught in schools has changed.

These three interesting and rich papers are presented as a prelude for the rest of the papers in other parts, zooming in on particular aspects of the manifold education reforms taking place worldwide at the present time.

Part 2 contains 6 papers. This part focusses on a comparison of international education in order to enhance education worldwide. The aim is to identify best practices for better education systems around the world.

The first paper, by Louw de Beer, Deon Vos and Jeannine Myburgh, explores the homeschooling phenomena in the BRICS member states. Homeschooling is gaining popularity globally and the rationale is explored. The second contribution, by Deon Vos et al., explores the challenges for teaching as a career choice in South Africa and Seychelles. South Africa and Seychelle share the same challenge but there are unique contextual challenges. Gender issues and the role women play in the role of principals are discussed in the third publication written by Leentjie van Jaarsveld. In his paper, Obed Mfum-Mensah accentuates the policy borrowing ideals which influenced Sub-Saharan Africa policy formulation. The next academic, Vesselina Kachakova, reviews the potential of ICT in education worldwide in several international studies. Lastly, Michelle Otto highlights the relationship between education expenditure and Gross Domestic Product in the European Union and BRICS countries.

A variety of important international issues are explored in this part. All the contribution focusses are on international contentious issues regarding education systems. Homeschooling, teaching as a career choice, gender, education expenditure, education policy formulation, and ICT in education are researched. The aim is to identify best practice internationally to augment education in the local context.

Part 3 comprises an eclectic mix of 9 papers, dealing with the constant changes occurring across the world in education settings. Innovations in various countries are an ongoing theme throughout this part, with careful examinations of education structures, pedagogy changes, leadership styles, new approaches to learning, changes in attitudes of parents to schooling and comparisons of the applications of similar policies in different countries. The contributors come from a wide variety of

nations across the globe, but raise many concerns shared internationally by those whose lives are dedicated to improving learning and schools worldwide.

Some contributions use philosophy as a way to examine practice: Vimbi Mahlangu who uses Betrayal Trauma to discuss how toxic leaders can affect the trust and wellbeing of their employees, and Claudio-Rafael Vasquez-Martinez et al., exploring approaches to inclusion in Mexican schools. Historical and political contexts are used by Joana Quinta and Teresa Almeida Patatas to examine educational reforms in Angola, by Gillian Hilton who explores the move to home schooling in England, and by Amelia Molina, Adriana Estrada and José Luis Andrade who compare the human rights policies in Mexico and Costa Rica. Pedagogy change is also an ongoing theme in the contributions: Godsend Chimbi and Loyiso Jita, examining how teachers in Zimbabwe are coping with the use of more interactive learning styles, and Karen Biraimah and Brianna Kurtz, discussing approaches to the education of immigrants in south-eastern USA. In these wide-ranging examinations of education, social and emotional learning and relationship practices are explored by Maja Ljubetic, Toni Maglica and Željana Vukadin in early years education in Croatia, and by Mashraky Mustary in an investigation into teacher/student relationships in Bangladeshi schools.

In these contributions, the need for constant examination and reform of how we practice education globally is combined with an awareness that, though we need to adopt good practice from other countries, we also need to tailor those approaches to local needs.

Part 4 has 3 papers – all of which speak to this year's conference theme of 'educational reforms worldwide'. Magdalin Anim and Gertrude Shotte's research-based paper examines leadership roles of women in higher education in Cameroon. The context of the study is the University of Buea, a publicly-founded institution in the southwest region of Cameroon. The paper highlights, among others, key socio-cultural factors influencing representation of women in higher education positions in Cameroon, particularly the paucity of women's representation in leadership positions at the University of Buea even though a sizable proportion of students and academics were female. The paper relates its findings to global practice where the paucity of women's representations in leadership positions in higher education is still evident.

Marie Myers' literature-based paper evaluates a university's quality assurance and the extent to which cultures 'inherent' in the system hinders and facilitates the quality assurance process. The paper concludes with a proposition, among others, that a university quality assurance system takes cognisance of system culture and how it might 'infiltrate' the process of quality assurance and evaluation.

The third research-based paper, written by Gordana Stankovska, Ruvejda Braha and Svetlana Pandiloska Grncharovska, uses learning styles measurements, inventory and questionnaire – Grasha-Reichmann Student Learning Styles Scale, Grasha-Teaching Style Inventory and Children's Attributional Style Questionnaire – to examine the relationship between optimism-pessimism and teaching and learning styles among university medical students. Not surprisingly, the paper finds, among others, association between learning and teaching styles and optimism-pessimism among the participant-medical students.

Part 5 includes 8 papers exploring the policy, rules and regulations, and the laws guiding education systems across the world. Here authors share knowledge about their education systems and implementation of rules and regulations. In this part, the authors share good practice in education to learn about the flaws in education systems and areas for implementation based on ethical and legal obligations to observe as educators, at the same time ensuring discipline, equality, child protection and fairness in education systems.

The paper by Elizabeth Achinewhu-Nworgu centers on examining how students engage in their teaching and learning activities, a study of what obtains in a London based institution and implementation of learning activates that meet students' needs. André du Plessis examines the statutory curtailment of school autonomy and explains how the government is moving in the opposite direction with school governance and management autonomy being curtailed by the initial objectives in South Africa with reference to the draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill. The next paper, written by Queen Chioma Nworgu, provides a critical overview of the impact of social media on online small business owned and run by women entrepreneurs in London and highlights the impact of social media platforms on improving business performance.

Sharon Thabo Mampane contributes with two interesting papers. The first one is on understanding and application of the institutional performance management system within higher education departments in South Africa. In her second paper, she highlights gaps in higher education institution managers' understanding and application of IPMS for supporting and improving staff performance. Her paper centers on academic promotion practices within higher education institutions, enabling us in understanding the regulations and fairness and equity in academic appointment practices.

Tebogo Jillian Mampane's paper on the school inspector's role of supporting mathematics education in South African township schools helps us to understand that supporting mathematics educators provide opportunities that make a real and lasting difference in learners' lives. The paper by Chinuru Achinewhu equips us with the future of the African child in protecting the right to education of internally displaced children in the Nigerian education system. The paper explores the need to protect the legal right of education for children to secure their future rights.

The contribution by Uchechi Bel-Ann Ordu provides an analysis of the entrepreneurial leadership as one of the modern styles of leadership in organizations and its relevance to academic knowledge and the link to teaching and learning in the practical business world.

The papers in Part 5 contribute to a wide range of knowledge and understanding of the role of law, policy, rules and regulations in education systems around the world and the challenges faced by the educators to effectively implement what we preach in terms of consistency across nations.

Part 6 consists of 8 papers exploring current issues in education in various contexts. Individually and collectively, these papers offer the readers an opportunity to learn from presented examples and findings in order to enhance their understandings and practices. The collection of papers includes a range of topics explored by authors from international as well as context specific perspectives. The key notions addressed in the papers can be captured in the following: innovation,

teacher education, development of human capital, professional development, research culture, research capacity building, and research enterprise.

The first paper, written by Ewelina K. Niemczyk, brings attention to the international climate of academic research enterprise. Her research illustrates the pressures placed on higher education institutions worldwide to build research capacity and to increase research activity along with the expectations placed on researchers to show high level of research productivity and efficiency to prove their research excellence. The author calls for more attention to institutional policies and practices that influence researchers work and on a larger scale the effectiveness of academic research enterprise.

The next paper, written by Franciska Bothma, centers on a South African context. The paper brings attention to the tensions between academic autonomy and accountability as well as the research vs teaching activity. The main question the author poses in her qualitative work is whether accountability in teaching-related work, if clearly defined and practiced, can be used as mechanism towards professionalizing higher education teaching.

The elements of academic autonomy are furthered explored by Zoltán Rónay and Ewelina K. Niemczyk in their work about institutional and individual autonomy in relation to research productivity in Hungarian and South African higher education contexts. In their reflective paper, the authors narrow the focus to how institutional and individual researcher's autonomy converge with two specific research productivity activities, namely dependence on funding and selection of outlets for research outputs.

Based on personal experience, JP Rossouw focuses on developing a faculty research culture in South African higher education. The author explores how academic managers such as deans, research directors and research professors may transform a weak research culture by embracing the principles of the innovation value chain. According to JP Rossouw, passive or negative attitudes of faculty members towards research productivity can be converted to positive attitudes and thus enhance research productivity.

The subsequent two papers are grounded in European context, namely Serbia and Slovenia. Nataša Matović and Emina Hebib present a research study about teachers as researchers and thus as reflective practitioners capable of assessing their own work. Based on the research conducted in four Serbian primary schools and a sample of 129 teachers, the authors explore teachers' engagement in school research activities that contribute to their professional development.

Klara Skubic Ermenc explores approaches to inclusive education in Slovenia from a comparative angle. In the paper, she describes key elements of inclusive policy in Slovenia, which reflect a human rights-based understanding of inclusion focused on students with special needs. The author pays special attention to three stages of the development of the concept of inclusion and aims to provide a foundation for further comparative research on inclusion.

The last two papers are based in African context, more specifically South Africa and Zimbabwe. Oliver Tafadzwa Gore brings attention to capabilities that matter most for disadvantaged students in South African universities. According to the author, inequality and inequity of outcomes persist in higher education despite policies to redress the effects of apartheid, which segregated black people from

accessing good quality education. In this paper, Oliver Tafadzwa Gore identifies the most significant capabilities for student disadvantage and urges higher education institutions to address these capabilities to ensure equal access, participation and success for all students.

In the final paper, Dairai Darlington Dziwa and Louise Postma explore building creative capacities through art teacher education in Zimbabwe. The authors argue that higher education institutions do not equip learners with creative and critical skills necessary for innovation. As a result, higher education does not contribute to the development of the human capital in the Zimbabwean labour market, which currently lacks the capacities to critically and creatively address technological, economic and industrial challenges.

All papers in this volume, written by authors from around the globe, and presenting national education reform experiences, comparative education studies, different research approaches, theoretical and empirical analyses of various topical education problems, make this edition an interesting, authentic and picturesque mosaic of educational reforms worldwide.

The Editors

May 2020

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Introduction

Nikolay Popov & Marina Pironkova

School Reforms in Bulgaria from the 9th to the 21st Century

Abstract

The aim of this introductory piece is to present the main school reforms in Bulgaria from the 9th to the 21st century. The cornerstones of school reforms during the different periods of Bulgaria's history are analyzed. Various cultural, social and political factors determining the school development are also discussed. The authors present the creation of the Slavic alphabet during the First Bulgarian State and the appearance of the first Bulgarian schools in 'The Golden Age of Bulgarian Letters and Culture', the school development during the Second Bulgarian State, the hard blow to the development of education under the Ottoman rule, the school uprising during the Bulgarian National Revival, the main school reforms from the Liberation to the 1940s, the educational development during the Socialist period, and the latest school reforms in Bulgaria since 1989. Special attention is paid to the current school system in Bulgaria.

Keywords: Bulgaria, school reforms, history of Bulgarian education, current school reform in Bulgaria, Bulgarian school system

March ahead, o revived people,
to your future march ahead,
forge your destiny of glory,
by the might of letters led.

March to powerful knowledge,
let your duty be your guide!
Join the host of other peoples,
God is always by your side.

Go! For like the sun is knowledge.
On the soul it sheds its rays.
Go! A people shall not perish,
when true learning lights its days.

Stoyan Mihaylovski's poem *Cyril and Methodius*
Source: https://lyricstranslate.com

Introduction

In its 1340-year history, Bulgaria has gone through three Bulgarian states and two foreign rules: First Bulgarian State (681-1018); Byzantine rule (1018-1186); Second Bulgarian State (1186-1396); Ottoman rule (1396-1878); Third Bulgarian State (since 1878). Education has always played a very important role in the history of Bulgaria. Schools have always been considered very powerful institutions in the cultural, social, political and economic development of the Bulgarian nation.

First Bulgarian State (681-1018)

The founding date of the Bulgarian state is considered to be 681, the year when the Byzantine emperor Constantine IV Pogonates signed a peace treaty with the newly-founded union between Proto-Bulgarians and Slavs under the rule of khan Asparukh. Of the time period between the end of the 7th century and the second half of the 9th century when the First Bulgarian State adopted Christianity and the first schools were established the records contain very little information. Many stone inscriptions were found, some that marked important political events, the construction of palaces, or the death of the great boils, the Proto-Bulgarian military leaders. They are written in Greek or Latin, a few are written in Bulgarian with Greek characters. There are also Proto-Bulgarian symbols that have not been fully deciphered until today (Besheliev, 2008, pp. 257-260). We do not know anything about the existence of schools but there were literate people, Bulgarians and Greeks, who had linguistic and legal training, handled state correspondence, and produced literature.

The establishment of the first Bulgarian schools is linked to the adoption of Christianity (865) and the introduction of the Slavic alphabet, created by Cyril and Methodius in 855. This graphic system was called *glagolitsa* (the Glagolitic script) from *glagol*, which means *word* in Old Bulgarian (Ivanova-Mircheva & Davidov, 2001). The founders of the first Bulgarian schools are considered to be Cyril and Methodius' disciples who arrived in Prince Boris' court in 885. There are records of a court school in the capital Pliska (the capital was moved to Preslav in 893) that was managed by Naum and a second school in the southeastern parts of Bulgaria with centers Ohrid and Devol, managed by Kliment. They translated from Greek to Bulgarian basic Christian texts, the New and the Old Testament, the works of the Church Fathers, and liturgical texts. With these translations, thousands of new concepts came along and the Bulgarian literary language was formed (Matanov, 2014, p. 150). Prolific authors from this period are Kliment Ohridski, Konstantin Preslavski, Yoan Ekzarh, Chernorizets Hrabar. They translated and wrote religious texts, some works (*Hexaemeron*, *Heavens*) described the animals, man, and natural phenomena, i.e. scientific knowledge also circulated.

The First Bulgarian State saw the creation and distribution of works written in two alphabets. The first was *glagolitsa*, a graphic system created by Cyril, which combined elements with a geometric form, in particular, the circle and the triangle. In parallel to it, another system was in use, one that in form was closer to the Greek alphabet used in Byzantium, which was later on given the name of *kirilitsa* (the Cyrillic script). The following centuries the Cyrillic script gradually prevailed as it was easier to write and, in a time when books were copied by hand, proved more

convenient to use. Glagolitsa was used in the Bulgarian literary language until the 12th century (Cholova, 2013, p. 49) but in the western parts, which nowadays make a part of Croatia, it was in use until the 19th century.

The schools of the First Bulgarian State trained scribes, men of letters, translators, and priests. Most became clerics, which was common for this age, but there were also educated members of the aristocracy, the administration, and even craftsmen (Cholova, 2013, p. 112). In terms of structure and curriculum, the schools most likely shared similarities with Kliment Ohridski's school, which was described in the Hagiography of St. Kliment. In the school, there were two levels. The first one was a school for beginners. It enrolled children who had initial education – they learned to read, write, and learn by heart short teachings and Psalms. Separately, as a second level, there were schools for the advanced, which taught grammar and Greek, as well as how to interpret the Holy Books and theological texts, how to lead mass and other religious service. The schools were usually not big but the Hagiography of St. Kliment states that he had prepared 3500 students that became clergymen (Milev, 1966, p. 127). There is little record regarding the volume and location of the schools but outside of the aforementioned centers, excavations in other places (Karaach Teke, Varna region, Ravna, near Provadia) in the last couple of years indicated the existence of big literary and educational centers.

The Bulgarian rulers supported the education, where Tsar Simeon (893-927) himself, who completed his education at Byzantium's most renowned school – the Magnaura School (in Constantinople), took part in the compilation of three volumes of theological texts. The next Bulgarian monarch, Tsar Peter was also renowned for having received a good education. The boom in education and knowledge from the end of the 9th century to the beginning of the 11th century was named 'The Golden Age of Bulgarian Letters and Culture'.

Second Bulgarian State (1186-1396)

The Second Bulgarian State was established after a successful revolt in 1186, led by the brothers Asen and Peter of Tarnovo. During the first decades of the 13th century Bulgaria became a leading European country with rich cultural life. Scriptoria were created in the monasteries around Tarnovo, and young men underwent training for spiritual or secular life. Important centers for book copying and pupil training were the Athos monasteries (Mount Athos), the Rila monastery, the Bachkovo monastery, as well as the cities, cleric centers like Veliki Preslav, Vidin, Plovdiv, Skopje, Sofia, Ohrid, etc. (Gyuselev, 1985, p. 97). More manuscripts from this period have been preserved and give us a clear picture of the education of the High Middle Ages in Bulgaria.

Schools were established, as parts of the churches and monasteries, and they received children (6 and 7-year-olds) who learned how to read and write. They used wax-covered boards, where the alphabet could be written. First they studied the letters, then the syllables, and finally the words. They studied prayers by heart, texts from the Psalter, other basic liturgical books, and some antique volumes with maxims, translated in medieval Bulgaria. Attention was paid to Calligraphy. The training took 3-4 years. Women also received an education, although less frequently so (Cholova, 2013, p. 134). There were schools in the monasteries and the city centers where the pupils received a more comprehensive education. It included

reading and interpretation of biblical and theological texts, as well as Greek, Cosmography, Chronology, Arithmetic, etc.

At the end of the Second Bulgarian State, Evtimiy Tarnovski, the last patriarch, initiated the introduction of new common spelling rules and together with his pupils and followers implemented a language spelling reform. Common spelling rules, compulsory for all scribes and men of letters, were introduced and uneducated and untrained personnel were barred from dealing with letters (Gyuselev, 1985, pp. 96-97). After the fall of the Bulgarian State under Ottoman rule, the men of letters migrated to the neighboring countries and spread these ideas in Russia, Wallachia, Moldavia, and Serbia. The first Bulgarian pedagogical work was also from this period, *Explained Exposition of Letters …*, known as *Tale of Letters*, by Konstantin Kostenechki, which described the education method (Kostenechki, 1993). He proposed a simplification of the training methods in reading through the use of elements of the phonological method, an idea, which was put in practice in schools some centuries later.

Ottoman rule (1396-1878)

Ottoman period

The fall of the Second Bulgarian State (the Tarnovo Kingdom in 1393, and the Vidin Kingdom in 1396) under the Ottoman rule dealt a hard blow to the development of education. Under foreign governance and dominant religion, the Bulgarian religious centers started deteriorating. The Bulgarian cities were in decline and in the course of several centuries, the monasteries came to be the only spiritual environments and places of worship. They were the centers that maintained the education and literacy of the population. Monastic schools were created as part of the monasteries and they trained their pupils for novices, taught literacy, and provided them with religious education. In some of the monasteries literary schools were developed. They established a tradition in developing and decorating handwritten books – liturgical books and volumes with diverse content, which was predominantly of a religious character (Gechev, 1967). The most renowned among them were the Athos monasteries, the Rila monastery, the Bachkovo monastery, the Etropole monastery and the monasteries and churches around Sofia.

The education of the Bulgarians during this period included the schools of the Bulgarians-Catholics in the 17th century. Orthodox faith played a unifying role for the Bulgarians, which limited the proselyting efforts of the Catholic Church. Some limited communities, however, adopted Catholicism – some villages in the Svishtov area and Plovdiv area, around Chiprovets and Ohrid. The Bulgarian Catholic population there gained access to literature and education in Europe – most commonly in Italy (Loreto, Rome, and Florence), less frequently in Austria, Germany, and Poland. Schools that enrolled and educated all children, who then studied the catechism were founded in Chiprovets and Kopilovets (Dimitrov, 1987, pp. 20-21). The education in these schools, however, was in Illyrian (a combination of Croatian and Bosnian). This way the scope of the achievement of the Bulgarian Catholics was limited to that of their community and did not influence the rest of the Bulgarians.

The Bulgarian schools during the Ottoman period were religious schools established for the needs of religious life. They helped maintain the Orthodox faith and the Bulgarian education tradition. They were called cell schools since they are most often located in a separate room (cell) in the monasteries, the church, or the convent. In most cases, the cell schools were elementary and the education there included reading and writing, Orthodox Slavonic singing and in some rare cases Arithmetic as well. The bigger cell schools also taught Greek and Calligraphy. The education was individual and conservative. It relied on the student's memory since everything had to be learned by heart. The cell schools played a role in preserving the national and religious spirit of the Bulgarians during the Ottoman period but the public needs of a secular education during the Revival period led to their closure and the establishment of the modern Bulgarian schools.

Bulgarian National Revival

During the 19th century the process of the Bulgarian National Revival marked the beginning of the modern school. The first schools introduced teaching and school books in Greek – that was the language used for trading in the Ottoman Empire. The teachers had graduated Greek schools and used that model in their work. Such schools were founded in 1810 in Sliven, in 1812 in Kotel, in 1815 in Svishtov and in other places, centers of the crafts and the trade. The teaching was in two languages – Greek and Bulgarian, and the goal was educating the sons of the rising Bulgarian manufacturer and merchant families.

In the 1830s there was an attempt to introduce reforms in the Ottoman Empire that allowed the local non-Muslim authorities to take care of the religious and educational life of their people. This gave birth to the modern Bulgarian elementary school. In his *Fable Book* (1824) the writer Peter Beron set out practical advice for the teacher on how to manage one hundred pupils. The first modern Bulgarian school opened in Gabrovo in 1835, and in the next few years 15 towns (Karlovo, Sopot, Sofia, Veles, Ruse etc.) followed the same pattern. In the beginning of the 1850s more than 200 elementary schools existed, most of them for boys and some for girls (Dimitrov, 1985, p. 83). The proliferation of these schools was possible because of the introduction of the monitorial system of A. Bell and J. Lancaster, where the 'helpers' of the teacher acquired the knowledge and competence to become teachers in a short period of time.

In the second half of the 19th century middle schools were opened (1843 in Elena, 1846 in Koprivshtitsa, 1850 in Plovdiv, a. o.) as a higher level of education. They usually had 2 to 4 classes and the curriculum depended on the education of the teachers, who were graduates of secondary schools, seminaries, and universities in Balkan lands, in Russia, and some European countries (Radkova, 1986, pp. 215-217). Common subjects were Bulgarian grammar, Catechesis, Geography, History (World and Bulgarian), Arithmetic, Calligraphy, Orthodox singing, Physics, Turkish, and French. Some schools also introduced Sciences, Drawing, Algebra, Geometry, Pedagogy and Theology. There was a lack of school books and the teachers translated and adapted foreign textbooks.

In the eve of the Liberation (1878) there were also three secondary schools at the gymnasium level – in Gabrovo (7 grades), in Plovdiv (6 grades) and in Bolgrad (in Moldavia for Bulgarians). These schools were usually for boys, but there were

some for girls – the ones in Stara Zagora and Gabrovo were the best among them (with 5 grades) (Pironkova, 2015, pp. 26-28). They adopted models from Greece and Russia but adapted and reworked them in accordance with the ideas of the Bulgarian National Revival and Enlightenment.

Bulgarian schools were founded, financed, and governed by the municipal authorities. They were decentralized and it was only in 1870 when the Bulgarian Exarchate was founded that the first steps in introducing some general elements like school age, school year and teacher education took place. The governance was led at local level, where school councils were elected. There were regional teacher meetings, where methodological issues were discussed and decisions concerning organization and school books were made.

Just before the Liberation in 1878 in the Bulgarian lands there were more than 2000 schools of different type and level – monitorial, middle, monastic, and secondary. The connections between them were private and there was no such thing as an educational system, which was set up in the Third Bulgarian State.

From the Liberation (1878) to the Union (1885)

Bulgaria threw off the Ottoman rule on the 3rd of March 1878 and gained its liberty, thus establishing the beginning of the Third Bulgarian State. However, the Berlin Congress of July 1878 broke up this country into the Principality of Bulgaria and the Eastern Roumelia. The first law on education in the Principality of Bulgaria was called *Provisional Statute on the Public Schools* (1878), created by the first Bulgarian minister of education, Prof. Marin Drinov. The main principles of this Statute were: democracy and decentralization in the administration of education; a 3-year compulsory primary education; secular character of education. The Statute established the following structure of the educational system: 3-year primary school + 4-year basic school + 4-year modern schools and gymnasiums. Only 2 years later, in 1880, a new *Law on National Education* changed the structure into: 4-year primary school + 3-year gymnasium lower level (pro-gymnasium) + 4-year gymnasium upper lever. Some gymnasiums became schools for the training of primary school teachers. A tendency to centralize the management of education appeared in 1881 when the Ministry of Education established school district inspectorates whose heads were appointed by the minister.

In 1880, the *Law on Primary Learning in Eastern Roumelia* was adopted in this part of Bulgaria. The law decentralized the management and finance of education. The structure was as follows: 4-year primary school + 4-year secondary school lower level + 3-year secondary school upper level (called gymnasium).

From the Union (1885) to 1918

The Union of Bulgaria was established on the 6th of September 1885. The *Law on Public and Private Schools* (1885) regulated education financing in details. A very important act was the *Law on Public Education* (1891) which made four main changes:

- centralizing the management of education through giving the whole power to the Ministry of Education;
- introducing 6-year compulsory education;

- establishing kindergartens for children aged from 3 to 7 as the first level of the educational system;
- establishing a new structure which consisted of the following schools: 6-year basic school; 4-year specialized schools (pedagogical, industrial, technical) beginning after the last year of the basic school; 3-year secondary school lower level beginning after the 4th year of the basic school; 4-year secondary school upper level divided into two sectors – classical and modern.

In 1898, the duration of compulsory education was reduced to 4 years. A pre-school teachers' course was opened in 1905.

The next very important act was the *Law on National Education* (1909). It was aimed at achieving the West-European level of education. The centralization of management became much stronger. The structure was changed as follows: 4-year primary school + 3-year pro-gymnasium + 5-year gymnasium (divided into 3 types – modern, semi-classical, and classical), 5-year pedagogical schools, 2-year vocational schools, 4-year high vocational schools. This structure remained for 35 years.

From 1919 to 1944

After participation in three wars (the Balkan Wars of 1912-1913 and World War I) in 1919 Bulgaria was a broken country. In the years of the post-war crisis (1919-1923) the general aim was the re-building of society, economy and education.

In 1921 a new law on education was adopted. Its main principles were: a) vocationalization of secondary education; b) replacement of the 5-year gymnasium with a 5-year secondary school consisting of a 3-year lower level (called modern school) and a 2-year upper level (called gymnasium); and c) introduction of 7-year compulsory education.

Three years later, in 1924, the vocationalization of secondary education was abolished and the general character was reinforced, putting the accent on classical education. The role of civic, moral and religious education increased. The strong centralized education management was kept and continued. The 5-year gymnasium was re-established and admission examinations between the pro-gymnasium and gymnasium were accepted.

In the middle of the 1930s the duration of pre-school teachers' training became 2 years after completing secondary education. A national institute for training pre-school teachers was opened in 1942.

Socialist period (1944-1989)

The Communists came into power on the 9th of September 1944 ushering in the period of the Communist regime in Bulgaria. Within some years all private schools (American, French, German, Armenian, Jewish, etc.) were closed. Only the Turkish schools were open up to 1959. In 1944-1948 the gymnasium admission examinations were abolished and the duration of gymnasium education was reduced by a year. The new *Law on National Education* (1948) established the following school structure: kindergarten for children from the age of 3 to 7; 4-year primary school + 3-year pro-gymnasium + 4-year gymnasium or 2-year vocational schools.

The idea of building first socialist followed by communist society found final expression in a law on education (1959) called *Law on Further Closer Links*

between the School and Life and on Further Development of People Education. The main aim of this law was to prepare the Bulgarian youth for life in socialist and communist society through connecting education with socially useful and productive work. That aim, which crippled the Bulgarian education system, was practically abolished in the end of 1989, and finally by law in 1991. The law of 1959 made two main changes in the structure. The duration of compulsory education became 8 years and the 12-year secondary polytechnic school was established. The latter was divided into three phases – primary, middle and high – each lasting 4 years. Two types of vocational schools – 4-year technikum (from Russian meaning 'vocational school') and 3-year secondary vocational technical schools were formed after grade 8.

However, the educational practice showed that a 12-year duration of school education was difficult to fulfil. Thus, in the early 1970s, the duration of the high phase of the secondary polytechnic school was reduced by a year, i.e. the structure became 4+4+3.

In 1979 one of the most unsuccessful experiments in Bulgarian education started – the so-called Educational Vocation Complexes were established. A United Secondary Polytechnic School was formed. It had three levels: first – 10-year education; second – 1-year Educational Vocation Complexes where students learned some profession with large polytechnic profile simultaneously with their regular classes; and third – half a year-specialization in a specific profession.

The Socialist period in Bulgarian education should be assessed from two aspects. Undoubtedly, the negative aspect is that everything in education – aims, content, management, structure – developed and functioned under the communist ideology. The educational process completely followed the examples and lessons of education in the Soviet Union. However, the positive aspect is that the State really cared about education. Thousands of kindergartens and schools were built. Many campuses, rest-houses etc. for children were also constructed.

Democracy (since 1989)

On the 10th of November 1989 the Communist regime in Bulgaria collapsed catalyzing deep political, economic and social changes. Democracy and market economy were reestablished in the country. This process brought about a new face to the school system. The most important positive features of the development of basic and secondary education in the early 1990s were as follows:

1) Abolishing all kind of ideological, political and party instructions in educational aims, management and contents; 2) Paying attention to the freedom and initiative of the individual; 3) Focusing on the educational interests and needs of students; 4) Diversifying textbooks, curricula and syllabi; 5) Allowing students to make their own choice; 6) Opening of private schools.

The following laws, regulating preschool and school education, were adopted in the 1990s: *Law on National Education* (1991); *Law on the Level of Education, General Education Minimum and Curriculum* (1999); and *Law on Vocational Education and Training* (1999) (Republic of Bulgaria, 1991, 1999a, 1999b).

According to the above listed laws and their amendment laws the structure of the school system in Bulgaria consisted of the following levels and types of schools:

1. Basic education, 8-year duration, divided into 2 phases:
   - Primary phase, 4-year duration, grades 1 – 4; and

- Pro-gymnasium phase, 4-year duration, grades 5 – 8.

2. Secondary education, 4-year duration, grades 9 – 12. In many cases the entrance to secondary schools was after completing grade 7, i.e. they had a 5-year duration, grades 8 – 12.

These two school levels – basic and secondary – comprised the following types of schools:

- primary school, 4-year duration, grades 1 – 4;
- basic school, 8-year duration, grades 1 – 8;
- pro-gymnasium, 4-year duration, grades 5 – 8;
- gymnasium, 4- or 5-year duration, grades 8/9 – 12;
- secondary general school, 12-year duration, grades 1 – 12;
- secondary general school, 8-year duration, grades 5 – 12;
- technikum (renamed into vocational gymnasium in 1999), 4- or 5-year duration, grades 8/9 – 12;
- secondary vocational technical school, 4-year duration, grades 9 – 12;
- special schools – primary, basic and secondary.

The *Law on National Education* (1991) defined that education is compulsory for all up to the age of 16. Preschool education is for children aged between 3 and 7. Primary education starts at the age of 7 but admission of 6-year olds to primary education is left to the parents' decision and permission by the schools' administrations. In 2002, compulsory preschool education was introduced for students at the age of 6.

Current educational reform

In 2015, the latest school education law, entitled *Law on Preschool and School Education*, was adopted (Republic of Bulgaria, 2015). Some fundamental aspects of the current school system in Bulgaria will be presented, as described by this law.

Goals of the system of preschool and school education

The main goals of preschool and school education are (Article 5, Para 1):

- Intellectual, emotional, social, moral and physical development of all children and students in accordance with their age, needs, and abilities;
- Preservation of the Bulgarian national identity;
- Acquisition of competences needed for successful personal and professional life;
- Early identification of talents and abilities of every child and student;
- Creation of sustainable motivation for lifelong learning;
- Understanding of the principles of democracy, human rights and freedom, active and responsible participation in society;
- Formation of tolerance and respect to ethnical, national, cultural, language and religious identity of every citizen;
- Development of tolerance to the rights of children, students, and disabled people;
- Acquisition of knowledge of national, European and global values, traditions, processes and trends, and of principles, rules, responsibilities and rights in the European Union.

Structure of the school system

Preschool education is for children aged between 3 and 7, and is compulsory for children aged 5 to 7. Primary education starts at the age of 7 but admission of 6-year olds to primary education is permitted in accordance with the national education standards. Compulsory school education lasts until completion of the age of 16 (Article 8, Paras 1-3).

Schools in Bulgaria are state, municipal, private and religious (Article 36). The school structure consists of 2 levels (Article 73, Paras 1-3):

1. Basic education, 7-year duration, grades 1 – 7, divided into 2 phases:
   - Primary phase, 4-year duration, grades 1 – 4; and
   - Pro-gymnasium phase, 3-year duration, grades 5 – 7.
2. Secondary education, 5-year duration, grades 8 – 12, divided into 2 phases:
   - First gymnasium phase, 3-year duration, grades 8 – 10; and
   - Second gymnasium phase, 2-year duration, grades 11 – 12.

According to the type of education, school education is general, profiled, and vocational (Article 74, Para 1). According to the type of training, schools are nonspecialized and specialized (Article 37).

Nonspecialized schools are (Article 38, Para 1):

- primary school, 4-year duration, grades 1 – 4;
- basic school, 7-year duration, grades 1 – 7;
- gymnasium (profiled or vocational), 5-year duration, grades 8 – 12;
- comprehensive school, 10-year duration, grades 1 – 10;
- secondary school, 12-year duration, grades 1 – 12.

Specialized schools are (Article 39, Paras 1-2):

- sport school, 8-year duration, grades 5 – 12;
- culture school, various duration, grades 1/5/8 – 12;
- art school, various duration, grades 1/5/8 – 12;
- religious school, 5-year duration, grades 8 – 12.

There are also special schools, which are (Article 44, Para 1):

- school for students with sensor disabilities;
- boarding school for behavioral correction;
- social-pedagogical boarding school.

There are the following forms of training: full-time, evening, part-time, individual, independent, distant, combined, and dual (Article 106, Para 1). National tests, called national out-of-school assessment, are organized at the end of each school phase, i.e. after completing grades 4, 7, 10 and 12.

Governance of the school system

The governance of preschool education is performed at four levels: national, regional, municipal, and school level. The governance of school education is performed at three levels: national, regional, and school level.

The following institutions exercise the governance of preschool and school education:

1. At national level – the Ministry of Education and Science (MES), represented by the minister who is a specialized body for governing and coordinating the implementation of the state policy in the field of preschool and school education

(Article 251, Para 3). The minister exercises control over the work of all institutions in the school system (Article 251, Para 4).

2. At regional level – Regional Offices of Education, which are regional administrations to the minister of education for governance, control, support, and coordination over the work of schools and kindergartens on the territory of the regions (Article 252, Paras 1-2).

3. At municipal level – local administrations which provide and control (Article 256, Para 1): compulsory education; out-of-school activities, sport facilities and recreation; security and health care; buildings; financing; information and library equipment; canteen catering, hostels, transportation.

4. At school level – directors and pedagogical councils, which are the governing bodies of the school. The school director organizes and is responsible for all activities of the school by: following the state policy in the field of education; performing control on the education process and organization; appointing teachers and other staff. The Pedagogical Council accepts: school development strategies; school regulations; school curricula and programs; forms of training; school symbols, rituals, and uniforms; inclusive education programs; dropout prevention programs; sanctions and awards to students (Article 263, Para 1). Other bodies such as Public Council, Board of Trustees, Parents Council, and Student Council are also set up to coordinate activities within the school.

Finance of the school system

Since 2008, the delegated budget has been the mechanism of school finance in Bulgaria. This mechanism can briefly be presented as follows (Articles 282-289):

1. Each year, by analyzing data on the number of students and schools in the country, the Government decides the dimensions of education financing the Ministry of Finance should send to the first-level budget distributors.

2. The first-level budget distributors are: a) the Ministry of Education and Science for state schools; and b) all municipalities for municipal schools. After receiving education financing from the Ministry of Finance, the first-level budget distributors approve formulas for creating delegated budgets of schools. The formulas contain main and additional components. The main components are: 1) number of students; 2) number of classes; 3) number and types of schools; 4) standard per a student; and 5) standard per a school. The additional components are geographic, demographic, logistic, social and other characteristics of schools. The main components are obligatory and must be at least 85%, while the additional components are optional and can be up to 15% of the delegated budget.

3. The first-level budget distributors send the delegated budget financing to school directors who are the second-level budget distributors. The delegated budget contains costs for: 1) salaries of school staff; 2) insurance; 3) supplies; 4) services; 5) maintenance; 6) furniture; 7) equipment; and 8) teacher qualification. All schools receive additional finances, not included in the delegated budget, for: textbooks and teaching manuals, capital expenditures, pension taxes, work with students from vulnerable groups, student grants, student transport, breakfast, dropout prevention, support to gifted students, sport and recreation activities, etc. There is a national teacher qualification program that provides additional finances, different from those included in the delegated budget.

Conclusion

This is a concise presentation of the main school reforms in Bulgaria from the 9th to the 21st century and of the current school system in Bulgaria.

The following national education strategies have currently been applied in Bulgaria: 1) educational integration of students from minority groups; 2) effective use of the information and communication technologies in the teaching-learning process; 3) enforcement of basic literacy; 4) development of vocational education and training; 5) implementation of the dual system; 6) support to lifelong learning; 7) decrease of drop-outs; and 8) professional and career development of teachers.

References

Beshevliev, V. (2008): *Protobulgarians. History, everyday life and culture*. Plovdiv: Fondatsia Balgarsko istorichesko nasledstvo. [In Bulgarian]

Cholova, Ts. (2013): *Education in Medieval Bulgaria*. Sofia: New Bulgarian University Press. [In Bulgarian]

Dimitrov, A. (1987): *School, Education and National Revolution. The Bulgarian School in the Period of the National Revival*. Sofia: Bulgarian Academy of Sciences Press. [In Bulgarian]

Gechev, M. (1967): *Cell Schools*. Sofia: Narodna prosveta. [In Bulgarian]

Gyuzelev, V. (1985): *Schools, Scriptoria, Libraries and Knowledge in Bulgaria 13. – 14. C. A.D*. Sofia: Narodna prosveta. [In Bulgarian]

Ivanova-Mircheva, D. & Davidov, A. (2001): *Small Dictionary of the Old Church Slavonic*. Veliko Tarnovo: Izdatelstvo Slovo. [In Bulgarian]

Kostenechki, K. (1993): *Essays: Explained Exposition of Letters; Hagiography of Stefan Lazarevich*. Sofia: Slavika. [In Bulgarian]

Matanov, H. (2014): *In Search of the Medieval Time. The Rough Road of the Bulgarians (7.-14. C. A.D.)*. Sofia: Gutenberg. [In Bulgarian]

Milev, A. (1966): *Greek Hagiographies of Kliment Ohridski*. Sofia: Bulgarian Academy of Sciences Press. [In Bulgarian]

Pironkova, M. (2015): *Secondary Education in Bulgaria 1878 – 1944*. Sofia: Sofia University Press. [In Bulgarian]

Radkova, R. (1986): *Bulgarian Intellectuals in the National Revival*. Sofia: Nauka i izkustvo. [In Bulgarian]

Republic of Bulgaria (1991): Law on National Education. *State Gazette*, No 86 of 18.10.1991. Amended 1996-2014. [In Bulgarian]

Republic of Bulgaria (1999a): Law on the Level of Education, General Education Minimum and Curriculum. *State Gazette*, No 67 of 27.07.1999. Amended 2002-2014. [In Bulgarian]

Republic of Bulgaria (1999b): Law on Vocational Education and Training. *State Gazette*, No 68 of 30.07.1999. Amended 2000-2018. [In Bulgarian]

Republic of Bulgaria (2015): Law on Preschool and School Education. *State Gazette*, No 79 of 13.10.2015. Amended 2016-2019. [In Bulgarian]

Prof. Dr.habil. Nikolay Popov, Sofia University, Bulgaria
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Marina Pironkova, Sofia University, Bulgaria

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Part 1

Comparative and International Education & History of Education

Charl Wolhuter

Education Reforms Worldwide: Incoming Tide for Comparative and International Education

Abstract

The aim of this paper is to map the tide of education reforms worldwide and to spell out the implications thereof for the field of Comparative and International Education – the field of scholarship tasked with assessing and guiding the global education project. In the field the notion of the Global Education Reform Movement (GERM) has gained currency. In this paper the deficiencies of that concept are identified. These include its non-exhaustiveness, its lack of a theoretical underpinning, and its lack of a normative dimension. It is argued that the field of Comparative and International Education, with its theoretical construct of the education system, its basic theorem of education systems being shaped by societal contextual forces, and the comparative method for approaching education issues and challenges, appears most promising in providing a theory as well as a method for a scholarly as well as a public discourse about education. The most salient societal trends of the twenty-first century world are enumerated, as well as how these have precipitated in changed education objectives, educational management and administration, teachers and students, and curricula.

Keywords: Comparative and International Education, education reforms, education theory, Global Education Reform Movement (GERM), twenty-first century

Introduction

Almost four decades ago, Brezinka (1981, p. 2) wrote:

> *... When someone wants to do something for peace, he introduces 'peace education', the person wanting to reduce the number of traffic accidents recommends 'traffic education'...*

Today that is still true (for example, cf. Lutz & Klingholz, 2017), as policy makers, the media, and the public discourse hold education up as the solution to any problem or challenge facing society; be it the eradication of unemployment, effecting economic growth, combatting crime, or whatever. Humankind has selected education as the ship to meet the new future. Large amounts of public as well as private money are invested into education. The aim of this paper is to map the tide of education reforms worldwide and to spell out the implications thereof for the field

of Comparative and International Education – the field of scholarship tasked with assessing and guiding the global education project.

The paper commences with the societal drivers (or contextual forces impinging on) the education reforms worldwide. The main dimensions of the worldwide education reform project are then outlined, and in conclusion the opportunities which these present for the field of Comparative and International Education are spelled out.

Contextual forces shaping education worldwide

It is a basic theorem of Comparative Education that education systems are shaped by contextual societal forces. The following is an overview of the most forceful global societal trends impacting on education. The first force is the ecological crisis. Humanity is taxing the resources of the earth to the point where not only the survival of humanity, but even the survival of the planet is at stake. This crisis has given rise to the notion of sustainable development, and to the creed of education for sustainable development. Demographically the world is still undergoing a population explosion (though population growth has decelerated in virtually all parts of the world in recent years). People are also getting more and more mobile in the contemporary world.

Humanity is experiencing scientific and technological progress across a very wide front, the most conspicuous include the ICT (information, communication and transport technology) revolution. Economic trends include increasing affluence. However, despite increasing levels of affluence on aggregate level, and diminishing incidences of poverty, economic inequality is also rising. Two other conspicuous trends are the rise of knowledge economies (that is where the production and consumption of new knowledge becomes the driving axis of an economy) and the fourth industrial revolution (the quintessential feature of which is the blurring of borders between the physical, the biological and the technological worlds, an example is the rise of artificial intelligence). A final forceful economic trend (in fact making its impact felt to more than just the economic system) is the neo-liberal economic revolution.

Social trends include the diminishing importance of primary and secondary groupings (these refer to respectively the family and the work place) and the rise of tertiary groupings, that is functional interest groups, such as sports or hobby clubs. One forceful political trends the past thirty years has been that of democratization. The once powerful nation state is losing its stature in the world, and in the vacuum left by the nation state, two other nodes of control or power are moving in. One is supra-national and international structures, and the other is sub-national: provincial, district and local structures, right down to the level of the individual. The last mentioned is part of another trend, namely individualization.

Four religious and life-philosophical trends are salient in early twenty-first society (Steyn & Wolhuter, 2020). The first is the continuing, but new and more complex presence of religion. Despite oft-made statements that the modern age is a post-religious, secular age, religion persists as an important factor in individual lives, as well as in social dynamics. Pew's (Pew Research Center, 2012) survey covering 230 countries found that 84% of the global population still regard themselves as belonging to some religious affiliation. However, three aspects

complicate matters further. One of them is the existence of multireligious societies, which is part of the multicultural make-up of modern societies, as explained above. Secondly, many people regard themselves to be religious although they do not belong to an organised religious community. Thirdly, people no longer fit neatly into categories such as "Christian" or "Sikh Muslim" but construct their own individualised belief systems.

Two other salient life-philosophical trends are the spread of the Western, individualistic, materialistic outlook to all parts of the globe, and likewise, the Creed of Human Rights finding subscription virtually all over the world, as the new moral compass of the world. Education in some form is often included as one of these human rights. On 10 December 1948, the General Assembly of the United Nations accepted the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (United Nations, 2016). This basic declaration of human rights has subsequently been complemented by a myriad of manifestos at international, supranational and national levels. On education, the United Nations Universal Declaration of Human Rights (United Nations, 2016) states the following in Article 26(1):

> *Everyone has the right to education. Education shall be free, at least in the elementary stages. Elementary education shall be compulsory. Technical and professional education shall be made more generally available, and higher education shall be equally accessible on the basis of merit.*

A last trend is the rise of interculturalism and intercultural education (Steyn & Wolhuter, 2020). In recent years, particularly after the terrorist attacks of 9/11, it seems as if the philosophy of multiculturalism and the pedagogy of multicultural education have been superseded by a philosophy of interculturalism and the pedagogy of intercultural education. Markou (1997) explains the four principles of intercultural education as follows:

- Education with empathy, which means showing deep understanding for others, and trying to understand their position;
- Education with solidarity, which means that an appeal is directed to the cultivation of a collective conscience, and to the promotion of social justice;
- Education with intercultural respect; and
- Education with ethicist thinking, which assumes the presence of dialogue.

Dimensions of the international education reform project

The concept of the Global Education Reform Movement (GERM, coined by Sahlberg, 2016) has gained currency in the scholarly community. However this paper will argue that while this idea describes some aspects, a complete depiction, and scholarly interrogation of the of the global education project, needs the delineation and inclusion of other dimensions too.

The notion of the Global Education Reform Movement (GERM)

According to Sahlberg (2016) a global education reform movement (though not a universal reform movement, many nations are not following this model) is evident. The GERM shows five features: 1. Competition and choice (competition between schools, people being given a choice which schools to attend or which schools to send their children to); 2. Standardisation of teaching and learning (standardized

curricula); 3. Emphasis of reading, mathematics and science, as core skills in the curriculum; 4. Corporate models of change; and 5. Test based accountability.

Sahlberg notes that from PISA (International Programme for Student Assessment) it seems that those nations not following the GERM pattern, shows the best education outcomes (at least as measured by PISA test results).

The thesis of this paper is that this is not an exhaustive list of trends in contemporary education, nor does it provide a complete platform for the interrogation of education issues facing twenty-first century society. What is much more promising for a theoretical framework interrogating or discussing education issues is the structure of the education system (for an explanation of this structure, see Steyn & Wolhuter, 2020), while the method and the field of Comparative and International Education has the method (for the method and scope of the field of Comparative and International Education, see Wolhuter, 2020) and constitutes the appropriate scholarly field for such a scholarly discourse to take place.

The following main dimensions of the worldwide education reform project will now be surveyed: educational objectives, management and administrative structures, teachers and students, and curricula.

Educational objectives

Biesta (2013, p. 4) contends that answers to the question "for what reason do we want an education system?" can fit into one of three generic ideal types, namely for the educand to learn skills (e.g. a trade), to socialize (for the educand to learn to adapt to society) and to give the educand opportunities for self-actualisation. While in any society an education system rarely, if ever pursues only one of these types of goals (there relative importance varies from place to place and from time to time), and while there was never unanimity in society regarding an answer, in view of the new society and new global moral order taking shape (as was outlined in the previous section) the place and relative importance of these three should be seriously considered in the contemporary public and scholarly discourse on education. The author is of the view that the last, with its philosophical superstructure in places such as Sen's Capabilities Theory, should be given much weight.

Educational management and administration

The best way to summarise changes in the management and administration component of the education system is to state that the principles of the neo-liberal economic revolution are being carried into education. Under the societal contextual trends shaping education outlined above the neo-liberal economic revolution has been described as a forceful societal trend since the 1980s. The principles of the neo-liberal economic revolution are being carried into education (see Wolhuter & Van der Walt, 2019). These principles include performativity, the profit motive, the principle of relevance and rising managerialism. While giving parents greater choice of schools, and competition may induce schools to give their best, the neo-liberal economic revolution, with its narrow, reductionistic view of the human being as a production and consumption unit, has many adverse effects on education too. Steglitz (2019) for example, explains how market fundamentalism harms the basic research function of universities.

Teachers and students

Teachers find themselves in a dilemma of an overly narrowly descriptive deprofessionalised environment, sandwiched between on the one hand a culture of managerialism and performativity from above, and a culture of entitlement among students, boldened by the time-spirit of democratization, individualism, and Human Rights. Such an environment stifles all autonomy, individuality, ingenuity and creativity, and is extremely dispiriting for teachers. The new multicultural society puts the teacher before new demands of Intercultural Education.

Turning to students, the first salient trend is that of massification of educational institutions as enrolment numbers at all levels of education are swelling. A second feature is the increase of diversity among the student corps. Thirdly, the emphasis in education has shifted from teaching to learning. In view of some of the above enumerated societal trends, this is to be welcomed, as is the rise of modern learning theories such as constructionism, replacing the behaviouristic models of the past. Another way to describe this trend is the change from teacher-centred education to student-centred education. Practice however, lags the scholarly discourse (even an education system regarded as exemplary and progressive, such as that of Finland, is still characterized by traditional, teacher-centred methods of teaching and learning, see Andrews, 2013), and in this regard the scholars of Education have an assignment to guide change in practice.

Curricula

While the trend identified by GERM, namely the emphasis on reading, mathematics and science, cannot be denied, curricula are more complicated than that, and many urgent questions surrounding school curricula need to be discussed, in the public and scholarly discourse about education alike. In his worldwide survey of secondary school curricula, Benavot (2004) (admittedly dates, but this still remains the most comprehensive survey of school curricula worldwide) found that languages occupy on average, about a third of instructional time in schools worldwide – rightfully so, in view of the importance of language as basis for any other cognitive pursuit (the Sapir-Whorff hypothesis comes here to mind). In fact in view of changing geo-politics and the rise of multicultural societies and the imperative for intercultural education (identified above under contemporary societal trends) a discussion on which languages should be included in curricula should be high on the agenda of the discussion of education.

There is also, in the current age, an imperative for global citizenship education (see UNESCO, 2014). What this should entail, how the cultivation of a global mindset should be provided for in curricula, and how global citizenship education should be balanced with local and regional imperatives, should also be an urgent topic for discussion about the reform of curricula. Critically belabouring the theme of the previous volume in this series, the author has argued that the concept of "glocal" represents a too easy "cop-out" from a difficult and a complicated question, and that a much more nuanced concept and finer calibrated instrument is needed (Wolhuter, 2019).

Rising societal trends, such as technological changes which include for example the rise of artificial intelligence, has lent new credence or potential value to the humanities. To balance the instrumental-technicist view or assessment of education

and curricula in particular, have resulted in a call for STEAM education, i.e. to add Art (A) to the current clarion cry for STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) education (see QSI News, 2019).

Conclusion

While the notion of the Global Education Reform Movement (GERM) is a useful heuristic encapsulating key features of educational change world-wide, it is neither an all-encompassing nor a coherent construct to describe the momentous changes taking place in education world-wide. Much less is it grounded in a theoretical framework, or does it provide a method to interrogate education issues facing humanity in the twenty-first century or provide any normative framework for interrogating such education challenges.

What appears most promising in providing a theory as well as a method for a scholarly as well as a public discourse about education, is the field of Comparative and International Education, with its theoretical construct of the education system, its basic theorem of education systems being shaped by societal contextual forces, and the comparative method for approaching education issues and challenges. The issues of education raised in this volume and the discussions around these issues following the presentations at the conference of which this book constitutes the proceedings of, should be guided by the conceptual and epistemological tools of the field of Comparative and International Education, conversely, these issues provides scholars in the field with a new opportunity to prove their mettle.

References

Andrews, P. (2013): Finnish Mathematics Teaching from a Reform Perspective: A Video-Based Case-Study Analysis. *Comparative Education Review*, 57(2), 189-211.

Benavot, A. (2004): *A global study of intended instructional time and official school curricula, 1980-2000*. Paris: UNESCO.

Biesta, G. J. J. (2013): *The Beautiful Risk of Education.* Boulder: Paradigm.

Brezinka, W. (1981): The limits of education. *Logos*, 1(1), 2-5.

Lutz, W. & Klingholz, R. (2017): *Education First! From Martin Luther to Sustainable Development*. Stellenbosch: Sun Media.

Markou, G. (1997): *Introduction to intercultural education*. Athens: Pappas Bros.

Pew Research Center (2012): *The global religious landscape*. www.pewforum.org/ 2012/12/18/global-religious-landscape-exec/ (Accessed 5 December 2019).

QSI News (2019): How STEAM education develop 21st century skills. *QSI News*, 2 October 2019. https://www.studyinternational.com/news/steam-education/ (Accessed 7 December 2019).

Sahlberg, P. (2016): The Global Education Research Movement and its Impact on Education. In Mundy, K., Green, A., Lingard, B. & Verger, A. (Eds.) *Handbook of Global Education Policy* (pp. 128-144). New York: John Wiley.

Steglitz, J. (2019): *People, Power and Profits: Progressive capitalism for an age of discontent*. London: Penguin.

Steyn, H. J. & Wolhuter, C. C. (2020): The education system and compelling trends of the early twenty-first century. In Steyn, H. J. & Wolhuter, C. C. (Eds.) *World Education*

Systems Entering the Twenty-Frist Century (pp. 1-28). Noordbrug: Keurkopie. [Forthcoming]

UNESCO (2014): *Global Citizenship Education: Preparing learners for the twenty-first century*. Paris: UNESCO.

United Nations (2016): *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights*. http://www.un.org/en/universal-declaration-human-rights/ (Accessed 3 December 2019).

Wolhuter, C. (2019): Problematizing "Glocal" as Catchword in Comparative and International Education. In Popov, N., Wolhuter, C., De Beer, L., Hilton, G., Ogunleye, J., Achinewhu-Nworgu, E. & Niemczyk, E. (Eds.) *Glocal Education in Practice: Teaching, Researching, and Citizenship*. BCES Conference Books, Vol. 17, 19-24.

Wolhuter, C. C. (2020): The Scholarly Field of Comparative and International Education and its Scope in the Global South. In Seroto, J., Noor, D. & Wolhuter, C. C. (Eds.) *Decolonising Education in the Global South: International Comparative and Historical Perspectives*. Pretoria: Pearson. [Forthcoming]

Wolhuter, C. C. & Van der Walt, J. L. (2019): Neo-liberalism and the human rights creed: Conflicting forces vying for control of the global education agenda. *South African Journal of Education*, 39(4). [Forthcoming]

Prof. Dr. Charl Wolhuter, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Nikolay Popov & Vera Spasenović

School Counseling: A Comparative Study in 12 Countries

Abstract

This paper presents results of a comparative international study on some aspects of school counseling in the following 12 countries: Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Denmark, Ireland, Malta, North Macedonia, Russia, Serbia, Slovenia, UK, and USA. The authors explain the multi-functional character of school counseling, give an idea of establishing a research field that could be called 'comparative school counseling studies', show the original terms in individual countries, and compare six aspects of school counseling: 1) legislative framework; 2) position requirements; 3) role of school counselors; 4) functions of school counselors; 5) interaction; and 6) ratio. The paper concludes with a long list of qualities school counselors are expected to possess. This is a document study chiefly based on examining, systematizing and comparing national documents (laws, reports, instructions, advices, position requirements, ministerial orders, recommendations, strategies, and statistics) on school counseling.

Keywords: school counseling, comparative school counseling study, school counselors' position requirements, role and functions of school counselors

Introduction

Advisor, advocate, agent, believer, collaborator, conductor, consultant, coordinator, diplomat, educator, enthusiast, expert, explorer, guide, initiator, leader, listener, mediator, mentor, navigator, negotiator, observer, pedagogue, professional, psychologist, researcher, specialist, supporter, teacher – these are just a part of most frequently used words in national documents, job requirements, school forums, and professional platforms about what a school counselor is expected to be. It could be said that school counseling is the most multifunctional position in the school system, with too many variable tasks, with a huge number of functions and a large circle of contacts. There is no other position in the school system that is given so many roles.

A school counselor is expected to care about the mental, emotional, social and academic development of students; to prevent them from various risks; to discover, diagnose and understand the essence of problems students face. At the same time, a school counselor should be loyal to the school authority, to be collegial to school teachers, to intermediate between students, parents and teachers in case of conflicts, to propose problem solving decisions, to define strategies for improving the school organization and climate, to organize individual and group consultations for all participants in school life, and to look for support from social and psycho-medical institutions, and to even contact police and court offices when necessary.

This paper is a revised, shortened and updated version of a coauthored study by N. Popov and V. Spasenović that was performed and published in 2018 in two languages – Bulgarian and Serbian (Popov & Spasenović, 2018a, 2018b). These editions serve as teaching manuals to students in Bachelor and Master's programs and in-service teacher training programs.

The study examines school counseling in the following 12 countries: Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Denmark, Ireland, Malta, North Macedonia, Russia, Serbia, Slovenia, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

Comparative school counseling studies

The mission of the above cited books and the purpose of this paper is to put the beginning of a process of establishing a comparative research field that could be called 'comparative school counseling studies'.

Firstly, such a research field could contribute to a better understanding of common features, similarities and differences in school counseling worldwide. Secondly, it could support transferring best school counseling practices and innovations between countries. Thirdly, it could help improving school counseling training programs at colleges and universities, especially in countries where such programs are not well developed.

Every comparative international study of school counseling usually faces many difficulties, including:

- the position of school counselor, although being similar across the world, often has different role, functions and tasks;
- in the school systems, in parallel with school counselors, there are many other school or out-of-school based specialists (such as school psychologist or psychotherapist, guidance teacher, speech therapist, social worker, career adviser, professional orientation consultant, etc.) whose functions are often mixed with those of school counselors; and
- in most cases, finding all actual national documentation that regulates school counseling is a very difficult process.

The term

The term 'school counselor' has different names in the national school systems: student or education counselor (Austria), pedagogical counselor (Bulgaria), pedagogical-psychological counselor (Denmark), pedagogue-psychologist (Russia), expert associate (Croatia, North Macedonia, Serbia), school counselor (Malta, Slovenia, UK, USA), and guidance counselor (Ireland). In this paper, the term 'school counselor / school counseling' is used as a common term for all countries.

The original terms in the 12 countries are listed below.

Note: for Bulgaria, North Macedonia and Russia the Cyrillic letters are replaced with their Latin equivalents.

Austria	Schüler- und Bildungsberater
Bulgaria	Pedagogicheski savetnik
Croatia	Stručni suradnik
Denmark	Psykologer / Konsulenter / Uddannelsesvejleder
Ireland	Guidance counsellor
Malta	School counsellor

North Macedonia	Struchen sorabotnik
Russia	Pedagog-psiholog
Serbia	Stručni saradnik
Slovenia	Svetovalni delavec
UK	School counsellor
USA	School counselor

Comparisons of school counseling aspects

The following six aspects of school counseling are compared: 1) legislative framework; 2) position requirements; 3) role of school counselors; 4) functions of school counselors; 5) interaction; and 6) ratio.

Legislative framework

In Bulgaria, Croatia, North Macedonia, Serbia, and Slovenia the governance of the school systems is generally centralized. Croatia, North Macedonia, Serbia, and Slovenia apply stronger centralization, which means that job requirements, professional activities and duties of school counselors are defined at the national (ministerial) level. The centralization in Bulgaria is soft, which means that school counseling details are decided on both national and school level.

In Austria, Denmark, Ireland, Malta, Russia, UK, and USA the governance of the school systems is decentralized. These countries can be divided into 3 groups:

- Countries with decentralized school system governance and centralized regulation of school counseling. Such countries are Austria, Malta, and Russia. School counseling is regulated by the ministries of education of these countries.
- Countries with decentralized school system governance and decentralized regulation of school counseling. Such countries are Denmark, Ireland, and the United Kingdom. The ministries/departments of education of these countries regularly publish documents on school counseling that are frameworks and give general recommendations, while the concrete regulation is performed by municipalities and local authorities. In the United Kingdom, the British Association for Counselling and Psychotherapy offers training and accreditation of school counselors. In Ireland, these functions are performed by the National Centre for Guidance in Education.
- A country with decentralized school system governance and national non-governmental regulation of school counseling. Such a country is the United States, where the American School Counselor Association has created its ASCA National Model that should be followed by all American school counselors (ASCA, n. d.).

Position requirements

Regarding the academic degree applicants for school counselors must have, the countries can be grouped as follows:

- Countries where applicants may have both Bachelor and Master's degree. These countries are Austria, Bulgaria, Denmark, North Macedonia, the United Kingdom, and Russia. The United States can also be included in this group because 45 states require a Master's degree, while in 5 states a Bachelor degree is enough (ASCA, n. d.).
- Countries where applicants should have a Master's degree. Such countries are Croatia, Ireland, Malta, Serbia, and Slovenia.

Regarding any specialization (additional qualification) applicants must have, the countries can be grouped as follows:

- Countries where applicants for school counselors must have any additional qualification for school counselors in addition to their academic degrees. It happens in Austria, Denmark, Ireland, Malta, the United Kingdom, and the United States. Various models of obtaining additional qualification can be seen – specializations in Bachelor and Master's programs, in-service training programs, etc.
- Countries where no additional qualification for school counselors is required. It happens in Bulgaria, Croatia, North Macedonia, Russia, Serbia, and Slovenia.

Regarding licensing (also met as certification or accreditation) of school counselors, the countries can again be divided into 2 groups:

- Countries with no licensing – Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Denmark, North Macedonia, Malta, Russia, Serbia, and Slovenia.
- Countries with licensing required – Ireland, the United Kingdom, and the United States.

Regarding the required type of higher education (specialty) applicants for school counselors must have, the countries can be divided into 3 groups:

- Countries where a degree in Education (or Pedagogy) is required. It is observed in Austria, Ireland, and Malta. The United States can also be included in this group due to the fact that the school counseling programs are often organized at faculties/colleges of education.
- Countries where a degree in Psychology (as a main or additional specialty) is required. Such countries are Russia and the United Kingdom.
- Countries where applicants may have a degree in Education (Pedagogy) or Psychology. It can be seen in Bulgaria, Croatia, Denmark, North Macedonia, Serbia, and Slovenia.

Role of school counselors

Examining this aspect, it can definitely be said that the role of school counselors has many common characteristics in all countries. The role usually includes:

- supporting students in their psychological, academic and social development;
- consulting students, parents, and teachers;
- resolving conflicts between teachers and students;
- helping students to identify their abilities, capacities and interests;
- preventing dropout;
- supporting the school organization and the teaching/learning process;
- advising students about their career orientation and decisions;

- collaborating with school staff (principals, teachers, other specialists); and
- maintaining school counseling documentation.

Functions of school counselors

The comparative review of a large body of documents (ASCA, n. d.; BACP, n. d.; Bundesministerium für Bildung…, 2017; Danish Agency…, 2014; Jurić et al, 2001; Ministarstvo prosvete i nauke, 2012; Ministry of Education, 2003; Ministry for Education and Employment, n. d.; Ministry of Education and Science, 2019; Ministry of Education and Science, 2016; Mrvar Gregorčič & Mažgon, 2016; National Centre for Guidance..., n. d.) shows that the following functions can be outlined as common for all or most countries:

- identification function – diagnosing psychological, learning and social difficulties students have, and identifying gifted students and students with special needs;
- information function – giving information to all school actors according to their needs;
- support function – supporting personal development of students;
- consultation function – organizing individual and group consultations with students, parents, teachers and other school members;
- orientation function – helping students to get a better orientation about next level of education, vocational qualification or work market;
- prevention function – preventing students from possible risks and dropout;
- correction function – working with students who need additional help in coordination with other teachers and specialists;
- mediation function – solving problems between students, teachers, parents and principals;
- assessment function – monitoring the school process and assessing the quality of school work;
- development function – creating tools for optimizing the school work; and
- research function – getting knowledge of changes, best practices and innovations for improving the school work.

It should be clarified that this list of functions is rather relative. In some countries, these functions are subordinated – some are main, while others are sub-functions or activities/tasks. It was our intention here to outline the big scope of functions of school counseling.

Interaction

It is clear that school counselors need to interact with a large circle of persons and organizations, such as: students, parents, teachers, principals, other school based or out-of-school based specialists (social workers, psychologists, speech therapists, doctors, etc.), municipal and state institutions, non-governmental youth and children organizations, centers for professional information, police and court authorities. In Ireland, the United Kingdom, and the United States school counselors are expected to contact universities and colleges, representatives of local business, and members of the local church. A specific feature in the United Kingdom is the cooperation between school counselors and the school pastoral system (BACP, n. d.).

Ratio

The number of students at school per one school counselor ratio averagely varies between 250 and 500 students. The best standard (i.e. the lowest ratio) is announced in Croatia – schools with about 180 students must have 2 school counselors, schools with 180 to 500 students must have 3 school counselors, and schools with more than 500 students must have 4 school counselors. In the United States, the average standard is 250 students per one school counselor. In Malta, the standard is 300 students. In Ireland, schools having up to 500 students must appoint at least one school counselor, while schools with more than 500 students must have one school counselor per every 250 students. In Bulgaria, Russia and the other countries the usual standard is 500 students. However, in Bulgaria, the Ministry of Education and Science plans to decrease this number up to 400.

Conclusion

The paper shortly and comparatively presented some aspects of school counseling in 12 countries (11 European countries and the United States). It is clearly declared in national documents (laws, strategies, reports, regulations, instructions, advices, ministerial orders, recommendations, etc.) of all countries that school counseling is a very important position at schools that will play a more and more significant role in the development of education. According to the United States Department of Labor (2018) the number of school counselors in USA will increase with 13% until 2026, which is the highest increase among all professions.

It could be summarized that in the countries included in this study the school counselor is considered the specialist who shall: 1) support the psychological, academic and social development of students; 2) try to resolve conflicts between all actors in school life; 3) help students to face personal problems; 4) consult students, parents, teachers and principals; and 5) act as a coordinator of various school activities. It was mentioned in the Introduction of this paper that school counseling is the most multifunctional position in the school system. The huge diversity of functions listed above shows an abnormal spectrum of problems school counselors should try to solve.

There are also certain differences in school counselors' work. While in some countries the focus is on supporting students in their personal development and learning (Denmark, Ireland, UK), in others the equal attention is paid to the successful realization of teaching and school work and the improvement of the overall functioning of the school as an institution (Croatia, Slovenia, Serbia). In addition, the dominant functions or duties of school counselors vary across the countries – in some cases it is mental health care (United Kingdom), elsewhere academic and career guidance and counseling (Austria, Ireland), prevention (Russia), etc.

It is evident in position requirements, ministerial instructions, school forums, and associations' advices used in the 12 countries that national education policy makers, principals, students, parents, and inspectors expect from school counselors to be: active, balancing, careful, communicative, competent, complex, confident, creative, curious, defending, discreet, educative, experienced, exact, flexible, honest, inspiring, interesting, kind, learning, loyal, moral, motivating, multifunctional,

objective, open, original, patient, positive, reliable, searching, seeing, sensitive, smiling, social, supportive, sympathetic, tolerant, understanding, useful, variable.

Acknowledgements

Special thanks to Prof. Dr. James Ogunleye (UK), Dr. Gillian Hilton (UK), Prof. Dr. Klara Skubic Ermenc (Slovenia), Prof. Dr. Gordana Stankovska (North Macedonia), Prof. Dr. Karen L. Biraimah (USA), Assoc. Prof. Dr. Susan M. Yelich Biniecki (USA), Prof. Dr. Kenneth F. Hughey (USA), Prof. Dr. Peter L. Schneller (USA), Dr. Victor Martinelli (Malta), Assist. Prof. Dr. Gordana Djigić (Serbia), Prof. Dr. Tatyana Korsakova (Russia), Maria Popova (Bulgaria/Germany), Dr. Siniša Kušić (Croatia), and Melika Illim (Denmark) for providing information and sources on school counseling in their countries.

References

American School Counselor Association (ASCA) (n. d.): https://www.schoolcounselor.org/ (Accessed 28 January 2020).

British Association for Counselling and Psychotherapy (BACP) (n. d.): https://www.bacp.co.uk/ (Accessed 30 January 2020).

Bundesministerium für Bildung, Wissenschaft und Forschung (2017): *Grundsatzerlass für Schüler- und Bildungsberatung*. Rundschreiben Nr. 22/2017 des Bundesministeriums für Bildung. https://bildung.bmbwf.gv.at/ministerium/rs/ 2017_22.pdf?68k0bf (Accessed 15 September 2018).

Danish Agency for Higher Education (2014): *Guidance in Education – the educational guidance system in Denmark*. Copenhagen: Euroguidance Denmark.

Jurić, V., Mušanović, M., Staničić, S. & Vrgoč, H. (2001): *Koncepcija razvojne pedagoške djelatnosti stručnih suradnika – prijedlog*. Zagreb: Ministarstvo prosvjete i športa.

Ministarstvo prosvete i nauke [of Serbia] (2012): Pravilnik o programu svih oblika rada stručnih saradnika. *Službeni glasnik - Prosvetni glasnik*, br. 5/2012.

Ministry for Education and Employment [of Malta] (n. d.): *Counselling Services in Schools*. https://education.gov.mt/en/education/student-services/Pages/Psycho-Social_Services/Counselling_Services_in_Schools.aspx (Accessed 28 January 2020).

Ministry of Education [of Russia] (2003): *Letter of the Ministry of Education of the Russian Federation of 27.06.2003, № 28-51-513/16 on methodological recommendations on psychological-pedagogical support to students*. Moscow: Ministry of Education. [In Russian]

Ministry of Education and Science [of Bulgaria] (2019): Instruction No 15 on the status and professional development of teachers, principals and other education specialists. *State Gazette*, No 61 / 02.08.2019. [In Bulgarian]

Ministry of Education and Science [of North Macedonia] (2016): *Regulations on basic professional competences of school counselors*. http://mon.gov.mk/images/Osnovni_ profesionalni_kompetencii_MON.pdf [In Macedonian] (Accessed 22 September 2018).

Mrvar Gregorčič, P. & Mažgon, J. (2016): Sodelovanje šolske svetovalne službe s posamezniki in institucijami v skupnosti. *Sodobna pedagogika*, No 1, 38-57.

National Centre for Guidance in Education (n. d.): *Becoming a Guidance Counsellor*. https://www.ncge.ie/ncge/becoming-guidance-counsellor (Accessed 9 March 2019).

Popov, N. & Spasenović, V. (2018a): *The school counselor: a comparative review in 12 countries*. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society. [In Bulgarian]

Popov, N. & Spasenović, V. (2018b): *Stručni saradnik u školi: komparativni pregled za 12 zemalja*. Sofija: Bugarsko društvo za komparativnu pedagogiju.

United States Department of Labor (2018): *School and career counselors: Summary*. Bureau of Labor Statistic. https://www.bls.gov/ooh/community-and-social-service/school-and-career-counselors.htm (Accessed 15 September 2018).

Prof. Dr.habil. Nikolay Popov, Sofia University, Bulgaria

Prof. Dr. Vera Spasenović, University of Belgrade, Serbia

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Akvilė Naudžiūnienė

History Education as a Form of Value Indoctrination in Soviet Lithuania

Abstract

In the 1960s Soviet regime in Lithuania introduced through education a concept of "a new man". This "new man" represented the idealistic vision of the Soviet citizen, thus he had to be indoctrinated with the specific set of values. History as a value-oriented discipline at schools, including both humanitarian and social dimensions, can be understood as one of the most appropriate school subjects for such totalitarian formation of a new man. The aim of this paper is to distinguish principal values, which were introduced to the school children at schools of late Soviet Lithuania (1957-1988) during history education. It is pivotal to note, that Soviet control in Lithuania is understood as an occupational and suppressive regime. Also, it was a regime of idiosyncrasies, so the contents of the aforementioned educational materials are analyzed in two-layered principle – the direct instructions regarding the lifestyle, values, and opinions appropriate to Soviet citizens and more subtle (through symbols, images, and politics of national Communism) indoctrination. This paper raises a hypothesis that Lithuanian break up with the Soviet Union in 1990 has left traces in current Lithuanian education because it was recreated mostly by the same people, who were instructed in the Soviet value system. People educated as "the new Soviet men" created a new Lithuanian history education curriculum, thus aspiring to prompt "a new Lithuanian man".

Keywords: education, history, Soviet regime, Lithuania, textbooks

Introduction

In the 1960s Soviet regime in Lithuania introduced a concept of promoting a new man through education. This "new man" had to represent the ideal vision of the Soviet citizen, so he had to be indoctrinated with the specific set of values. This idea was neither new nor controversial at that time – it had been already proposed in the Soviet Union in the 1920s (Martin, 2001; Grant, 1979). However, it extended to the Lithuanian field of education only in the 1960s, because after the second Soviet occupation in the year 1945, it required almost two decades for the experimental reformed educational system (especially regarding history education) to be introduced to the public (Pilkauskas, 1965, pp. 49-51). The period of 1945-1957 was a specific, so-called "limbo" period in Soviet Lithuanian history education. At that time all materials from the non-Communist Lithuanian interwar period were considered ideologically unfit for the education of the Soviet citizen. Nevertheless, new materials came to life very slowly due to the harsh economic and social conditions after the Second World War and during the partisan war (1945-1953) for independent Lithuania.

History as a specific discipline at schools, including both humanitarian and social dimensions, was understood as one of the most appropriate school subjects for such totalitarian formation of a new man. The aim of this paper is to distinguish

primary values, which were introduced to the schoolchildren in schools of late Soviet Lithuania (1957-1988) during history lessons. In Soviet Lithuania as in most other Soviet republics alike, there were separate educational programs and textbooks for explaining World history, history of the Soviet Union and history of Soviet Lithuania. These three groups of textbooks released in Soviet Lithuania and programs for education at schools in Soviet Lithuania are analyzed in this paper while seeking to identify formal value indoctrination of the new Soviet man in Lithuania. It is meaningful to note, that in this context the Soviet government in Lithuania is understood as an occupational and suppressive regime. It was also a regime of idiosyncrasies, so the contents of the aforementioned educational materials are analyzed in two-layered principle – the direct instructions regarding the lifestyle, values, and opinions appropriate to Soviet citizens and more subtle (through symbols, images, and politics of national communism) indoctrination.

The lack of spontaneity

While talking about the educational system of any state or any period, firstly, it is significant to note it never exists in a social vacuum. The educational system represents a compromise between specific ideological aims and apparent needs of the society of that time. Theoretically, in the well-functioning state, whose authorities are ready to discuss the needs of its people, the educational system reflects ideas and understanding of most of the society. At the same theoretical level Soviet regime in Lithuania by the Soviet government itself was not considered as an occupational regime. The Communist ideology was represented by the government as a project for an ideal society.

However, the practice was indeed considerably conflicting. It is clear, that there was a dichotomy between the goals of the Soviet educational system and the needs of occupied Lithuanian people. In this context the crucial issue I aim to emphasize is the orientation of teaching towards fiction and simply ignoring reality. The general line of educational narrative presented the will of Lithuanians to remain a part of the Soviet Union whilst Lithuanian society, in general, understood itself as an occupied nation and state. Soviet government, unlike many of the democratic governments in the world, did not try to obscure the fact, that they regarded the educational system as a means to spread their ideology in society.

This fact was even highlighted and other purposes of the educational system regarding the value formation matters had been ignored (Grant, 1979, p. 26). History in the education of Soviet society was used both as the way of developing a specific Soviet lifestyle – the fight between the bourgeois and proletariat comprised the main line of historical narrative. It served as a means of creating an understanding of the unspontaneous and self-determined images of the history and that of daily life as well. Fundamental Communist ideals unrelated directly to historical description and important only for value indoctrination were incorporated into historical textbook narrative, especially while promoting Communism as a sole ideal way of living: “the human being is differed from the animals only by his work” (Jurginis, 1961, p. 5) or about the generalized history before the Communism: “all people were alike in their harsh and miserable lives” (Jurginis, 1961, p. 7). Textbooks of the history of Soviet Lithuania highlighted the birth of the socialist nation as a modern and better-developed construct of society. The socialist nation of Lithuanians through formal

textbook narrative became highly attached to the Soviet Union and Communist ideology: "socialist Lithuanian nation was formed after socialism had been established. It founded a historically new national community, which is currently able to resolve complex issues of creation of communist society" (Navickas & Žepkaitė, 1981, p. 143).

As follows, the first and prime value we recognize in the historical narrative of Soviet history textbooks is the stability and lack of spontaneity. Historically based on ideas of Marxism and Leninism everything was explained by interconnected events, which are like a flow of the river – they lead from one to another fostering an illusion, that the current situation is determined by history (and not by people). In this way society or nation is considered irresponsible for the events in their country, region or the world – and the creation of irresponsible masses led by the leaders, who understand so-called historical "flow" begins there.

Simplification of life and simplification of reasoning

Soviet history education programs emphasized the simplification of historical narrative and this idea of simplification was introduced as catering to the needs of students[1]. Methodological regulations for teachers also highlighted presentation of the most significant historical event or fact separately from any contextual information and teachers were encouraged to provide simplified generalizations[2]. The basis of soviet history education programs represented the knowledge of selected historical facts that worked as a specific simulation of truth. The role of history teacher as a passive mediator of textbooks materials was also minimized because programs constantly suggested "instructing pupils to learn part of the understandable text from the textbooks at home"[3]. So only strictly sanctioned history textbooks remained as the core required element of history education. Although researcher of Soviet republics education in Caucasia, V. Rouvinski, notes that methodological recommendations for history teaching in separate soviet republics encouraged teachers to employ supplementary materials and thus it enabled broader understanding of local histories in comparison to the general history of Soviet Union (Rouvinski, 2007), it is frequently unclear if and how teachers indeed exploited this possibility.

In that respect, we must acknowledge the importance of the teacher's personality, his or her ideological inclinations and fear of the regime as well. As history teaching was understood as a necessary ideological weapon, historians and history teachers even after destalinization were considered by the Communist Party as potentially ideologically dangerous people. This resulted in that they had been monitored and controlled more strictly than teachers of other subjects.

To such a degree, although local history education programs enabled teachers to improvise a little bit more, the constant control from the Party made this possibility only an illusion of freedom, which was self-censored by cautious teachers themselves.

[1] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl., 1988. p. 8.
[2] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl., 1988. p. 8.
[3] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl., 1988. p. 10.

Ethnoculture instead of the culture

Soviet doctrine used ethno-national elements in Soviet Lithuanian history education programs, which stated that history had to develop "respect for national pride and national culture" and at the same time "fight against nationalist elements"[4] or "discipline students in the spirit of peace and collaboration, against discrimination and racial inequality, genocide and fascism"[5]. Both Lenin and Stalin established in their works a separation between unwelcome nationalism of "ruling-nations" and legitimate nationalism of "victim-nations" which shall pass as Communism will become universal (Martin, 2001). The dichotomy of these two notions of nationalism was used in the educational programs for history in Lithuania ("spirit of Soviet patriotism and socialist internationalism"[6] or "Soviet patriotism as a higher level patriotism"[7]) as well as in the textbooks, where only those Lithuanian cultural achievements were emphasized that were considered as coherent with the universal plan of socialist state (for instance, "works of S. Stanevičius and S. Daukantas encouraged to respect mother-tongue and own nationality, to learn about ones past" (Jurginis & Pilkauskas, 1967, p. 41). While the so-called negative nationalism was suppressed, we can distinguish the use of the Lithuanian national element as a facade for a successful boasting of Soviet ideology. These two elements were constantly represented as interrelated. This specific use of Lithuanian national elements in other spheres of daily life to promote newly formed Soviet Lithuanian identity has been already noticed and discussed by several Lithuanian researchers (Vaiseta, 2014; Streikus, 2018; Putinaitė, 2019).

Victimization and the need to be rescued

If we would look at the history textbook of Soviet Lithuania as a work of fiction (as it was) or simply as to the narrative presented in the novel, and we would like to distinguish main characters of the narrative, we would certainly notice, that not Lithuanians, whose history supposed to be represented, were the main actors of this story, but Russians as a nation (not Soviets *per se*). According to this narrative Russians saved Lithuania not only in 1940 and in 1944, but in various historical periods and circumstances, thus 1940 became a symbolical date in this continuation of historical events. So the events of the year 1940 was legitimized as a historically determined "coming together". Lithuanians remained the victims in this narrative, determined to be where they were at that moment and unable to execute any independent decisions. However, Soviet Lithuanian history textbooks, as still oriented towards only Lithuanians, could be considered as more subtle on the presentation of the historically determined ethnical hierarchy. If we would compare them to the textbooks of the general history of the Soviet Union, it would represent how the game of Soviet history politics was played in practice – in the same textbook narrative, it stated that "Russian nations have learned a lot from each other", and then in the further text it indeed explained (or *Soviet-plained*) who learned from who – "The books of great Russian writers, works of the progressive

[4] Aštuonmečių, vidurinių ir vakarinių (pamaininių) mokyklų programos. Istorija. IV-XI kl., 1978. p. 3.
[5] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl. 1988. p. 5.
[6] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl., 1988. p. 5.
[7] Aštuonmečių, vidurinių ir vakarinių (pamaininių) mokyklų programos. Istorija. IV-XI kl., 1981, p. 14.

scholars became more available to the educated masses of all nations living in Russia" (Golubeva & Geleršteinas, 1978, p. 85). In this context, it is significant, that both in history education programs and history textbooks there was a division between the Russian nation as a hero (singular) ("The old Russian nation constitutes the basis for the three brotherly nations – Russians, Ukrainians, and Byelorussians"[8] or "The fight of the Russian nation and Baltic nations with the aggression of German and Swede feudalism"[9]) and Russian nations (plural) as victims to be saved and educated ("the importance of the progressive Russian culture to the development of culture of Russian nations"[10]). Thus, it was firstly eliminating cultural independence of so-called Russian nations and then – denying the idea of their political independence.

The constant fear of the "other"

Every so often in the Soviet textbooks "the other" was clearly identified as a German and sometimes it remained under the mysterious cover of "the foreigner". This "foreigner" in the vocabulary of the Cold War could suggest anyone on the other side of the Iron Curtain. I believe the term *schizophrenic history* is the best one to describe this part of Soviet history education which aimed to install the fear of the "other" in the society whilst creating a unified and thus easily controlled and predicted society. In the textbooks, there was a constant emphasis on "...the common fight of nations from our State against foreign aggressors"[11]. And if this fight was presented more widely, Germans remained the fiercest historical enemies – from aggression based on religious inclinations in the 14-15th centuries to the fights for the Lithuanization of Klaipėda district against Germanization of the area, and of course the fights against Germans in the two world wars of the 20th century[12]. These territorial and cultural conflicts certainly were important while talking about the Lithuanian-German relationship in the course of history. However, their intentional representation as the most brutal conflicts in Lithuanian history added to the prevailing grand narrative of Soviet Union history, where the Russian nation must save Lithuanians (as well as others) from the foreign aggressors from the West[13]. It is paradoxical, considering the Cold War status, but in the diverse ideological contexts of Wild West than in American history, the peculiar kind of Wild West existed as an idea in the Soviet Union as well.

Next to the image of the foreign enemy in Soviet history education stood an unprecedented kind of enemy – the idea of the enemy as anyone who is richer, more powerful (but not in the Soviet government) and differs from the idea of proletarian society. There was a mistrust built regarding anyone who lived considerably better than their neighbors, suggesting, that it was impossible without foul deeds. And in Soviet society, this kind of mistrust genuinely had a basis. However, it is questionable, if we can speak about the comparable situation before the Soviet regime in Lithuania as it was presented in the Soviet period textbooks: "In this

[8] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl., 1988, p. 30.
[9] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl., 1988, p. 31.
[10] Vidurinės bendrojo lavinimo mokyklos programos. Istorija. V-XII kl., 1988, p.41.
[11] Aštuonmečių, vidurinių ir vakarinių (pamaininių) mokyklų programos. Istorija.IV-XI kl.,1983, p. 13.
[12] Aštuonmečių, vidurinių ir vakarinių (pamaininių) mokyklų programos. Istorija. IV-XI kl., 1978, p. 77.
[13] Aštuonmečių, vidurinių ir vakarinių (pamaininių) mokyklų programos. Istorija. IV-XI kl., 1983, p. 13.

society (pre-Soviet) the financially stronger one always hurt the weaker" or "the wealthy noblemen wanted to be liked by Tsarist government no matter what" (Jurginis, 1957). In that manner, everyone was instructed to look cautiously at the achievements of others and at the same time hide personal achievements in order not to be qualified as the "other" in society.

Conclusion

To summarize, we can distinguish five principal directions for formal value indoctrination in late period (1957-1988) history education in Soviet Lithuania through textbooks and educational programs:

1. Lack of spontaneity. This factor is common to all totalitarian ideologies; it only proves that Soviet ideology is not exceptional in totalitarian contexts.
2. Complexity as the unwanted characteristic of the intelligent citizen.
3. Deculturization via ethnoculturization.
4. Introducing inferiority complex of self-victimization and a value of the "big brother" in this context.
5. Constant fare of the "other". The Russians were presented not as the "other", but as the savior or allegedly better version of "the other".

These identified points of Soviet "new man" value system can be seen as starting points for the analysis of the idea of *homo sovieticus* as a specifically ideologically inclined man in Lithuania after the 1990s.

Acknowledgement

This paper is prepared within the project "Raising of the 'New Man' in Soviet schools: the case of Lithuania". Project has received funding from the Research Council of Lithuania (LMTLT), agreement No S-LIP-19-68/(1.78) SU-810.

References

Golubeva, T. & Geleršteinas, L. (1978): *TSRS Istorijos skaitiniai*. Vol. 4. Kaunas: Šviesa. [in Lithuanian]

Grant, N. (1979): *Soviet education*. England: Penguin books.

Jurginis, J. & Pilkauskas, Z. (1967): *Lietuvos TSR istorija VII-IX klasei*. Kaunas: Šviesa. [in Lithuanian]

Jurginis, J. (1957): *Lietuvos TSR istorija: vadovėlis vidurinėms mokykloms*. Kaunas: Valstybinė pedagoginės literatūros leidykla. [in Lithuanian]

Jurginis, J. (1961): *Lietuvos TSR istorija: vadovėlis vidurinėms mokykloms*. Kaunas: Valstybinė pedagoginės literatūros leidykla. [in Lithuanian]

Martin, T. (2001): *The Affirmative Action Empire: nations and nationalism in the Soviet Union, 1923-1939*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.

Navickas, K., Žepkaitė, R. & Surblys, K. (1981): *Lietuvos TSR istorija*, *10-11*. Kaunas: Šviesa. [in Lithuanian]

Pilkauskas, Z. (1965): Lietuvos TSR istorijos dėstymo bendro lavinimosi mokyklose vystymosi bruožai (1940-1965). *Kai kurie pedagoginės minties ir švietimo istorijos klausimai. Pranešimų tezės*, 49-51. [in Lithuanian]

Putinaitė, N. (2019): *Skambantis molis. Dainų šventės ir Justino Marcinkevičiaus trilogija kaip sovietinio lietuviškumo ramsčiai*. Vilnius: Lietuvių katalikų mokslo akademija. [in Lithuanian]

Rouvinski, V. (2007): Ethnic Enclosure in Soviet and Post-Soviet School Textbooks. The Humanities: Peace Studies and Peace Discourse in Education. *Vestnik of the Tomsk State Pedagogical University*, 1(64), 1-12.

Sirutavičius, V. (2012): Tautinis komunizmas ir jo raiška. Istoriografiniai problemos aspektai. *„Istorija". Mokslo darbai*. 87 tomas, 48-58. [in Lithuanian]

Slezkine, Y. (1994): The USSR as a Communal Apartment, or How a socialist state promoted ethnic particularism. *Slavic review,* 53(2), 414-452.

Streikus, A. (2018): *Minties kolektyvizacija. Cenzūra sovietų Lietuvoje*. Vilnius: Naujasis Židinys-Aidai. [in Lithuanian]

Vaiseta, T. (2014): *Nuobodulio visuomenė. Kasdienybė ir ideologija vėlyvuoju sovietmečiu (1964-1984).* Vilnius: Lietuvių katalikų mokslo akademija. [in Lithuanian]

Dr. Akvilė Naudžiūnienė, Vilnius University, Lithuania

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Part 2
International Organizations and Education

Louw de Beer, Deon Vos & Jeannine Myburgh

Homeschooling in the BRICS Members States: A Comparative Study

Abstract

Homeschooling is an alternative method of teaching where parents take the responsibility of education and teach their children at home. This method of education is increasing worldwide. Various authorities around the world have taken note of this trend and recognized homeschooling as an alternative method of education in their legislation. The paper examines the educational policy and practice of homeschooling in the BRICS countries (Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa) through a literature study, with the aim of comparing the five countries to hit. It also looks at what the BRICS countries can learn from each other regarding homeschooling. Most of the BRICS countries have education law that does not provide for homeschooling. In the countries where homeownership is legal, there are strict requirements that must be met. These requirements place a heavy burden on home school parents. However, it is clear from the investigation that homeschooling is increasing in the BRICS countries legally and illegally. There are also other similarities arising from the study.

Keywords: BRICS countries, education system policy and practice, homeschooling

Introduction

Rademeyer (2015) states the following unequivocally that homeschooling is one of the most controversial educational issues in South Africa and that parents, educationalists and education experts can differ greatly from one another. These differing views are probably partly due to the unfamiliarity of the nature and context of homeschooling, within and outside the educational community, as well as at national and international levels. There is little empirical data available on homeschooling in the BRICS countries, so this paper concentrates on homeschooling in the BRICS countries. In order to contribute to the better dissemination of knowledge and information regarding the practice of homeschooling, this paper focuses specifically on the comparison between education policy and practice of homeschooling in the BRICS countries. A literature study serves as the basis for the comparison between Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa.

Homeschooling

A variety of homeschooling definitions are available in the literature. Most of this is in line with the fact that the parent takes on the responsibility of teaching the child at home, outside the national school system. Homeschooling is defined by Vieux (2014, p. 556) as schooling that occurs outside of an institutional school setting and where parents are responsible for providing their children. According to Louw (1992, p. 356), at least one of the parents in the family accepts full responsibility for the teaching and learning of their children. This teaching and learning are usually done by the mother without any compensation from the state. Therefore, children who are taught at home do not attend public or private schools at all.

Homeschooling in the BRICS countries

The purpose of this section is to compare the BRIGS countries' experiences with regard to the homeschooling. Some of the main points discussed by Kostelecka (2008, pp. 451-458), in her study on the legal status of homeschooling in the post-Communist countries of Central Europe, will serve as a framework for this section. Comparisons will be made between the BRIGS countries to answer the following questions: What is the official point of view regarding homeschooling in each of the BRIGS countries? Who can receive homeschooling and what prerequisites must be met? What are the reasons why parents prefer homeschooling to formal schooling? What is the scope of homeschooling? How is the quality of education that children receive in-home education regulated?

The prerequisites for homeschooling

Of the five BRICS countries, homeschooling was legalized in only two of the countries, namely in South Africa and Russia.

In terms of section 3 of the South African Schools Act, 84 of 1996, every child is obliged to attend school from the first school day of the year in which he/she turns seven to the last day of the school year in which he/she turns fifteen or has passed grade 9, whichever happens first. However, section 51 of the same Act makes it clear that parents who want to teach their children at home must apply to the Head of the Provincial Department of Education to register their children with the department.

If the head of the department is satisfied with the following requirements, he/she must register the child for homeschooling with the Department of Education (section 51 of the South African Schools Act, 84 of 1996):

- If the registration for homeschooling is in the best interests of the child;
- If the education that the child will receive at home meets the minimum requirements of the public-school curriculum;
- The parents will comply with any other conditions set by the Head of the Department of Education.

Children who still receive homeschooling after grade 9 have several options for obtaining a matric certificate. Academic matriculation remains the most popular way among homeschoolers and can be obtained in two ways, among others, South

African Matric and Cambridge Matric (SA Homeschoolers, 2020). In addition to the academic matriculation certificate, homeschoolers can also complete an adult matriculation certificate. In Russia, learners are required to attend school from the age of six, and not older than eight years, until the end of the year, they turn fifteen (Article 19 of the Federal Education Act of Russia no. 3266.1 of 1992). Learners under the age of six to over 15 can be taught at home, provided they follow the federal standards of education (For Family Rights, 2015). Other curricula may be used to supplement the official curriculum (For Family Rights, 2015). In Russia they use the concept self-education which is similar to home-schooling. There are different forms of self-education and each form has its own conditions that must be met, namely (Melnikov, 2010):

- Family Education. These learners are enrolled in a local school but are taught at home by their parents.
- "Externship" is much like family education. The relationship between the school and the family is regulated by an order of the principal.
- Homeschooling is a third form that is also common. In Russia, this term does not mean the same as in other parts of the world. It refers to learners being taught at home by a teacher because of serious illness or physical disabilities. Regardless of the form of homeschooling that parents give to their children, the parents must inform the municipal authority of their choice and their children still must take regular exams in order to obtain a high school diploma (Melnikov, 2010).

In India, there are no clear guidelines or laws regarding homeschooling. Therefore, it can't be clearly determined who may not be taught at home (HSLDA, 2010). In China and Brazil, homeschooling is illegal, and no one should receive homeschooling. If children are taught when at home, it is illegal (Guo-ping, 2014; Prado, 2016).

Homeschooling in BRICS

The number of children being taught at home in the BRICS countries varies from country to country. Despite the growing number of children being taught at home, it is safe to claim that the number of children involved is relatively small to the school-going population. It can be assumed that South Africa has the largest number of children being taught at home. Homeschooling in South Africa is growing phenomenally. The legal fund for home education in South Africa, namely the manager of the Pestalozzi Trust, van Oostrum (2013, p. 11), believes there could be between 30,000 and 90,000 learners receiving homeschooling in South Africa. Homeschooling in Russia is a growing trend (Shamolina, 2016) and it is referred to as "family education" (HSLDA, 2016). The total number of homeschooled children is estimated at a maximum of 75,000, representing about 0.5% of the total of 14.1 million school-aged children in Russia (Shamolina, 2016).

Determining the true numbers of homeschoolers in Brazil, China and India is difficult. As is homeschooling in an uncertain area regarding its legalization, there is growing interest in homeschooling as an alternative way of education (HSLDA, 2010). Homeschooling is not legally mandatory in this country (HSLDA, 2010). The literature indicates that there is a growth in the number of children receiving

homeschooling in the BRICS countries. It is still relatively small to the total school-going population but is growing at a rate that requires authorities not to avoid the potential impact of homeschooling in their country.

Homeschooling challenges

The general public believes that children in homeschooling do not socialize. For the wider community, this can be considered an obstacle. However, children who receive homeschooling are convinced that this is not the case and that they are given more than enough opportunities to socialize (Van Schoor, 1999, pp. 206-207). In the BRICS countries there are many other diverse, yet similar, obstacles that homeschooling families must overcome. For example, the legal uncertainty of homeschooling in Brazil is a cause of the following obstacles that homeschooling families must overcome (De Holanda, 2012):

- Firstly, there is the condemnation and criticism they receive from family, friends, and experts (because it is a strange/illegal phenomenon);
- Secondly, there is a lack of curriculum providers and educational guidelines that meet their unique educational needs;
- Many parents are afraid to expose themselves as homeschooling supporters and to communicate with other parents about it in that context.

Until homeschooling is declared legal or illegal in Brazil, these uncertainties will continue to exist. Although homeschooling is a growing trend in Russia (Shamolina, 2016) and the law supports parents' rights, however, many parents feel that choosing to use family education can be a major administrative obstacle and not user-friendly (Melnikov, 2010). A well-known homeschooling parent, Saju Joseph (2015) from India also mentions some challenges he and other homeschooling parents face. Among these obstacles, he mentions the constant energy it takes to teach children at home – there must be daily planning and new activities devised to keep children productive. Parents should always be willing to listen, play and not become anxious when children understand certain concepts more slowly.

According to Terry (2013), parents who prefer homeschooling in China have major concerns with which they are struggling. In China, the one-child policy ensures that almost all parents have only one child and this child becomes the focus of his parent's and grandparents' ambitions and dreams. The custom in China is that this child's future also determines his entire family's future because he/she must care for them one day. With such a large population as China has, competition is strong and access to colleges and universities is severely restricted. Access to a good university is considered the pinnacle of a successful childhood. With the choice of homeschooling, parents can run the risk of not achieving these dreams and ideals for their child. Children who are homeschooled in China are unable to take the standardized high school exams, which may, among other things, prevent him/her from writing the compulsory entrance exam required to be admitted to a university in China (Terry, 2013). Another obstacle that stems from the one-child policy is the fact that socialization is minimized if homeschooling is preferred because there are no siblings. Socialization usually takes place at schools, which in the case of homeschooling do not materialize (Zhao & Badzis, 2014, p. 19). In the study by Zhao and Badzis (2014, p. 20), homeschooling families also identified the lack of

appropriate homeschooling curricula and poor publicity of homeschooling as an educational option and the legalization of homeschooling as additional barriers.

Although homeschooling in South Africa is legal, there is still confusion and questions from parents who are considering teaching their children at home. Breytenbach (2013) mentions an important obstacle facing parents of homeschooling families in South Africa. Parents fear that they will not be able to meet their children's educational needs and that they will fail. They fear what the public outside of them thinks. There is little public recognition and parents are under pressure not to doubt their affection and the value of homeschooling for their family. According to the brochure of the Pestalozzi Trust, the legal fund for homeschoolers in Southern Africa, another obstacle for homeschooling families is the legal consideration of homeschooling. To register or not to register with the Department of Education?

If the BRICS countries are compared in terms of the barriers to homeschooling, it can be concluded that there is generally a fear among parents about the choice of homeschooling for their children. In many of the BRICS countries, there is a shortage of curriculum providers and in the countries where homeschooling is legal, the administrative burden is very high.

BRICS countries cooperation regarding homeschooling

Through this study, it was possible to identify one BRICS country that serves as a forerunner in terms of family versus home education as a human rights choice of education. The authorities of Russia have a very open attitude towards homeschooling and had already legalized this method of education in 1992. The way in which Russia exercises control over the conduct of children who are taught at home is something that another four BRICS countries can learn. However, Russia's regulation of homeschooling is strict and all children receiving homeschooling are still required to enroll in a school. These schools serve as supervisory bodies to ensure that children who were taught at home, still receive a good standard of education. South Africa already has similar legislation in place, but it is centralized in nature and lacks the management of this legislation at the provincial level. Brazil, India, China and South Africa can learn more about homeschooling in Russia in terms of developing legislation and requirements that need to be met, as well as the regulation of quality education that children receiving homeschooling receive.

Conclusion

Each BRICS country has its own sense of homeschooling. Compared to the international trend regarding homeschooling, only Russia and South Africa have already acknowledged homeschooling in their education legislation. Homeschooling is growing worldwide, and more and more homeschooling groups and organizations are turning to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights to fight for the right to this alternative method of education. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (United Nations General Assembly, 1948) explicitly states that the family has the full right to decide on the type of education and education that their children should receive. This is also the right most of the parents who teach their children at home (in countries where it is not yet legal). Most of the BRICS countries still have a

conservative view on education in general and have a closed education system where homeschooling is not yet accepted as an alternative method of teaching. Most countries do not consider this an essential provision of education. In the case of South Africa and Russia, the authorities in the early 1990s adapted their education laws to provide for the choice of homeschooling, under strict conditions. However, Russia's legislation is designed to make it easier for children to be taught at home. Authorities that have not yet provided for homeschooling as an alternative method of education should realize that parents will be unlawfully exercising this universal right to homeschooling. Authorities that do not recognize homeschooling will never be able to fulfill their state duty of quality education if this remains the case. There will always be parents who prefer homeschooling for their children and that number is growing every year in all BRICS countries. Homeschooling is here to stay. The biggest problem facing the BRICS countries is the regulation of homeschoolers and the quality of education these children receive. One recommendation that can be made is, in the case of Russia, to legally recognize this method of education and to put regulatory bodies in place to ensure that quality education is available to all.

References

Breytenbach, B. (2013): *Homeschooling lets you in*. Home schooling. https://www.home-teaching.co.za/blogs/postIThome-teaching-you-incoming/home-teaching-blog (Accessed 2 September 2016).

De Holanda, A. (2012): Home education in Brazil: legal status, data, opportunities and challenges. Presentation presented at the International Home-schooling Conference 2012. http://www.ghec2012.org/cms/sites/defauIUfiles/Holanda_Around%20the%20World.pdf (Accessed 8 June 2019).

For Family Rights (2015): *Legal Basis for Home Education in the Russian Federation*. HLSDA. http://www.hslda.org/hs/international/Russia/201503200.asp (Accessed 13 July 2019).

Guo-ping, Z. (2014): A qualitative study of educational needs of home-schooling families in China. *US-China Education Review*, 4(6), 391-400.

HSLDA (2010): *Home-schooling: Legal in India*. http://www.hslda.org/hs/international/lndia/201009160.asp (Accessed 18 May 2019).

HSLDA (2010): *Brazil: Families Hope for a Home-school Amendment*. www.hslda.org/hs/internationaI/BraziI/201207170.asp (Accessed 20 September 2019).

HSLDA (2016): *Home-schooling: India*. http://www.hslda.org/hs/international/lndia/default.asp (Accessed 6 August 2019).

Joseph, S. (2015): *Indian Father Shares Home-schooling Challenges*. HSLDA. http://www.hslda.org/hs/international/lndia/20151207.asp (Accessed 20 September 2018).

Kostelecka, Y. (2008): The legal status of home education in post-communist countries of Central Europe. *International Review of Education*, 58(4), 445-463.

Louw, G. J. J. (1992): The home-school - A form of alternative education. *Rate*, 57(3), 355-372.

Melnikov, K. (2010): Home-schooling in Russia. *The Old Schoolhouse Magazine*, Spring, 32-34.

Prado, C. (2016): Homeschooling gains strength in Brazil and seeks legalization. *Gazeta do Povo*. http://www.gazetadopovo.com.br/educacao/educacao-domiciliar-ganha_forca_no-brasil-e-busca-legalizacao-7wvulatmkslazdhwncstr7tco (Accessed 16 June 2019).

Rademeyer, A. (2015): Home-schooling: Yes or No? *Maroela Media*, 18 March 2015. http://maroelamedia.co.za/bIOg/goodgoods/parenting/homeEducation-year-new (Accessed 11 February 2019).

SA Homeschoolers (2020): *Matric overview*. https://www.sahomeschoolers.org/matric/matric-overview.html (Accessed 2 March 2020).

Shamolina, I. (2016): Home education around the world: Struggles, successes, and strategies. Presentation presented at the International Home-schooling Conference. https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLlnNEcPjg5O6xvSd8FZD6KauzONXfSKE3 (Accessed 10 March 2019).

Terry, R. (2013): *Homeschool's New Day in China*. http://www.crosswalk.com/family/homeschool/high-school/homeschool-s-new-day-in-china.html (Accessed 30 September 2019).

United Nations General Assembly (1948): *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*. http://www.un.org/en/udhrbook/pdf/udhr_booklet_en_web.pdf (Accessed 20 September 2019).

Van Oostrum, L. (2013): Homeschooling running into heavy weather. *Pestalozzi Trust*, 15(1), 11-13. http://www.hslda.org/hs/international/SouthAfrica/Jan2014.pdf (Accessed 10 February 2019).

Van Schoor, J. H. (1999): Home-schooling in Post-Apartheid South Africa. Unpublished M.Ed., University of the Orange Free State.

Vieux, A. (2014): The politics of homeschool's: religious conservatives and regulation requirements. *The Social Science Journal*, 51(4), 556-562.

Zhao, J. & Badzis, M. (2014): Parents' perspectives on home-schooling in Chinese Mainland. *International Proceedings of Economics Development and Research*, 78, 17-21. http://www.ipedr.com/vol78/004-ICSEP2014-S00014.pdf (Accessed 18 June 2019).

Dr. Louw De Beer, North-West University, South Africa

Dr. Deon Vos, North-West University, South Africa

Mrs. Jeannine Myburgh, Homeschooler, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Deon Vos, Hennie Steyn, Louw de Beer, Charl Wolhuter & Indra Persaud

Teaching as a Career Choice: Comparing the Persistent Challenges in South Africa and Seychelles

Abstract

Both Seychelles and South Africa are experiencing serious challenges with regard to providing for the need to employ the required number and quality of teachers – needs that are differentiated according to specific areas of competencies. In the paper, it is argued that each of the education systems of these two countries should have a well-planned recruitment strategy and particular attention should be paid to preparing a recruitment message that will attract possible candidates. Each of the education systems has been found to be lacking in several aspects of the recruitment message, such as the social status of the teaching profession and the comparison of teachers' remuneration. It has been found that South Africa is better placed than Seychelles in respect of only two factors, namely teacher training opportunities and better comparable remuneration packages of teachers in South Africa. It is clear that all of the stakeholders should be involved in the recruitment of teachers. Other developing education systems can learn from the experiences of the two countries.

Keywords: recruitment, teachers, education systems, teaching profession in Seychelles, teaching profession in South Africa

Introduction

The availability of the required differentiated number and quality of teachers depends on the correct planning of the required teacher cohort, the continuous implementation of a carefully planned recruitment and selection strategy, and the availability of suitable and sufficient preservice and in-service training opportunities for prospective and practising teachers. The recruitment message should include particular information concerning the following: the status of teaching as a profession in the respective countries; the availability of employment for teachers in both of the education systems; the levels of teachers' remuneration; the nature of the available education infrastructure; challenges regarding the languages of teaching and learning; the qualifications and training opportunities that are available; the learners' discipline; and the professional conduct of teachers (Gore et al., 2015).

Recruitment of teachers

Recruiters should use applicable methodologies to communicate with possible candidates and especially consider using Internet-based technologies (Chungyalpa & Karishma, 2016, p. 5).

The following factors are important: the status of the profession; the availability of employment positions; the levels of remuneration in relation to comparable professions; preservice and in-service training opportunities and funding of such

training; and the general positive and negative characteristics of the profession (Gore et al., 2015).

The status of teaching as a profession

All professionals want to be respected in the community when juxtaposed with other professions, and teaching professionals are not an exception. Historically, teachers were highly regarded in the community and often served in leadership positions. However, currently, teaching is quite often regarded as an 'ordinary' career that does not deserve particular respect (Kassiem, 2007). This trend will obviously influence the appeal of teaching as a career choice.

Remuneration of teachers

An increase in the cost of living is a reality across the world and poses significant challenges to the lower- and middle-income groups. Teachers' compensation packages vary between countries but, in general, teachers are categorised as being in the middle-income groups, and in some countries even in the lower-income groups. Young prospective professionals compare the remunerations of different careers before they make decisions regarding their career choice. In order to be able to compare the income of teachers in the two countries, it is important to compare it to particular income numbers.

The level of learner discipline

The general perceptions about a specific profession and the articulated experiences of professionals in that profession determine the decision of interested individuals to choose that particular profession as a career. It is an indisputable fact that an environment with poor learner discipline limits quality teaching and learning and leads to difficult work conditions for teachers (Oosthuizen, 2015; Wolhuter & Steyn, 2003). The learners' quality of discipline has a significant impact on the school environment and will negatively influence the level to which possible newly interested individuals consider the teaching profession as a career (Kassiem, 2007; Rademeyer, 2014). Learner discipline is a significant source of concern. In both countries, incidents have been reported where learners and parents have threatened teachers and have even used physical violence against them. These tendencies are some of the reasons why young prospective candidates hesitate to enter the teaching profession.

The language of teaching and learning

The majority of teachers prefer to teach in the language in which they are the best qualified and proficient. Teachers usually perform with increased productivity when they teach in their home language or first language. The language proficiency of the teacher is even more important in teaching subjects with a specialised vocabulary, such as science, mathematics, or technology. Needless to say, teachers experience much frustration and the quality of teaching and learning is severely compromised if they are not proficient in the language in which the learners ought to be taught. This often occurs in education systems that are characterised by multilingualism, and the more so in cases where the learners themselves are not proficient in the language of teaching and learning either (Van Rensburg, 2006, p.

98). Thus, it stands to reason that many teachers who are expected to teach in a second language could easily leave the teaching profession and take up another career in which they could use their mother tongue as a medium of functioning in the workplace.

As a result of French and British influences on the history of Seychelles, although many people are fluent in English and French, most people have a French-based creole as their home language. Contemporary Seychellois Creole has gradually been influenced more by English, which has led to a further mixing of languages. The official languages of instruction at the primary level are predominantly English, with some French and Creole. At the secondary level, the official language of teaching and learning is English, relegating Creole to non-academic status. This fact has a negative influence on the effective use of Creole as a language of teaching and learning. Recognising this trend, it can be reasoned that many teachers may not consider teaching at upper primary or secondary levels since Creole is not officially recognised or valued in the education system. The dominance of English as the language of teaching and learning could explain the difficulty in finding Seychellois teachers who are proficient enough to teach, using English (Mahoune, 2018).

South Africa has 11 official languages, and sign language is now also accepted as a language in its own right. In terms of the South African Constitution (South Africa, Act 108 of 1996) and the South African Schools Act (South Africa, Act 84 of 1996), the learner's mother tongue is acknowledged as his or her language of teaching and learning, provided that it is feasible and attainable to use it as language of teaching and learning. This means that learners of minority groups would probably not be taught in their mother tongue. In the South African context, it is neither economically nor administratively possible to use all 11 languages as languages of teaching and learning in one school. Also, not all 11 languages have been developed to a level where they can be used as languages of teaching and learning. Furthermore, there are not enough trained teachers who can teach all the subjects in all 11 languages (Steyn et al., 2017).

The reality is that a diversity of languages is used in the communities of Seychelles and South Africa. In both countries, strategies are being implemented to use these languages as languages of teaching and learning, but with little effect. In both countries, the tendency is to use one language, namely English, as the medium of teaching, at least at the level of post-primary education. This, however, significantly complicates the work of the teachers. Parents and teaching authorities put considerable pressure on teachers to ensure that learners perform well academically. Thus, if a teacher is not proficient in the language of teaching and learning, the frustration of the teacher is increased. This reality in both countries may cause teachers to leave the profession and discourage young, interested candidates from considering teaching as a profession.

The conduct and behaviour of teachers

The media often reports on members of professions who transgress the relevant professional codes, and the teaching profession is no exclusion (Parfitt, 2017). It also happens that teachers are guilty of making undesirable and insensitive remarks on social media about teaching, their colleagues, the parents, or their learners, which

adds to the negative image of the teaching profession. Corruption, physical assault, sexual assault, truancy, incompetency, and unlawful remarks are further examples of negative cases reported on teachers' conduct (Maqhina, 2017).

In Seychelles, a report noted a concern about the conduct of learners and teachers with regard to a lack of mutual respect, problems with discipline, and a lack of responsibility (Bonne, 2016). The dedication of teachers towards education in Seychelles is a complex phenomenon and the development thereof should be actively supported in order to establish a professional, value-based dedication in the ranks of the teaching corps, especially in the case of beginner teachers.

In the South African context, it has been found that some teachers are not role models to their learners and should rather not teach (Wolhuter et al., 2012, p. 30). The South African Council for Educators is concerned about the drastic increase in the number and seriousness of complaints of physical and sexual offences against teachers which the Council is currently investigating (Jordaan, 2017; Mngadi, 2017; Oosthuizen, 2015). The following are some of the alleged complaints against teachers that have been received: corporal punishment, sexual offences, mismanagement, fraud, and violence against colleagues (Magwedge, 2017; Wakefield, 2015). The discussion indicates that in both countries, the concern is being expressed about the conduct and behaviour of teachers.

Findings

The social status of teachers has an impact – positively or negatively – on the image of the teaching profession. The social status of teachers in both countries has been found wanting. The only way to improve or change the social status of teachers is to positively adjust the opinion of society towards the teaching profession. This opinion can be changed by attending to the other aspects that determine the recruitment message or inherent image of teachers, such as improving the professional conduct and behaviour of teachers, improving the level of training and competencies of teachers, increasing their remuneration, enhancing their effective work performance, and acknowledging the implicit and explicit contributions of teachers in society.

The availability of reasonable and competitive salary packages is a significant aspect that is a primary consideration for possible candidates. Competitive remuneration packages should be offered to teachers. This seems to be the case, especially in the Seychelles education system. The following aspects, among others, should be considered when remuneration is being structured: the social status of the teaching profession; the qualifications of teachers; the changes in and increasing of living costs; the compensation of comparable careers in the private sector; work hours; and the wide-ranging and diverse responsibilities of teachers (Concordia University, 2019). Remuneration in public and private schools should compare favourably.

An environment of positive learner discipline increases the quality of teachers' working life and will, without a doubt, raise the level at which possible candidates consider choosing teaching as a career. Relevant programmes should be available to capacitate all stakeholders to execute their unique roles effectively in order to create an environment of positive learner discipline. These programmes should focus on individual human rights and the agreed-upon responsibilities of all involved, either

directly or indirectly. Attainable and sustainable preventative and reactive measures to develop and maintain an environment of positive learner discipline should be incorporated in the system and available.

The language proficiency of teachers and learners is a determining aspect for developing and maintaining academic success in education. Ideally, learners have the right to an education in their language of preference, and every measure should be put in place to realise this right. If only one particular language of teaching and learning is available to learners, every measure should be applied in order to ensure that the language proficiency of both the teachers and the learners will support the expected quality of education. This is especially applicable in the case of teachers and learners whose first language is different from the available language of teaching and learning.

The professional conduct of practising teachers is considered as an important aspect to convince possible candidates to consider education as a career. Therefore, clear guidelines should be established regarding teacher conduct and behaviour, and these guidelines should be discussed regularly with all stakeholders (South African Council for Educators, 2019). Teachers should be thoroughly informed concerning what constitutes unacceptable conduct or behaviour, as well as the consequences of such conduct and behaviour. Society should also be suitably informed of what is expected from teachers. It is logical that strict action, by the Council for Educators in South Africa and the Department of Education in Seychelles, against teachers who commit professional offences is essential.

Conclusion

The two countries under discussion are facing similar challenges regarding the provisioning of the required differentiated number and quality of teachers in order to ensure the delivery of meaningful and effective education. In this paper, it has been argued that such provisioning of suitable teachers should be based on, and guided by, a well-planned recruitment strategy. The strategy consists of different elements, but special attention should be paid to the recruitment message, which should be based on correct information. The information should give clarity about the status of the teaching profession, the employment opportunities, the comparison of remuneration for similar careers, the level of teaching infrastructure, the availability of training opportunities (including the funding of training of, and support services for, teachers), the level of positive learner discipline (which determines the level of work satisfaction), how the challenges of a diversity of languages of teaching and learning are being addressed, and information concerning the nature of the professional conduct and behaviour of teachers.

The relatively poor appeal of the teaching profession to possible and suitable candidates is a matter of concern in both countries. It is the responsibility of all stakeholders to be constructively involved in all actions aimed at implementing an attainable, sustainable, affordable, and manageable recruitment programme through which the required number and quality of prospective candidates can be convinced to enter the teaching profession.

References

Bonne, M-J. (2016): The Route towards Developing our MPI. http://www.mppn.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/1-Seychelles-MPI-Prez.pdf (Accessed 16 November 2018).

Chungyalpa, W. & Karishma, T. (2016): Best Practices and Emerging Trends in Recruitment and Selection. *Journal of Entrepreneurship & Organization Management*, 5(2). https://www.omicsonline.org/open-access/best-practices-and-emerging-trends-in-recruitment-and-selection--2169-026X-1000173.php?aid=71688 (Accessed 7 May 2019).

Concordia University (2019): Average Salaries for Primary School Teachers: Six Factors that Can Make a Difference. https://education.cu-portland.edu/blog/classroom-resources/average-salaries-for-primary-school-teachers/ (Accessed 7 May 2019).

Gore, J., Holmes, R., Smith, M. & Fray, L. (2015): *Investigating the Factors that Influence the Choice of Teaching as a First Career.* Queensland: Queensland Colleges of Education.

Jordaan, N. (2017): Cases of Physical, Sexual Assault Against Teachers Have Risen: Teachers' Group. *Sunday Times,* 28 September. https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2017-09-28-cases-of-physical-and-sexual-assault-against-teachers-have-gone-up-teachers-group/ (Accessed 6 November 2018).

Kassiem, A. (2007): Discipline is a Challenge for Most Teachers. *IOL News,* 3 April. https://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/discipline-is-a-challenge-for-most-teachers-321523 (Accessed 13 November 2018).

Magwedge, H. (2017): First JHB Teacher Found Guilty of Sexual Misconduct. *Eyewitness News.* http://ewn.co.za/2017/01/19/first-on-ewn-jhb-teacher-found-guilty-of-sexual-misconduct (Accessed 16 November 2018).

Mahoune, J. C. (2018): Seychelles Creole Development and Evolution. Ministry for Youth, Sports and Culture. http://www.pfsr.org/uncategorized/seychellois-creole-development-evolution/ (Accessed 6 November 2018).

Maqhina, M. (2017): Unprofessional teachers still breaching ethics. *Cape Times*, 28 September. https://www.iol.co.za/capetimes/news/unprofessional-teachers-still-breaching-ethics-11386923 (Accessed 7 May 2010).

Mngadi, M. (2017): School Principal, Teacher Sexual Misconduct Charges. *News24*, 12 September. https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/p3-school-principal-teacher-face-sexual-misconduct-charges-20170912 (Accessed 16 November 2018).

Oosthuizen, J. (2015): Swak Dissipline Ondermyn Goeie Onderrig. *LitNet*. http://www.litnet.co.za/swak-dissipline-ondermyn-goeie-onderrig/ (Accessed 12 November 2018).

Parfitt, O. (2017): Grahamstad Onnie in Sop na Skrywes op Sosiale Media. *Netwerk24*, 2 June. https://www.netwerk24.com/Nuus/Onderwys/grahamstad-onnie-in-sop-na-skrywes-op-sosiale-media-20170602 (Accessed 18 November 2018).

Rademeyer, A. (2014): Tot 30% van Onderwysers Voel Onveilig in Skole. *Maroela Media*, 28 July. https://maroelamedia.co.za/nuus/sa-nuus/tot-30-van-onderwysers-voel-onveilig-in-skole/ (Accessed 16 November 2018).

South Africa (1996): *Constitution of the Republic of South Africa 1996*. Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa (1996): *South African Schools Act 84 of 1996*. Pretoria: Government Printer.

South African Council for Educators (2019): *Code of Professional Ethics*. https://www.sace.org.za/assets/documents/uploads/sace_58684-2018-11-22-Ethics%20brochure.pdf (Accessed 7 May 2019).

Steyn, H. J., Wolhuter, C. C., Vos, D. & De Beer, Z. L. (2017): *South African education system: Core characteristics in focus*. Potchefstroom: Keurkopié.

Van Rensburg, J. J. J. (2006): Die Keuse van 'n Taal van Leer en Onderrig in die Verdere en Hoër Onderwys in Suid-Gauteng. MEd dissertation. North-West University, Potchefstroom. https://dspace.nwu.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10394/2510/;jsessionid=CDEBCF2616B62B67B61B41B812A5B5BE?sequence=1 (Accessed 20 May 2019).

Wakefield, A. (2015): Most Complaints about Teachers Related to Corporal Punishment. SACE. *News24*, 13 September. https://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/Most-complaints-about-teachers-related-to-corporal-punishment-Sace-2015092 (Accessed 13 November 2018).

Wolhuter, C. C. & Steyn, H. J. (2003): Learner Discipline at School: A Comparative Educational Perspective. *Koers*, 68(4), 521-538.

Wolhuter, C., Steyn, H., Taole, M. J. & Geyer, W. (2012): The Dual Image of the South African Teacher. In I. Kestere, C. Wolhuter & R. Lozano (Eds.) *The Visual Image of the Teacher: International comparative perspectives* (pp. 24-33). Riga: SIA.

Dr. Deon Vos, North-West University, South Africa

Prof. Dr. Hennie Steyn, North-West University, South Africa

Prof. Dr. Charl Wolhuter, North-West University, South Africa

Dr. Louw De Beer, North-West University, South Africa

Dr. Indra Persaud, University of Seychelles, Seychelles

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Leentjie van Jaarsveld

Female School Principals in Canada and South Africa: An Overview

Abstract

Worldwide, the issue of women in school principal positions is being discussed. Discussions on this matter include, among other things, the underrepresentation and promotion opportunities of female principals, stereotyping, culture and education and competencies of women. Several studies have shown that women do not have to stand back for their male counterparts. This paper deals with the perspectives of female school principals in Canada and South Africa. The study was employed in the interpretivist paradigm, and as it aimed to explore different aspects of the leadership of female school principals, a qualitative approach was used as a vehicle to come to understand the central phenomenon shared by the 12 participating female school principals in the two countries. They were interviewed by means of semi-structured interviews through which aspects with regard to their position as school principals were revealed. The case studies showed that female principals can be regarded as effective principals.

Keywords: female, principals, leadership, schools

Introduction

Poor socio-economic conditions, violence and the conversation around equity do not seem to be confined to one continent only. That schools are influenced by these aspects is a reality. That is why Hargreaves (2019, p. 17) suggests that ethical leadership is important: "It's about creating and fighting for a positive educational and ethical environment together that removes ethical dilemmas between serving the child and complying with the system that are neither necessary nor desirable". Hargreaves and Fullan (2013, p. 36) further highlight the importance of professional capital: "Professional capital requires attention not only to political and societal investments in education but also to leadership actions and educator needs, contributions, and career stages". Following these statements, the issue of female principalship comes to the fore. Debates about female principals often ensue, especially when underrepresentation, stereotyping and their ability to act as principal are discussed. This paper focuses on these factors with regard to female school principals in Canada and South Africa. The paper commences with an overview of leadership of school principals in Canada and South Africa, followed by the methodology, discussion of results and conclusion.

School principal leadership

It is well known that the circumstances in which principals have to perform their daily work constantly fluctuate. For instance, the needs and demands in schools in a First Nations community, suburban Calgary or inner-city Toronto ask for a different

approach from principals. At the same time, township schools in South Africa, which are mostly situated in poor socio-economic circumstances, place pressure on the principals to provide the best teaching and learning with the minimum funds, a lack of resources and poor infrastructure at their disposal. Thus, whether it is Canada or South Africa under discussion, the basic challenges remain the same. Hargreaves (2019, p. 17) postulates that recent research literature identifies a number of changes influencing the work of principals in Canada. These changes are grouped in categories and address 1) school regulation changes, 2) pedagogical changes, 3) budgetary cuts, 4) changes in parents' perceptions regarding their role in education, 5) social changes, 6) demographic changes, 7) the marketisation of education, and 8) technological advancement. The question that often arises is how capable and prepared school principals, especially female principals, are to address challenges.

Male versus female school principals

Traditionally, school leadership is associated with male leaders. Historically, men come from a tradition of being dominant, and women have been subjected to this domination (Naidoo & Perumal, 2014). In addition, women were seen as mothers and were not regarded as having sufficient knowledge in the academic world. According to Eagly and Carli (2007), women find themselves in what they call a "double bond". Society expects women to portray common traits such as kindness, warmth, gentleness and concern for others, along with the assertive qualities, such as determination, guidance and confidence, that are expected of leaders. However, women have become empowered and have learnt how to balance their personal and professional responsibilities. Yet, gender bias still manifests itself in the system of patriarchy (Naidoo & Perumal, 2014). It is therefore no surprise that worldwide, women are still underrepresented in leadership positions. According to Carter and Silva (2010), three explanations are given as to why women are underrepresented in high-level leadership positions in Canada: the human capital difference; gender differences; and prejudice and discrimination against female leaders. It seems that women have less human capital investment in education, training and work experience than men.

Although it is the 21st century, the belief that "women take care and men take charge" still exists. Men are stereotyped with characteristics such as confidence, assertiveness, independence, rationality and decisiveness, whereas women are stereotyped with communal characteristics such as concern for others, sensitivity, warmth, helpfulness and nurturance. In South Africa, it is no different. Grant (2008) reports that in rural communities, women are still seen as weak and have very little credibility as leaders. On the other hand, men are seen as strong and are, therefore, associated with leadership. For this reason, women do not think they are able to act as leaders. Research conducted by Mestry and Schmidt (2012) revealed that negative bias, sexist generalisations and stereotypical myths continue to inhibit the effective application of duties and responsibilities by female principals in South African schools. According to Davids (2018, p. 160), women are underrepresented as female principals in South Africa because it is believed that women and men lead and manage differently.

Current studies on female principals include those of Steyn (2018), in which she focuses on the success of female principals in difficult circumstances. Botha's

(2018) research on female principals focuses on transformation and how schools can transform with the help of the community. In another study, Davids (2018) sheds more light on how female principals understand and perceive their identity, values and social or cultural contexts and how these affect their leadership. Netshitangani (2018) supports the issue of gender preference with regard to the appointment of principals but maintains that context plays an important role. The study also indicates that women are competent and confident in the leadership role, as opposed to what is assumed by stereotyping. However, little research is focused on how female principals experience community stereotyping and how they could maintain themselves in mixed-gender schools.

Appointment of school principals

It is evident that the appointment of school principals differs in Canada and South Africa. In Canada, all principals require formal education, which much include a Bachelor of Education degree and a Master's degree. In addition, all principals must have been a teacher instructing within a school or district setting for a minimum of five years. This five-year period of practical experience as a teacher is critical to the role of principal, as it provides them with the time needed to develop pedagogical approaches to teaching and learning that will enhance their instructional as well as evaluative leadership abilities. Canadian principals also require a minimum of three qualifications in the following four areas: primary, junior, intermediate and senior education. Coupled with the aforementioned, all current principals must have completed a certified Principal's Qualification Program (PQP) Part I and Part II. This PQP training also involves an internship. Prior to becoming a principal, one must be promoted to the position of vice-principal. In effect, he or she must be successful in this position, with a recommendation from his or her principal and superintendent of education. To be considered for the principal leadership role, the vice-principal must also have a successful employee evaluation conducted by his or her supervising principal and superintendent of education. In South Africa, the situation is different. To be appointed as the principal of a school, the minimum requirement is a REQV14 qualification (matric plus a four-year qualification and seven years' teaching experience). A prospective principal has to be registered at the South African Council for Educators. "Going through the ranks" (that is, acting as department head or deputy principal) is not necessary. Although some essential experience and skills may be of benefit to the candidate, it is not compulsory. In principle, any good teacher can thus become the principal of a school.

With the above in mind, the question often arises as to whether women are truly capable of handling the day-to-day challenges of principalship.

Methodology

The study was employed in the interpretivist paradigm. As the study aimed to explore different aspects of the leadership of female school principals, a qualitative approach was used as a vehicle to come to understand the central phenomenon shared by the female school principals (cf. Creswell, 2014, p. 16). A case study design was followed in order to gather in-depth data from female school principals for the purpose of learning more about the unknown aspects of their leadership (cf.

Leedy & Ormrod, 2013, p. 100). Using purposive sampling to gain a multifaceted perspective on female school principals' leadership, a sample of 12 female school principals in two countries – South Africa and Canada – were selected. To generate data, face-to-face, semi-structured interviews were conducted with female principals of secondary schools. Open-ended questions were asked to elicit the views and opinions of the principals (cf. Creswell, 2014, p. 181). Thematic analysis was conducted to uncover prominent themes. The data of each female school principal in each country were analysed first, followed by a cross-case analysis that allowed for generalisations across diverse contexts.

Results and discussion

Canada is seen as a developed country and South Africa as a developing country. Nevertheless, the female principals revealed similar characteristics, skills and viewpoints.

Support

Although domestic duties are primarily associated with being female, the principals' spouses unconditionally assumed these duties in support of their wives' responsibilities regarding principalship. In some cases, the spouses even gave up their work, thus providing the opportunity for their wives to become school principals. In both countries, it seems that the spouses had no problem with women being seen as breadwinners. With regard to the support from the staff, management teams and governing bodies of the schools, it was clear that the female principals were fully supported, even by their male colleagues. In fact, the female principals' peers (that is, the male principals) went out of their way to provide advice, motivation and support to them.

Acceptance

When it comes to the acceptance of women as school principals, the results showed a significant difference between Canada and South Africa. It was clear that the female principals in Canada were unconditionally accepted as principals; it seems that both women and men are equally recognised as leaders. However, when it comes to South Africa, there is a deviation, especially with regard to parents, as the fathers were sceptical towards women as principals. This could possibly be attributed to the South African context, tradition and education. Principals are still strictly associated with a "man's world". The female principals acknowledged that they had to carefully consider every word before engaging in conversation with men.

Proficiency

It was clear that the female principals in both Canada and South Africa were fully qualified to act as principals. Of note, however, was the fact that the female principals in South Africa improved themselves academically with the aim of leading and managing their schools more effectively. Most of the principals obtained a postgraduate degree (an honours degree, especially with a view to legal matters, or

a master's degree in education) and a further qualification in education and management (Advanced Certificate in Education).

The female principals in this study were distributed across primary and secondary schools, some in mixed-gender schools and others in girls' schools. When they were asked whether they could adapt to a mixed school, there was no hesitation in their answers. They pointed out that as human beings, they could act as principal in any circumstances, whether in a remote, rural mixed school or a modern, urban mixed school. However, they acknowledged that they might have to adapt their management style, as a girls' school has specific characteristics that do not necessarily apply in a mixed school. It is important, however, to remember that to act as principal, particular basic skills, knowledge and attitudes are important.

Women becoming school principals

The female principals in this study were clear about why they had become principals. They agreed that female principals should become principals for factual reasons because it is not an easy task in a predominantly male world. The female principals acknowledged the role of mentorship, development and exposure in leadership positions provided by preparatory workshops and their principals. In most cases, the principals under which they had served were excellent examples of how a principal should behave, make decisions and solve problems. This made it easier for the women to accept the offer to act as principal.

Findings

The findings in this study regarding Canadian and South African female principals are not unique, but noteworthy. The perception that only male principals are mandated has faded, as female principals have become increasingly prominent. It is no longer about "female" or "male" principals, but rather about *effective leadership.* In addition, the question arises whether principals can lead in *any* circumstances, whether in an urban or a rural school and mixed, boys' or girls' schools. As leadership, especially effective and successful leadership in schools, is being scrutinised worldwide, gender is no longer important. A good leader, whether male or female, is imperative when change, challenges, diversity, inclusivity and excellent academic performance are relevant. Schools have to invest in professional capital rather than the preference for a male or a female principal. This is especially important for schools that are performing poorly or have poor economic conditions. According to Naidoo and Perumal (2014), the main challenge experienced by female principals is that in most cases, they are employed in low-performing or dysfunctional schools with a corrupt culture.

Although the above is noted, it still seems as if female principals have to work harder to prove themselves in a man's world, especially in South Africa. This statement corresponds to the claim made by Kanjere, Thaba and Teffo (2011) that there is a general impression that women are not good leaders. In this modern age, there are people who still believe that women are incapable of leading. Women in leadership positions are adversely affected by prejudice because most men are firm custodians of culture. As South Africa is characterised by diversity, culture and tradition play a very important role, especially with regard to the empowerment of women. Female leaders often start with a backlog due to a long lack of exposure to

leadership. Many studies have shown that most men oppose women in leadership. The attitude of people, especially men, will therefore first have to change, and a paradigm shift about the competence of women needs to be made. In addition, women need to develop more self-confidence to apply for leadership positions. Because of the imprinted idea that women belong at home, women do not believe in themselves.

Female principals seem to be blessed with a sixth sense that comes in handy in their role as principal. A sixth sense is advantageous, especially for problem solving and the appointment of staff members. Women usually use their intuition to make the final choice. It plays an important role in how they sum up, handle and control a situation. Female principals have a "softer" approach when guidance and management are involved, which often leads to better collaboration. In addition, the typical "mother figure" attribute contributes to their accessibility, which often leads to trust, compassion and openness. These characteristics lead to a good balance between task orientation and human orientation.

A good support network is of the utmost importance for any leader in a leadership position. By setting up the right network, any leader can make a success and lead and manage effectively. However, in both countries, this network needs to be expanded to the Department of Education and services such as psychologists or counsellors who can assist principals. Many female principals refuse to ask for help, as they fear it might be seen as a weakness.

Conclusion

This study showed that women are more readily appointed as principals in both Canada and South Africa. Yet, there is a hesitancy to appoint women as principals in mixed schools, especially in high-performing urban schools in South Africa. As culture and tradition fade and change in ethnic groups, women will have the confidence to apply for school principal positions. After all, effective and successful leadership matters, regardless of gender.

References

Botha, R. J. (2018): Making a difference in South African schools: The case of two female principals. *Gender & Bahaviour*, 16(1), 10812-10823.

Carter, M. N. & Silva, C. (2010): Mentoring: Necessary but insufficient for advancement. *Catalyst*. http://www.catalyst.org/knowledge/mentoring-necessary-insufficientadvancement (Accessed 18 February 2019).

Creswell, J. W. (2014): *Research design, qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches*. 4th Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Davids, N. (2018): When identity and leadership intersect: The experiences of six female principals in South Africa. *Africa Education Review*, 15(1), 157-174.

Eagly, A. H. & Carli, L. L. (2007): *Through the labyrinth: The truth about how women become leaders.* Cambridge, MA: Harvard Business School Press.

Grant, C. (2008): Did not put our pieces together: Exploring a professional development initiative through a distributed leadership lens. *Journal of Education*, 44, 85-104.

Hargreaves, A. (2019): Leadership ethics, inequality and identity. *Principal Connections*, 23(1), 14-17.

Hargreaves, A. & Fullan, M. (2013): The power of professional capital. With an investment in collaboration, teachers become nation builders. *Journal of Staff Development*, 34(3), 36-39.

Kanjere, M. M., Thaba, K. L. & Teffo, L. J. (2011): Stereotypes against women principals in rural communities: An individual or cultural issue? Synthesis onto indigenous knowledge systems. *Indilinga: African Journal of Indigenous Knowledge Systems*, 10(2), 245-256.

Leedy, P. D. & Ormrod, J. E. (2013): *Practical research: Planning and design.* 10th Ed. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Prentice Hall.

Mestry, R. & Schmidt, M. (2012): A feminine post-colonial examination of female principals' experiences in South African secondary schools. *Gender and Education*, 24(5), 535-551.

Naidoo, B. & Perumal, J. (2014): Female principals leading at disadvantaged schools in Johannesburg, South Africa. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 42(6), 808-824.

Netshitangani, T. (2018): Constraints and gains of female becoming school principals in South Africa. *Journal of Gender, Information and Development in Africa*, 7(1), 205-222.

Steyn, G. M. (2018): Leading a once underperforming South African school in a challenging community to a successful school. *Gender & Behaviour*, 16(1), 10784-10801.

Dr. Leentjie van Jaarsveld, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Obed Mfum-Mensah

"Dirty Gossips", Transnational Policy Borrowing and Lending, and Education Policy Discourse in Sub-Saharan Africa

Abstract

Transnational policy borrowing and lending of ideas is mostly from the global North to the global South. In sub-Saharan Africa, transnational policy borrowing and lending is complicated by western "dirty gossips" (distortions and stereotypes) about African societies. While works by Steiner-Khamsi, Quist and Kendall outline the complexities of transnational resource flows to sub-Saharan Africa, analysis of how western distortions about Africa shape transnational policy transfer is lacking. This paper employs symbolic violence and postcolonial frameworks to outline how Europeans and Americans' "dirty gossips" about Africa have influenced external transfer and flow of educational ideas and practices to sub-Saharan Africa since the colonial era. It also delineates the complicated ways western distortions and stereotypes about sub-Saharan Africa is a strategy by western partners in the global transnational policy borrowing and lending processes to position themselves in trusteeship roles while infantilizing education policy makers in sub-Saharan Africa. The paper argues that western education partners, particularly, western Africanist scholars, employ distortions and stereotypes as important components of their transnational policy borrowing and lending frameworks with the objective to present education in sub-Saharan Africa as a "crisis" and a new frontier, and their resolve to confront, explore and tame the crisis.

Keywords: philanthropy, education and development, education policy, non-state actors

Introduction

Globalization literature delineates the complicated ways transnational policy borrowing and lending, and transnational networks in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) have shaped the region's education policy discourses. While works by Steiner-Khamsi and Quist (2000), Quist (2003) and Kendall (2007) outline the complexities of transnational resource flows to SSA, studies analyzing how external narratives shape transnational policy transfer of a region is lacking. This paper employs symbolic violence and postcolonial frameworks to analyze the ways European and American bards' "dirty gossips" (distortions, misrepresentations, and stereotypes) about Africa have influenced external transfer and flow of ideas about education policy, practice and research in SSA. The paper argues that the distortions, misrepresentations and stereotypes perpetrated by Western forces (colonial administration, geographers, Christian missionaries, scholars and contemporary development entities) about SSA have led to education policy-making that positions Western partners in trusteeship and dominant roles and Africans in subordinated positionality in global education discourses.

Theorizing "Africa" in Western imaginations

Symbolic violence and postcolonial frameworks help explain how Western distortions, misrepresentations and stereotypes about Africa positioned African societies in subordinated positions in transnational policy borrowing and lending in education discourses. Symbolic violence as a sociological construct, discusses the social relations, power and the "othering" of people in multicultural, postcolonial and development discourses (Richards, 2013). The framework outlines how dominant groups create power asymmetry and a hierarchy that puts "dominated" groups in subordinated positons. In this case, European forces use distortions, misrepresentations and stereotypes to construct and create "subalterns" in the development discourse to suppress developing societies. Postcolonial framework also outlines the ways colonial cultural processes and political structures created indelible imprints on colonized societies. In the process of colonization, colonial subalterns accepted an inferior position and inferiority complex in their relationship with colonial dominant groups in what Frantz Fanon describes as "epidermization of inferiority" or Bourdieu's "habitus" disposition (Johnson, 2013). Postcolonial framework challenges and estrange colonial episteme and discourses, which project the narratives of white Europeans and colonial people at the center of cultural processes and occlude the history of colonialism and imperialism and rather reproduce epistemic structures and Eurocentrism. It provides a critique of how Western colonial and racial domination worked together to render the voices of colonial subalterns fugitive (Lennox, 2006). Postcolonial analysis helps decenter Western discourses that distort and misrepresent African societies and challenges imperialist narratives that depict the depravity of Africa and Africans in and position Western entities as "trustees" and "saviors" of Africa's development.

Western distortions about Africa

European distortions and misrepresentations of Africa helped pushed African societies to subordinated statuses in the global geopolitical order. Ugandan scholar P'Bitek terms the distortions and misrepresentations as "dirty gossips" (P'Bitek, 2011, p. 11). The mention of the name "Africa" invokes negative reactions of powerlessness, backwardness, primitivity, diseases, poverty, famine, chaos, crisis, conflict, and corruption. A major implication of these "dirty gossips" is that Western forces view Africans as children that need direction and their resolve to take the role of "trustees" in the education policy process. Many Westerners grow up with the notion of western White racial and cultural superiority. European forces used symbolic violence to "exoticize", romanticize and pathologize the African "other" in ways that reinforced those "dirty gossips". Western forces employed frameworks that constructed the "othering" of Africans to define the terms of their partnership with Africans. Contemporary western development entities have invented contrasts like "develop" versus "developing", "global north" versus "global south", and "first world" versus "third world" to legitimate and justify their right to their trusteeship roles in Africa's development discourse.

Four western entities have played prominent roles of promoting the dirty gossips about Africa: fifteenth century European traders; nineteenth century explorers; nineteenth century Christian missionaries, scholars and scientists; and twentieth

century American philanthropic entities. Early European Christian traders depicted Africans as less humans to justify the barbarity and inhumanity of slave trading. Nineteenth century explorers employed "imaginative geography" to scavenge the terrain of Africa to explore its geographical mysteries and acquire land for Kings and country. This group served as "unofficial symbolic imperialists, which helped define the cultural terms on which to establish unequal political relations between colonizer and colonized" (Driver, 1991, p. 135). Nineteenth century Christian missionaries used their field reports and conversion stories to popularize the myth of the "Darkest Africa". These "spiritual" soldiers on God's errands came to Africa with "3Cs": Christianity, Commerce and Civilization. They saw their divine right to lay converts in this "heathen" African continent. They portrayed all forms of African religions as superstitious. European Christians and colonial administrators employed the tools of missionary education and colonial language to undermine African children's minds about their culture.

European and American scholars used their writing to distort, misrepresent and construct African people as racially inferior (Benson, 1936). Europe's grand agenda to use the African continent for scientific study stemmed from European's categorization of Africa as the "Dark Continent" and their thirst to decode the mysteries of the "Dark Continent" and the differences of skin color. They employed scientific theories of "monogeny" and "polygeny" to reinforce the narrative of black inferiority. European scholars also employed the same old construct of "primitivity" to portray Africans as unintelligent "children" that needed direction and help to in the development process (Benson, 1936; Hershey & Artime, 2014). Benson for instance depicted the African this way:

> *He is an individual who does not look closely into things… he loves to accept laws and rules to be followed blindly… such an attitude we have to face carefully, and sanely* (Benson, 1936, p. 420).

Such European-American views about Africans came to embody much of Western narratives about Africa. American philanthropic entities including Phelps-Stokes Fund and Carnegie Corporation provided huge sums of money to educational institutions to study the "Negro" and "primitive" peoples in sub-Saharan Africa. American philanthropic entities also provided money to universities to create Social Anthropology and African Studies programs to promote research initiatives that focus on Africa and Negroes. Many of these studies reinforced the "dirty gossips" of colonial administrators. These "dirty gossips" defined transnational policy borrowing and lending on the African continent. In the next two sections, I outline how western "dirty gossips" about Africa shaped education policy discourse in Africa is education.

Non-state actors and education partnership in sub-Saharan Africa

After World War I, American philanthropic foundations collaborated with the British colonial government to intensify support for education. The strategy to insert the United States in the education policy discourse in Africa after World War I for ideological and political reasons drove the philanthropic initiatives as Dr. Anson Phelps Stokes clearly articulated in his Report of the First Commission to West Africa:

> *The end of the world war… and the appointment of mandatories under the League of Nations had drawn the attention to publicists in Europe and America to the importance of adopting educational policies that would tend to prevent international friction and to fit the Africans to meet the actual needs of life* (Benson, 1936, p. 421).

Politically, the United States wanted to insert itself in the international arena in a world that was changing. The ideological goals of the philanthropic foundations were both economic and social and included how to use education to construct the subordinated position of blacks on the African continent in the same way it occurred in American south, and how to promote economic development in the colonies through investment in human capital. American philanthropic foundations' work of promoting education of blacks in colonial Africa was to create a space within the international arena for non-state and nonmarket actors to shape the trajectory of international affairs and to influence how Americans think about the world (Berman, 1978; Yamada, 2008). Berman (1978) points out that in the face of increasing American political and economic isolation, American philanthropists designed overseas educational schemes to allow corporate America to capitalize on developing export market and raw material. The groundwork of philanthropic work in Africa in the early twentieth century was not new. Yamada points out that the American philanthropic entities aligned their transnational policy borrowing and lending on earlier frameworks of the Christian missions and colonial administration.

> *The ideas of 'adaptation', government-mission cooperation, and character training through religious instruction, which Phelps-Stokes Fund… repeated preached, were not new to colonial officials and missionaries working in Africa. The America models did not supersede what had been practiced already, but rather mixed with British notions about education for lower social ranks and local contexts* (Yamada, 2008, p. 22).

Phelps-Stokes Commission pushed for industrial education along the lines of the Hampton-Tuskegee philosophy of education to "lay the foundation of a true civilization" to the black person (Benson, 1936, p. 423). Its recommendation helped establish a system of grants to specific schools in British colonial territories and streamlined black educational initiatives on Africa for close supervision. The Commission's recommendation also led to the creation of education programs in SSA including the Achimota School in Ghana and Jeans Teacher Program in Kenya. These programs had the objective to give black students training skills needed for jobs available to ordinary blacks, and to instill character training for Africans to accept a lower social and economic positon. The contradictions and complexities of transnational borrowing and lending of American philanthropic entities became clear in the creation of Achimota School. It was the first school in British Colonial Africa to implement the Hampton-Tuskegee model of education transplanted as "adapted education" in 1924. The British colonial government repackaged the program to combine the English "public" school model and the Hampton-Tuskegee model because the local elites resisted its initial technical-vocational curriculum. The technical-vocational nature of Achimota was to turn the emerging Ghanaians into "hewers of wood and drawers of water". The integration of two very distinct and opposing models created tensions and contradictions (Quist, 2003; Steiner-Khamsi & Quist, 2000). Rockefeller Foundation, through its international Education Board provided financial support for the Phelps-Stokes Fund. Similarly, Carnegie

Corporation provided financial support to promote education in SSA, particularly in South Africa from the 1920s into the 1980s. Carnegie Corporation's educational initiative in South Africa represents one of the complexities of ideological drive and use of complicated partnership between colonial governments, Christian missions, philanthropic entities and people of good will to promote the broader colonial and imperial agenda.

Transnational policy borrowing and lending: "Crisis in education" in sub-Saharan Africa

Beginning in the late 1980s, global entities reemerged and inserted themselves in the education policy discourse in SSA. At the1990 Jomtien World Education Conference of Education for All (EFA), Western development partners presented the urgency of "Education For All" (EFA) and urged all governments to redouble their efforts to promote the initiative to ensure that all children in SSA enroll in basic education by 2015. The urgency stems from the Western entities' belief that African societies are "backward" societies and "children" that need direction in the development discourse (Lugo-Ocando & Malaolu, 2015). Western Development entities employed "institutionalized paternalistic" framework for promoting transnational policy borrowing and lending in African societies with the belief that they have the "divine" mandate to steer African societies in the "right" direction even though their objectives have always supported the European-American agenda. The Jomtien World Education Conference gave Western Development entities another opportunity to inset themselves as Africa's voice in development discourses. The imposition of policy decisions on African societies in the 1990s is similar to Europe's takeover of Africa during the 1884/5 Berlin Conference. The urgency placed on African societies to embrace the EFA initiative came at a time the Britton Woods institutions had implemented neoliberal economic policies in the region and many nations were in economic disarray.

In the process of transnational policy borrowing and lending, how knowledge flows and disseminates has become another way to create "center versus periphery" dichotomy in development discourse. Knowledge production and the direction of discourses are hegemonic processes that shape and reshape our understanding of the world. Western education researchers and policy makers have utilized knowledge production to provide narratives that portray insurmountable "crisis" in sub-Saharan Africa's educations. This perceived "education crisis" in SSA has become another phase of the "dirty gossips" about Africa. Lugo-Ocando and Malaolu (2015) point that the distortions are written in magisterial tone, derisive, dismissive or, at least, adopting the conspiratorial tone of 'After all, it is Africa: what do you expect?'. The global distortion and misrepresentation of Africa's educational achievements obscures the reality of the gains made by African societies and the challenges of extending EFA to marginalized and vulnerable population in African societies because of external economic policies. Western researchers' narratives about "education crisis" in SSA, is part of a major strategy to reinforce the "center versus periphery" dichotomy in the global human capital development discourse. The focus on "crisis in Africa's education" is a tool to justify why external agencies need to intervene in the educational discourse and transnational policy borrowing and lending and transnational network flow of ideas to the region in much the same way

European and American did in past. One wonders why indigenous African scholars and educational experts do not seem to have a voice in this discourse. Why is it that "experts" on education in SSA are predominantly white Europeans and Americans? Where are the voices of African scholars and experts? Lugo-Ocando and Malaolu intimate that such is the order of things. "Africans had little voice in their own stories – the 'knowledgeable' Western 'experts' speak for them, analyze their developmental problems for them and proffer the 'necessary solutions'" (Lugo-Ocando & Malaolu, 2015, p. 88). Western researchers have taken the role of "trusteeship of education policies and research in SSA". Their voice is the "valid voice" and their scholarship is the valid knowledge about Africa. Many Western "Africanists Education experts" operate within the garb of research to push for transnational policy borrowing and lending of educational ideas that promote Western models of policy and practice.

Conclusion

Western Africanist researchers have implemented transnational policy borrowing and lending frameworks that are similar to the "imaginative geographies" of the nineteenth century, which distorted the narrative about Africa. These education researchers present the challenges in education in SSA as new frontiers to confront, explore and tame through education research and implementation of education initiatives. They present their research initiatives as their resolve and resilience to tame the frontier in much the same ways explorers and colonial forces trooped, confronted and took over "uninhabited lands". Contemporary Western education researchers and "experts" work in much the same way as the colonial explorers in their use of imaginative geographies in a fictive way to imprint in the minds of the global community, a crisis that is not just akin to SSA but is a global crisis.

References

Benson, T. G. (1936): The Jeanes School and the Education of the East African Native. *Journal of the Royal African Society*, 35(141), 418-431.

Berman, E. H. (1978): Review: 'Pan-Africanism and Education: A Study of Race, Philanthropy and Education in the United States of America and East Africa' by Kenneth James Kings; 'Creative Philanthropy: Carnegie Corporation and Africa, 1953-1973' by E. Jefferson Murphy. *History of Education Quarterly*, 18(4), 461-470.

Driver, F. (1991): Henry Morton Stanley and his Critics: Geography, Exploration and Empire. *The Past and Present Society*, 133(1), 134-166.

Hershey, M. & Artime, M. (2014): Narratives of Africa in a Digital World: "Kony 2012" and Student Perceptions of Conflict and Agency in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Political Science and Politics*, 47(3), 636-641.

Johnson, D. (2013): Fanon's Travels in Postcolonial Theory and Post-Apartheid Politics. *College Literature*, 40(2), 52-80.

Kendall, N. (2007): Education for All Meets Political Democratization: Free Primary Education and the Neoliberalization of the Malawian School and State. *Comparative Education Review*, 51(3), 281-306.

Lennox, S. (2006): *Cemetery of the Murdered Daughters*. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press.

Lugo-Ocando, J. & Malaolu, P. (2015): Africa, that Scar on our Face. In J. Lugo-Ocando (Ed.) *Blaming the Victim. How Global Journalism Fails Those in Poverty* (pp. 85-103). London, UK: Pluto Press.

P'Bitek, O. (2011): *Decolonizing African Religions. A Short History of African Religions in Western Scholarship*. New York: Diaspora African Press.

Quist, H. O. (2003): Transferred and Adapted Models of Secondary Education in Ghana: What Implications for National Development? *International Review of Education*, 49(5), 411-431.

Richards, P. (2013): *Race and the Chilean Miracle: Neoliberalism, Democracy, and Indigenous Rights*. Pittsburg: University of Pittsburgh Press.

Steiner-Khamsi, G. & Quist, H. O. (2000): The Politics of Educational Borrowing: Reopening the Case of Achimota in Britain Ghana. *Comparative Education Review*, 44(3), 272-299.

Yamada, S. (2008): Educational Borrowing as Negotiation: Re-examining the Influence of the American Black Industrial Model on British Colonial Education in Africa. *Comparative Education*, 44(1), 21-37.

Prof. Dr. Obed Mfum-Mensah, Messiah College, Mechanicsburg, USA

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Vesselina Kachakova

The Potential of ICTs in Education Worldwide: A Review of Several International Studies

Abstract

The potential of ICTs in education is often seen as a panacea for almost all educational problems: ICTs would narrow the inequalities, give access to open resources and make the system fair for all who want to benefit from it, ICTs would make the education more attractive and effective for the students, ICTs would have the power to reform the way of teaching and the way of learning, and to bring for a huge social change. Different international organizations (OECD, IEA, World Bank, etc.) study the impact of ICTs on education worldwide and their conclusions do not confirm the high expectations. The politicians should not hyperbolize the positive effects that ICTs could have for improvement of quality or reducing the inequality in education, and to rely on ICTs to do their work as policymakers, responsible for the implementation of educational reforms and changes in the ways of learning and teaching through ICTs.

Keywords: information and communication technologies (ICTs), education, policy, quality, access, inequality

Introduction

Since the late 1970s in many developed countries, there have been increasing efforts to introduce ICTs at schools through the provision of personal computers. In the early 1980s when relatively cheap microcomputers became available and distributed to schools the issue of 'computers in education' became more popular in educational policymaking. Later the term 'computers' was replaced by 'IT' (information technology) and around 1992 when e-mail started to become available to the general public the term 'ICTs' (information and communication technologies) was introduced (Pelgrum & Law, 2003, p. 19), and it has been used until now.

Reports from the World Bank (2000) and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD, 2000) share the concerns that ICTs deepen the existing inequalities: "the gap between the rich OECD countries and the poor developing countries is growing, both in terms of ICT products as well as in terms of incomes" (World Bank, 2000, p. 3) and "the divide between the information rich and information poor exists between individuals in the same neighbourhood, as well as between nations and continents" (OECD, 2000, p. 17).

In 2012 the European Commission states in its Communication *Rethinking Education* that: "Technology offers unprecedented opportunities to improve quality, access and equity in education and training. It is a key lever for more effective learning and to reducing barriers to education, in particular social barriers." (European Commission, 2012, p. 9).

Research framework

The EU statement provoked the aim of this paper to search for evidence in the recent international studies on the potential of ICTs to improve: quality, access and equity in the education worldwide, as well as to find if it is a key lever for changes in the way of learning and reforms in the educational systems.

One of the studies was undertaken by OECD's Centre for Educational Research and Innovation (CERI) and it presents and discusses the findings from 93 case studies of 22 participating countries in the fieldwork of ICTs and organizational change, completed by 2001 (OECD, 2008). The paper systematizes also the results from the international studies of the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) – *Results of the International Computer and Information Literacy Study (ICILS) for 2018*, OECD – *Students, Computers and Learning: Making the Connection*, and the European Commission's *2nd Survey of Schools: ICT in Education*, as well as some conclusions from particular studies on the effects of ICTs in education and on the way of learning.

Potential of ICTs to improve quality, access, and equity in education

The use of laptops in classrooms seems to be a controversial topic. Many teachers believe that computers (and the Internet) serve as distractions, detracting from class discussion and student learning. Conversely, students often self-report a belief that laptops in class are beneficial. Empirical research tends to support the teachers' view, finding that students using laptops are not on task during lectures, show decreased academic performance, and are less satisfied with their education than their peers who do not use laptops in class (Mueller & Oppenhaimer, 2014, p. 1).

Examples from the case studies, largely based on teacher opinion, express uncertainty about the potential of ICTs to enhance educational quality: some see it as a valued resource for student research, others concern it as wasting student time, encouraging a 'cut and paste' culture and superficial work. This range of opinion reinforces that the educational impact of ICTs depends largely on the use to which it is put (OECD, 2008, p. 31).

The *2nd Survey of Schools: ICT in Education* presents controversial data about the opinion of students regarding the positive impact of ICT use during lessons: about 35% of them define the positive impact as 'A lot', about 38% think the impact is 'Somewhat', and the rest about 27% think it is 'A little' or even 'Not at all' (European Commission, 2019, p. 113).

The data from the report of OECD *Students, Computers and Learning: Making the Connection* (2015) conclude: "Resources invested in ICT for education are not linked to improved student achievement in reading, mathematics or science" (2015, p. 146). According to their findings: "countries where it is less common for students to use the Internet at school for schoolwork, students' performance in reading improved more rapidly than in countries where such use is more common, on average" (OECD, 2015, p.146); and "even such specific online reading skills do not appear to benefit from more intensive use of computers at school" (OECD, 2015, p. 154). Some of the reasons are associated with a greater frequency of certain

activities, such as chatting online at school and practicing and drilling, which may replace other more effective learning activities (OECD, 2015, p. 154).

Concerning the connection between ICTs use and the quality of education, the results from the studies are still skeptical and controversial for the potential of ICTs to improve the quality of education. According to the conclusions, the role of the teacher as a predictor for the better quality of education is more significant than the use of ICTs.

Despite these conclusions, during the past 25 years schools and families around the world have spent a substantial amount of money on computers, Internet connections, and software for educational use. By 2012, in most OECD countries less than 2% of 15-year-old students lived in households without computers (OECD, 2015, p. 188). Differences in access to digital resources across students of different socio-economic status have narrowed considerably over recent years, to the point where, in all but five OECD countries with available data, disadvantaged students spend at least as much time on line as advantaged students do (OECD, 2015, p. 147). The tendency, however, is that students use information and communication technologies more for leisure than for learning activities (Fraillon et al., 2019, p. 132).

Results from the case studies give examples of schools, which had schemes to facilitate access – some provided laptop computers on loan or even desktop computers on long-term loan; in others, the issue was addressed by extending access to the computers after normal school hours. Such measures help address the 'digital divide' but they are not in place for all students and all schools (OECD, 2008, p. 30).

Particular benefits from the access to ICTs were reported for students with special needs. The case studies' results show good examples of how ICTs can help students with writing difficulties, may enhance the opportunities for those with communication difficulties and those with autism to relate to others and to participate more actively in the education process (OECD, 2008, p. 24, p. 31).

But, even with equal access, not all students have the knowledge and skills to benefit from the resources that are available to them. To reduce inequalities in the ability to benefit from digital tools, countries need to improve equity in education first and to ensure that every child attains a baseline level of proficiency in reading and mathematics (OECD, 2015, p. 16).

The results of the *International Computer and Information Literacy Study* (ICILS) for 2018 confirm that the access to the technical devices, the Internet and the open resources does not mean that the young people have the knowledge, the skills, and the attitudes to use them: "Digital natives are not digital experts: Young people do not develop sophisticated digital skills just by growing up using digital devices" (IEA, 2019, slide 10); "There is a digital divide relating to the socioeconomic status, home access to devices and years of experience of using devices" (IEA, 2019, slide 26); "Differences in students' Computer and Information Literacy (CIL) scores within countries are larger than the differences between countries" (IEA, 2019, slide 32).

Although in many classrooms around the world, technology is used to support quality teaching and student engagement, through collaborative workspaces, remote and virtual labs, or through the many ICT tools that help connect learning to authentic, real-life challenge, still, countries and education systems can do more to improve the effectiveness of their investments in ICTs, so that to maximize the use of the potential of ICTs. To conclude, the expanded access to technologies

worldwide is not directly linked to improvement in quality or reducing the inequalities in education. Introducing ICTs in education is not a panacea and the policymakers need to identify the goals they want to achieve by ICTs in education and to measure progress towards these goals.

Potential of ICTs to be a key lever for changes and reforms in educational systems

The Report of the International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement (IEA) of 2013 concludes: "computers were most commonly being used to access digital textbooks and workbooks rather than to provide dynamic, interactive pedagogical tools" (Fraillon et al., 2019, p. 245). It is similar to the high expectations in the early 1990s that the introduction of microcomputers in education would make it more effective and motivating. Many surveys had shown that computers were used mainly as a supplement to the existing curriculum and much less as tools that were fully integrated into the learning of traditional subject matter, the general feeling among many policymakers was one of great disappointment (Pelgrum & Law, 2003, p. 19). According to Pelgrum and Law, there are three distinct roles of ICTs in the curriculum: "'Learning about ICT', which refers to ICT as a subject of learning in the school curriculum, such as computer (or ICT) literacy, computer science and information literacy; 'Learning with ICT', which refers to use of ICT, including multimedia, the Internet or the Web, as a medium to enhance instruction or as a replacement for other media without changing the beliefs about the approaches to, and the methods of, teaching and learning; and 'Learning through ICT', which refers to the integration of ICT as an essential tool into a course/ curriculum, such that the teaching and learning of that course/curriculum is no longer possible without it" (Pelgrum & Law, 2003, p. 23).

Only the third role of ICTs has the potential for significant changes in the ways of teaching and learning as well as for reforms at school or system level. The OECD case studies research on the impact of ICTs raise the question "To what extent ICT acts as the change agent?" and their findings conclude: "Several of the schools reported that ICT had led to changes in pedagogy within the school"; In many schools, ICT was used as a lever by a higher administrative body, such as ministry, university, etc.; ICT can support a traditional didactic model of teaching as well as a project-based model. There is nothing inherent in the technology which orients it towards one particular methodology; If ICT is a neutral lever, then the crucial factor in determining the direction of change will be the thinking of the teachers who use it (OECD, 2008, pp. 7-11). The Concluding Summary of the research states that: 1) the impact of ICT on educational quality flows from the way the technology is used, and the same technology, in the hands of different teachers, produces different outcomes; 2) the adoption of ICTs is not a technical implementation but an ongoing process of educational change and as such, it may be a slow, often unpredictable process (OECD, 2008, p. 28).

The World Bank report of 2000 concludes that civil liberties go hand in hand with the conditions to innovate and generate technological progress and the ICTs diffusion rates may influence and be influenced by a national or international legal, institutional and political environment. A central role for the development of the potential of ICTs in education could be given to civil liberties in the countries,

including freedom of expression, transparency of institutions and protection of human rights (World Bank, 2000, pp. 29-30).

Conclusion

Indeed, "Technology offers unprecedented opportunities" but it depends mostly on how it is used and the access to ICTs cannot be seen as a predictor for significant success or improvements in educational quality and equity. Even, conversely, if not regulated and navigated, the potential of ICTs in education could be harmful through wasting students' and teachers' time which result in insufficient learning activities, or through exposure to online risks such as violations of privacy or online bullying.

To be correct politicians should not hyperbolize the positive effects that ICTs could have for improvement of quality or reducing the inequality in education, and to rely on ICTs to do their work as policymakers, responsible for the implementation of educational reforms and changes in the ways of learning and teaching through ICTs.

References

European Commission (2012): *Rethinking Education: Investing in skills for better socio-economic outcomes*. Strasbourg. https://www.cedefop.europa.eu/en/content/rethinking-education-investing-skills-better-socio-economic-outcomes (Accessed 11 February 2020).

European Commission (2019): *2nd Survey of Schools: ICT in Education*. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. https://ec.europa.eu/digital-single-market/en/news/survey-schools-ict-education (Accessed February 2020).

Fraillon, J., Ainley, J., Schulz, W., Friedman, T. & Duckworth, D. (2019): *Preparing for Life in a Digital World. IEA International Computer and Information Literacy Study 2018 International Report*. https://www.iea.nl/sites/default/files/2019-11/ICILS%202019%20Digital%20final%2004112019.pdf (Accessed February 2020).

IEA (2019): *Results from the International Computer and Information Literacy Study (ICILS) 2018*. https://www.iea.nl/publications/study-reports/infographics/icils-2018-infographics (Accessed February 2020).

Mueller, P. & Oppenheimer, D. (2014): The pen is mightier than the keyboard: Advantages of longhand over laptop note taking. *Psychological Science*, 25(6), 1159-1168.

OECD (2000): *Schooling for Tomorrow Learning to Bridge the Digital Divide*. Paris: OECD Publications.

OECD (2008): *ICT in Innovative Schools: Case Studies of Change and Impacts*. https://www.oecd.org/site/schoolingfortomorrowknowledgebase/themes/ict/41187025.pdf (Accessed February 2020).

OECD (2015): *Students, Computers and Learning: Making the Connection*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

Pelgrum, W. & Law, N. (2003): *ICT in education around the world: trends, problems and prospects*. Paris: UNESCO, International Institute for Educational Planning.

World Bank (2000): *Are poor countries losing the information revolution?* infoDev working paper. Washington, DC: World Bank.

Dr. Vesselina Kachakova, Institute of Philosophy and Sociology, Bulgarian Academy of Science, Bulgaria

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Michelle Otto

Knowledge as Currency: A Comparative Exploration of the Relationship between Education Expenditure and Gross Domestic Product in the European Union and BRICS Countries

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to explore the relationship between the percentage of expenditure on public education of a country and the effect that each percentage mark has on the economic growth, and therefore Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of a country. The goal of this paper is to explore how investment in education impacts the economic growth of a country through the production of more skilled workers in the workforce. This paper aims to draw a comparison between the BRICS countries, and a representative number of the countries in the European Union to compare the investment, process and product delivered through these groupings. By looking at the production function from a Marxist perspective it is inevitable to notice that the error coefficient is significantly higher within the BRICS countries than in the European Union, which is reflected in the rate of economic growth. This paper would be of interest to economists, education policy makers, researchers, and scholars.

Keywords: BRICS, economic growth, education, European Union, expenditure, gross domestic product, human capital

Introduction

Education is defined as the process of changing the personality of an individual in a specific direction with the intent of adopting a variety of content subjected to the age and requirements of said individuals; it is the process through which accumulated knowledge, skills and values are transmitted to future generations (Tomić, 2015, p. 19). Tomić asserts that teaching and educational facilities are both fundamental elements of education – when the age and needs of individuals are considered (Tomić, 2015, p. 19). According to the goals of education set by the European Union, and the BRICS countries, education aims to: strengthen vocational education and training, promote quality in education, and the professional development of staff – by looking at these three goals it is evident that the goal of education is to produce skilled workers that would be able to join the workforce of a country and promote education further.

Human capital, economic growth and the production function

Swanson and Holton III (2001, p. 4) define human resource development as "a process of developing and unleashing human expertise through organization development and personnel training and development for the purpose of improving performance".

Looking at the production function from a Marxist perspective (Schefold, 2016), the aim is to accumulate capital at a steady rate, which is not correspondent with an increase of workers income (Hanusek, 2020), in effect creating a steadily growing profit margin. Applying the Marxist philosophy to this study, with capital referring to skilled workers, it can be said that the aim is to accumulate skilled workers (human capital i.e. the workforce of a country), however, the skilled workers trained and accumulated do not correspond to the increase of benefits that these workers receive. The profit margin in this instance refers to the growing economy: The Gross Domestic Product (GDP) of a country.

Tomić (2015, p. 20) proposes a model derived from the previous model that focuses on components such as labour, material, capital and energy that has now shifted towards knowledge and by extent human capital is now regarded as primary component (Idrees & Siddiqi, 2013). This further reinforces the Marxist perspective, and states that:

> *investment in knowledge may increase the production capacity more than any other factor of production and to transform them into new products and processes. Because these investments in knowledge characterised by an increase in the rate of return on investment, they are the key to long-term economic growth.*

Data selection

This paper explores the relationship between the expenditure on education in a country as opposed to the country's overall GDP. For the purpose of this paper, a representative number of the five BRICS countries (Brazil, Russia, India, China, and South Africa) was chosen, specifically Russia and South Africa as Brazil, China and India did not have complete statistics publicly available. The BRICS countries will be compared to a representative number of the countries in the European Union – it is important to note that the United Kingdom left the EU effectively from the 1st of February 2020, however, the available statistics include the United Kingdom as part of the European Union, and is thus used as such.

The countries from the European Union were chosen as follows: from the twenty eight EU countries, ranked from largest expenditure on public education to lowest expenditure on publication, the top two – the United Kingdom, and Sweden; the middle two – France and Ireland; and the lowest ranking two, Poland and Hungary were chosen according to the 2019 report by the National Centre for Education Statistics (NCES, 2019, p. 4). For this paper there will be a comparison made between these countries during the time period of 2012 to 2016 as the data from 2017 onwards is not available. It was determined that a prediction can be made for the years of 2017 to 2019, when the financial year comes to an end.

Drawing a comparison between public expenditure and the economic growth of a country, one has to determine the expenditure of public education over a specific time period, as well as the economic growth in the same time period, while taking into account the error coefficient (Tomić, 2015, p. 23).

Data analysis

Data from 2006 to 2016 was used to determine the relationship between the investment in education which produces more skilled workers, and their impact on

the overall economic growth, in essence, the GDP of a country (Idrees & Siddiqi, 2013; Schefold, 2016). By using a period of ten years, a trend should be evident if the error coefficient is minimal.

To determine the impact that the expenditure on education has on the GDP, one has to make use of a model; in the case of this exploration Lucas' model of economic growth was used. In this model, the factor of production is equivalent to human capital as the education system aims to produce skilled workers, according to the priorities of education set throughout the EU and BRICS countries, furthermore, the model suggests that knowledge is fundamental to accelerated economic growth. Therefore, according to Lucas' model of economic growth, if the investment in education increases, the human capital will increase and result in an accelerated economic growth to ultimately heighten the country's GDP, while taking the error coefficient into account and aiming to keep it as low as possible.

The analysis of the data will be done to determine the relationship between investment in education and the rate of return reflected in the GDP calculated with the current rate of economic growth per year.

Russia

Taking the information presented by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Russia spent an average of 11.06% of the annual budget from 2012 to 2016 on education whereas the GDP average for the country is 76.57 Trillion USD, indicating that 8.47 Trillion USD is spent on education annually. Looking at the years individually: in 2012 Russia spent 8.36 Trillion USD on education; 8.36 Trillion USD in 2013; 9.11 Trillion USD in 2014; 8.15 Trillion USD in 2015; and 8.36 Trillion USD in 2016 – comparing this to the GDP of the country, it is clear that the expenditure on education is directly linked to the GDP of a country – Russia having a two year period of return on investment as is made clear over this period wherein 2013 Russia invested 8.36 Trillion USD in education, and the GDP was 75.05 USD in 2015, whereas in 2014 9.11 Trillion USD was invested in education and the GDP rose to 76.16 Trillion USD in 2016 – a difference of 1.11 Trillion USD. Taking the time period into consideration, for every 1% that Russia invests in education, the GDP will rise by 1.53 Trillion USD within two years.

South Africa

South Africa, on the other hand, has a decline of expenditure on education from 2012 to 2016, with an average of 2.6% decline from 81.8 million USD spent in 2012 to 53.46 million USD spent in 2016 on education, as opposed to the GDP declining from 396.33 Billion USD in 2012 to 296.36 Billion USD in 2016. Which, according to statistics, for every 1% invested in education, the GDP should rise by 10.94 Million USD per year, or for every 1% not spent, the GDP will fall with 10.94 million USD per year, with an investment return of three years.

United Kingdom

The UK spends an average of 56.32% of the annual budget on education, with their GDP being an average of 2.83 Trillion USD, the expenditure on education is

1.6 Trillion USD annually from 2012 to 2016. Given these statistics, for every 1% invested in education, the GDP should rise by 33.75 million USD annually.

Sweden

Sweden spends an average of 15.39% of the annual budget on education, with their GDP being an average of 54.7 Billion USD, the expenditure on education is 8.42 Billion USD annually from 2012 to 2016. Given these statistics, for every 1% invested in education, the GDP should rise by 40 million USD annually.

France

France spends an average of 57.32% of the annual budget on education, with their GDP being an average of 2.65 Trillion USD, the expenditure on education is 1.52 Trillion USD annually from 2012 to 2016. Given these statistics, for every 1% invested in education, the GDP should rise by 432 Billion USD annually.

Ireland

Ireland spends an average of 13.28% of the annual budget on education, with their GDP being an average of 26.28 Billion USD, the expenditure on education is 3.5 Billion USD annually from 2012 to 2016. Given these statistics, for every 1% invested in education, the GDP should rise by 8.5 million USD annually.

Poland

Poland spends an average of 58.32% of the annual budget on education, with their GDP being an average of 50.39 Billion USD, the expenditure on education is 29.39 Billion USD annually from 2012 to 2016. Given these statistics, for every 1% invested in education, the GDP should rise by 8.8 Million USD after three years, as the investment return takes three years.

Hungary

Hungary spends an average of 9.15% of the annual budget on education, with GDP being an average of 13.12 Billion USD, the expenditure on education is 1.2 Billion USD annually from 2012 to 2016. Given these statistics, for every 1% invested in education, the GDP should rise by 1.16 Billion USD after three years, as the investment return takes an average of three years.

Conclusion

It is clear that there is a definite relationship between the investment in education and the economic growth, which in the EU has an average growth rate of 19 Billion USD for every 1% invested into education with a return of the investment within three years. In contrast, the BRICS has an average economic growth rate of 77 Billion of the GDP for every 1% invested in education with a return of the investment within three years. The difference in the rate of return and increase of GDP between the EU and the BRICS is mainly, but not limited to, the attribution of the error coefficient as factors such as migration, administration and population has to be considered. The difference in the growth rates can be due to a variety of factors, such as investment from outside sources, and migration, especially within

the BRICS countries; on the other hand, the steady rate of economic growth within the EU countries is due to the EU being stable in terms of the grouping having had more time to stabilise, whereas the BRICS grouping is relatively new in comparison and have not had as much time to stabilise yet.

References

Hanusek, E. (2020): Education Production Functions. In S. Bradley & C. Green (Eds.) *Economics of Education*, 2nd Edition (pp. 161-170). London: Academic Press.

Idrees, A. & Siddiqi, M. (2013): Does public education expenditure cause economic growth? Comparison of developed and developing countries. *Pakistan journal of commerce and social science*, 7(1), 174-183.

National Centre for Education Statistics (NCES) (2019): *Education expenditures by country 2019. The condition of education*. Washington, DC: NCES.

Schefold, B. (2016): *Marx, the production function and the old neoclassical equilibrium: Workable under the same assumptions? With an appendix on the likelihood of reswitching and of Wicksell effects*. Frankfurt am Main: Goethe University, Department of Economics.

Swanson, R. & Holton III, F. (2001): *Foundations of human resource development*. San Francisco, CA: Berret-Koehler.

Tomić, Z. (2015): Analysis of the impact of public expenditure on economic growth of European Union and BRICS. *Economic Analysis*, 48(1), 19-38.

Michelle Otto, United Kingdom

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Part 3

School Education: Policies, Innovations, Practices & Entrepreneurship

Gillian L. S. Hilton

Elective Home Schooling in England: A Policy in Need of Reform?

Abstract

This paper examines the recent noticeable rise in parents and carers in England, deciding to home school their children. This rise has been attributed to schools advising parents with 'difficult' children, those with special educational needs or behavioural problems, that they have a choice; home educate or their child will be permanently excluded. Also, there is a rise in parents removing children from schools due to bullying, school refusal and general unhappiness with school regimes and demands made on learners. The paper discusses causes of this increase in elective home schooling and examines the policy changes proposed and implemented by successive governments. Recently, concerns have arisen over what type of education is being offered to children by poorly educated parents, the rise of so called temporary schools in unsuitable buildings, concerns over religious indoctrination and the lack of a broad and balanced curriculum being offered, which could result in a lack of future employment opportunities for students. Certainly, a new approach is urgently needed if children's futures are to be protected.

Keywords: home schooling, England, policy on home education

Introduction

Williams (2018), claims that the current move to home educate children arose in the 1970s, when it was judged as unusual or anti-establishment, but has now become the fastest growing type of education provision. Guidance for elective home education (EHE) was first given by the Department for Education (DfE) in 2007. The guidance applies to England alone and has been recently updated in 2019, due to growing concerns about the number of children in 'home education' as this has increased rapidly of late. The government is concerned that schools may be encouraging parents/carers of children who have special needs and/or have behavioural problems to home educate, or face permanent exclusion of the student from school. In addition, worries have arisen over the appearance of unregulated schools, springing up in unsafe buildings and tending to be run by and attended by, those of the Muslim faith. Grave concerns have arisen about the radicalisation of children, the use of untrained teachers in unsuitable conditions, a restricted

curriculum and discrimination against girls. These concerns echo what became known as the 'Trojan Horse Crisis' in Birmingham schools in the early teens of this century (Clarke, 2014). This was an accusation that some schools in areas of Birmingham, were following a restricted curriculum, demonstrating discriminatory attitudes towards staff and a lack of equal treatment for the different genders. In addition, the National Curriculum was not being followed and children introduced to values that were not considered as 'British' in origin or outlook.

In a *Dispatches* Documentary for Channel 4 TV (Channel 4, 2019), the Children's Commissioner, who herself took part, raised concerns about the quality of home education being provided. She claimed that, though there were cases of excellent home schooling with a broad curriculum being provided by parents, there were also instances where parents, who themselves had learning difficulties such as dyslexia, were being encouraged by schools to teach their children at home. This was happening particularly, if their children were liable not to achieve desired passes at GCSE examinations. In the programme, LAs were asked if they had enough powers or resources to supervise the education of these children. All those who responded, said those powers were insufficient and they lacked accurate knowledge of numbers of home schooled children in their areas.

The Local Government Association (LGA), which represents councils in England and Wales, has repeatedly called for a compulsory register of home schooled children and is demanding the right to enter homes to see if these children are receiving an adequate education (LGA, 2019). The LGA points to the fact that some children are actually being taught under the home schooling name, in illegal, unsafe schools (often old office buildings), which are known to the authorities, but continue to practice despite receiving closure orders. This was underlined in the Channel 4 *Dispatches* programme, where such a school was visited and entry was refused; 'teachers' claiming that it was not a school. It is a criminal offence to run an unregulated school, that is, one not registered with the DfE where no Ofsted or LA inspections occur. These illegal schools often only teach for a limited number of hours each week and therefore claim to be 'home schooling'. O'Sullivan (2015) noted in a blog that the DfE at that time had expressed concerns that some of these schools are not teaching 'British Values' as required in law and that a fear of radicalisation was causing concern. It appears there are only limited ways by which the existence of these schools can be challenged, LAs only redress is to use health and/or fire regulations, but this needs the right of entry, which is generally refused.

The Children's Commissioner asserted in her report (Children's Commissioner, 2019), that the increase in schools 'off-rolling' or informal exclusion of children, whose behaviour, attendance or academic achievement was likely to cause schools trouble with Ofsted inspections, had got out of control. Adams (2019) pointed out, in one of many press reports, that the Commissioner had called for greater supervision of such children's education, as home schooling had doubled in the last five years (Children's Commissioner, 2019). Her report asserted that the exponential increase of home schooling, raised the need for Local Authorities (LAs) to have the right to demand that home schooled children are placed on a compulsory register. This would allow note to be made of the curriculum they are being taught and their safety assured. The report claimed there had been a 48% rise in home schooling between 2015-16 and 2017-18, but as registration was not demanded, the numbers could be

much higher. 'Estimates suggest that in 2018 there may have been around 53,000-58,000 home educated children in England' (Foster & Danechi, 2019, p. 15).

Numbers of home schooled children have it is thought, doubled since 2013. Figures are incomplete, as parents do not have to register their child for home schooling, causing safeguarding concerns (NSPCC, 2014; Adams, 2019). In 2018 the DfE launched a consultation on EHE, asking for opinions whether the regulations re home schooling and the curriculum taught, should be reviewed (DfE, 2018; Lepper, 2018). This resulted from a call by the Association of Directors of Children's Services (ADCS), raising concerns over the growth in numbers. In its reasons for the consultation, the government admitted that little had changed since the Education Act of 1944, in response to home schooling and that it was time to re-examine their approach. LAs were asked to provide evidence on whether registration of home schooled children should be compulsory; how home schooling could be monitored; what support is/could be offered to families. Two draft documents to advise parents/carers and LAs about their rights and duties to home schooled children, were included; on which LAs were asked to express their opinion.

As a result of these growing anxieties, there was a call in April 2019, by the Secretary of State for Education Damian Hinds, for the compulsory registration of all children whose parents elected to educate them at home (DfE, 2019a; Weale, 2019a). This move however, was strongly resisted by parents. Therefore, the government, in an attempt to appease them, promised more support and the provision of teaching materials. However, much is already available online, provided by private companies profiting from the rise in home schooled numbers. Further concerns rose from a 2019 review of EHE, showing that at least eighteen per cent of home educated children were known to social services, for other reasons than home schooling (ADCS, 2019). The ADCS survey also showed that the majority of home educated children were in the secondary stage of schooling, which raises concerns about their ability to take national examinations and move into employment.

Government guidance

In 2019 after the concerns of the Children's Commissioner, and the consultation in 2018, an update to the 2007 LAs and Parents' Guidance Documents was issued. However, these still do not allow inspection by LAs of the quality of education offered to home schooled children, which many in the system think is a mistake (Issimdar, 2018). These documents set out the legal requirements for those involved, but there is no stipulation of a curriculum, whereas schools are expected to provide a broad and balanced curriculum, with secondary level children being prepared for national examinations as normal practice. The 2019 guidance document to LAs notes the following:

> *When local authorities engage with home-educating families they should take into account the context of individual situations. Often home education will be undertaken as a positive choice which is expected to lead to a better outcome. However, in some cases home education may be attempted as a last resort. This appears to be occurring more frequently, and is likely to have implications for the quality of home education provided. Such families may require more support and guidance.* (DfE, 2019b, p. 7)

However, this new set of regulations and guidance suggestions are non-statuary, that is they are guidance only and the documents for parents and for LAs were not well received by the LGA. In them, though a register for home school children is proposed, this does not in the eyes of the association to go far enough to ensure that the safeguarding duties of LAs are supported. For example, there is no right to enter homes unless there are safeguarding issues brought to light via other agencies. Merely claiming to home school a child is not sufficient to allow LAs the right to check if the child is being correctly treated and cared for (Weale, 2019b). Safeguarding issues have been brought to light after deaths at the hands of their parents of a small number of children, either by neglect or assault. For example, a child who died in Wales as a result of scurvy, due to extremely poor nutrition provided by his parents (Forrester et al., 2017). 'The overriding objective in these cases is to ensure that the child's development is protected from significant harm' (DfE, 2019b, p. 4).

The guidance gives LAs the opportunity if evidence if brought to light, that suitable education is not occurring, to serve a School Attendance Order (SAO) on the parents. If this is not obeyed, then an Education Supervision Order (ESO), or prosecution of the parents can occur. If the ESO is not complied with, a Care Order can be issued, by which the child/children can be moved into the care of the LA. Lack of adherence to prosecution can also lead to an ESO etc. being applied. However, as LAs point out, how do they gain evidence if they are not allowed to insist on entry to homes? According to the ADCS (2019, p. 1) 'A combined total of 1,400 School Attendance Orders (SAOs) were issued across 61 LAs relating to the suitability of home education'. Foster and Danechi (2019, p. 15) commenting in their House of Commons briefing paper on an unfinished version of the ADCS report noted that 'This represents an increase of 171% from 2018'.

Why do parents choose to home educate?

The reasons for parents deciding to full or part-time educate their children are varied and include the off-rolled children mentioned above. However, many parents choose it for other reasons, often ideological ones. For example, that expecting children to sit at desks all day and follow a set routine is wrong (Williams, 2018). Financially it can be difficult, as the costs of education have to be borne by the family and often EHE means one parent cannot work. Other reasons such as the need for education to be child-led, rather than teacher-led is given, but also many parents say they have to take this route as their child has suffered from bullying or assault, verbal, physical or by social media. The National Association of Head Teacher's Report on the accountability stresses on schools, calls for a rethink of the pressures put on schools and therefore children and teachers, by the high targets set by the DfE (NAHT, 2018). These certainly contribute to the dislike of school suffered by some children, as they feel under constant pressure to succeed.

Criticisms of home schooling

One of the fiercest critics of home schoolers is Apple (2000), who compared their philosophy to that of gated communities in the USA, locked away from communities unlike theirs and living in an artificial bubble removed from real life.

Schools he adheres, though not perfect do provide a community, a sense of belonging in our divided, so called multi-cultural societies.

In 2019 the House of Commons reacting to the concern of LAs and the Children's Commissioner produced a report *Home Education in England* (Foster & Danechi, 2019) which, like other reports, showed that the outcomes of home educated children are generally poor in comparison with those who receive full-time schooling. Yet, still LAs have no right of access to the homes of these children. The DfE collects no data on the outcomes for EHE, but in 2009 the Children Schools and Families Committee of the House of Commons found from an enquiry, that at the time twenty two percent of 16-18-year old's who had been home educated, were not in work or full-time education. In comparison the national average is 5 per cent (House of Commons, 2019).

There is a belief that children left to their own devices and natural curiosity will educate themselves; an idea supported by many of the home educating parents. These ideas are based on those of Holt (1991) who also wrote about home schooling and his theories about learning and why children fail. Autonomous learning, or unschooling, child-directed or self-directed learning as it is also called, does not need the 'teacher' to be knowledgeable in any specific area, but to learn with and alongside the child in areas in which he/she is interested. It acknowledges that some input is required, say on learning to read and doing higher maths problems, but that should happen through interest not compulsion. The autonomous education could be in a home setting, or in an educational establishment on which philosophy the famous 'Summerhill School' in England was based. There children do not have to attend any learning activities whatsoever and make up their own rules as a collective. The author, on visiting the school was somewhat astonished to discover a multitude of rules invented by the children, to be followed by teachers and students. These rules where it appears, constantly discussed and added to by the children and were, when the author visited, in the hundreds. To this author's mind it rather negated the do-it-yourself 'free' philosophy adopted by the policy's adherents. Apple's views are echoed by Webb (2011) who believes that giving children choices often results it little actual education occurring; rather, late sleeping, watching junk television programmes, eating 'rubbish' and a lack of self-discipline, as they do not learn it from slack parents. These problems were observed in the *Dispatches* programme mentioned above. Webb home educated his own daughter, but is fiercely critical of parents who do not encourage and insist on their children taking national examinations, so they can move forward in their education. He believes much of the so-called autonomous education is doing little service to children, as it is wrong to let children choose what it is important to learn and the type of lifestyle to adopt. They are not capable he believes, of making such judgements at such a young age.

Research

To explore further this topic, five in-depth interviews were carried out to ascertain the opinions of parents as to their reasons for EHE. These reasons were very varied, 2 parents had withdrawn their children due to problems with the school, either behavioural or learning difficulties, one who thought local schools were, 'rubbish' and all schools 'restrictive' and had never enrolled her children in a school

and 2 who had withdrawn their children because they were unhappy did not like school, or were bullied.

On the whole they appeared to be happy with their decision though, all agreed it affected their own lives and restricted their ability to work. All were female and two were single parents, living on benefit, never had holidays and could not afford extras such as sport or music tuition, or even many visits to 'educational' activities. Most made use of internet provision for learning, which gave them some relief from constant interaction. Three parents admitted it was sometimes difficult to get their children to work on material they did not enjoy and that the curriculum studied, though involving for example, free concert visits at a local church, or walks in the park and discussions of nature etc. were limited. One was teaching her children her own native language (she is not British) but others were making no attempt to introduce any foreign language experience, as they did not have the expertise and providing constant access to the internet cost money that was not always available. None of these parents had any training in teaching or curriculum design. Introducing material such as physics and chemistry was in most cases not possible because of the lack of opportunity to undertake practical work. There were some attempts at design and technology through cooking, some textile work and the use of construction materials. All of the children were of primary school age and when asked as to how the wider secondary curriculum could be handled, two parents said they would possibly pay for some input from tutors However, the others said affording this was not possible, so they would have to use the net and manage on their one, The children appeared to be happy and secure and had siblings, but one said he missed his school friends and as an observer it does make one have concern over the social relationships of these children.

Conclusion

It does appear that the position of home schooled children in England is giving rise to concern as to what is being taught, by whom and if the children involved are having the best education possible. It appears that pressures on children to succeed, lack of provision or support for those with special educational needs and above all the pressure on parents to remove 'difficult' children from school rather than having them excluded, is of concern to LAs, to the Children's Commissioner, the ADCS and other groups. There are also worrying situations where parents, with little or no training and poor education themselves, are taking on the education of their own children, which does not bode well for future success. Also, that so many children appear to be withdrawn from school because they are unhappy, do not fit in, or suffer from bullying, should be given greater attention by all those involved in the education process. It is distressing to see that the constant pressures on children, teachers and schools to succeed, are having a detrimental effect on learning and on the happiness of some of our children. Lack of a wide curriculum, coupled with a non-attendance at national examinations is sure to have an adverse effect on the future attainment and employment of many of these children. It is essential that future governments allow more power for LAs to insist on registration of home schooled children with them and give them the duty to inspect what is actually happening to individuals and groups, withdrawn from the national education system.

The government has announced a further review of the guidance on home schooling, which will be undertaken at the beginning of this decade and the argument about the compulsory registration of home schooled children carries on.

References

Adams, R. (2019): Call for more regulation of home-schooled children in England. https://www.theguardian.com/education/2019/feb/03/call-for-more-regulation-of-home-schooled-children-in-england (Accessed 23.10.2019).

ADCS (2019): *Elective Home Education Survey*. https://adcs.org.uk/assets/documentation/ADCS_Elective_Home_Education_Survey_Analysis_FINAL.pdf (Accessed 20.11.2019).

Apple, M. (2000): *Away with All Teachers: The Cultural Politics of Home Schooling*. https://nepc.colorado.edu/sites/default/files/Apple.Away.pdf (Accessed 23.10.2019).

Clarke, P. (2014): *Report into allegations concerning Birmingham Schools as a result of the 'Trojan Horse' Letter*. London: House of Commons (HC 576), National Archives, Crown Copyright. www.gov.uk/government/publications (Accessed 26.10 2019).

Channel 4 TV (2019): *Dispatches Skipping School; Britain's Invisible Children*.

Children's Commissioner (2019): *Skipping School: Invisible Children, how children disappear from England's schools*. London: Children's Commissioner for England.

DfE (2018): *Home Education: Call for Evidence and Revised DfE Guidance*. London: DfE.

DfE (2019a): *New Register to help all children get the education they deserve*. London: Crown Copyright.

DfE (2019b): *Elective Home Education: Departmental Guidance for Local Authorities*. London: Crown copyright.

Forrester, D., Maxwell, N., Slater, T. & Doughty, J. (2017): *An Evidenced Review of the Risks to Young People and Children who are Educated at Home*. Wales, UK: Cascade.

Foster, D. & Danechi, S. (2019): *Home Education in England*. Briefing Paper 5108, 24th July. London: HofC Library.

Holt, J. (1991): *Learning all the time: How small children begin to read, write, count, and investigate the world, without being taught*. New York: Ticknall and Liss: Education Now Publishing Cooperative and Lighthouse books.

Issimdar, M. (2018): Home schooling in the UK increases 40% over three years. BBC NEWS, 28th April.

Lepper, J. (2018): DfE announces review of home schooling regulations. *Children and Young People Now*. https://www.cypnow.co.uk/cyp/news/2005140/dfe-announces-review-of-home-schooling-regulations (Accessed 20.10.2019).

LGA (2019): Government urged to toughen up home education plans. London: LGA. https://www.local.gov.uk/about/news/government-urged-toughen-home-education-plans (Accessed 12.11.2019).

NAHT (2018): *Improving School Accountability*. Report of the NATHE Accountability Commission. West Sussex: NATHE.

NSPCC (2014): *Home Education: Learning from Case Reviews*. London: NSPPC Briefing.

O'Sullivan, A. (2015): Unregulated schools. Blog for ADCS.

Weale, S. (2019a): Council register of home-schooled children proposed. https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2019/apr/02/home-educated-children-to-be-registered-under-proposals (Accessed 05.11.2019).

Weale, S. (2019b): Government proposals 'fall short' on helping home-schooled children. https://www.theguardian.com/education/2019/jul/17/government-proposals-home-schooled-children (Accessed 25.102019).

Webb, S. (2011): *Elective Home Education in the UK*. Stoke on Trent: Trentham Books.

Williams, S. (2018): 'Schooling is very oppressive': Why home schooling is on the rise. *The Guardian*, 3rd November.

Dr. Gillian L. S. Hilton, Middlesex University, London, United Kingdom

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Karen Biraimah & Brianna Kurtz

An Innovative Reform of Secondary Education for Immigrant Students in Southeastern USA

Abstract

Migrant and immigrant education are both problematic and impactful in the U.S., which often identifies itself as "a nation of immigrants", though these concepts are currently criticized by a conservative government intent on building walls rather than bridges. Nevertheless, schools throughout the country have demonstrated an ability to provide immigrant students with quality instruction and a supportive environment designed to ensure their contributions to the nation. This paper will review a government-funded secondary magnet school for information technology in Southeastern U.S. that enrolls a significant number of first and second-generation voluntary immigrant students. Through an analysis of data obtained from questionnaires and extended focus group discussions, the authors will describe the challenges and achievements of these students, and the role their school's environment played in helping to create both a sense of belonging and opportunities for success.

Keywords: migrant education, secondary schools, ethnic discrimination, technology, USA

Introduction

In the past, the United States (U.S.) has seen itself as a "nation of immigrants". A notion that is being severely tested and scrutinized by the current administration in Washington, DC. Moving beyond this political quagmire, however, issues linked to migrant and immigrant education remain significant in the U.S. and worldwide. Fortunately, we can draw upon examples of U.S. schools that have demonstrated an ability to provide their migrant and immigrant students with an effective curriculum within a supportive environment.

The research reported in this paper focuses on first and second-generation immigrant students whose families chose to come to the U.S. for a variety of political, social and economic reasons. It reviews a public secondary magnet school for information technology with a large population of first and second-generation immigrant students. This school is located in the state of Florida, in Southeastern U.S. The paper explores the school's academic programs that immigrant and migrant students have taken advantage of to enhance their life chances. This paper also examines the challenges and achievements experienced by students, and how their school's positive environment has contributed to a sense of belonging and desire to become successful and productive adults. It explores how the students have not only survived, but have thrived by transforming formidable challenges into opportunities.

Research foci

The foci of this research include:

(1) Immigrant students as the "other".
(2) Perceived work ethics.
(3) Educational opportunities for immigrant students.
(4) "Tech Academy's" positive and supportive environment.

Methodology

Site: "Tech Academy", located in a Florida urban, high needs neighborhood, was selected as the research site based on convenience and its unique history, current academic opportunities, and population of first and second-generation immigrant students. "Tech Academy" was founded in the early 1900's as the region's first secondary school for African-American students, and remained a segregated institution (by race) until 1970. Emerging from divisive desegregation legislation in 2003 the school was transformed into "Tech Academy", a secondary magnet school open to all students in the district, with free tuition and free transportation to the school (District, 2018).

In 2005, only two years since its inception, "Tech Academy" received Florida's highest rating of "A", and continues to maintain this rating. The school was also named one of U.S. News' "Top 100 Best High Schools in the U.S." in 2008, and was ranked as "Number One" by U.S. News for being the "Most Connected Classrooms in the U.S." in 2009 (U.S. News & World Report, 2009; Sheehy, 2011). Moreover, today "Tech Academy" remains only one of a few secondary schools across the U.S. where each student receives a laptop computer.

Participants: Teachers shared information about this research project during their scheduled classes, and purposive snowball sampling methodology was used to identify and invite all first and second-generation immigrant students to join the study. Forty percent (N=8) of the student sample (N=20) were first generation immigrants and 60% (N=12) were second-generation immigrants. Seventy percent (N=14) of the student sample were males, 30% (N=6) were females, and the average age of the sample was 17 years. Half of the participants (N=10) indicated that English was their home language, and half reported single or multiple languages spoken at home, such as Spanish and English. Twenty-five percent (N=5) of student families migrated from Asia or Central/South America, 50% (N=10) reported multiple country origins (parents originating in different countries/areas), 15% (N=3) migrated from the Caribbean, and the remaining 10% (N=2) migrated from North Africa/Middle East.

Seventy-five percent (n=15) of the students were in their final (4^{th}) year, with the remaining 25% (N=5) indicating that they were third or first year students at "Tech Academy". Sixty-five percent (N=13) reported an overall grade point average (GPA) of 3.8-4.0 (on a four point scale where 4 was the highest), while 25% (N=5) reported a GPA of 3.0-3.7 and only two students (10%) reporting a GPA lower than 3.0. Not surprisingly, 55% (N=11) reported their favorite subject areas as mathematics, science and IT, with the remaining students reporting that social science and humanities courses were their favorites. Indicative of a school that maintained high academic expectations for its students, 75% (n=15) of the student sample were enrolled in Advanced Placement/Honors courses, and 65% (n=13) were part of "Tech Academy's" dual enrollment program where students earned two years of college credit while still attending secondary school. Moreover, almost all

students reported obtaining one or more certification in Microsoft Word, Excel, PowerPoint, Adobe, Photoshop etc.

Data Collection: Basic descriptive data were obtained from first- and second-generation immigrant students at "Tech Academy" through anonymous questionnaires, and qualitative data were obtained through extensive focus group discussions open to all first and second-generation immigrant students. Analysis of qualitative data focused on demographic features and addressed key issues such as students' experiences as the "other", and factors that fostered positive academic and career opportunities at "Tech Academy".

Theoretical considerations: building upon and moving beyond the work of John Ogbu

This research builds upon, yet moves beyond the scholarship of John Ogbu that initially focusing on the education and school performance of minorities in the U.S. Ogbu's (1978) initial conclusion was that the difference between the school performance of minority and dominant group students was due to the unequitable treatment of minority groups in society. However, Ogbu began to realign his research in the 1980s to focus on an analysis of the differences in school performance between various minority groups, which he defined as "voluntary immigrants" and "involuntary immigrants" (Ogbu, 1987; Ogbu & Simons, 1998).

Voluntary immigrant minorities, according to Ogbu, were those who, to some degree, willingly left their homelands for what they regarded as better opportunities for employment and expanded social/religious freedoms in the U.S. (Ogbu & Simmons, 1998, p. 164). Conversely, "involuntary (nonimmigrant) minorities" were "people who have been conquered, colonized, or enslaved" (p. 165). These involuntary minorities were brought to, or made part of the U.S. against their will, and they usually experienced less success economically and academically than what Ogbu termed voluntary minorities. Involuntary immigrants often experienced "greater and more persistent cultural and language difficulties" than their voluntary immigrant counterparts, and thus did less well in school (p. 166). However, though Ogbu has provided an invaluable lens to observe and to understand the impediments of being the "other", the work also suggests a more positive experience for voluntary immigrants, socially, economically and academically. Our research will ask if voluntary immigrants at "Tech Academy" are succeeding, and if so, what factors might be responsible for these achievements. Future research will ask if involuntary immigrants (African American students at "Tech Academy" in this instance) also have the opportunity to succeed in a supportive and nurturing school environment. This paper will explore experiences of voluntary immigrants whose academic performance may depend more on the type of school, than on their categorization as voluntary or involuntary immigrants.

Immigrant student demographics

Not surprisingly, students from immigrant households currently represent 23% of all public school students in the U.S., a significant increase over 7% in 1980. Perhaps because of its geographic location, the state of Florida has exceeded this national level of immigrant students enrolled in public schools as 29% of all

households in Florida were classified as immigrant, the sixth highest rate in the country. Conversely, school dropout rates for first generation immigrant students declined from 27% in 2006 to 10% in 2016. This declining dropout rate is even more significant given that in the U.S. immigrant households are often concentrated in high poverty, urban areas (U.S. Census Bureau, 2018).

As Florida shares the Gulf of Mexico with many of its Caribbean and Central American neighbors, we find that about 14% of Florida's immigrant students originated from Mexico and 16% from Cuba (U.S. Census Bureau, 2018). Predictably, given its location, 78% of all immigrant households in Florida reported that Spanish was the first language while 9% of the homes reported Haitian Creole as the language spoken at home (U.S. Census Bureau, 2015).

Thematic findings

(1) Immigrant students as the "other"

No student is immune to the effects of the current spate of bullying in U.S. schools, including declined levels of achievement and attendance as well as increased self-esteem issues. Recent research (Strohmeier, Spiel & Gradinger, 2008) has focused on the impact of bullying on the health and welfare of all students. Unfortunately immigrant students, who are often portrayed in roles as the "other" based on their unique language, ethnic origin and/or cultural practices, may suffer higher levels of bullying than their white, nonimmigrant counterparts may. Fortunately, the first- and second-generation immigrant students included in this research managed to avoid the more devastating effects of bullying that have occurred at their previous schools, though memories of not "fitting in", and being labeled as "other" still suggests a mild form of bullying by exclusion. It is significant to note that all students included in this study agreed that "Tech Academy's" culture did not include the negativity associated with bullying and "othering" experienced in their former Florida secondary schools. A tangential, yet cogent issue linked to "fitting in", was mentioned by several students who had bicultural nuclear families. For example, they mentioned the angst experienced by being too Mexican for one social group, while not being Mexican enough for another student population.

Clearly, the issue of being the "other", and thus not a reflection of the dominant school culture, appeared to be of critical importance during focus group discussions, as well as in the literature, such as Dabach et al. (2017). Three themes emerged from these conversations. First, quite interestingly, and reflective of the previous comment about being too, or not enough Mexican, multiple students shared the problem of not being sure whether they belonged within an American culture, or their home county's culture. Second, many students in our focus groups shared that they had attended another public U.S. school before enrolling at "Tech Academy", mentioning that they never felt that they actually belonged within their previous school's culture. Third, and perhaps most important, students reflected a sense of truly belonging at "Tech Academy", perhaps because none of the focus group students mentioned a need to identify with a dominant school culture, if in fact it actually existed at "Tech Academy". In sum, though perhaps a confusing concept initially, the students experienced a sense of belonging, as none belonged to a

dominant school culture. The following student quotations demonstrate these perspectives:

> *In other American public schools, they don't know how to talk to me and they don't understand why I wear a hijab.* (Focus Group Student, F3)
>
> *Most of the people who come to this school have been outcasts at some point – we come from places where we were the "other".* (Focus Group Student, M2)

(2) Perceived work ethics

Though not a primary focus of this study, an interesting sidebar occurred during focus group discussions when students discussed their parents' perceived appropriate work ethic now that they were living in the U.S. In short, their responses tended to reflect the following parental messages: first, focus group first- and second-generation immigrant students mentioned significant and strong messages emanating from their parents regarding the need to work hard and to succeed in school, now that they were living in the U.S.; second, students often felt that their own parents' sacrifices were reason enough to work hard and to succeed in school, and later in a career. The following two quotations reflect these perceptions:

> *You want to do so much for them. They gave up things for you, so you want to do well so that you can give back to them.* (Focus Group Student, M3)
>
> *I tell them I want to be a psychologist – but what I hear is that I need to be a surgeon and get those big bucks. My father works in maintenance.* (Focus Group Student, M1)

(3) Educational opportunities for immigrant students

Reflecting on perceived school experiences in their home country, had they not immigrated to the U.S. and enrolled in "Tech Academy", our first- and second-generation immigrant student sample responses followed two lines of thought. First, reflections on schooling experiences at "home" centered on the themes of a strict and sever educational environment (whether based on their own experiences by first-generation immigrant students or based on experiences transmitted to them by their parents). Second, our "Tech Academy" focus group strongly emphasized the superior educational opportunities available in the U.S., as compared to perceptions of education in their home countries. Excerpts from these focus group discussions solidify their negative perceptions of education in their home countries:

> *Teachers can hit students for even the smallest thing, like a haircut.* (Focus Group Student, M6)
>
> *Because of the economic crisis at home, teachers don't even show up at private schools.* (Focus Group Student, M7)

(4) "Tech Academy's" positive and supportive environment

During the 2018-2019 academic year, student enrollment at "Tech Academy" reached 628 (in four grade levels), a significantly smaller institution than most secondary schools in Florida, which can enroll up to 3,000 or more students in densely populated areas. Overall, 43% of "Tech Academy's" students were classified as belonging to a minority group (over half of this population consisted of first- and second-generation immigrant students). In comparison, 61% of all students in Florida, and 50% of all students in the U.S. are members of a minority group

(which challenges the concept of minority, unless considering issues of power and voice rather than numerical participation). Clearly, economic status can also place individuals in a less powerful, minority status. In the case of "Tech Academy", 43% of its students were deemed economically disadvantaged, which was slightly better than state's rate of 59% and the nation's average of 48% (Florida Department of Education, 2017; National Center for Education Statistics, 2017a, 2017b).

Countering conventional perspectives on the questionable academic abilities of minorities and lower SES children, "Tech Academy's" students are clearly recognized for their academic achievements. For example, the school proudly boasts a 97.7% graduation rate, particularly when compared to Florida's 80.7% rate and the national average of 84% (Florida Department of Education, 2017; National Center for Education Statistics, 2018).

This significant academic achievement is explained by "Tech Academy's" ability to provide a supportive and appropriate educational environment for immigrant students, as highlighted below:

1) Students may participate in "dual enrollment" programs that allow them to earn credit for the first two years of university while still enrolled at "Tech Academy".
2) Students may enroll in Advanced Placement (AP) courses.
3) Students can obtain certification in computer programming languages.
4) Information technology and computer skills are incorporated in general education and specialty courses.
5) Students may take advantage of internship and job shadowing experiences, which enhances their ability to obtain appropriate future employment.
6) As a public institution, each student pays no tuition, receives a laptop, and enjoys free transportation to school, as long as they reside within the county.

Beyond these significant institutional advantages, however, student focus groups emphasized the notion of feeling accepted within what they perceived to be an extremely welcoming and supportive environment. Moreover, students reflected upon the notion that they were able to exercise their own academic and social choices, instead of living down to the expectations for "others". The following comments clearly articulate these perceptions:

> *Here you have opportunities, no matter who you are.* (Focus Group Student, F6)
>
> *"Tech Academy" prepares for life in a technology workforce.* (Focus Group Student, F5)

Concluding remarks

Moving beyond a current fixation on dysfunctional school experiences, this research has suggested a positive alternative, particularly with regard to first- and second-generation immigrant students in the U.S. Expanding beyond Ogbu's theories of voluntary and involuntary minorities, this paper provides clear examples where voluntary immigrants (who are also perceived as minorities) have moved beyond negative perceptions of academic ability to achieve, to the best of their abilities, within a supportive learning environment. Through numerous focus group discussions, this paper has documented a process whereby students have built upon family expectations, a supportive school environment, and a sense of belonging to

rise above "otherness" to achieve personal academic and career goals. Clearly, the positive and supportive environment of "Tech Academy" provides us with a model for moving beyond bullying and negativity to provide every student, including first- and second-generation immigrants, with access to an equitable and progressive education.

References

Dabach, D. F., Fones, A., Merchant, N. H. & Kim, M. J. (2017): Discourses of exclusion: Immigrant-origin youth responses to immigration debates in an election year. *Journal of Language, Identity, and Education*, 16(1), 1-16.

District (2018): *Student assignment and program access*. https://www.scps.k12.fl.us/district/departments/assignment-access/ (Accessed November 2018).

Florida Department of Education (2017): *"Tech Academy" Academy of Information Technology: School, district, and state public accountability report*. http://doeweb-prd.doe.state.fl.us/eds/nclbspar/year1516/nclb1516.cfm?dist_schl=59_2515 (Accessed November 2018).

National Center for Education Statistics (2017a): *Number and percentage of public school students eligible for free or reduced lunch, by state*. https://nces.ed.gov/programs/digest/d16/tables/dt16_204.10.asp (Accessed October 2018).

National Center for Education Statistics (2017b): *Indicator 6: Elementary and secondary enrollment*. https://nces.ed.gov/programs/raceindicators/indicator_rbb.asp (Accessed November 2019).

National Center for Education Statistics (2018): *Public high school graduation rates*. https://nces.ed.gov/programs/coe/indicator_coi.asp (Accessed October 2018).

Ogbu, J. U. (1978): *Minority education and caste: The American system in cross-cultural perspective*. New York: Academic Press.

Ogbu, J. U. & Simons, H. D. (1998): Voluntary and involuntary minorities: A cultural-ecological theory of school performance with some implications for education. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, 29(2), 155-188.

Sheehy, K. (2011): High schools and technology: Top 10 most connected. *The Huffington Post*. https://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/10/25/floridas-"Tech_Academy"-academy-o_n_1030454.html (Accessed November 2019).

Strohmeier, D., Spiel, C. & Gradinger, P. (2008): Social relationships in multicultural schools: Bullying and victimization. *European Journal of Developmental Psychology*, 5(2), 262-285.

U.S. Census Bureau (2015): *American Community Survey*. https://www.census.gov/acs/www/data/data-tables-and-tools/data-profiles/2015/ (Accessed October 2018).

U.S. Census Bureau (2018): *School enrollment in the United States: October 2017 – Detailed Tables*. https://www.census.gov/data/tables/2017/demo/school-enrollment/2017-cps.html (Accessed October 2018).

U.S. News & World Report (2009): *Best high schools: "Tech Academy" Academy of Information Technology*. https://web.archive.org/web/20090416051254/http://www.usnews.com/listings/high-schools/Florida/ (Accessed November 2019).

Prof. Dr. Karen L. Biraimah, University of Central Florida, USA
Dr. Brianna Ashley Kurtz, University of Central Florida, USA

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Godsend T. Chimbi & Loyiso C. Jita

Putting the Cart before the Horse: Curriculum Reform Policy and Teachers' Pedagogical Preferences

Abstract

When presented with a new curriculum very few teachers teach in accordance with the prescribed pedagogies. This study reports on how teachers in Zimbabwe selected their teaching methods in response to a new curriculum reform policy. Using a qualitative multiple case study design and the theoretical lens of sense-making, the study interrogated teachers' understanding of a new history curriculum and their compliance to its pedagogical prescriptions. Although teachers were aware of the methodological demands of the new history curriculum, they complained that they were not adequately prepared and resourced to implement the new pedagogical policy. Teachers' pedagogical preferences appeared to be in line with their personal philosophy to history instruction, rather than what reform policy prescribed. It appears policy makers placed pedagogical reform policy in front of the teacher; like the proverbial case of putting the cart in front of the horse. To augment compliance with reform policy, it is necessary to in-service teachers on how to use innovative teaching approaches before asking them to change pedagogical practice. Teacher capacity building on innovative instructional strategies and creating learning communities may reduce the gap between policy demands and classroom practice.

Keywords: curriculum reform policy, history pedagogy, sense-making, pedagogical preferences, reform implementation, classroom practice

Introduction

In many countries policy reformers continue to push for the transformation of classroom practice from teacher-dominated didactism to learner-centred constructivism. But this change is not yet evident in many classrooms (Sibanda & Young, 2019; Gleeson, Klenowski & Looney, 2020). Prendergast and Treacy (2017, p. 1) report that: "in most schools there is the common mismatch between the intended curriculum prescribed by policy-makers and the implemented curriculum that is actually carried out by teachers in their classrooms". This gap between reform policy and classroom practice is often expected because teachers are often regarded as resistant to change (Harris & Graham, 2019). However, Drake and Reid (2018) argue that, in many countries, there is little professional development on how teachers' knowledge of innovative teaching practices can be improved. This may partly explain why teachers often find it difficult to reform their practice.

The state-mandated New Curriculum for Primary and Secondary Education in Zimbabwe, disseminated into schools in January 2017, advises teachers to use learner-centred pedagogy and desist from treating learners as empty vessels to be loaded with information (MOPSE, 2015). The new History Syllabus states that: "the teaching of History will be accomplished through the use of the following learner-centred and multi-sensory approaches: games and quizzes, simulation, video and

film shows, educational tours, case study, group discussion, discovery, research, debate, role play, projects, folklore and e-learning" (CDTS, 2015, p. 2). The syllabus does not recommend teacher exposition, lecturing, dictation and writing notes on the board.

Purpose of the paper

Globally, history teachers are known for their unimaginative and boring classroom practices (Schul, 2015); despite numerous reform initiatives to transform the subject from a dead collection of facts to a vibrant body of knowledge. Harris and Graham's (2019) research in England established that history teachers were reluctant to engage in curriculum reform. This paper contributes to the current discourse on why history teachers appear resistant to change in the technology-driven 21st century. As such the research question which undergirds this paper is: To what extent are history teachers in Zimbabwe transforming their classroom practice to align with new pedagogical reform policy?

Review of related literature

Change in classroom practice has always been difficult, slow, complex and controversial. "Trying to change teaching practice is one area of schooling which has proved the most resistant to change", remarks Desimone (2002, p. 434).

Reform as difficult enterprise

Despite many positive changes in schools in the developed world, teachers continue to face reform implementation challenges. Commenting on the state of history instruction in Europe, Stoel, van Drie and van Boxtel (2015, p. 50) point out that: "classroom practice is out of sync with the policy goal of teaching historical reasoning". Reese (2013) adds that progressive ideas are easier to proclaim than implement.

When a signal for reform is sounded, very often there is the misleading assumption that teachers will change their teaching methods overnight, simply because they have been told what is good for them and their students (Prendergast & Treacy, 2017). Three decades ago Cohen (1990, p. 323) argued that: "teachers cannot simply shed their old ideas and practices like a shabby coat, and slip on something new… as they reach out to embrace or invent a new instruction; they reach with their old professional selves, including all the ideas and practices comprised therein". Cohen's thesis appears valid up to the present day.

History instruction in the USA

Warren (2007) observes that existing literature is full of complaints about secondary school history teachers' dull and uninspiring classroom practices. Schul (2015) also points out that there is a serious problem with history pedagogy; because it is characterized by the memorisation of names and dates, and monotonous lectures by teachers. Although Warren and Schul were writing on the American situation, the scenario seems no different in many other countries in Southern Africa.

Pedagogical practice in Southern Africa

A bird's eye view of classroom practice in Malawi, Zambia, Botswana, South Africa, Lesotho and Zimbabwe shows that, despite numerous curriculum reform

initiatives, classroom practice has not changed much in the past 20 or so years (Tabulawa, 2013; Sibanda & Young, 2019). History instruction in Zimbabwean secondary schools remains teacher dominated. Chitate (2005, p. 11) observed "the stubborn persistence of traditional methods that went against the grain of the new 'O' level history syllabus". Some six years later, Moyo and Moyo (2011) found that, history lessons were still characterised by lists of dates and strings of names. Mapetere (2013) also established that simple narratives and uncritical reading of text remain the staple of history teaching in Zimbabwe. It appears chalk-and-talk continue to dominate history instruction in Zimbabwe.

Theoretical underpinnings

A critical element, usually neglected in reform implementation studies, is how teachers make sense of new and often complex ideas enshrined in new curriculum policy (Priestley & Philippou, 2018). This paper taps into sense-making as its theoretical framework because teachers are inquisitive about policy prescriptions that seek to change their practices. Sense-making involves gathering, restructuring and reorganising information to build a reasonable understanding about an issue that is puzzling, troubling or confusing (Wheat, Attfield & Fields, 2016). Teachers make efforts to understand new policy in the light of their past experiences, content knowledge and classroom contexts.

We found sense-making appropriate in exploring teachers' understanding and choice of teaching methods in the first year of implementing new pedagogical reforms. "If teachers do not fully comprehend the goals and form of new policy, then their efforts to implement will invariably fall back on existing practices and ways of thinking", advise Priestley and Philippou (2018, p. 154). By analysing what goes on in the teachers' minds after receiving new pedagogical policy, sense-making provided lens for exploring and explaining why teachers develop certain pedagogical preferences rather than others.

Methodology

Permission to collect data for this study was sought from the University of the Free State in South Africa and the Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education in Zimbabwe. Teachers participated voluntarily and to protect their identities, and those of their schools, pseudonyms are used throughout this paper.

The research design selected is the qualitative multiple case study. Each of the four participants was studied as an autonomous classroom practitioner over an eight-week data collection period. The study was conducted in four schools purposively sampled out of 13 targeted secondary schools in one urban district near Harare. Minichiello and Kottler (2010, p. 12) advise that: "qualitative researchers observe people in their natural setting so that they can learn from them about what they are thinking, and more importantly, why they think and act the way they do". There was no manipulation or interference with the classroom setting and lesson delivery.

The four secondary schools selected were considered to have the best teaching-learning resources. One history teacher was purposively sampled from each school on the grounds that: s/he had a minimum of a degree in history, a diploma in history pedagogy and five years' teaching experience. Curriculum documents collected and

analysed included reform policy frameworks, syllabuses, circulars, research task guidelines and teachers' schemes of work.

Three semi-structured interviews (of approximately an hour long each) were conducted with each participant and audio-taped. These interviews were conducted at the pre-observation, intermittent and exit stages. Intensive non-participatory lesson observations were also made by the first researcher. The plan was to observe each participant teaching the new history curriculum to the same Form 3 class twice a week, yielding a target of 64 lesson observations. However, because of unanticipated interruptions (like staff meetings, invigilation, and cultural festivals), a total of 47 lessons were observed.

Qualitative data analysis techniques used included interpretive content analysis, intra-case analysis, triangulation, thematic aggregation and cross-case analysis.

Findings

Pedagogical demands of the new curriculum

Data from the interviews and informal discussions indicated that all the four teachers were aware that the new history curriculum requires them to use learner-centred pedagogy in their lessons. What differed were the meanings they attached to 'learner-centred' methodology. The theory of cognitive sense-making informs that: "Based on their experiences in the profession, teachers develop a personal system of knowledge and beliefs that act as a cognitive and affective lens through which they look at their job, give meaning to it and act on it" (Marz et al., 2013, p. 15).

In the pre-observation interview Bessie explained that: "The new teaching approach is downloading of notes from the internet, the use of computers, giving pupils some work so that they carry out research on their own using the internet". Computer aided learning appeared to be at the centre of Bessie's conceptualisation of the new curriculum. Angela also recognized e-learning as a major pedagogical innovation in the new history curriculum. She observed that: "The new syllabus requires us to use the internet, computers, interactive boards, white boards, projectors, but all these things are absent… It also encourages learner-centred activities like group work, pair work, presentations, text study and students writing their own notes."

For David, learner-centred pedagogy meant students carrying out research on their own and going on educational tours. "I really liked the aspect of research because we are training our students to be historians at a very tender age. And this idea of trips has brought a lot of interest in my students because working indoors becomes monotonous and boring", he remarked. For Emmy, learner-centredness meant students taking a leading role in a variety of learning activities with the teacher as a facilitator. "We just facilitate and students take the leading role, they can co-ordinate themselves with minimum supervision. There is no room for dictation in the new curriculum", she explained. Each teacher interpreted the curriculum the way s/he understood it.

Classroom practice during reform implementation

After the pre-observation interviews, the first researcher went on to observe each teacher teaching the new history curriculum. Ten lessons were observed in

Angela's Form 3A, 13 in Bessie's Form 3B, nine in David's Form 3D and 15 in Emmy's Form 3E. All the lessons were 35 minutes long each except for David's lessons which were 70 minutes long each. The teachers' efforts to reform classroom practice met a number of setbacks, except for Emmie.

In her lessons Angela tended to start with text study and discussion, showing attempts to align practice with the new pedagogical policy. But she always ended up dictating notes or summarizing them on the chalkboard. Similarly, Bessie started her lessons with some attempts to engage students in teacher-guided discussions or question-answer sessions. But once students failed to answer her questions or engage in any fruitful discussion she would rhetorically ask: "So you don't want to talk? Then take the following notes." A lesson which started with some learner-centred activity ended with Bessie writing notes on the chalkboard. Many such lessons were observed in Bessie's Form 3B. She complained that the class was of below average ability.

But students in David's Form 3D were eager to participate in individual and group presentations, debates and class discussions. They could articulate and justify their ideas in fluent English. This gave credence to David's claims that the 20 students doing history in this class had freely chosen to do history (instead of biology) and were of above average ability. David encouraged students to take notes during class discussions. After the discussions, David dictated notes to reinforce what had emerged from the students. David insisted that: "Making students write their own notes is like leaving your students in the wilderness… Even if students are to write their own notes, it's not everything which is found in the school textbook." David strongly believed that: "History teachers cannot totally do away with exposition and dictation, no matter how progressive they may want to be… In history the teacher remains the master of the subject."

But Emmy's practice contradicted David. All the 15 lessons observed in Form 3E were learner-centred; corroborating what Emmy had said in the pre-observation interview: "Even before the new curriculum, I had already moved from the teacher-dominated approach". She declared that: "To me the new methods are old. I have been using them before the new curriculum, so it's just a continuation. The coming in of the new curriculum doesn't change anything."

Discussion

Liu and Wang (2019, p. 1) remark that: "teachers' classroom pedagogies are found to reflect neither the official curriculum ideas nor their own espoused beliefs". Liu and Wang's findings seem to speak to Bessie's classroom practice. Her teaching methods did not reflect the constructivist teaching methods recommended by the new pedagogical policy, nor did they reflect her own claimed belief that she had changed her practice to learner-centred pedagogy since her return from university. In the pre-observation interview Bessie claimed that: "My attitude was changed by going to the university. Prior to that, I gave pupils notes and sometimes never cared to explain… But when I came back beginning this year (2017), I started to see the teaching of history with another eye…"

Although Bessie talked of fundamental changes in her teaching methods, the lessons observed did not reflect much change in her classroom practice. She continued to dictate and write notes on the chalkboard. Tyack and Cuban (1995, p.

40) observe that there is often a wide gap between 'policy talk' and 'policy action'. Bessie appeared to engage more in policy talk than policy action.

But Angela insisted that: "Methods have not really changed because of inadequate materials… So we are still resorting to our traditional teaching methods – lecturing and dictation." Angela's classroom practice seems to speak to Drake and Reid's (2018, p. 32) observations that: "There is little professional development around the capabilities or knowledge of innovative teaching practices". David's classroom practice also reflected that he was not empowered with the innovative teaching methods that reform policy expected him to use. Although David made efforts to change his classroom practice towards learner-centred pedagogy, he always found himself reverting back to traditional practices, partly because the curriculum reformers had introduced new pedagogical policy before in-servicing teachers on how to use innovative methodologies. The reformers had placed the cart (reform policy) in front of the horse (the teacher), before harnessing and training the horse to pull the cart.

Conclusion

Far-reaching structural changes are necessary in Zimbabwe's education system if fundamental changes are to take place in teachers' pedagogical preferences. Teachers must be involved in the process of formulating reform policy in order to reduce the yawning gap between those who decide and those who implement the decisions. Teacher capacity building on innovative teaching strategies is necessary if constructivist pedagogy is to be successfully enacted. Future studies can explore students' perspectives on the learning methods they like. More often than not, students are the forgotten factor in the politics of curriculum change; although they are the ultimate beneficiaries, or victims, of policy reform.

References

Chitate, H. (2005): Post-independent Zimbabwe's new 'O' Level History Syllabus 2166: A crisis of expectations. *Zimbabwe Journal of Educational Research*, 17(3), 1-30.

Cohen, D. K. (1990): A Revolution in One Classroom: The Case of Mrs Oublier. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 12(3), 311-329.

Curriculum Development and Technical Services (CDTS) (2015): *History Syllabus 4044 Forms 1-4*. Mount Pleasant, Harare: CDTS.

Desimone, L. (2002): How can comprehensive school reform models be successfully implemented? *Review of Educational Research*, 72(3), 433-479.

Drake, S. M. & Reid, J. L. (2018): Integrated curriculum as an effective way to teach 21st century capabilities. *Asia Pacific Journal of Educational Research*, 1(1), 31-50.

Gleeson, J., Klenowski, V. & Looney, A. (2020): Curriculum change in Australia and Ireland: A comparative study of recent reforms. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 52(1), 1-21.

Harris, R. & Graham, S. (2019): Engaging with curriculum reform: Insights from English history teachers' willingness to support curriculum change. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 51(1), 43-61.

Liu, W. & Wang, Q. (2019): Walking with bound feet: teachers' lived experiences in China's English curriculum. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, DOI: 10.1080/07908318.2019.1615077.

Mapetere, K. (2013): The new history concept. *Greener Journal of Educational Research*, 3(3), 134-137.

Marz, V., Kelchtermans, G., Vanhoof, S. & Onghena, P. (2013): Sense-making and structure in teachers' reception of educational reform. A case study on statistics in the mathematics curriculum. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 29, 13-24.

Minichielo, V. & Kottler, J. (2010): An overview of the qualitative journey: reviewing basic concepts. In V. Minichielo & J. Kottler (Eds.) *Qualitative Journeys: Students and Mentor Experiences with Research* (pp. 11-32). New Delhi: Sage.

Ministry of Primary and Secondary Education (MOPSE) (2015): *Curriculum Framework for Primary and Secondary Education 2015-2022*. Harare: MOPSE.

Moyo, T. & Moyo, S. (2011): An Evaluation of the 'New History' Phenomenon. *Zimbabwe Journal of Educational Research*, 23(3), 302-313.

Prendergast, M. & Treacy, P. (2017): Curriculum reform in Irish secondary schools – a focus on algebra. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 50(1), 126-143.

Priestley, M. & Philippou, S. (2018): Curriculum making as social practice: Complex webs of enactment. *The Curriculum Journal*, 29(2), 151-158.

Reese, W. J. (2013): In search of American progressives and teachers. *History of Education*, 42(3), 320-334.

Schul, J. C. (2015): Pedagogical triangulation: The mergence of three traditions in history instruction. *The Social Studies*, 106, 24-31.

Sibanda, L. & Young, J. (2019): Towards a postcolonial curriculum in Zimbabwe: A critical review of the literature. *Africa Education Review*, DOI: 10.1080/18146627.2018.1507622.

Stoel, G. L., van Drie, J. P. & van Boxtel, C. A. M. (2015): Teaching towards historical expertise: Developing pedagogy for fostering casual reasoning in history. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 47(1), 49-76.

Tabulawa, R. T. (2013): *Teaching and learning in context: Why pedagogical reforms fail in sub-Saharan Africa*. Dakar, Senegal: Council for the Development of Social Science Research in Africa.

Tyack, D. & Cuban, L. (1995): *Tinkering toward utopia: A century of public-school reform*. Cambridge. MA: Harvard University Press.

Warren, W. J. (2007): Closing the gap between authentic history pedagogy and everyday classroom practice. *The History Teacher*, 40(2), 249-255.

Wheat, A., Attfield, S. & Fields, A. (2016): Developing a model of distributed sense making: A case study of military analysis. *Informatics*, www.mdpi.com/journal/informatics.

Acknowledgments

This paper is generated from an unpublished PhD thesis: Chimbi, G. T. (2018). Patterns of classroom practice and the history curriculum reforms in Zimbabwean secondary schools. University of the Free State, Bloemfontein, South Africa. https://scholar.ufs.ac.za/xmlui/handle/11660/9979

Dr. Godsend T. Chimbi, University of the Free State, South Africa

Prof. Dr. Loyiso C. Jita, University of the Free State, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Joana Quinta & Teresa Almeida Patatas

The Historical and Political Contexts that Led to the Educational Reforms in Angola

Abstract

Educational reforms in Angola have emerged from changing political contexts in the country's history. The last three stand out: the Veiga Simão reform, which was approved in 1973 (colonial period) but did not come into full force; the 1978 reform (post-independence) coming from the third constitutional revision and the reform begun in 2004 (after national peace) instituted with the publication of Law 13/01, of 13 December. These reforms brought the innovations and measures considered relevant to the necessary changes in the education sector. They aimed to improve the current educational situation and brought guidelines that sought other levels of quality crucial to the country's development. Education being a basic pillar of society, all other sectors have benefited from these reforms, especially the economic, social and cultural ones. The aim of this paper is to show the different historical and political contexts that led to the last three educational reforms in Angola and the consequent changes. In order to achieve this objective, a bibliographical research was carried out, which allowed the authors to know the different contexts of the reforms implemented in education in the country. It is hoped that this paper will contribute to the reflection on how these contexts, with specific outlines, led to the educational reforms in question and cooperated in the necessary educational changes in this African country.

Keywords: historical context, political context, educational reforms, education, Angola

Introduction

The reforms always bring changes to the current system in order to improve it. Thus, there is no sustainable economic growth or evolution in societies in terms of human resources and management policies, without an education system that guarantees quality education within a country.

There is talk of reforms at all levels and sectors of social life. For evolution, in all senses, happens from reflections that are made and that lead to new positions taken in favor of improving the functioning of a nation

Thus, educational reforms are implemented with the purpose of improving the future of societies. This fact involves decision made, taking into account the situation of each nation, to overcome their needs, that is, to guarantee the quality of education in the context in which societies live together.

The objective of this research is to show the different historical and political contexts that led to the last three educational reforms in Angola and the consequent changes. Thus, the methodology used to achieve this objective was bibliographic research, which allowed the authors to know the different contexts of the reforms implemented in the country's education.

Our research focuses on the three educational reforms experienced in Angola beginning with the last of colonial times.

Veiga Simão Reform

Veiga Simão (Portuguese Minister of Education who implemented the educational reform in 1971) aspired to produce a just society, based on human and spiritual principles, which would enable mankind to control the progress, making himself free.

Before independence, Angola also lived through a period of educational debate with the discussion of the Veiga Simão Reformation, which was approved in 1973 but was not fully implemented.

In this sense, Veiga Simão's perspective when creating the reform in the 70s was to implement an education for all Portuguese (at that time, Angola was one of the provinces of Portugal) as there was a shortage, in terms of human and material resources. To do this would be a huge challenge in a conservative country (Simão, 1970). The solution to its evolution plan was education, as it was the indispensable means that granted dignity to human life. In this way, he encouraged the nation to adopt new procedures such as valuing science, new techniques and intellect. "The interventions made in the National Assembly during the presentation, debate and general discussion of Law Proposal nº 25 / X were favorable to him. The proposed Law established the general reform of the Portuguese education system, according to the principles of the Minister of Education, Veiga Simão." (Stoer, 1982, p. 28).

In this way, Veiga Simão showed that the social sciences were dynamized in order to free man from the state of total domination by technology. Education had to be authorized for all citizens, in a meritocratic way, so that inclusion in the nation's elite was based on the capabilities of each person, separately from their socioeconomic status (Stoer, 1982). Thus, the concept of democratization was included in the context of a conservative and nationalist political regime and "it became frequent in his speeches, and there were many alarm signals that his words raised" (Carvalho, 1986, p. 808). In this way, there was an enormous social participation and mobilization in the teaching sector, which led to some considerable changes, especially linked to the modification of learning content at all levels of education.

According to Cardia (1971), the educational system would include:

- Preschool education;
- Schooling;
- Permanent Education.

School education would include basic, compulsory education, being primary and preparatory, lasting four years each. The first four years of primary education were structured, starting from the 1974-75, in periods lasting two years and operating on an experimental basis.

Similarly, secondary education underwent enormous changes. In 1975, the 1st year of the general unified course was created, consisting of the 7th, 8th and 9th years of compulsory education, which combined high school and technical education and showed a similar trunk in the first two years (Reis, 1971).

In terms of higher education, the main changes were analyzed in curricular plans and access conditions. Universities would have scientific, pedagogical and financial autonomy. In this sequence, the industrial institutes of secondary education were converted into higher institutes, identically provided with administrative autonomy and legal personality. Educating all Portuguese was an essential principle of

advancement. In the modern standard of living this principle had an absolute value (Simão, 1970).

According to Veiga Simão "the degree of our education most in need of reform was the university" (Carvalho, 1986, p. 808). The teaching of the university introduced into the life plan of the people, as an indispensable driver of their progress; this being the trainer of technicians and scientists, who study and carry out development programs. The university is the driver par excellence of teachers at secondary and high school levels who propagate education, and is also the driving force for permanent and humanistic culture.

In summary, the Veiga Simão Reform, for some authors mentioned above, emphasizes the control function with the motivation to reduce the opposition's force. To others, however, the Veiga Simão Reform appeared as a democratic constituent of the Portuguese community, that improved the system in a social way. Thus, the process of restructuring the system allowed access to citizenship, at an economic level, that is, the willingness to expand education in order to evolve the economy. Material and human, factors were applied and the education system was standardized, being called OECD (Miranda, 1978).

1978 Reform

According to Mangens (2016, p. VII) the objectives of educational reforms are "to improve the performance, efficiency and capacity of educational systems to adapt to the scientific, technical and socio-economic life of the nation-states". After independence, seeking national development, the government of Angola materialized reforms to implement educational policies considered crucial for the sector.

In this sense, Angola's independence had immediate objectives in the new regime which proposed the destruction of the landmarks of the colonial regime and the immediate construction of a new social, political and economically different country, in order to serve the Angolans who had been excluded and exploited by this regime (Vieira, 2007).

One of the first measures to be carried out in national terms was the fight against illiteracy. According to the Ministry of Education (ME) Indicators, they showed that about 85% of the population of Angola was illiterate. Because literacy was a priority task, the Angolan authorities created the National Literacy Commission in 1976, under the tutelage of the ME.

Thus, the Educational Reform of 1978 took place after the 1st Congress of the MPLA (Popular Movement for the Liberation of Angola), in 1977 and after the 3rd Constitutional Review of Angola. "According to the country's political, economic and social system, the First Reformation (as an independent country) tries to respond to the real needs of the young Nation: consolidating independence and popular power, ending the class struggle, implanting society communist socialist with Marxist-Leninist ideologies; integration and coherence of Education with the needs of society; provide the integral and universal development of the human personality, 'creation of a new man' and promote a better future for the new generation" (Mangens, 2016, p. VII).

According to Zau (2011): After 1978, Angola applied an educational system, which, at the time, reflected the cold war environment, internal conflict and the legacy of a historic past characterized by the slave trade, by shameful racial

discrimination and for the compelled work of the 'contract'. Based on a broad sense of free teaching, the first educational system sought to respond to the high rate of illiteracy and the low rate of schooling, with a view, in the medium and long term, to the training of human resources capable of supplying the stark lack of middle and senior technicians, who, with the onset of the civil war, had, many of them, left the country, as did the vast majority of Portuguese technicians residing in Angola.

The post-national civil war hampered the intended advance of educational reform. According to the Ministry of Education (2008), the context at that time was the destruction of educational infrastructures; decrease in school institutions; migratory flow from rural to urban locations and from inland to coastal areas, thus causing the consequent overcrowding of schools in the main cities as well as in their peripheries; with a sharp reduction in education budgets and staff in the education sector.

In 1977 the adult education subsystem (as presented in the 2004 reform) had a core task and objectives. The recovery of school backwardness based on the triggering of formal, non-formal and informal educational processes in the fields of the elimination of illiteracy and, as a result, the raising of the educational and instructive level of the active community, forming literacy and post-literacy.

In this sequence, Law nº 4/75 of December 9, 1975, enshrined the nationalization of education. In political terms, the nationalization of education had as its immediate objectives to make the education system an instrument of the state and replace the entire colonial apparatus of education and teaching, advancing within the community an education aimed at the people Escola para todos (Vieira, 2007).

Angola, lacking the capacity to intervene, especially for the middle and higher levels of education, asked to the socialist bloc countries, of which it had a coalition for support. Thus, Bulgarian, Cuban, Russian, Vietnamese teachers and others came to Angola, in addition to the few Portuguese who resided in the country.

In the 1978/1980 period in the Republic Popular of Angola, the decisions that emerged from the 1st MPLA Congress on educational policy explained the following as objectives of the education and teaching system (Vieira, 2007):

- Stimulating the people's physical and intellectual capacities;
- Conceiving the new generations and all the working people based on the Marxist-Leninist ideology;
- Boosting national unity;
- Boosting national perception and respect for traditional values;
- Stimulating the love of study and collective work; and
- Ensuring socio-economic development.

Making a comparative analysis, in relation to the number of school enrollments, in the period of 1976/77, according to references of the ME, the enrolled students were 1,032,854 in all levels of basic education, significantly surpassing the colonial period (ME, 2008).

Nguluve (2010) affirms that the educational system developed in the first reform (1977), was based on the increase of educational opportunities, free basic education (from 1st to 4th grades), the obligation to attend the first education level and the pedagogical improvement of the teachers. So it was from the year 1990, when Angola left the single-party system and followed the multi-party political system that it needed to make changes in educational policy. Thus, the Ministry of

Education decided to embrace the intervention strategies, enunciated in the following reform.

2004 Reform

In this context, the first steps began to prepare for the second reform of the education system (in independent Angola). In 2001, the National Assembly of the Republic of Angola approved the Basic Law for the Education System (Law 13/01 of December 31), as already mentioned. This law includes the outline of the new system, so the structure includes the following subsystems:

- Pre-school education subsystem;
- General education subsystem;
- Technical and professional education subsystem;
- Teacher training subsystem;
- Adult education subsystem;
- Higher education subsystem (Chivela et al., 2003, p. 6).

Thus having peace in Angola from 2002, all sectors of society benefited from this achievement. As the end of the armed conflict brought favorable conditions for the implementation of the reform of the education system, since the previous education system "was not profitable and the Ministry of Education started (…) to feel the need to stabilize it and to proceed (…) to its reform" (Zau, 2011, p. 7). This reform was approved by the Law 13/01, of December 2001 (Basic Law for the Education System, referenced above), however implemented only in 2004.

The climate of greater security and the freedom of movement of the population allowed an increase in the numbers of students. However, the war left school infrastructure destroyed or seriously damaged, as well as an insufficient number of active teachers. Therefore, there were difficulties in welcoming more students with the minimum conditions required for this purpose. To respond to these needs, the government has gradually taken steps to increase the budget for the education sector and invest in building schools and employing more teachers.

For Mangens (2016, p. VII) the reform "is required by the new political ideologies of State organization: responding to the free market economy, political mobility, improving the quality of teaching and learning, favoring accessibility and equity in the education system".

In this context, the Angolan Minister of Education (Pinda Simão, referred by the Agência Lusa in 2004) explained that "the educational reform aims to improve the quality of teaching through a strong educational structure and a new educational project, based on recent curricular instruments" (Ernesto, 2016, p. 4).

In 2017, Cabral mentioned in an interview to Angop, that "the reform was carried out according to 4 fundamental objectives, namely: the expansion of the school network, the improvement of the students' learning, the equity of the education system and the internal effectiveness of the system" (Cabral, 2017, p. 14).

The Global Assessment Phase of this reform was carried out in 2012 and the results are diverse, namely: the expansion of the school network and the expansion of the admission capacity for new students. There was also an increase in the numbers of teachers hired and trained and they were more highly valued. The gross enrollment rate was seen to increase (Cabral, 2017). Another positive result was the

achievement of universal primary education by complying with the principle of compulsory education for children from 7 to 14 years of age (Zau, 2011).

It is hoped that this communication has contributed to the reflection on how that particular contexts, with specific outlines, led to the educational reforms in question and cooperated in the necessary educational changes in this African country.

References

Agência LUSA (2004): *Reforma do sistema educativo em Angola*. https://www.rtp.pt/noticias/mundo/reforma-do-sistema-educativo-em-angola_n100386 (Accessed 29.01.2020).

Cabral, J. (2017): *Reforma educativa atinge apenas um dos quatro objetivos propostos*. ANGOP. https://www.angop.ao/angola/pt_pt/noticias/educacao/2017/10/46/Reforma-Educativa-atinge-apenas-dos-quatro-objectivos-propostos,736cfc1b-d1b7-4a3e-957a-197c6da1219a.html (Accessed 29.01.2020).

Cardia, M. S. (1971): *O dilema da política portuguesa*. Lisboa: Prelo Editora.

Carvalho, R. de (1986): *História do ensino em Portugal*. Desde a fundação da nacionalidade até ao fim do regime de Salazar-Caetano, 2ª ed. Lisboa: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian.

Chivela, D. L., Cabral, J. & Nsiangengo, P. (2003): *Caraterização Global do Contexto Angolano e Respetivo Sistema da Reforma Educativa*. Luanda: INIDE.

Ernesto, M. E. (2016): *Terminologia da reforma educativa (2001-2014): Proposta de uma Base de Dados Terminológica para o Ministério da Educação de Angola*. Dissertação de Mestrado em Terminologia e Gestão da Informação de Especialidade Faculdade de Ciências Sociais e Humanas. Lisboa: Universidade Nova de Lisboa.

Lei nº 4/75 de 09 de Dezembro de 1975.

Lei nº 13/01 de 31 de Dezembro de 2001.

Mangens, R. S. (2016): *As reformas do sistema educativo em Angola: Ensino de base 1975–2001*. Dissertação de mestrado. Universidade Lusófona de Humanidades e Tecnologias, Faculdade de Ciências Sociais, Educação e Administração.

Ministério da Educação (2008): *Evolução da educação e ensino em Angola (2002-2008)*. Luanda: Governo de Angola.

Miranda, S. de (1978): Portugal e a O.C.D.E.: expansão económica e planificação educative. *Vértice*, XXXVIV.

Nguluve, A. K. (2010): *Educação angolana: Políticas de reformas do sistema educacional*. São Paulo: Editora Biscalchin.

Reis, A. (1971): O economicismo é um humanismo. *Seara Nova*, n° 1506, 5-17.

Simão, J. V. (1970): *Batalha da educação, discurso proferido pelo ministro da Educação Nacional*.

Stoer, S. R. (1982): *Educação, Estado e Desenvolvimento em Portugal*. Lisboa: Livros Horizonte.

Vieira, L. (2007): *Angola: A dimensão ideológica da Educação 1075–1992*. Luanda: Editora Nzila.

Zau, F. (2011): O percurso da reforma educativa em Angola. *Jornal de Angola*. http://jornaldeangola.sapo.ao/opiniao/artigos/o_percurso_da_reforma_educativa_em_angola (Accessed 28.01.2020).

Assist. Prof. Dr. Joana Quinta, Lusofona University, Portugal
Assist. Prof. Dr. Teresa Almeida Patatas, Lusofona University, Portugal

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Vimbi Petrus Mahlangu

Understanding Toxic Leadership in Higher Education Work Places through Betrayal Trauma Theory

Abstract

The paper emanates from the Chancellor's address that I presented on the 5th of March 2019 at the University of South Africa. Betrayal Trauma Theory (BTT) was used as a lens in understanding toxic leadership in work places. BTT focuses on the ways in which toxic behaviour of leaders may violate or negatively affect trust and well-being of employees. Toxic leadership can bring negative consequences to employees' attitudes toward their leaders and organizations' well-being, and work behaviours. Employees are the less powerful individuals in the leader-employee relationship. They are characterized by a power differential and constrained in what they can do in response to unfavourable treatments they receive from their bosses.

Keywords: toxic leadership, dysfunctional, employee, organisation, Betrayal Trauma Theory, trust, workplace

Introduction

It is important to recognise dysfunctional behaviour in a leader as early as possible, before discontent and toxicity is spread to the organization. Savas (2019) is of the view that such leadership behaviour may show some earlier signs, such as, inadequate attention to employees, driving an agenda of self-interest and declining organizational climate in higher education due to conflicts in relations. If such dysfunctional behaviour is not recognised as soon as possible, then, the consequences of dysfunctional leadership can be huge, even well beyond the organization itself.

Method

The paper investigates toxic leadership in higher education work places. A qualitative approach and interpretive paradigm were used together with Betrayal Trauma Theory (BTT) as a lens in understanding toxic leadership in higher education work places. Methods used in gathering information consisted of a literature review and document analysis.

Purpose of the paper

The purpose of this paper is to understand toxic leadership in higher education work places. Arguments in this paper may encourage positive social change by indicating solutions to improve higher education work environments, thereby increasing leader-employee well-being, and reducing turnover rates in higher education.

Research question

The overarching question this paper is trying to understand is: what do we understand by toxic leadership in higher education work places? Toxic leadership can bring negative consequences to employees' attitudes toward their leaders in higher education and the organization's, well-being, and work behaviours. Employees are the less powerful individuals in the leader-employee relationship. They are characterized by a power differential and constrained in what they can do in response to unfavourable treatments they receive from their bosses. Xia, Zhang and Li (2019) take the view that toxic leaders customarily perform hostile verbal or nonverbal behaviours toward their subordinates.

Betrayal Trauma Theory

This paper uses Betrayal Trauma Theory. This theory focuses on the ways in which toxic behaviour may significantly violate or negatively affect trust or well-being in higher education (Morris, Jr, 2019). Johnson (2018) is of the view that toxic leadership can exist in any organization. It is a style of leadership categorized by an apparent lack of concern for the well-being of subordinates and a personality or interpersonal technique that negatively affects an organizations' climate. In addition, it is a conviction by subordinates that the leader is motivated mainly by self-interest.

Therefore, toxic leadership in higher education work places can create toxic relationships among peers, in which personnel mirror the toxic behaviours of their leaders. The behavioural set of a toxic leader is also often referred as the 'dark-side of leadership' (Savas, 2019, p. 37). There are a lot of behaviours or practices that can be observed as part of the dark side. Therefore, authoritarianism and narcissism are the most common types of dysfunctional leadership in higher education. Also, abusive supervision and unpredictability are added to the classification (Savas, 2019). Before, proceeding to explain those, I would like to add also Machiavellianism, as a commonly observed toxic leadership behaviour to the list.

Authoritarianism is a "behaviour often associated with tyrants like Hitler, or Stalin" (Husain & Liebertz, 2019, p. 19). However, it is not limited to the area of politics, and commonly observed in higher education work places. Authoritarian leaders command and tell other people what to do, and often how to do it. They must exercise choice and reach a certain conviction, but its content must correspond to the official ideology (Germani, 2019). They offer to employees, limited autonomy and space for personal creativity and academic freedom. They tend to lead in a rigid hierarchical structure, with no flexibility. They are usually quick tempered, with little tolerance of failure (Savas, 2019). They demand absolute obedience from subordinates and penalise those acting otherwise. Abusive supervision is defined as subordinates' perceptions of the extent to which supervisors engage in the sustained display of hostile verbal and nonverbal behaviours, excluding physical contact. Unpredictability from a leadership in higher education can be a reason for stress and discomfort among the employees.

Most of the research on the dysfunctional leadership area assumes a leader to act in a certain way consistently, even if it is a toxic behaviour. Machiavellianism is also considered as part of the 'dark triad' of personality (Paulhus & Williams, 2002). It is

described as "aggressive, manipulative, exploiting and devious moves to achieve personal or organizational objectives" (Phillips & Gully, 2012, p. 85).

Marcus Garvey was born in 1887 in St. Ann's Bay, Jamaica. His father was a stonemason and his mother was a household servant. One of the 11 children born to the couple, only Marcus and one sibling survived into adulthood. He fought for Freedom, Justice and Equality. His speaking engagements took on an angry tone, in which he questioned how the United States could call itself a Democracy when across the country people of colour were still oppressed. For example, in the United States, the following was observed when one academic was trying to recruit scholars to discuss biases in journal review processes:

Many faculty members were fearful about publicly sharing their academic lives on university campuses. Some said their narratives were too painful to share, while others expressed that they could be targeted because they were among a few, or the only ones in their departments. Others declined to participate because they felt that their untenured status would be at risk because some managers will target them. This illustrates toxic leadership (Jacques-Garvey, 2009).

There is a symbiotic relationship between leadership and power. Marcus Garvey in his work *The Philosophy and Opinions of Marcus Garvey* reminds us that leadership means everything: '**Pain, blood and death**' **(**Jacques-Garvey, 2009, p. 9**).** This, among other points, implies that leadership takes the metaphor of a battle field. For Garvey, leadership embraces power and he highlights that power is the only argument that satisfies man. He continues that a leader is not satisfied or moved by prayers or petitions. However, every leader is moved by that power of authority, which forces him to do things even against his will. People who lead forget when they come into power that they have an obligation to those who placed them in authority and through selfishness claim to themselves all that is good within the nation, to the exclusion of those who placed them in their positions of trust. "During leadership, it is natural that one should meet opposition because of ignorance, lack of knowledge and sympathy of the opposition in understanding fully the spirit of leadership" (Jacques-Garvey, 2009, p. 2).

Leaders who themselves experienced injustice and violations tend to behave abusively towards their followers. Negative leadership is associated with organizational and supervisory pressure which is a 'trickle-down' phenomenon in which pressure and stress 'flows' top down from one level to the next (Schilling, 2009, p. 120). Reed (2004) is of the view that a toxic leader bullies and threatens. There are three key elements of the toxic leadership syndrome, namely: an apparent lack of concern for the well-being of subordinates; a personality or interpersonal technique that negatively affects organizational climate; and a conviction by subordinates that the leader is motivated primarily by self-interest. Wilson-Starks (2003) views toxic leadership as an approach that harms people and, eventually, the organisation as well. In a toxic leadership environment, people are rewarded for agreeing with the boss and punished for thinking differently, and 'yes' people are rewarded and are promoted to leadership roles, while people who more fully engage their mental resources, critical thinking, and questioning skills are shut out from decision-making and positions of influence (Wilson-Starks, 2003).

The behaviour of toxic leadership

Toxic leaders engage in one or more of the following behaviours, namely: violating the basic human rights of their own supporters and others; demoralizing; intimidating; engaging in unethical activities; deliberately feeding their followers illusions that enhance the leader's power and impair the followers' capacity to act; playing to the basest fears and needs of their followers; in addition, they identify scapegoats and incite others to castigate them; and improperly cling to power (Lipman-Blumen, 2005). According to Aubrey (2012), toxic leaders create lasting and enduring harm to their organisations' culture and climate. They like to succeed by tearing others down. They also want to demonstrate their superiority and dominance over their subordinates (Tavanti, 2011). Toxic leaders have negative leadership tendencies such as insincere leadership; treating followers unjustly; not backing followers; distorting/withholding information, acting disloyally, authoritarian behaviour; attacking followers personally; being inapproachable; acting inconsiderately/ruthlessly, exerting pressure on followers; threatening/scaring followers; pushing goals and regulations; not bearing responsibility, and communicating insufficiently; and not recognizing or motivating (Schilling, 2009). From the perspective of reactions, individuals have the tendency to attempt to restore their own autonomy by withdrawing their efforts and engagement at work when they encounter threatening situations. Thus, employees perceived leaders' abusive treatments decrease their engagement related to helping behaviours to restore their own autonomy (Xia, Zhang & Li, 2019).

Leadership through others

A good leader inspires a team to have confidence in the leader. A great leader inspires a team to have confidence in themselves (Fargo, 2003). Management is paid to solve problems and make decisions; that is why we have such a tendency to rush in, to fix things. But we often fail to take the time to diagnose – to really, deeply understand the problem first. The highly effective manager seeks first to understand, and then to be understood (Covey, 2015).

Organisations are no longer built on force. They are increasingly built on trust. "Truthfulness requires a certain dose of the moral character trait of courage, persevering or pursuing what is good in spite of obstacles" (Turriago-Hoyos, Thoene & Arjoon, 2016, p. 6). Moreover, this presupposes that people ought to understand one another and "management must become the instrument through which cultural diversity can be made to serve the common purposes of mankind in higher education" (Oyler & Pryor, 2009, p. 422). To manage effectively is to unleash people, to remove the barriers and obstacles that crush and defeat the inherent commitment and creativity that people are otherwise prepared to offer. To have joy and pride in one's work is every one's right. Certainly, it is the manager who prevents it or makes it happen (Covey, 2015).

Ethical leaders use position power to serve others whereas unethical ones use power for personal gain and self-promotion. Unethical leaders use control and coercion to impose their goals while censuring opposing views. Destructive leaders describe dissidents and rivals in terms designed to devalue and isolate them while promoting in-group solidarity. "Leaders with personalized needs for power use

authority in an impetuously aggressive manner for self-aggrandizing purpose, to the detriment of their subordinates and organizations. They are impulsive, irresponsible, and extraordinarily punitive, involve dominance, grandiosity, arrogance, entitlement, and the selfish pursuit of pleasure." (Padilla, Hogan & Kaiser, 2007, p. 181).

Accountability and moral competence

Morris, Jr (2019) is of the view that unlike a toxic leader, an effective leader maintains employees' self-esteem while showing errors made or production targets missed. Contrary to an accountable leader, a toxic leader might publicise employees' lack of ability in a derogatory manner or ridicule them. Toxic leadership is not always intentional. For example, leaders with negative traits, such as poor communication or little experience, may be ineffective in their role, which may subsequently lead to unintentional toxicity. In general, ineffective leadership negatively affects the quality of life of the employees and lowers performance in the workplaces.

Accountability and moral competence are two factors that may have a positive effect on ethical leadership in organizations. Accountability involves assessing individual's beliefs and feelings and observing and evaluating the performance and behaviour of self and others. An ethical leader promotes Ubuntu principles such as ethical behaviours and guidance, fairness, integrity, people orientation, power sharing, role clarification, and concern for sustainability through ethical leadership. A mechanism for enhancing ethical leadership is moral competence. Often, ethics and morals are used interchangeably; however, they are clearly different. **Ethics** refer to behaviours or decisions made by individuals within external values that are compatible with the social order system, whereas **morals** refer to internal principles that help individuals recognize what is right or wrong (Ghanem & Castelli, 2019).

Autocratic leaders make decisions without consulting their team members. However, this style can lead to high levels of absenteeism and staff turnover. Democratic leaders make the final decision, but they include team members in the decision-making process. They encourage creativity and employees are often highly engaged in projects and decisions. As a result, team members tend to have high job satisfaction and high productivity (Sousa & Rocha, 2019).

I argue for transformational leadership in higher education work places, where the leader(s) should develop a vision, accountability, responsibility, Ubuntu, respect and trust. The leadership ought to pay personal attention to employees and provide them with intellectual stimulation, challenge them with new ideas and approaches; to ensure that decisions made are democratic; to promote knowledge sharing and help to resolve problems; to welcome different viewpoints; to provide constructive criticism and agree to differ; to involve everyone in the organisational activities by identifying strengths and challenges of all employees. Also, to be able to change problematic behaviours; incentivise employees to seize opportunities to grow and improve; to trust in employee's effectiveness; to create and foster a vision of a new future; to promote creativity and eliminate resistances by changing the mindsets, and to create a willingness to separate from the past '**injustices**' (Sousa & Rocha, 2019, p. 364).

Higher education work places require a collegial type of leadership that relies on intrinsic awards such as friendship, collaboration and shared values. A '**Nut Island**

Effect' should be avoided whereby a leader **ruins a team of deeply committed members**. In other words, if the leader lacks the strategic grip over the organization, individuals tend to focus on roles or individual accomplishments at the cost of the prime mission of the higher education organization itself (Dinesh, 2019, p. 43).

Toxic leaderships tend to minimize their personal discomfort by shifting the blame to other persons and circumstances in conditions of ambiguity, such as unpredictable outcomes. The presence of "a leader who can inspire employees can make a lot of difference in an organisation" (Dinesh, 2019, p. 44).

Findings

The paper recognizes toxic leadership in higher education as a work place stressor for employees. Demotivation can be caused by negative treatments from the leadership, and the employees will not necessarily attribute that negative emotion to their colleagues who are also victims in the organization. In addition, employees will experience their leaders' negative interpersonal treatments together, which can make it necessary for them to rebel against the leadership quietly.

It is important for leaders to avoid showing abusive behaviours in higher education work places and to spend time and money training to change their toxic behaviour patterns even if these behaviours are unconscious. Managers should be alert to employees' efficacy changes caused by toxic leadership behaviours. It should be noted that once employees' self-efficacy decreases, they are likely to withdraw their engagement in those organisations. Generally, toxic leadership can easily increase the employees' negative levels. Leaders should also bear in mind that employees who are victims at the same time will get together to struggle against the leaders' harassment.

Conclusion

My thesis is that successful higher education institutions as organisations will have to shift from hierarchical leadership structures to more collaborative leadership models that will be influenced by the digital revolution where individuals and organisations will engage and collaborate using the internet. Leaders should have **contextual** (the mind), **emotional** (the heart), **inspired** (the soul), **physical** (the body) and **technological** intelligences for coping in leading higher education institutions in the fourth industrial revolution era.

References

Aubrey, D. W. (2012): *The Effect of Toxic Leadership*. Philadelphia: U.S. Army War College.

Covey, S. R. (2015): *The 7 Habits for Managers: Managing Yourself, Leading Others, Unleashing Potential*. USA: Franklin Covey.

Dinesh, K. V. (2019): Good, bad and ugly: Exploring the Machiavellian power dynamics of leadership in medical education. *Journal of Advances in Medical Education & Professionalism,* 7(1), 42-46.

Fargo, W. (2003): Richard Kovacevich Honored with 2003 Arbuckle Award. Stanford: Stanford Graduate School of Business, 19 February.

Germani, G. (2019): *Authoritarianism, Fascism, and National Populism*. London: Routledge.

Ghanem, K. A. & Castelli, P. A. (2019): Accountability and Moral Competence Promote Ethical Leadership. *The Journal of Values-Based Leadership*, 12(1), paper 11.

Husain, M. Z. & Liebertz, S. (2019): Hitler, Stalin, and Authoritarianism: A Comparative Analysis. *The Journal of Psychohistory*, 47(1), 18-36.

Jacques-Garvey, A. (2009): *Philosophy and Opinions of Marcus Garvey*. New York City: The Journal of Pan African Studies 2009 eBook.

Johnson, N. S. (2018): *A Phenomenological Analysis of Military Personnel's Experiences of Toxic Leadership*. Minneapolis: Walden University, Scholar Works.

Lipman-Blumen, J. (2005): *Toxic Leadership: A Conceptual Framework*. *Encyclopedia of Executive Governance*. California: California State University.

Morris, Jr, J. A. (2019): *Understanding Coping Strategies and Behaviors of Employees Affected by Toxic Leadership*. Minneapolis: Walden University, Scholar Works.

Oyler, J. D. & Pryor, M. G. (2009): Workplace diversity in the United States: the perspective of Peter Drucker. *Journal of Management History*, 15(4), 420-451.

Padilla, A., Hogan, R. & Kaiser, R. B. (2007): The toxic triangle: Destructive leaders, susceptible followers, and conducive environments. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 18(3), 176-194.

Paulus, D. & Williams, K. M. (2002): The Dark Triad of Personality: Narcissism, Machiavellianism, and Psychopathy. *Journal of Research in Personality*, 36(6), 556-563.

Phillips, J. M. & Gully, S. M. (2012): *Organizational Behavior, Tools for Success*. USA: Melissa Acuňa.

Reed, G. E. (2004): Toxic leadership. *Military Review Journal*, 84(4), 67-71.

Savas, O. (2019): Impact of Dysfunctional Leadership on Organisational Performance. *Global Journal of Management and Business Research: Administration and Management*, 19(1), 36-41.

Schilling, J. (2009): *From Ineffectiveness to Destruction: A Qualitative Study on the Meaning of Negative Leadership*. Germany: Sage Publication-RWTH Aachen University.

Sousa, M. J. & Rocha, Á. (2019): Leadership styles and skills developed through game-based learning. *Journal of Business Research*, 94, 360-366.

Tavanti, M. (2011): *Managing Toxic Leaders: Dysfunctional Patterns in Organizational Leadership and How to Deal with Them*. https://works.bepress.com/marcotavanti/32/ (Accessed 4 March 2014).

Turriago-Hoyos, A., Thoene, U. & Arjoon, S. (2016): Knowledge Workers and Virtues in Peter Drucker's Management Theory. *Sage Open*, January-March, 1-9.

Wilson-Starks, K. Y. (2003): Toxic Leadership. Transleadership, Inc., 1-4. www.transleadership.com (Accessed 2 March 2019).

Xia, Y., Zhang, L. & Li, M. (2019): Abusive Leadership and Helping Behavior: Capability or Mood, which Matters? *Current Psychology*, 38(1), 50-58.

Prof. Dr. Vimbi P. Mahlangu, University of South Africa, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Maja Ljubetic, Toni Maglica & Željana Vukadin

Social and Emotional Learning and Play in Early Years

Abstract

The aim of the paper is to briefly explain the relationship between *early and preschool-aged children's play* and social-emotional learning (SEL). Play, as the child's dominant activity, ensures his full and healthy development and SEL makes a significant contribution to it. As SEL is important for a children's healthy growth, it has recently been the subject of numerous studies and, as a result, has become an indispensable part of the curricula of educational institutions. Socio-emotional competencies enable children to make achievements and advance both academically and personally. In this paper, the emphasis is placed on symbolic and peer play and it is concluded that both types provide opportunities for enhancing all social and emotional competencies (responsible decision-making, social awareness, social skills, self-awareness, and self-management). The prerequisite for creating the conditions for appropriate SEL of early and preschool-aged children are socially-emotionally competent educators (and parents). It is necessary to enrich study programmes at universities where educators are trained in the field of social-emotional competencies and indirectly to enable parents of early and preschool-aged children to learn this as well.

Keywords: children, play, competency, educator, development, social-emotional learning

Introduction

Play is a fundamental children's activity that is usually associated with childhood. Given that it is the subject of interest of various scientific disciplines (pedagogy, psychology, anthropology, sociology, etc.), it is almost impossible to define it using a single comprehensive definition (Johnson et al., 2005, in Samuelsson & Carlsson, 2008).

For the purposes of this paper, we opted for a relatively recent definition by Rajić and Petrović-Sočo (2015). Seen in the context of modern childhood, play is perceived as the child's practice, i.e. the child's free activities beyond ordinary and real life. No extrinsic gain is associated with it, but it is a process in which the child enjoys himself and is an end in itself. Play is a complex, multifunctional and intrinsic activity that contributes to the child's overall development (social-emotional, motor, cognitive and verbal ones). By playing, children satisfy their need for having fun, socializing, moving, exploring, collaborating, and building a positive self-image, they develop their creativity and the ability to successfully cope with and solve problem situations. As it is the dominant activity for early and preschool-aged children, which occupies most of their time, playing is also understood as "a state of existence that is largely focused on the current fun experience and less on the achievement of a specific goal" (Miljković, Đuranović & Vidić, 2019, p. 206). The benefits of children's play are multiple in terms of both specific learning (development of speaking, listening, and observation skills, development of the ability to follow complex instructions, to wait for one's own turn, of perseverance,

responsibility, etc.) and personal, i.e. social learning (building self-esteem and respect for others, developing tolerance, honesty, empathy, responsibility, recognizing and understanding one's own and other people's feelings, etc.). Depending on the child's age and development and his personal characteristics, he expresses a desire and a greater or lesser interest in involving adults in his own play activities. If included in child's play, adults may play different roles (Miljković, Đuranović & Vidić, 2019), e.g. an observer, manager and facilitator, mediator or active participant in the play. Adults (parents and/or educators-professionals) are those who are called upon to design optimal conditions, an interactive environment, and to offer appropriate materials that enable the start and development of children's play.

Numerous studies have shown that play contributes to learning in a variety of areas, and one of the most significant ones for the current and future development and success of a child is the social-emotional one. The term Social Emotional Learning (SEL) refers to the acquisition of knowledge and skills that enable children (and adults) to recognize and manage emotions, to achieve and maintain interpersonal relationships, and to reach effective decisions. It is linked to social-emotional competencies (self-awareness, self-management, social awareness, social skills, responsible decision-making), and is enhanced by social-emotional learning (CASEL, 2008). In recent years, many scholars have become very interested in SEL and the importance of integrating it into official curricula has been recognized. The results of a series of scientific studies have confirmed that social-emotional competencies are key to the success and children's accomplishments in their private and professional lives (Takšić & Smojver-Ažić, 2016). Without a doubt, children with developed socio-emotional competencies progress better in the academic and social fields (Haggerty, Elgin & Woolley, 2011). The development of prosocial and emotional skills is reflected in school success, better physical and mental health, the child's self-esteem and greater confidence in the environment (Takšić & Smojver-Ažić, 2016).

Social-emotional learning

Through SEL, children and adults acquire and effectively use the knowledge and skills and express attitudes needed to understand and manage emotions. During this process, they set and achieve positive goals, feel and show empathy, establish and maintain good relationships, and make responsible decisions (CASEL, 2017). Zhou and Ee (2012) state that the primary goal of SEL is to develop five interconnected cognitive, affective and behavioural competencies identified by CASEL (2017), namely: self-awareness, self-management, social awareness, relationship skills, and responsible decision-making. Thus, SEL can be defined as the process of acquiring and enhancing basic social-emotional competencies.

Self-awareness – relates to an aspect of social-emotional competence that includes assessing, identifying and recognizing one's emotions. It includes beliefs, values, self-confidence, self-respect, curiosity, optimism, recognition of strengths and weaknesses as well as expressing emotions in line with the current situation (Zhou & Ee, 2012). Although pre-schoolers have a well-defined and stable sense of self, self-awareness is further developed during the early elementary school years.

Self-management – relates to the ability to cope with emotions in a productive way, being aware of one's emotions, monitoring and changing them when needed to help the child cope with different situations. This aspect involves dealing with stress and anger, persevering despite obstacles, expressing emotions appropriately, exerting self-control, setting and achieving goals, showing flexibility and adaptability. Empirical data show that children who can manage their emotional experiences in an emotionally exciting situation at play are more successful in their peer relationships (Zhou & Ee, 2012).

Social awareness – relates to the ability to understand others and appropriately respond to their feelings, the ability to empathize and to put oneself in the position of another, and to respect interpersonal similarities and differences (Zhou & Ee, 2012). Another important component of social awareness is a sense of belonging to one's family, community and culture. Emotions play a significant role in the ongoing process of children trying to understand their own and others' behaviour, and it is precisely the information that people receive and send to each other that determine the interaction. If a child is unable to interpret emotions, he may see his environment as confusing, uncomfortable, potentially threatening, and dangerous.

Social skills – focus on building and maintaining long-lasting healthy relationships with others, resisting unwanted social pressure and resolving conflicts constructively. Learning social skills such as starting and continuing conversations, teamwork, collaborating, listening, seeking help, negotiating, giving feedback, joining a small group, assertiveness and conflict resolution is intensively pursued in preschool and early elementary school years (Munjas Samarin & Takšić, 2009).

Responsible decision making – includes behaviours that are consistent with ethical standards and social norms and includes a sense of responsibility and respect for others and the community. It also encompasses taking responsibility, acknowledging mistakes and oversights, and includes leadership skills. This aspect is a complex task for children as it involves solving problems by analysing social situations, identifying problems, setting pro-social goals, and determining effective ways to resolve peer disagreements (Zhou & Ee, 2012).

The stated competencies are a *prerequisite for better adaptation* to different circumstances and situations. They also enable better academic success and the development of more prosocial behaviours, and fewer emotional and behavioural problems (Durlak et al., 2011). SEL promotes competency development, reduces the impact of risk factors, and increases the impact of protective factors with the aim of prosocial adjustment (Durlak et al., 2011). SEL programmes are key to gaining the competencies necessary for children's success and achievements in their personal and professional lives and advancement, both academically and socially (Haggerty, Elgin & Woolley, 2011).

The importance of integrating SEL into curricula has been recognized in recent years. The developmental potential of emotional intelligence and the understanding that emotional competence is crucial for adapting and functioning successfully in different areas of life, has encouraged the development of SEL programs.

Preschool-aged child's play in the function of SEL

There are several different types of children's play and their classifications. One of the more recent ones is by Klarin (2017, in Miljković et al., 2019), according to

which plays are divided into imitation/matching, body play/movement, object play, board games (including games with rules), imaginative and pretend play, storytelling-narrative play, and creative play. Recently, scholars have been increasingly focused on researching computer games whose dynamics of development is expanding. Klarin (2017) points out that virtual games allow children to leave the physical and enter the virtual world, which is a new zone of free movement. The main feature of virtual games is the breaking down of space barriers for communicating with other children. Numerous studies of the impact of computer games on children's development indicate positive (improving perceptual abilities, speed of decision making, sharpening their sight, etc.) and negative (*video game addiction*, developing violent behaviour, obesity, lack of direct social contacts, etc.) effects.

The concepts of play and learning have long been analysed separately. Playing was linked to kindergarten and preschool, while teaching was reserved for the school. However, research shows that there is no longer room for such thinking, and it is difficult today to determine the line between playing and learning. Learning results from each form of play and it is considered that these two concepts are an inseparable whole. Children integrate the playing and learning process and make no distinction because they do not care about the terminology – playing or learning as long as they are interested in and fulfilled by the process (Pyle & Bigelow, 2015).

Understanding children's play in the context of SEL seems significant in terms of how children's play contributes to the social and emotional development. Socialization is a complex learning process during which by interacting with the social environment an individual adopts the attitudes, knowledge, values, and behaviours necessary to participate in the life of a society. One of the most important effects of socialization is the development of a complete personality as a stable structure, his way of thinking, feeling and behaving as an individual (Mahmutović, 2013). Primary socialization takes place during the preschool age, from the birth of a child to school, through contacts with adults, and especially with peers, and this learning experience is irreplaceable. Preschool children have a strong need to socialize and the first true social relationships can be noticed around the age of two. Relationships in a group are important as early as the preschool period, so it is extremely important for children to what extent they are accepted by peers (Klarin, 2017).

Play is a dominant process in early childhood and the title of a friend is given to the child who participates in the play process with another child. The dominant activity between friends is a symbolic play that plays a big role in SEL. It teaches rules, social roles, and relationships. It also teaches how to anticipate the other persons' behaviours. Playing requires children to communicate and collaborate, which thus deepens the relationships between children. In addition to social development, friendship has its influence on both regulation and control of emotions (Klarin, 2017). In joint activities that intensify between the ages of three and five, the number of children involved in playing activities increases, which encourages a more complex social and emotional development. Children who participate in playing with children of the same or different age, expand their own understanding of the social world, the relationships in it and its linguistic diversity, and learn to cooperate, share and respect each other (Rajić & Petrović-Sočo, 2015). By setting

rules, discussing, negotiating and resolving conflicts, children spend more and more time in conversation and thus encourage the development of social skills (Klarin, 2017).

Much scientific evidence confirms that playing with others is necessary for the development of social competence and indicates a high development risk in adolescence and adulthood if the child has not reached the minimum level of social competence by the age of six (Stegelin, 2005). Other researches indicate that socio-emotional, academic and cognitive development, as well as civic awareness, are enriched if the child is regularly exposed to numerous opportunities for building social competence during childhood (Stegelin, 2005).

In order to gain and maintain pleasure in playing together, children need to develop a range of competencies (understanding others' perspectives and feelings, sharing their own ideas and feelings, expressing empathy, etc.). Children sometimes use play to understand and express emotions regarding situations that are too complicated for them to verbalize. The more children play, the more they learn about the causes, consequences and expressing emotions. These competencies enable children to anticipate and understand the behaviours of others and to respond to those behaviours through emotions and facial expressions. Research shows that children who exhibit less empathy have more difficulty participating in play and continuing to play with other children (Uyanik et al., 2018).

Galyer and Evans (2001, according to Uyanik et al., 2018) emphasize the relationship between expressing empathy in everyday life and the frequency of symbolic play. Thus, preschool children who often participate in symbolic play are extremely successful in regulating and properly expressing their emotions. Symbolic play encourages intrinsic motivation, flexibility, positive emotions, the ability to release negative experiences from life and focus on the process rather than the result of an activity. It makes it possible to manipulate and relive different emotions, thus becoming a space for learning.

Children learn a lot about emotions interacting with adults, and then engage in further emotional interactions with peers, especially during the pretend play. By quarrelling with siblings, but also listening to parents' explanations and negotiating with them, children become more sensitive to the feelings of others. The knowledge that children have about emotions helps them in social relationships and in getting along with others, and they become more willing to apologize or cooperate to maintain relationships, recognizing the importance of respecting other people's emotions. Through play, especially those that have rules, the child learns to delay pleasure and thereby gains control of his own emotions and behaviour. By playing, the child learns to self-regulate his behaviour by developing different mechanisms and evaluating his own emotions in order to adapt to a particular situation (Klarin, 2017).

Symbolic play is an appropriate space for learning how to regulate and properly express emotions, and thereby self-management and self-awareness. The various exciting and tense situations at play require the child to persevere, to be flexible and adaptable, thus opening up space for SEL. The more competent the children are, i.e. the better they regulate and express their feelings, and also the more they understand other people's feelings, the easier it will be for them to socialize and to be more successful.

Conclusion

The importance of SEL on the child's overall and healthy development is indisputable, as is the importance of child play in this context. Bearing in mind the results of scientific research that supports the importance of children's play in the process of SEL, adults and experts, in particular, are responsible for designing an optimal space-material environment that will allow and encourage free children's play and peer interactions, and for offering the games and activities that will promote SEL to all children and especially to those in deficit in this area of development.

A well-educated educator, himself, should have developed social and emotional competencies in order to enable the development of the same competencies in children. One of his primary tasks is to create a context that allows a complex play scenario, which enables the children's play to last long and not be interrupted, to ensure the choice of materials and teammates, and to provide playtime. The educator's task is also to inform and educate parents in order to develop an environment and atmosphere in the family that facilitates and encourages quality parent-child-other children interaction and ensures enough time for socializing with children. Playing together, discussing, planning, communicating with each other, resolving and/or preventing conflict while playing are all valuable social experiences for a child.

References

Collaborative for Academic, Social and Emotional Learning (CASEL) (2017): https://casel.org/core-competencies/ (Accessed 21 February 2018).

Durlak, J. A., Weissberg, R. P., Dymnicki, A. B., Taylor, R. D. & Schellinger, K. B. (2011): The Impact of Enhancing Students' Social and Emotional Learning: A Meta-Analysis of School-Based Universal Interventions. *Child Development*, 82(1), 405-432.

Haggerty, K., Elgin, J. & Woolley, A. (2011): *Social-Emotional Learning Assessment Measures for Middle School Youth*. Seattle: Social Development Research Group, University of Washington.

Klarin, M. (2017): *Psihologija dječje igre*. Zadar: Sveučilište u Zadru.

Mahmutović, A. (2013): Značaj igre u socijalizaciji djece predškolskog uzrasta. *Metodički obzori,* 8(18), 21-33.

Miljković, D., Đuranović, M. & Vidić, T. (2019): *Odgoj i obrazovanje: iz teorije u praksu*. Zagreb: IEP-D2 & Učiteljski fakultet Sveučilišta u Zagrebu.

Munjas Samarin, R. & Takšić, V. (2009): Programi za poticanje emocionalne i socijalne kompetentnosti kod djece i adolescenata. *Suvremena psihologija*, 12(2), 355-371.

Pyle, A. & Bigelow, A. (2015): Play in kindergarten: An interview and observational study in three Canadian classrooms. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 43(5), 385-393.

Rajić, V. & Petrović-Sočo, B. (2015): Dječji doživljaj igre u predškolskoj i ranoj školskoj dobi. *Školski vjesnik*, 64(4), 603-620.

Samuelsson, I. P. & Carlsson, M. A. (2008): The Playing Learning Child: Towards a pedagogy of early childhood. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research*, 52(6), 623-641.

Stegelin, D. A. (2005): Making the Case for Play Policy: Research-Based Reasons to Support Play-Based Environments. *Young Children*, 60(2), 1-22.

Takšić, V. & Smojver-Ažić, S. (2016): *Promocija zdravlja razvojem socio-emocionalnih kompetencija u školskom okruženju.* Katedra za socijalnu medicinu i epidemiologiju, Medicinski fakultet Sveučilišta u Rijeci.

Uyanik, G., Arslan Ciftci, H., Unsal, O., Kilic, Z. & Degirmenci, S. (2018): Analysing the Relationships between Preschool Children's Play Skills and Their Social Competence and Emotion Regulation Skills. *Croatian Journal of Education*, 20(Sp.Ed.3), 243-257.

Zhou, M. & Ee, J. (2012): Development and Validation of the Social Emotional Competence Questionnaire (SECQ). *The International Journal of Emotional Education*, 4(2), 27-42.

Prof. Dr. Maja Ljubetic, University of Split, Croatia

Dr. Toni Maglica, University of Split, Croatia

Željana Vukadin, bacch. paed., University of Split, Croatia

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Mashraky Mustary

The Impact of Teacher-Student Relationships in Public Schools, Private Schools, and Madrasahs in Bangladesh

Abstract

Education is a very important aspect of a person's life. In Bangladesh, several different types of institutions are available for youth's education, including private schools, public schools, and religious schools called madrasahs. For these institutions to continue to run properly, teachers, students, and a curriculum must be present. A major aspect of the education system in Bangladesh is Islam and religious learning. The main objective of this study is to identify the effect of the teacher-student relationship in public schools, private schools, and madrasahs in Bangladesh. The research methods, including document review, observation and survey, were used to collect information from the target respondents in public, private, and madrasah schools in Bangladesh. The results show that teachers have a different kind of relationship with their students, depending on the school in which they are teaching. This is strongly determined by the number of students in the school, the degree of accessibility to each school, and social perceptions of the teacher-student relationship. The main purpose of this study is to understand how teacher-student relationships impact student's grades since these relationships have a great effect on the learning environment in all three types of institutions. Positive relationships help students feel loved and acknowledged, consoled and secure. This research, concentrated on three schools to perceive how educators' relationships with students have impacted their school life and how it has affected their studies.

Keywords: teacher-student relationship, public schools, private schools, madrasahs, Bangladesh

Introduction

For effective learning to occur in schools, a strong relationship between the teacher and students is very important. Teachers must acknowledge the impact they have on their students and take into consideration the perceptions of the students towards them. The teachers must ensure that they meet the academic and emotional needs of the learners. Classroom environments which facilitate a positive culture, as well as healthy associations, is critical for motivating learners to study more (Mustary, 2018). With a good relationship, the teacher can allow the student to do their schoolwork alone, consulting the teacher in case of any difficulties. When students get to a formal institution, the relationship with their teachers is the foundation of their school life and, with positive relationships, students can adjust quickly to their learning environment (Lee, 2016).

Important information can be obtained on an institution's operations by holding conversations with teachers and observing activities in the classes. Research has shown that forming positive and close teacher-student relationships will help the students feel safer and more secure in their respective institutions, have a feeling of competence, be in a better position to connect with their peers and acquire better

grades. Positive relationships help students to feel loved and acknowledged, appreciated and secure (Osterman, 2016). These relationships have a great effect on the learning environment in all three institutions in Bangladesh. In this examination, three types of schools were examined to perceive how the educator-student relationship has been created and how it has affected the students.

Bangladesh has empowered relational connections and cooperation among students and their educators. Although many researchers have explored these areas, finding from studies such as that conducted by Dronkers and Roberts (2008) suggest the relationship between students and their teachers affects the student's performance. The kind of connection created between teachers and their students can impact the student's performance (Hamre & Pianta, 2011). This study elaborates on the difficulties found in creating teacher-student relationships and how this has affected the students.

Background of the study

This study examines why education is especially important to the people of Bangladesh. The country has three different types of educational institutions, including private schools, public schools, and religious schools called madrasahs. Approximately 80% of the people in Bangladesh can only afford to send their children to public schools. For these institutions to keep running properly, teachers, students, and curriculum must be present. Since Bangladesh is an Islamic state, the school incorporates Islamic religious studies as one of the course to be covered (Hamre & Pianta, 2011). Therefore, the religious aspect of education is included in both the public and private sectors.

To be able to build a strong developing nation, the education system must be of high quality the different institutions should not be developed for competition, but aim at excellence in education. Due to the high population in Bangladesh, there has been statistical evidence that many students have too few teachers in their schools. (Banik & Kumar, 2019). This study focuses on three public schools, three private schools, and three madrasahs and determines how teacher-student relationships have been developed and how that has impacted students (Jacobson, 2000). To establish a better environment for students' learning programs, good teacher-student relationships are highly recommended (Jacobson, 2000).

Students are in a better position to attain high grades when surrounded by an environment filled with positive relationships and interactions. Creating a positive environment for students will help them feel admired, respected, appreciated and acknowledged by their teachers. Students need to feel a sense of trust coming from their teachers. The ratios between teachers and students in private schools, public schools, and madrasahs can be shockingly high, depending on the school. To create a healthy, effective relationship between the teachers and their students, the education system should try to maintain smaller class sizes. However, Bangladesh is at present, struggling to develop positive interactions between teachers and students due to the poor teacher-student ratio (Hossain, O'Neill & Strnadová, 2019). It is worth noting that not all instructors see their responsibility as building close relationships with the students and that not all the teachers fully understand the positive impact that good relationships can bring to students (Mustary, 2018).

Statement of the problem

This was the first study to be conducted on the impact of teacher-student relationships in three public schools, three private schools, and three madrasahs.

To acquire this information, the methods used were document review, observation and survey to collect information from the target respondents in the designated schools. The observations were however, adversely affected by the large class sizes. Another challenge faced by this study was the missing research records pertaining to the level of education offered in Bangladesh and the reasons for its lack of attainability. Due to the level of poverty in Bangladesh, not every person is able to afford a good education and most people drop out early. While research studies have focused on the many students who drop out, none have attempted to determine the level of education attained by those who continue with their studies (Hossain, O'Neill & Strnadová, 2019).

Significance of the study

This study is important due to the significant impact of teacher-student relationships on academic performance. Students who have a positive relationship with their teachers are bound to perform better, since it is easy for them to ask questions of their teachers. Such positive relationships mostly occur when the teacher-student ratio is low, which allows teachers to create a positive environment for the students (Hamre & Pianta, 2011). This study attempted to discover why not all institutions can create positive environments for the students. The study attempted to provide an understanding of how teacher-student relations have impacted the students and how it helps the student's performance (Asadullah, Chaudhury & Dar, 2007). The relationship between the students and their teachers plays a significant role in their academic performance and it also aids in shaping the social lives of the students as Osterman (2016) highlights.

Research objectives

The study had three objectives:

- To implement a comparative analysis between public, private and madrasah schools in Bangladesh.
- To find out how teacher-student relationships have impacted education in Bangladesh.
- To compare the different relationships between the teachers and students depending on the institutions they attend.

Literature review

Because Bangladesh has a very high population, 80% of them are poor and live on less than 3 dollars a day (Biswas et al., 2019). The largest age group in the population is the youths and teenagers; due to the high birthrates, the number of schools has continued to increase (Biswas et al., 2019). Thus, illiteracy is a major issue in Bangladesh and the number of teachers working in schools is quite low, making it more difficult for students to have a relationship with their teachers. When it comes to the quality of teachers in Bangladesh, over 40% of those who teach in

public schools are not university graduates (Burton, Eyres & McCormick, 2019). According to recent research reports, Bangladesh is one of the nations globally with the highest number of students in primary and secondary schools. Over 25 million students are at this level, which has caused a problem in education, since the number of schools in Bangladesh is inadequate. Private schools are attended by the 20% who are rich (Burton, Eyres & McCormick, 2019). Those students who come from poor backgrounds cannot afford to attend public schools and thus drop out. However, madrasahs are quite affordable since teaching Islam is mandatory in Bangladesh. Every child growing up is encouraged to learn more about the Bangladesh formal religion. Since Islam is their formal religion, religious learning is more common in the nation. The ratios between the educators and students in non-public schools, private schools and madrasahs are amazingly high, depending on the school. This is the conclusion and repeats what has been said earlier. Bangladesh is battling to keep up positive relationships among educators and students because of the high ratios. Huge classes containing up to a hundred students may be difficult to establish a teacher-student relationship (Burton, Eyres & McCormick, 2019).

Methodology

Direct observation (Lee, 2012) was conducted in three public schools, three private schools, and three madrasahs. Due to the high number of students found in public institutions, it was not as easy to capture student interactions with teachers. Classrooms observations provided the data needed to complete the study.

The survey was conducted by involving three participants from each of three institutions who came from both urban and rural areas in Bangladesh. Schools were selected based on their location to compare their performances and the students' relationships to their teachers. The students were asked whether they had established a teacher-student relationship or not. They were asked to report on the ways their teachers interacted with them.

Data analysis

The information acquired from various documents and reports, the observations and survey responses were then analyzed. Basically teacher-student relationships depend on the school the student attends, as well as on the student's individual personality. By using a one-word description the students reported what they had observed in schools by using always, sometimes, never.

The information received from the public classroom observation and survey is as follows:

- Teachers do not have personal relationships with their students because the classrooms include too many students.
- Teachers do not know all their students.
- Teachers barely pay attention to their students.
- Teachers have difficulty in interacting with the students.
- Teachers are not able to help all their students.

The information received from the private classroom observation and survey is as follows:

- Teachers are very attentive in class.

- Teachers like being in their classrooms.
- Teachers make the students feel appreciated.
- Teachers make students feel heard.
- Teachers are willing to answer any question asked by a student.
- Teachers have a great relationship with their students.
- Teachers have great respect for their students.

The information received from the madrasahs classroom observation is as follows:

- Teachers pay attention to their students.
- Teachers are ready to answer student's questions.
- Teachers make the students feel appreciated.
- Teachers are always productive in class.
- Teachers are fair to their students.

The data collected from the survey concludes:

- Public school students never interact with their teachers.
- Private school students always have a relationship with their teachers.
- Madrasah students sometimes interact with their teachers.

By comparing the three outcomes of the teacher-student observation analysis, it appears that students from private schools and madrasahs have a very positive relationship with their teachers, unlike students from public schools. Students from public schools are the majority, since their parents are too poor to pay for better schools. The high number of students in public institutions is the main cause of a negative impact when it comes to the teacher-student relationship in Bangladesh. The overall results concluded that students who attend private schools have the best teacher-student relationships and students who come from poor families and attend public schools have a very poor relationship with their teachers. The madrasahs demonstrated a slightly poorer relationship between the students and their teachers due to the number of students attending madrasahs classes. With large student numbers, it is hard to establish a teacher-student relationship. Students from public schools have a lower chance of performing well due to their lack of positive interactions with their teachers, as well as the fact that their teachers are not university graduates (Dronkers & Robert, 2008). This has led to the development of poor-performing patterns for students who attend public schools. Since most of the youth population attend public school, it is difficult to end poverty in Bangladesh. Students who do not have a relationship with their teachers tend to perform poorly because they do not have a platform for asking questions.

Conclusion

It is clear that the teacher-student relationship has a great impact on student school life. The teacher-student relationship is greatly determined by the kind of school that a student attends. These relationships greatly vary between public schools, private schools, and madrasahs. After conducting the research, it is clear that public school teachers are at a great disadvantage, since their classrooms have so many students that the teachers are not able to create a teacher-student relationship. Private school students are at an advantage, since class sizes are small and they are able to have a relationship with their teachers. These relationships have

helped students to feel respected, appreciated and confident. Students in both the madrasahs and the private schools are likely to perform better than students in the public schools. The education system in Bangladesh should make the environment in institutions conducive to learning by encouraging peers to undertake teaching programs so as to end the struggle being faced in classrooms by teachers who are likely to teach over 100 students in a single class. However, the teacher-student relationship can have a positive impact on both the teacher and the student.

References

Asadullah, M. N., Chaudhury, N. & Dar, A. (2007): Student achievement condition upon school selection: Religious and secular secondary school quality in Bangladesh. *Economics of Education Review*, 26(6), 648-659.

Banik, P. & Kumar, B. (2019): Impact of information literacy skill on students' academic performance in Bangladesh. *International Journal of European Studies*, 3(1), 27-33.

Biswas, T., Townsend, N., Islam, M. S., Islam, M. R., Gupta, R. D., Das, S. K. & Al Mamun, A. (2019): Association between socio-economic status and prevalence of non-communicable diseases risk factors and comorbidities in Bangladesh: findings from a nationwide cross-sectional survey. *BMJ open*, 9(3), e025538.

Burton, S., Eyres, I. & McCormick, R. (2019): The Educational Context of Bangladesh: An Overview. In Eyres, I., McCormick, R. & Power, T. (Eds.) *Sustainable English Language Teacher Development at Scale: Lessons from Bangladesh* (pp. 9-22). London: Bloomsbury Academic.

Dronkers, J. & Robert, P. (2008): Differences in scholastic achievement of public, private government-dependent, and private independent schools: A cross-national analysis. *Educational Policy*, 22(4), 541-577.

Hamre, B. K. & Pianta, R. C. (2011): Early teacher-child relationships and the trajectory of children's school outcomes through eighth grade. *Child Development*, 72, 625-638.

Hossain, S., O'Neill, S. C. & Strnadová, I. (2019): What really matters for students' school satisfaction in Bangladesh? *Psychology in the Schools*, 56(5), 670-689.

Jacobson, L. O. (2000): Editor's choice: Valuing diversity: student-teacher relationships that enhance achievement. *Community College Review*, 28(1), 49-66.

Lee, S. J. (2012): The effects of the teacher-student relationship and academic press on student engagement and academic performance. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 53, 330-340.

Lee, S. J. (2016): The relations between the student-teacher trust relationship and school success in the case of Korean middle schools. *Educational Studies*, 33(2), 209-216.

Mustary, M. (2018): Theoretical considerations regarding the connection between teacher-student relationship and students' academic performance in Bangladesh. *Sophia University Studies in Education*, 103, 93-106.

Osterman, K. (2016): Students' need for belonging in the school community. *Review of Research*, 70(3), 323-367.

Mashraky Mustary, Doctoral Student, Sophia University, Japan; Lecturer, Begum Rokeya University, Rangpur, Bangladesh

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Claudio-Rafael Vasquez-Martinez, Felipe Gonzalez-Gonzalez, Francisco Flores, Martha Guerra, Jose-Gerardo Cardona-T, Liliana Valdez-Jimenez, Piero Espino, Eugenia Olaguez, Humberto Muñoz, Jorge Chavoya, Hector Rendon, Luz-María Zúñiga, Yolanda Franco, Sandra-Yarely Rojas-Garcia, Maria-Ines Alvarez, Joaquin Torres-Mata, Erik-Moises Betancourt-Nuñez, Sergio-Esteban Rodriguez-Ramirez, Miguel Alvarez-Gomez, Jesus Cabral-Araiza, Carlos Anguiano

Development of Careful, Creative and Critical Thought According to the Philosophy of Matthew Lipman: A Proposal for Inclusion in Basic Education

Abstract

To satisfy the imperative need for developing life skills in basic education students throughout the country, it is important to think about continue educational inclusion, which is to be understood as the idea of Education for All. Education for all should satisfy the basic needs of learning while developing the individual and social welfare of each student. From this perspective, it is necessary to reflect on how to make students citizens who make decisions and assume consequences, so that they can act with critical judgment. For this, it is necessary to inspect and reconstruct the essence of critical, creative and careful thinking, the essence of learning to think.

Keywords: creative thought, critical thought, education, inclusion

Introduction

The development of critical, careful and creative thinking, according to the philosophical thinking of Lipman (1988, p. 3), resonates as an alternative approach to educational inclusion in basic education.

The focus is on learning to think. The graduation profile of basic education in Mexico is very logical, based on the current curriculum. The graduate of basic education is expected to argue and reason when analyzing situations, identify problems, formulate questions, make judgments, propose solutions, apply strategies and makes decisions, evaluate the reasoning and the evidence provided by others and modify their own points of view as a consequence (Secretaría de Educación Pública, 2011, p. 5).

Thought is the activity and creation of the mind

Based on the above, it is important to identify some concepts that develop the idea of learning to think.

In the first place, with respect to thought, Gonzalo (2007, p. 2) points out that:

> *Thought is the activity and creation of the mind; everything that is brought into existence through the activity of the intellect. The term is commonly used as a generic form that defines all the products that the mind can generate including the rational activities of the intellect and the abstractions of the imagination; everything that is mental in nature is considered thought.*

Some types of thinking can be distinguished, such as critical, creative and careful thought. Gonzalo (2007, p. 4) argues that critical thinking examines the structure of reasoning on issues of daily life, and has dual analytical and evaluative aspects. On the other hand, creative thinking is used in the creation or modification of something, introducing novelties to modify something that already exists.

In an earlier analysis of these concepts, Dewey (2007, p. 8) proposes an education focused on the development of the child and not on the reproduction of society. According to the analysis of Velasco-Aceves (2012, p. 7):

> *John Dewey proposes an integrated approach, attempting to make education an exercise of community rationality, where thought and action are continuations of the same process, because there is dialogue and consideration aligned with the rigor of thought. There are two basic axes: thinking skills and social dispositions, aiming to sustain critical thought that is organized and ordered, but also careful thought that considers and is delicate and creative thought that is fertile in diversity.*

These considerations led Lipman (1988, p. 6) to found a Philosophy Institute for Children in 1974 at Montclair State College, New Jersey, developing a curriculum to introduce Philosophy in the classroom. Lipman started from the assumption that if children are helped to reason and apply logic to think about their experience, they can be responsible for their own ideas, and will find meaning in what they hear, in what they express and in general, in their lives as individuals and members of a society (Velasco-Aceves, 2012, p. 3).

In order to promote and facilitate a significant learning process in students, and critical and responsible thinking, Lipman (2004, p. 4) developed the Philosophy Program for Children, proposing the inclusion of a space for philosophical reflection in the classroom, to promote a reflective and analytical attitude in children inside and outside the school (Lipman, 2004, p. 5).

Philosophy is an everyday exercise

Philosophy is seen as an everyday exercise (Herrera & Mogollón, 2012, p. 2) and Dewey undoubtedly inspired Lipman.

Lipman (1988, cited by Velasco-Aceves, 2012, p. 5), stated that:

> *Most of the time, when we hear the word Philosophy, we think about the works and teachings of the great thinkers and intellectuals of history, or, in those people who currently propose a way of interpreting and giving meaning to the events of our life as Humans. When we hear about Philosophy we rarely think about children, but Philosophy is a fundamental and naturally present aspect of their lives. The child needs to understand the world around him and the things that happen to him, and his first philosophical question is that well known and familiar, why? The question is that those of us who are with the children interpret the question literally and try to answer it with information, assuming that it is information that the child wants to obtain.*

Often we do not perceive that the meaning or intention of the student's question goes beyond precise information. Having the habit of trying to respond, there is no space to consider the possibility of talking with students about issues that have no specific answers, much less allow them to ask, not to get answers, but simply to play with the great ability to think and wonder they have (Lipman, 1988, p. 6).

Meanwhile, Velasco-Aceves (2012, p. 4) considers that:

> *Often when the child asks why, what he expresses is amazement, perplexity before the things he perceives, amazement to see that things are one way and not another, amazement at the immensity and intensity of the things that the world and people offer him and that escape the precise and concrete answer.*

By not discerning in students the fact that they are actually able to think philosophically, unconsciously, we work in a limited way to transmit information, values and concrete behaviors, which, even when they are performed interactively, do not open the possibility for students to explore and ask about other aspects of life and about the importance that these can have in their daily experience (Flores, 2017, p. 2).

However, Lipman's proposal is very interesting, since it opens a panorama that unquestionably points to the philosophical foundations of the reform of basic education (Secretaría de Educación Pública, 2011, p. 3), based on the development of genuinely critical thinking. Intelligent, and based on criteria and on the fact of conceiving that rather than reaching the truth, it is about understanding better. In other words, it is about acquiring, not great definitions, but functional definitions.

It should be noted that, as Miranda-Alonso (2018, p. 5) says:

> *M. Lipman is a philosopher convinced of the potential of philosophy to transform education at all levels, both formally and informally. But every educational process has to start in childhood and, therefore, the inclusion of philosophy in the curriculum, from the stage of early childhood education, and the adoption of the methodology of research and philosophical inquiry in all subjects constitutes the specific and differentiated proposal of a program and of an educational project that has the objective of teaching to students to think, to feel and to live in a rigorous, critical, creative, and careful way.*

Children think for themselves

As the main objective is to help children think for themselves about aspects that are significant in their lives, Lipman (1988, p. 6) argues that the fact that children think for themselves means that they are able to reflect on their own experience and formulate their own explanations and hypotheses about what this experience means to them. It is not about the teacher providing the specific answers to specific topics. The idea is that children can formulate questions about the issues that are relevant to their daily lives, and that by listening to different points of view they can assume their own position. It should be noted that reflecting on one's own experience implies taking one's beliefs critically and acting responsibly.

When we talk about children transforming their experience into questions and assuming their own position, we are talking about the development of critical thinking, which consists, according to Lipman (1988, p. 4), in being able to exercise judgment, based on criteria, with sensitivity to the context, and following a self-correcting thought process. That is, it is important to support students so that they

are careful in their affirmations, develop the ability to distinguish those situations in which making a judgment may or may not be relevant, and have the necessary skills to identify whether the criteria they use to affirm or deny something are relevant, supported by the evidence and whether they facilitate a better understanding of what is being judged, without forgetting the context.

The methodology of the Philosophy Program for Children allows students to develop a series of thinking skills and a social disposition that leads them to work in what is called a community of inquiry. This is done by converting the traditional classroom into a community of dialogue or joint, participatory and cooperative research, in which students and teachers seek answers to the questions raised through collaborative work (Herrera & Mogollón, 2012, p. 3), and where both students and teachers benefit.

Lipman (1988, p. 5) states that if we want to achieve a better understanding of human experience, in all its diversity, the presence of others who accompany us in thinking, and who help us put our own perspectives in perspective, is essential. The presence and judgments of others help us to think better.

Lipman (1988, p. 3) argues that:

> *In a community of inquiry it is intended that members get involved by sharing their points of view, which are put to the consideration of the group, which assumes the task of investigating its foundations and implications, making use of a series of thinking and in a climate of confidence and security, where what is submitted to inquiry is not the person, but their ideas and questions.*

It is then a matter of developing a coherent and productive attitude of inquiry in an atmosphere of respect, where all opinions are taken into account and all members of the community of inquiry contribute, in such a way that experience, and its significance, are better understood.

These considerations are corroborated by the contributions made by Marzano and Pickering (2005, p. 6) in the dimensions of learning, especially those that indicate an awareness of the learning process, since the approach seeks to develop an understanding of how that which is known comes to be known, and if what is known is correct.

Conclusion

To conclude, it is important for students to have the experience of knowing and of being part of a Community of Inquiry, and of being able to ask and get an answer about what is achieved when starting and developing this process with students. It is very interesting to analyze and reflect on how Philosophy is not taught, but rather is done daily in classrooms and, as Gonzalo (2007, p. 2) affirms, begins with the student's own thinking on questions of daily life.

Perhaps more importantly, Philosophy does not only reside in the great thinkers of yesteryear, but can also be available to students and teachers, from the least to the greatest. Thus, Philosophy is available to everyone. It allows us to see the original meaning of the Study Plans with which we work in Mexico and the openness that it gives to the great models for educational transformation. The method of teaching will be affected by the conception that one possesses of philosophical activity (Lipman, 2002, p. 8).

It is essential to develop thought that is critical but is, at the same time, reflective and careful of others. For this it is necessary to learn to think in such a way that one has genuinely valid arguments, that is, where there is the possibility of putting the strength of one's ideas and beliefs to the test. Critical, careful and creative thought, as Marzano and Pickering (2005, p. 6) argue, seeks to understand how to know what is known and if what is known is correct.

In this sense, as pointed out by Lipman (1988, cited by Velasco-Aceves, 2009, p. 4):

> *Along with critical thinking, we can facilitate the development of careful and creative thinking.*
>
> *Careful when considering others, to appreciate the value of their thinking, to respect and try to understand their framework of values and beliefs; creative because as situations are explored from different perspectives, it is possible to sketch new alternatives and possible courses of action that allow the transformation of personal and group experience.*

Therefore, the development of critical, careful and creative thinking, according to Lipman's philosophical thinking, becomes a proposal that supports educational inclusion in basic education, since it aims to promote an education open to all students, with equity but also with quality (Secretaría de Educación Pública, 2011, p. 3).

And if education starts where the child is rather than starting where the teacher is, what would be the best starting point? In the end, Philosophy is an everyday exercise (Herrera & Mogollón, 2012, p. 6).

References

Dewey, J. (2007): *Cómo pensamos. La relación entre pensamiento reflexivo y proceso educativo*. Barcelona: Paidos.

Flores, P. (2017): *El debate actual por la epistemología infantil o el ocaso de la ideología del pensamiento cognitivamente evolucionista*. http://www.comie.org.mx/congreso/memoriaelectronica/v09/ponencias/at08/PRE1178736866.pdf (Accessed 25.06 2019).

Gonzalo, L. (2007): *Entre libertad y determinismo. Genes, cerebro y ambiente en la conducta humana*. Madrid: Ediciones Cristiandad.

Herrera, Y. & Mogollón, E. (2012): Influencia del programa filosofía para niños (FpN) en el desarrollo de la competencia comunicativa de los estudiantes de educación primaria. *Educare Electronic Journal*, 16(1), 1-7.

Lipman, M. (1988): *Philosophy goes to school*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Lipman, M. (2002): *La Filosofía en el Aula*. Madrid: Ediciones de la Torre.

Lipman, M. (2004): *Pensamiento Complejo y Educación*. Madrid: Ediciones de la Torre.

Marzano, R. & Pickering, D. (2005): *Dimensiones para el aprendizaje. Manual para el maestro*. México: ITESO.

Miranda-Alonso, T. (2018): *M. Lipman: Función de la Filosofía en la Educación de la Persona Razonable*. http://www.celafin.org/documentos/MirandaAlonso_FuncionFilPersonaRazonable.pdf (Accessed 24.06.219).

Secretaría de Educación Pública (2011): *Plan de Estudios 2011. Educación Básica*. México: Gobierno Federal.

Velasco-Aceves, M. (2009): *Habilidades de razonamiento y disposiciones sociales que se trabajan con el Programa de Filosofía para Niños*. Documentos de apoyo didáctico. Centro de Filosofía para Niños y Servicios Educativos de Guadalajara A.C. México: CFPN.

Velasco-Aceves, M. (2012): *Filosofía para Niños: una alternativa para resignificar la práctica*. Centro de Filosofía para Niños y Servicios Educativos de Guadalajara A.C. y Departamento de Educación del ITESO. México: CFPN.

Corresponding author:
Prof. Dr. Claudio-Rafael Vasquez-Martinez, University of Guadalajara, Mexico

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Amelia Molina, Adriana Estrada & José Luis Andrade

Human Rights Policies: A Comparative Analysis of Mexico – Costa Rica

Abstract

Part of the process of broader research is presented, in which it is necessary to establish a context of comparison between two Latin American nations. They implement educational policies related to human rights and training for social coexistence. It is assumed that the role of international organizations strongly influences the definition of such policies. For this, a comparative analysis is presented between what these organizations dictate and how they are retaken or redefined from two countries: Mexico and Costa Rica. For the analysis, the classic comparative methodology of Bereday (1968) is used. The description is presented based on primary, national and international sources, on the guidelines and policies of educational systems. Human Rights are considered as thematic axis. The interpretation phase is based on the construction of meaning that each country gives to its educational policies. This, considering the recommendations or guidelines of supranational organizations. Finally, the juxtaposition and comparison phases are developed, where the recurrences presented by the Mexican and Costa Rican educational policy documents are identified, considering the supranational guidelines, in order to build hypotheses or inquiry questions. In general, it is concluded that the policies of the countries studied are mediated by supranational organizations and, in turn, in their construction process they go through structural links (Torres, 2004), where each one re-produces its policies based on its sociocultural contexts.

Keywords: educational policy, comparative education, citizenship education, Latin America, supranational organizations

Introduction

The right of people to education is decreed in different international documents, among them, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), considered the main promoter that sets the tone for subsequent declarations. There are various positions and guidelines that disrupt the work of each of the nations that subscribe them. Therefore, it is important, for this work, to focus on the revision of documents that contain the legal recommendations and guidelines that guide educational policies in the field of human rights and citizenship training. In this sense, the paper is developed through four sections. The first takes the UDHR as a guideline to identify the right to education. The second identifies how some supranational organizations retake the UDHR and also give importance to other aspects. The third analyzes the legislative-educational approaches of two countries studied. The fourth presents an exercise in the identification of convergences in relation to educational policies regarding human rights and citizenship. The work concludes by presenting hypotheses and questions that will guide the development of subsequent educational research.

Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)

The UDHR is a document developed by the General Assembly of the United Nations (UN), where through 30 articles, the basic human rights of humanity are expressed, proclaiming, as a common ideal:

> *[…] That all peoples and nations must strive, so that both individuals and institutions, (…) promote, through teaching and education, respect for these rights and freedoms, and ensure, by progressive measures of national and international character, its universal and effective recognition and application, both among the peoples of the Member States and among those of the territories placed under their jurisdiction* (UN, 1948, p. 2).

It is important to recover the emphasis that the UN General Assembly places on education and teaching as a means to promote the exercise of human rights. In particular, Article 26 recognizes education as a human right, which must be free and compulsory, at least at the elementary level. By recognizing this Article, the school becomes a privileged space for training in human rights, so it is necessary to analyze the role it is playing in the forms of relationship between its actors. Therefore it is necessary to ask: what is happening within it, in the normative, ethical and social spheres? How do relationship forms promote or not the exercise of rights? Recognize that the school offers not only knowledge, allows the analysis of its social dimension, the ethical-legal bases that it transmits and how the uses and customs of its context are recognized.

It is also recognized that analyzing de-contextualized practices detracts from the practice itself, so reviewing some national-legislative documents, which establish norms and standards that concern the right to education, helps in understanding them. These references allow the identification of the legal obligations of the States, their policies and the specific programs that help to guarantee this right. Although several axes of discourse analysis could be defined, in this case, attention is focused on those who define the conditions to improve coexistence, training in values and the promotion and development of moral autonomy. The guidelines of supranational organizations are analyzed and then the educational policies of each of the countries studied.

Education and human rights from international organizations

After the Second World War, international organizations position themselves in the global debate on economic and social policies. Regarding education, the recommendations of organizations such as UNESCO, OECD, UNICEF, World Bank (WB), and in Latin America, the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) and the Economic Commission for Latin America (ECLAC), exercise marked influences on the development and implementation of policies of the countries of the region (Miranda, 2016; Canan, 2017).

In the literature review, there seems to be consensus on the power and influence of the great powers and their economic interests that, aligned with the neoliberal model, adjust policies to generate transformations that are not necessarily in favor of the rights of the most vulnerable states and the individuals that inhabit them, but designed to strengthen the interests of the new world capitalism (Canan, 2017; Cárdenas, 2015; Miranda, 2016). It is a fact that in the educational field, the topic of

international agencies allows articulation of the debate on the internationalization of educational trends (Maldonado, 2000), so that its review and analysis becomes essential to understand the changes implemented in educational systems in recent decades.

In this regard, the Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNICEF, 1989) mentions: that the right of the child to education must be exercised progressively and under equal opportunities. In its Article 29, it establishes that education must: "Develop the personality, aptitudes and mental and physical capacity of the child to the maximum of his possibilities". In the same Article, training in values is included, which states: "to promote the values enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, equality between people, respect for diversity, tolerance and non-discrimination, the promotion of peace and the common good" (UNICEF, 1989, p. 23).

On the other hand, Article 13 establishes the right of children to freedom of expression, which implies that "every child has the right to seek, receive and disseminate information and ideas of all kinds, provided that this does not go into undermine the rights of others" (UNICEF, 1989, p. 14), which, according to Landeros and Chávez (2015), is related to participation, and guarantees that the voice of children is heard to make decisions that affect them. From these Articles, it is considered that, in addition to developing in a transversal way the potential of children in the spheres: social, cognitive, academic and emotional, among others, it is very important to educate for coexistence. What it implies, help them to develop as moral subjects tending towards autonomy; prepare them for life, so that they are able to build and exercise their status as human beings in a responsible and supportive way, have institutions capable of forming citizens committed to building a more just and equitable society.

Since the last decade of the 20th century, the relationship between education and human rights began to occupy a relevant place in several countries of the region, including Mexico and Costa Rica. In this sense, Molina (2017) places three moments related to UNESCO's declarations: 1) The World Declaration of Education for All (Jomtien, 1990) whose commitments gave rise to the second moment; 2) World Education Forum (Dakar, 2000); and 3) The Framework for Action for the Development of Sustainable Education 2030 (Incheon, 2015).

Through these declarations, challenges and goals are established that each country must achieve by generating the conditions to achieve them. With regard to training in values, the Framework for Action for the Development of Sustainable Education 2030, states as a general objective: "Guarantee quality inclusive and equitable education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all" (UNESCO, 2015, p. 20) and in accordance with goal 4.7 it is due to:

> *[…] Ensure that all students acquire the theoretical and practical knowledge necessary to promote sustainable development, among other things through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and nonviolence, world citizenship and the valuation of cultural diversity and the contribution of culture to sustainable development* (UNESCO, 2015, p. 48).

In the region -Latin America and the Caribbean- assemblies have been held so that governments commit to generate the conditions for the development of the

objectives proposed in each Declaration. Examples are: The Declaration of Lima (2014) and that of Buenos Aires (2017). Both reaffirm the general objective, set by UNESCO: to ensure an inclusive and equitable quality education throughout life for all; ratify education as a fundamental right, pillar for the achievement of other rights, an indispensable condition for peace, responsible citizenship and the fulfillment of other sustainable development goals, such as: "end of poverty, zero hunger, health and well-being, gender equality…" (UNESCO, 2015).

In particular, the Declaration of Buenos Aires reflects the commitment of States to education, considering multiculturalism and multilingualism, essential to contextualize national and local realities, as characteristic factors for the construction of more inclusive societies (UNESCO, 2015). Thus, the States must generate the means to guarantee access and educational opportunities for the various sectors of the population, ensuring that schools operate with quality conditions and promote fair treatment for all their members. The challenge in the region is great, as each country has great cultural diversity and huge economic and social gaps.

Regarding the school space, from a human rights approach, it will be necessary to rethink the relationships between the different actors in it, encouraging participation, equity and solidarity, which are essential for students to develop an ethical commitment to justice, autonomy with moral sense and critical sense (UNICEF, 2006).

National legislation on education and human rights

Each of the countries defines the training objectives that guide their educational systems. They establish laws, define operating criteria and determine the conditions for carrying out the agreements established in the Declarations. In the case at hand, an analytical description is made of the aims of education, emphasizing the type of citizen that one wishes to train in the countries of interest: Mexico and Costa Rica.

The case of Mexico

In Mexico, the State has the constitutional commitment to ensure that the right of students to receive a quality education with equity at the mandatory levels, which include basic level (initial, preschool, primary and secondary education) and the middle level higher. Initial education is part of the basic one since May 2019.

Article 3, paragraph 4 of the Political Constitution of the United Mexican States (CPEUM, 2019) remarks that education will be based on unrestricted respect for the dignity of people, the focus will be on human rights and 'substantive equality', it will promote respect for rights, freedoms and culture of peace. It will promote honesty, values and the continuous improvement of the teaching-learning process. Specifically in the same article in section II, subsections *a* & *c*, promulgate that the criteria that will guide education are:

> *a) It will be democratic, considering democracy not only as a legal structure and a political regime, but as a system of life, based on the constant economic, social and cultural improvement of the people* (CPEUM, 2019).
>
> *c) It will contribute to the best human coexistence, in order to strengthen the appreciation and respect for nature, cultural diversity, the dignity of the person, the integrity of the families, the conviction of the general interest of society, the ideals of*

> *fraternity and equal rights of all, avoiding the privileges of races, religion, groups, sexes or individuals* (CPEUM, 2019).

These criteria are found in the General Education Law (SEP, 1993), Article 8, paragraphs I and III, the first is literal and the III does not include what was amended in May 2019, which refers to: 'respect for nature' and includes 'Families', in the plural, leaving open the recognition of diversity. Also, Article 12, paragraph V, establishes that the objectives of the school management programs must include: promoting conditions that favor the participation of students, teachers and parents.

The case of Costa Rica

Title VII of the Costa Rican Constitution addresses Education and Culture, which prescribes that preschool and basic general education (primary and secondary) are compulsory and free. Diversified education (equivalent to a higher average in Mexico) is not mandatory, but in the public system it is funded by the nation. Costa Rica has the Basic Education Law (No 2160), amended in June 2017, in which its Article 1 stipulates:

> *Every inhabitant of the Republic has the right to education and the State has the obligation to try to offer it in the widest and most appropriate way. Therefore, students should be encouraged and encouraged to appreciate the exercise of human rights and the linguistic, multiethnic and multicultural diversity of our country* (SCIJ, 2017).

Article 2 of this Law (SCIJ, 2017), subsections *a* to *f*, addresses various aspects of the aims of education, among which are: to form citizens with a sense of responsibility and respect for human dignity, for a conciliatory democracy between individual and community interests, that preserve and expand the cultural heritage; supportive and understanding of the human condition, inclusive, aware of their duties, rights and freedoms.

Convergences between supranational and national speeches (Mexican and Costa Rican)

With the approach so far, points of coincidence can be identified both from the recommendations of the international organizations and in the laws of each country studied. Such convergences appeal to characteristics of education: quality, inclusive, equitable, throughout life; but they also refer to respect for rights and freedoms, promotion of peace, responsible citizenship, among others.

To achieve a finer analysis, we group the recurrences into six axis-categories, in which related or constituent terms are integrated, such as:

1. **Human rights**, include: human dignity, quality, equitable, inclusive and equal education.
2. **Respect for freedoms**, defined by: multiculturalism, multilingualism and freedom of expression.
3. **Training**: lifelong education, progressive, full development of personality and skills.
4. **Promotion of peace**: non-violence, non-discrimination, peaceful coexistence and fraternity.
5. **Responsible citizenship**: participation, solidarity and democracy.

6. **Ethics and morality**: common good, justice – fair treatment, autonomy and values.

Since the 80s of the 20th century, the discourses produced by supranational organizations have greatly influenced the educational policies of the member countries; they begin to resemble in their legislative-educational discourses, reason, among others, for which it is possible to identify that Mexico and Costa Rica disrupt their educational systems in a similar way, in their structures and forms of operation. However, carrying out a background transformation that integrates such intentions requires a process of articulation at the macro, intermediate and micro levels. That is, at the macro level it implies a relationship between internationally legitimized sources and the transformation of State politic. At the intermediate level it refers to the transformation or redefinition of educational policy and therefore of its educational system, its organization and structural practice. At the micro level, it refers to transforming teacher training processes, revaluing this figure and its practices in schools.

Translating the claims of the 'governing' instances, at the school and classroom level, implies changing the practices that lead to an attitude from which democracy, values and equity are considered, as a way of life and implementation of the interactions. It implies a change of mentality, in which each individual who converges in the school space is allowed to express their ideas, initiatives, proposals, feelings and knowledge. Therefore, as a hypothesis of inquiry, we consider that the new forms of operation entail a tension between the specific forms of interaction of individuals, their educational practices and the emergence of structural changes.

Conclusion

We can say that in Mexico and Costa Rica, the State, in general, is establishing the legal basis for respect for the human rights, that there are possibilities of participation of the actors of education and that a culture of peace may be fostered in the relations of coexistence. However, in order to carry out the comparative study in the broadest sense, one would have to ask: How do they seek to increase educational quality, inclusion and equity? How do you promote a culture of respect for diversity? Is the school a space to develop autonomous moral judgment? What role does value training play in shaping the new citizenship? How do educational policies and their implementation affect the processes of shaping a free society with autonomy for decision-making? among others.

Although there are many questions that arise from these exploratory phases of the comparative study, these constitute the basis for determining the levels and ways of approaching the object of study regarding the formation processes for a world citizenship with competences for peaceful coexistence.

References

Bereday, G. Z. (1968): *El método comparativo en pedagogía*. Barcelona: Herder.

Canan, S. R. (2017): *Influencia de los Organismos Internacionales en las Políticas Educacionales ¿Sólo hay intervención cuando hay consentimiento?* http://biblioteca.clacso.edu.ar/clacso/se/20171002041747/Influencia_de_los_organismos_internacionales.pdf (Accessed 14.11.2019).

Cárdenas, J. (2015): Las características jurídicas del neoliberalismo. *Cuestiones Constitucionales*, (32), 141-155.

CPEUM (2019): *Diario Oficial de la Federación*. México. http://www.diputados.gob.mx/LeyesBiblio/pdf/1_090819.pdf (Accessed 07.01.2020).

Landeros, L. & Chávez, C. (2015): *Convivencia y disciplina en la escuela. Análisis de reglamentos escolares de México*. http://publicaciones.inee.edu.mx/buscadorPub/P1/C/232/P1C232.pdf (Accessed 30.01.2018).

Maldonado, A. (2000): Los organismos internacionales y la educación en México. El caso de la educación superior. *Perfiles Educativos*, XXII (87), 51-75.

Miranda, L. M. (2016): *Influencia de las Organizaciones Internacionales en el modelo de desarrollo de los países de América Latina, mediante la educación*. Universidad Colegio Mayor de Nuestra Señora del Rosario. https://repository.urosario.edu.co/bitstream/handle/10336/12711/1014253889-2016.pdf?sequence=1 (Accessed 14.10.2019).

Molina, A. (2017): *Educación y Derechos Humanos: Declaraciones Internacionales y Estrategias Educativas Implementadas en México 1993-2017*. Coloquio Internacional sobre Desarrollo Sustentable, Hidalgo, México.

SCIJ (2017): *Ley Fundamental de Educación.* Sistema Costarricense de Información Jurídica. http://www.pgrweb.go.cr/scij/Busqueda/Normativa/Normas/nrm_texto_completo.aspx?param2=NRTC&nValor1=1&nValor2=31427&strTipM=TC (Accessed 24.10.2019).

SEP (1993): *Ley General de Educación.* Secretaría de Educación Pública, México. https://www.sep.gob.mx/work/models/sep1/Resource/558c2c24-0b12-4676-ad90-8ab78086b184/ley_general_educacion.pdf (Accessed 11.12.2019).

Torres, J. (2004): Acoplamientos estructurales. Luhmann, N. *La política como sistema*. México: UIA/ITESO, 379-381.

UN (1948): *Declaración Universal de los Derechos Humanos.* https://www.ohchr.org/EN/UDHR/Documents/UDHR_Translations/spn.pdf (Accessed 24.11.2018).

UNESCO (2014): *Educación para Todos (EPT) en América Latina y el Caribe: Balance y Desafíos post-2015. Declaración de Lima*. Lima: UNESCO.

UNESCO (2015): *Educación 2030. Declaración de Incheon y Marco de Acción para la realización del Objetivo de Desarrollo Sostenible 4*. Incheon: UNESCO.

UNESCO (2017): *Declaración de Buenos Aires. Reunión Regional de Ministros de Educación de América Latina y el Caribe*. Buenos Aires: UNESCO.

UNICEF (1989): *Convención sobre los derechos del niño*. Madrid: UNICEF Comité Español [2006].

UNICEF (2006): El derecho a la educación, una tarea pendiente para América Latina y el Caribe. *Desafíos*, 3, 1-12. https://repositorio.cepal.org/bitstream/handle/11362/35991/Desafios_Nro3_esp_es.pdf (Accessed 12.06.2019).

Prof. Dr. Amelia Molina García, Universidad Autónoma del Estado de Hidalgo, México

PhD Student Adriana Estrada Girón, Universidad Autónoma del Estado de Hidalgo, México

Prof. José Luis Horacio Andrade Lara, Universidad Autónoma del Estado de Hidalgo, México

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Part 4
Higher Education & Teacher Education and Training

Magdalin Nji Anim & Gertrude Shotte

Leadership Roles, Women and Higher Education: Lessons from the University of Buea, Cameroon

Abstract

There is no dearth of literature on the numerous challenges that women face in securing leadership roles in government, non-government and other societal and community organisations. Over the past five decades or so, researchers and concerned others have been reporting on the lack of women in leadership roles. This paper explores leadership roles of women in higher education (HE), with a special focus on the University of Buea, Cameroon. The paper is based on research work carried out in 2016 and was framed by the gender and development (GAD) model; but it is also supported by on-going research investigation, carried out for the purpose of future publications. This means that by and large, the paper makes use of literature review methodological approach to build the discussion. It makes clear that although on a global scale women's enrolment in HE exceeds that of men, this does not translate into women senior leadership positions in HE. It acknowledges what HE means in the Cameroonian context, and looks at the socio-cultural and structural factors that influence women's representation in HE positions in the University of Buea. The paper concludes that the paradigm shift in the global concepts of development has not shown a satisfactory level of decrease in the challenges that women face in relation to attaining senior leadership roles in HE institutions.

Keywords: development, higher education, leadership, University of Buea, gender and development

Introduction

The theme *Women in Leadership Roles* has been a passionate topic of discussion, as evidenced by numerous literature accounts. Globally, over the past five decades or so, researchers, educators, societal institutions, government and non-government organisations have been giving much attention to the lack of women in leadership roles in higher education (HE) (Waheeda & Nishan, 2018; Goryunova, Scribner & Madsen, 2017; Kezar, 2014; Ely, Ibarra & Kolb, 2011; Anderson & Williams, 2001). The seriousness of the situation has been flagged up as a 'systemic' issue, especially when recent decades have witnessed a paradigm shift in the global concepts of development (Morley & Crossouard, 2014; Morley, 2013). The scope of this paper does not allow a full discussion of all the elements and factors that are linked to women and leadership roles in HE. This paper therefore

takes a brief look at some of the factors that are associated with the observed low representation of women in leadership positions in the University of Buea (UB). It draws attention to the fact that although on a global scale women's enrolment in HE exceeds that of men, this does not translate into women senior leadership positions in HE. It also reveals how HE is conceptualised in the Cameroonian context and identifies some socio-cultural and structural factors that influence women's representation in HE positions in UB. To aid understanding, the paper will briefly explain the contextual factors that frame the issues. The paper concludes that the paradigm shift in the global concepts of development has not shown a satisfactory level of decrease in the challenges that women face in relation to attaining senior leadership roles in HE institutions.

Methodology

The findings from research work carried out in 2016 form the foundation content for this paper. Other supportive content materials are the preliminary results of a related on-going research investigation and the gender and development (GAD) model. Data for the paper was therefore collected by using the literature review method. When effectively done, this method can be quite useful in establishing the basis for knowledge enhancement and theory development (Snyder, 2019; Webster & Watson, 2002). Also, by incorporating views from various research findings, "a literature review can address research questions with a power that no single study has" (Snyder, 2019, p. 333). Such practicality does demonstrate that the literature review as a method bears much relevance.

Framing the issues

The purpose of this section is to provide some background information that frames the issues under discussion. It intends to place the main discussion points in context with a view to facilitating understanding. It offers conceptualisations for development, HE enrolment, leadership and UB.

Development

Development is one of those terms that does not carry a strict definition, but can be interpreted in various contexts. Generally, development has to do with change and processes of change in different situations. More often than not, it is used in a positive sense. Bellù (2011) relates that when used in a societal or socio-economic context, development is usually linked to improvement, "either in the general situation of the system, or in some of its constituent elements". Improvement often calls for some kind of action, for example, policy formulation and development. This clearly demonstrates that development in its fullest sense has numerous and varied dimensions. Some of these aspects may be even contradictory (Todaro & Smith, 2003; Galor & Moav, 2000).

In the context of this paper, it is important to note that development does not dwell solely in the realm of socio-economic activities. It should be interpreted and understood in settings that are beyond incomes, Gross Domestic Product (GDP), inflation, export, import and economic growth, to include the changing patterns of poverty, quality education, good health and wellbeing and gender equality (United

Nations (UN), 2019; Abwa & Fonchingong, 2004). Four of the many dimensions of development are identified by Bellù (2011) as economic, human, sustainable and territorial development. If these dimensions are central to improvements and the progress made in a given society, it is imperative that both men and women have leadership roles. For example, with regard to human development Bellù puts the focus on "the improvement of the various dimensions affecting the well-being of individuals and their relationships with the society". Lack of empowerment, entitlements, capabilities, health and education are some of the elements that can negatively affect one's well-being.

HE enrolment

Generally, universities are the places where one pursues HE, which is sometimes referred to as third level or tertiary education. How HE is perceived varies in countries across the world. In Cameroon and most countries of the Commonwealth, where upper secondary education, otherwise known as advanced level exists, HE represents education at post advanced level (Njeuma et al., 1999; Nath, 2014).

Globally, women are outnumbering men in HE institutions (HEIs). The trend shows that for the ratio of men to women, there is a consistent annual increase in many countries across the globe (Bilton, 2018). A report from Universities and Colleges Admissions Service (UCAS), a UK-based organization, showed that women are 36% more likely to apply to university than their male counterparts (Martin, 2015). A similar situation exists in some countries in Asia, North America, South America and the Caribbean (Bilton, 2018; Martin, 2015). By contrast, as reported by Kigotho (2018), "women are also still largely under-represented in higher education, especially in Sub-Saharan Africa". Kigotho makes reference to this United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organisation (UNESCO) report: "Contrary to positive expansion trends in Africa, the gross enrolment ratio for women in Sub-Saharan Africa is 4.8%, compared to 7.3% for men".

The recent reorientation towards gender equity legislation, policy initiatives, changes in socio-economic gender relations and the aspiration and expansion of higher education opportunities have contributed to the surge in the number of women participating in HE (Morley, 2013; Longman & Madsen, 2014). Encouragingly, UNESCO (2010) indicates a surge in enrolment of women in HE around the world – from 10.8 to 77.4 million. However, this unprecedented expansion of HE opportunities to women, have not yet translated into proportional representation of the number of women in decision-making positions in HE. This is the position even in countries with diverse policies and legislation for gender equality such as Sweden and Australia among others (Morley, 2013; Longman & Madsen, 2014).

Leadership

Leadership is a complex concept with numerous strands and as many conceptualisations. Therefore, in the interest of scope and context, the paper takes a peek at why *total leadership* in HEIs is crucial for securing the desired quality for institutional success; and more importantly, for ensuring that student progress and achievement is sustained. *Transformational leadership* has been demonstrated to be

a dynamic leadership style for those in leadership roles in schools and academic institutions (Miller, 2013; Shotte, 2013). There is also the shared leadership model, which is a collaborative endeavor, emphasises the need for all professionals to contribute to total leadership (Bush, 2020; Leithwood et al., 2006).

The structure of academia at UB has shown that changes in leadership and leadership styles have been made in the wake of the establishing of the Department of Women and Gender Studies. This is a demonstration of *heroic or transformational leadership* for it portrays a commitment to achieving the goal of creating and increasing leadership roles for women. Clearly, total leadership is crucial to realising overall success in HEIs. The paper asserts that overall success is not possible without meaningful leadership contributions from women in important leadership roles.

The University of Buea

The University of Buea is a 27-year old institution, located in the South West Region of Cameroon. Although it was modeled within the English-speaking tradition, UB has not forsaken the wider bilingual and multicultural context of Cameroon. This inclusivity is shown in the diversity of UB's over 12,000 student population, who hail from the English-speaking part of Cameroon as well as other provinces of the country. UB aims to create a top-class teaching-learning and research environment that provide students with opportunities for attaining the quality education that will allow them to strive for excellence. This same environment allows UB to make appropriate responses to market forces. The University fosters community collaboration, promotes human values, encourages tolerance, inspires creativity and supports critical analysis and independent thinking.

The paper looks at the socio-cultural and structural factors that influence women's representation in higher leadership positions at UB. Of the eight (8) public universities in Cameroon, UB is the only one that had a female Vice Chancellor (VC) at its inception in 1993. The paper contends that having a female VC from the onset, is an important structural factor that could have boosted women's confidence and influenced them to seek ways to attain high positions at UB. It also asserts that a socio-cultural factor is linked to UB being one of the two English-speaking public universities in Cameroon that has a Department of Women and Gender Studies. This might have served to stimulate a gender-conscious environment, as well as to motivate the woman to press for leadership roles at UB (Endeley & Ngaling, 2007; University of Buea, 2002).

Gender and development (GAD)

The GAD framework, which began with the United Nations (UN) 1945 Charter and the 1948 Declaration of Human Rights, is an on-going structure. The GAD approach is also linked to social feminism that emerged in the 1980s as a critique of the women in development (WID) which focused on women integration in development as a lens through which women subordination in the society could be understood (Aikman & Unterhalter, 2005). GAD focuses on the social relations of power between men and women in the society and not relations characterised by biological differences (Moser, 1993; Tasli, 2007). In this paper, focusing on the number of women in leadership positions in HE vis-à-vis men, necessitates the

examining the unequal power structures and relations characterised by the socio-cultural, economic and political dynamics in the society. Analysing women's representation in leadership roles in HE, should not impede the holistic understanding of women's subordination in this context. Approximately forty years ago, it was noted that gender relations often take the form of male dominance and female subordination (Whitehead, 1979). Decades later, researchers have explored "some of the ramifications of the phenomenon of women's subordination to men in Africa and to highlight its educational implications with reference to development in Africa" (Uchem & Ngwa, 2014).

GAD basically centers on gender mainstreaming that could take the form of integration or agenda setting (transformation), which emphasises the active involvement of both men and women as active agents and veritable partners in development (Moser, 1993; Kabeer, 1999). Consequently, in exploring the relationship between gender and development, feminists, academics, researchers and policy makers have employed the GAD framework to interrogate and challenge the socio-economic and political *status quo* that produce unequal gender and power relations and social injustices that discriminate against women in all spectrum of the economy, including women's leadership in HE (UNESCO, 2002; Morley, 2013; Onsongo, 2004). The different components of GAD include the concepts of gender division of labour, practical gender needs, strategic gender interest, empowerment and gender mainstreaming.

Gender mainstreaming

Gender mainstreaming (GM) is central to GAD framework in eliminating existing gender bias against women. GM is a strategy that calls for men and women experiences to form an integral part of designing, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programs at international, national and local levels (Tiessen, 2007). In this case, firstly it is important to examine how higher education systems are design with men in mind, as a result, polices need to be retooled to incorporate women experiences and their general femaleness to gain equal representation in leadership positions in the universities. This could be done by destabilising existing cultures, strategies and practices, in order to establish a new order with women in mind. This retooling should enhance women's representation at levels of education across male-dominated disciplines in the universities.

The GAD approach suggests the need for women themselves (sisterhood) to collectively interrogate and challenge unfair structures from grass-roots level (down-up approach) that impede their progression to high positions in HE (UNESCO, 2002; Nkomo & Ngambi, 2009). In this light, GAD views women as agents of change and not passive beneficiaries of development efforts (Tasli, 2007). Despite its attempt to provide a holistic understanding of women subordination, the GAD framework faces some criticism.

Conclusion

The paper reviewed the literature on leadership and women in leadership roles. Development, HE enrolment, leadership and UB are the main concepts that provide

the framework for the discussion. Other themes that support the discussion are gender development and gender main streaming. Both themes highlight the operations of GAD in challenging the social and political forces that are responsible for producing and sustaining injustices and discrimination against women, including debarring women from leadership roles in HE.

The paper acknowledges that the theoretical shifts in global concepts of development have not worked favourably in terms of lessening the challenges that confront women face in relation to attaining senior leadership roles in HE institutions. Obviously, there is a need for identifying some possible strategies that may have some positive effect on the increase in women's representation and effective participation in leadership positions in UB. The authors intend to address these strategies in a follow-up paper.

References

Abwa, D. & Fonchingong, C. (2004): Gender and Poverty Alleviation in Cameroon. In J. Endeley, S. Ardener, R. Goodridge & N. Lyonga (Eds.) *New Gender Studies from Cameroon and the Caribbean*. Cameroon: Department of Women and Gender Studies, University of Buea.

Aikman, S. & Unterhalter, E. (Eds.) (2005): *Beyond Access: Transforming Policy and Practice for Gender Equality in Education*. Oxford: Oxfam.

Anderson, P. & Williams, J. (2001): *Identity and Difference in Higher Education: "Outsiders Within"*. London: Ashgate.

Bellù, L. (2011): *Development and Development Paradigms A (Reasoned) Review of Prevailing Visions*. Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. EasyPol, Resources for policy making.

Bilton, I. (2018): *Women are Outnumbering Men at a Record High in Universities Worldwide*. https://www.studyinternational.com/news/record-high-numbers-women-outnumbering-men-university-globally/ (Accessed 10/02/2020).

Bush, T. (2020): Turnaround Leadership in Education: A Restatement of Heroic Leadership or a Flawed Concept? *Educational Management Administration and Leadership*, 48(1), 3-5.

Ely, R., Ibarra, H. & Kolb, D. (2011): Taking Gender into Account: Theory and Design for Women's Leadership Development Programs. *Academy of Management Learning & Education*, 10, 474-493.

Endeley, J. & Ngaling, M. (2007): Challenging Gender Inequality in Higher Education: Attitudes and Perceptions of Teaching Staff and Administrators at the University of Buea, Cameroon. *Feminist Africa*, 9, 63-84.

Galor, O. & Moav, O. (2000): From Physical to Human Capital Accumulation: Inequality and the Process of Development. *Review of Economic Studies,* 71(4), 1001-1026.

Goryunova, E., Scribner, R. & Madsen, S. (2017): The Current Status of Women Leaders Worldwide. In S. Madsen (Ed.) *Handbook of Research on Gender and Leadership* (pp. 3-23). Northampton: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Kabeer, N. (1999): Resources, Agency, Achievements: Reflection on the Measurement of Women's Empowerment. *Development and Change*, 30(3), 435-464.

Kezar, A. (2014): Women's Contributions to Higher Education Leadership and the Road Ahead. In K. Longman & S. Madsen (Eds.) *Women and Leadership in Higher*

Education: Research, Theory, and Practice (pp. 117-134). Charlotte: Information Age Publishing.

Kigotho, W. (2018): *Higher Education - Caught in a Double Bind*. https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20180328162530835 (Accessed 10/02/2020).

Leithwood, K., Day, C., Sammons, P., Harris, A. & Hopkins, D. (2006): *Seven Strong Claims about Successful Leadership*. London: DfES.

Longman, K. & Madsen, S. (2014): *Women and Leadership in Higher Education: Research, Theory, and Practice.* Charlotte: Information Age Publishing.

Martin, W. (2015): The 19 countries with the highest ratio of women to men in higher education. *Independent*, 22 November.

Miller, P. (2013): School Leadership in the Caribbean: Approaches and Development. In P. Miller (Ed.) *School Leadership in the Caribbean: Perceptions, Practices, Paradigms* (pp. 13-28). Oxford: Symposium Books Ltd.

Morley, L. & Crossouard, B. (2014): *Women in Higher Education Leadership in South Asia: Rejection, Refusal, Reluctance, Revisioning.* Sussex: University of Sussex, Centre for Higher Education and Equity Research.

Morley, L. (2013): *Women and Higher Education Leadership: Absences and Aspirations.* London: Leadership Foundation for Higher Education.

Moser, C. (1993): *Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training*. London and New York: Routledge.

Nath, S. (2014): Higher Education and Women Participation in India. *Journal of Business Management and Social Science Research*, 3(2), 43-47.

Njeuma, D., Endeley, H., Mbuntum, F., Lyonga, N., Nkweteyim, D., Musenja, S. & Ekanje, E. (1999): *Reforming a National System of Higher Education: The Case of Cameroon*. A Report of the ADEA Working Group on Higher Education. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

Nkomo, S. & Ngambi, H. (2009): African Women in Leadership: Current Knowledge and a Framework for Future Studies. *International Journal of African Renaissance Studies*, 4(1), 49-68.

Onsongo, J. (2004): *Factors Affecting Women's Participation in University Management in Kenya.* Report for Organisation for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa (Addis).

Shotte, G. (2013): School Leadership for Sustainable Education: Reflections on Montserrat. In P. Miller (Ed.) *School Leadership in the Caribbean: Perceptions, Practices, Paradigms* (pp. 29-44). Oxford: Symposium Books Ltd.

Snyder, H. (2019): Literature Review as a Research Methodology: An Overview and Guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, 104, 333-339.

Tasli, K. (2007): *A Conceptual Framework for Gender and Development Studies: From Welfare to Empowerment*. Wien: Österreichische Forschungsstiftung für Entwicklungshilfe (ÖFSE).

Tiessen, R. (2007): *Everywhere/nowhere. Gender Mainstreaming in Development Agencies*. Connecticut: Kumarian Press.

Todaro, M. & Smith, S. (2003): *Economic Development*. Essex: Pearson Education.

Uchem, R. & Ngwa, S. (2014): Subordination of Women in 21st Century Africa: Cultural Sustainability or a New Slavery? Implications for Educational Development. *Journal of Developing Country Studies*, 4, 143-150.

University of Buea (2002): *Department of Women and Gender Studies: Undergraduate Programme*. Limbe: Department of Women and Gender Studies.

UN (2019): *The Sustainable Development Goals Report 2019*. New York: United Nations.

UNESCO (2002): *Women and Management in Higher Education: A Good Practice Handbook*. Follow-up to the World Conference on Higher Education, Paris 5-9 October 1998. Paris: UNESCO Publishing.

UNESCO (2010): *Global Education Digest 2010: Comparing Education Statistics across the World (A Special Focus on Gender)*. Paris: UNESCO Publishing.

Waheeda, A. & Nishan, F. (2018): Challenges of Women Leaders in Higher Education Institutions in the Republic of Maldives. *International Journal of Education, Psychology and Counseling*, 3(12), 8-22.

Webster, J. & Watson, R. (2002): Analyzing the Past to Prepare for the Future: Writing a Literature Review. *MIS Quarterly*, 26(2), DOI: 10.2307/4132319.

Whitehead, A. (1979): Some Preliminary Notes on the Continuing Subordination of Women. *IDS Bulletin*, 10(3), 10-13.

Dr. Gertrude Shotte, Middlesex University, London, United Kingdom

Magdalin Nji Anim, MA Education, Gender and International Development UCL – Institute of Education, London, United Kingdom

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Marie J. Myers

Evaluation of an Academic Unit for Quality Assurance: Also Looking into Culture

Abstract

Academic reviews take on new directions in an ever-increasing fast-paced development. Unit reviewers should be provided different samples, with varied cultural contents also providing nuances, as related to the 'object' of the evaluation, as well as a final overall product, i.e. more of a synthesis, through which one will check the degree of compliance, as regards the previously established conditions, and the degree of sensitivity towards the variety of cultures inherent in the system. The aim of this paper is to shed light on evolving processes attempting to keep up with new contexts. The methodological approach used is qualitative. It consists of the analysis of observational notes from the researcher as a participant observer involved in the process of two evaluation exercises in higher education. We will present our findings using Weiss' (1980) models for implementation of results in education and discuss underlying strategies. Conclusions drawn can be adapted to most educational settings and should enable cultural aspects that infiltrate the process to be considered as a value-added characteristic in the establishing of a fairer evaluation framework.

Keywords: higher education, evaluation, fairness, cultural variability

Introduction

Evaluation has always favored a certain type of individual and system. For others, the results could be influenced by a pre-emptive attitude, as before evaluation time all the senses are awakened, and all systems are adjusted to be more efficient during the evaluation phase. This sometimes only happens temporarily just before the system comes under scrutiny. However, this way of proceeding is contrary to the spirit of evaluation. The purpose of monitoring and evaluation is to improve individual outcomes, accept responsibilities and adjust vision to aim for the best possible progression.

Considering the importance of outcomes, it is crucial, to also have in mind what happens following the data gathering activity. Weiss (1980) described seven models whereby the process of implementing research results is carried out in education.

1. The classic model consists of a follow-up: research, development followed by sharing, dissemination and then application.
2. The problem-solving model presupposes that the researcher presents the evidence or conclusions necessary to resolve a problem caused by a settlement or the implementation of a regulation. This model is based on sequence, identification of the required knowledge, search for appropriate knowledge or have it searched by someone, and finally make a decision.
3. The interactive model is seen as a complex and disorderly interaction between researchers and decision-makers.

4. The political model presupposes the selective use of search results to support or justify a position already taken or to organize a search with the expectation that the results will provide confirmations to justify the policy adopted.
5. The tactical model aims to sweep under the carpet a research problem or to avoid the search for a problem to cover the postponement or opposition to an action.
6. The model, called participant research to the company's intellectual enterprise, does not foresee a direct influence of research but seeks the impact of the large number of factors that influence various policy factors in various ways at different times.
7. The most common model is to inform the decision-making process through an influence on thinking and conceptualization in relation to the questions asked.

The latter is the model Weiss advocates.

We believe, for our part, that a completely explicit path must be followed, and it also seems necessary to define the appropriate terms so that we can qualify the procedures, so they are well-understood by all parties involved.

Beveridge (1996) agrees that there is a tendency to simplify and distort to accommodate for simplistic ideas about learning and understanding that the education system tends to accept (p. 34).

Methodology

Qualitative research is best suited for these two studies in order to find out details and uncover intricacies (Creswell & Poth, 2018; Patton, 2014) when looking for specifics and making comparisons. The main approach used was an analysis of observational notes during evaluation processes at two universities. We are also looking at case study as two different situations have been examined in two different locations. There is also comparison involved as we are outlining similarities and differences in the way the processes unfolded.

The first study took place before a business model was used for universities. As regards the site, we are talking about the internal evaluation of a university institute in eastern Canada. The evaluation had to do with a particular academic unit. The process lasted three months. Observations were recorded in a journal. Analysis of journal texts allowed to uncover emerging themes. These were later discussed in light of the approach to the evaluation processes.

The approach to that evaluation exercise was as follows. The team of reviewers consisted of four individuals, including an external reviewer, a highly recognized peer in the field of specialty and from the same cultural background as the members of the institute. The other three evaluators were on site, one from a similar institute within the same university and a culture similar to that of the institute, another of the same type of institute at a nearby university and sharing the culture, and the third evaluator shared the culture but came from a totally different institute from the same university.

The team members who were on site were tasked with doing a sort of clearing ahead of time, consisting of a data collection and summarizing the items to be reviewed, from which the external examiner could prepare his two-day investigation in the field upon arrival.

All members of the institute were summoned to a first meeting during which the process was explained in detail and all questions were answered. The secretary of the institute also set up schedules to allow each member to have an interview with the evaluators. The secretary was also to advise all students at the institute to contact the evaluators either for an interview or by sending their comments. After his visit, the external reviewer was still allowed to consult the onsite committee through phone calls or mail. The committee was also required to submit a full report of the process and the issues uncovered as well as recommendations to be made to assist the external evaluator in drafting his report. Only the report and recommendations of the external evaluator were intended for the university administration and the institute.

The second study was carried out at a university in central Canada of the same type as the first one but more recently, particularly when the business model had been adopted in academic settings which occurred approximately five years ago. The evaluation process observed in this unit did not necessarily reflect what is happening elsewhere at the same university and the subjects studied at that unit have nothing to do with the business world. Observations were recorded in a journal during the evaluation, in the same way as in the first study. These was subsequently analyzed, and findings discussed in light of the process for the specific site and later comparisons were made between the two processes and the two sites.

Three knowledgeable evaluators were chosen also perhaps with the hope that they would be lenient. The cultural issue however was viewed from a totally different perspective. Playmakers recommended their friends as examiners. These reviewers therefore shared the culture of these particular members of the institution but were probably not particularly representative of the local population. They also chose people who shared the same philosophy, no longer looking for neutral persons.

Only management representatives could meet with the reviewers to present all the successes of the unit. Members of the institution could not speak to evaluators individually, only in small groups organized ahead of time, as if one 'in-person' were in charge of controlling the discussions. The administration asked to see the names of the people who went to these meetings ahead of time, the reason for this strategy was unclear. One wonders if someone was infiltrated into the group meetings with the reviewers with the mandate to report each person who had a complaint to the unit administration.

A whole productivity file for each member of a group wishing to meet with the evaluators had to be submitted to the evaluation committee and prepared beforehand: so perhaps the idea was to contextualize the positions of the group member who decided to speak-up. All unit members also had to submit their productivity records but did not know what the administration was doing with them. I requested to have a look at the overall file while meeting with the evaluators in a small group meeting and discovered that half of the pages listing my publications had been placed after the name of the colleague next to me in alphabetical order and who hardly had any publications associated to his name. Headquarters controlled this file.

We had to prepare at least one year in advance of the evaluation. The report of the last evaluation was taken up just at that time, with just a year of implementation

of the last directions given four years earlier, and it appeared that directions suggested during the previous review had received little attention up to that date. New processes seemed to have just been implemented as in crisis management. In other words, a quick change was made, even in a temporary way to meet the requests from previous evaluators. We had to double our effort, mask and embellish at every step, in order to influence the result in a positive way. The survival of a unit is the concern of every employee.

Discussion

The two studies although conducted in different situational contexts showed that a great amount of effort was displayed to carry out the evaluation exercises. Despite sufficient amounts of care taken, one can wonder how much the results weighed on future outcomes. In addition, in light of the vast amounts of data, it would be important to know who proceeded with quality control in the organization of files. This question concerns the issue of publications data shifted from one colleague to another as mentioned above. As a result of the academic review no one ever sent detailed comments to unit members, just a one-page summary in each case was offered for viewing.

It is unclear if any negative outcome would have made it to the person concerned. There had not been any big issue as a follow-up of the unit evaluations in our studies. However, it should be noted that at one point, the second unit received a conditional pass only, with a request to submit corrective measures implemented that were recommended within a given timeline. Beveridge (1997), and Beveridge and Rimmershaw (1991) caution about the complexities involved in analyzing any kind of data and unit evaluations that require to put of vast amount of information under scrutiny.

Common trends

The process in the first study shows a certain openness and consideration for cultural diversity. The evaluators were well chosen culturally. They all had knowledge of, and an openness to, the culture of the institute. As a result, all members of the institute openly contributed, leaving out no details about a problem they had at heart. The sharing of the same culture had therefore served to build confidence and allow for further evaluation. The committee consisted of two women and two men. The young women in the institute who had difficulties to report contacted the two women of the evaluation committee.

One of the problems identified was the gender imbalance at this institute in the first study. Another cultural problem that emerged was the differences in conduct expected by two different generations. There did not seem however to have been any bad intentions in either group, rather a lack of communication.

It was also discovered that the administration took advantage of the cultural differences between members of the institute who were not from the local culture to pay them a lower salary.

However, at the same time there was no complaint about their long absences during the summer, thinking that they probably had to return to their country of origin to teach a summer session and be better able to provide for themselves. In a

sense, this evaluative approach can be considered more humane and humanistic than other known models because nothing had been swept under the carpet. However, it is mindful of the fact that the only report that is officially recognized is that of the external reviewer, who was free to leave out some of the recommendations and comments of the local committee.

All in all, the final report was fair, carried a lot of weight and also respected different sensitivities.

Placing evaluative responsibility on the external reviewer for the final report also helped establish a distance between the members of the institute and the local examiners, which allowed to maintain good neighborly relations between academics sharing the same spaces on campus. These results point to a successful process along the lines of Weiss' (1980) seventh model.

The second study results came about following observations made during an evaluation of a university unit in central Canada, when the business model was adopted in academic settings. The choice of evaluators appeared to be judicious especially given that more complexity was involved in the business approach to the evaluation. The second evaluation was more in line with Weiss' (1980) second model. It also appeared close to a crisis management model. The outcomes of the new evaluation were in a sense predetermined by the selection of the evaluation committee members. The reviewers made suggestions about new paths proposed, of course, but in a superficial and unsustainable way to enable the institute to shine despite shortcomings. It was doubtful that this would lead to improvement and the same approach to crisis management would probably follow again. Recommendations were made, but not directly implemented, probably not until just before the next assessment would be scheduled, to show that there has been progress made. This approach cannot lead to profound change. There is a lot of food for thought stemming from these studies. As student population bases shift drastically and at a very fast pace, there undoubtedly needs to be a more concerted effort in taking into account the diversity of situations also involving variety and variation across a number of spectrums.

Principles underlying the evaluation process

One would assume that any evaluation basically would have to do with balance. Ways must be found to align all elements of the evaluation with the individuals that need to be evaluated. In other words, it is a matter of using the most appropriate method in line with contextual information.

The evaluation exercise must be valid, reliable and fair. It is necessary to see what is being done and to what degree of satisfaction if not perfection. This cannot be carried out without a calibration system. It is clear that clear expectations and explicit criteria for the objectives had to be established beforehand.

As mentioned above various methods and diversified strategies must come into play along evaluation activity divisions into two areas: it is essential to include representative samples of the performance of the individuals involved as well as copies of behaviors examined on the job.

A conclusion can only be drawn by taking into account the training streams and specific instructions given that are at the source of the behaviors. It has to do with culture.

The evaluative approach adopted must aim to lead to success, to bring about improvement. To that end, assessors and evaluators should make decisions about what will be placed under scrutiny together and how, that is, by what criteria, the 'objects' of the evaluation will be assessed.

This makes a lot of sense and it is understandable that units no longer accept to be evaluated without preparation after sufficient notice is given.

A lot of thought and preparation should go into the process. An awareness for evaluators of their own culture is required.

In the assessment act, the evaluator's culture is very often imposed on the 'object' of the evaluation. In addition, personal ways of using a language also condition this act.

De Gramont (1990) predicts distortions caused by language but which are mainly due to lack of cultural knowledge. He tries to identify the problem by drawing up a list of metaphors of the self. It includes a hereditary and biological component, and other components, including contextual, conventional and poetic. These should allow the individual to be well positioned in relation to the assessment to be undertaken.

The hereditary component relates to our physical aspects and the mental traits that characterize us. Our biology dictates our behavior to some extent. The contextual component refers to the influences of our environment on our individuality. This can influence our habits, our working conditions, our responses to certain stimuli. Everything about culture, the customs that explain the cultural mold that formed us, is found in the conventional component. In the multicultural context in which we assess, it is necessary to question the various cultural influences surrounding it. Our creativity is placed within the framework of the poetic component. The perspective from which a person approaches the issues can also be explained by the greater or lesser degree of creativity they possess.

There should be an openness to the multiplicity of possible cultural clues. In addition, higher psychological processes have to be taken into account (Vygotsky, 1978) when placing institutes of higher education under scrutiny. According to Borden (1991), there are a whole range of aspects that influence our assessment of situations. The questions he asks relate to eye movement, the importance attached to time, positioning, colors, noise and silence, and gestures.

We need to be aware of such factors because without taking into account the traits inherent in cultural habits could lead to distorted interpretations.

Conclusion

Knowing how to operate fairly in a unit evaluation is crucial.

Following the consideration of evaluators' characteristics of their own cultural coloring, in addition to the awareness of other factors that various cultural filters have missed, it is also necessary to take stock of the diversity of skills. Assessing properly will depend on a given context and on the way the assessment will have to change depending on the situation. What could a reasonable operating framework look like? For a successful evaluation, it is a matter of working on two aspects. First, we must gather facts: we take into account the accumulation of information, documents from various sources, whether it be summaries of written activities, oral presentations made at meetings, reports of individual productivity or review of

finished products, but always in the light of established expectations and not a virtual and perfectionist goal. On the contrary, we must take into account the current aspect of things, see what can be improved in relation to pre-established expectations and choose exemplary ways to demonstrate opportunities for improvement.

It is essential to draw up the list of 'objects' to be put under scrutiny at the beginning because afterwards, once the process has begun, there will no longer be the necessary distance for judgment to remain neutral.

The tricky part is to choose the items to be evaluated in a culminating way to be able to demonstrate that the system holds together soundly. It will be important that the small samples selected at the outset reflect the overall aim and add to the value of documents that will come under the microscope at an advanced stage, with all of it coming together at the time of the synthesis of all the data accumulated.

On the other hand, it is also necessary to review the 'collected objects' and judge them on their value, establish their quality and decide on the value to be attributed to them. As final remarks, it should be said that since culture infiltrates any evaluation process, an accurate picture can only be made if one is prepared to take into account the knowledge, know-how and knowing how to be, associated with the people whose 'objects' are part of the evaluation.

References

Beveridge, M. (1996): *Strategic Review of Educational Research*. Report prepared for the Leverhulme Trust.

Beveridge, M. (1997): Educational implementation and teaching. In L. Smith, J. Dockrell & P. Tomlinson (Eds.) *Piaget, Vygotsky and beyond* (pp.15-26). London: Routledge.

Beveridge, M. & Rimmershaw, R. (1991): Teaching and tutoring systems; explanatory dialogues in context. In P. Goodyear (Ed.) *Teaching Knowledge and Intelligent Tutoring* (pp. 279-296). New Jersey: Ablex.

Borden, G. (1991): *Cultural Orientation: an approach to understanding intercultural communication*. Englewood Cliffs: Prentice Hall.

Creswell, J. W. & Poth, C. (2018): *Qualitative inquiry and research design.* Thousand Oaks, Cal.: Sage.

De Gramont, P. (1990): *Language and the Distortion of Meaning.* New York: New York University Press.

Patton, M. Q. (2014): *Qualitative research and evaluation methods*. 4th Ed. Thousand Oaks, Cal.: Sage.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1978): Interaction between Learning and Development. In M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner & E. Souberman (Eds.) *Mind and Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes* (pp. 79-91). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Weiss, C. H. (1980): *Social science research and decision making*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Prof. Dr. Marie J. Myers, Queen's University, Canada

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Gordana Stankovska, Ruvejda Braha & Svetlana Pandiloska Grncharovska

Relationship between Optimism-Pessimism, Learning Style and Teaching Style among Medical Students

Abstract

Each person is born with a certain ability towards particular learning styles, which demonstrates that people learn in different ways. Styles influence the way students learn, the way teachers teach, and the way they interact. Thus, the main aim of our paper was to introduce the relationship between optimism-pessimism and teaching and learning styles among medical students. The Grasha-Reichmann Student Learning Styles Scale (GR-SLSS), Grasha's Teaching Style Inventory (TSI) and Children's Attributional Style Questionnaire (CASQ) were administered to a sample of 160 medical university students. The results demonstrated that among the teaching styles, facilitator, delegator and expert were the teaching styles most preferred by students. Based on the results, the dominant learning style of students in general was the collaborative, competitive and participatory style. At the same time, there was a significant positive relationship between optimism and student-centered teaching styles (facilitator and delegator), while pessimism was highly correlated with teacher-centered styles (expert, formal authority and personal model). Also, we found a significant positive relationship between optimism and the collaborative, competitive, independent and participatory learning style. On the other hand, pessimistic students tend to choose the dependent and avoidant learning style. More than half of male and female students preferred the collaborative, competitive and participatory learning style and the delegator, facilitator and expert teaching style. Overall, the research findings have successfully shown the relationship between a learning style, a teaching style and optimism-pessimism among medical students. The learning and teaching style together with the dichotomy optimism-pessimism are a significant factor for the teaching-learning process.

Keywords: optimism-pessimism, learning style, teaching style, students, management

Introduction

The world young people live in today is different from the one where their parents grew up (Heibert, 2002). Heibert suggests that we, as a society, are only beginning to identify and understand the nature of this change. Listening to the needs and wants of young people enabled the society to provide "tools" that are necessary for them to survive and succeed. Today higher institutions are shifting from their sole objective of transfer and absorption of knowledge and academic achievement towards a more inclusive focus on the development of the whole individual. Fullarton (2002) describes this as being a shift from a focus on what is learned to a focus on what it takes to develop the learner.

Each person is born with a certain ability towards particular learning styles, which demonstrates that people learn in different ways. Styles influence on the way students learn, the way teachers teach, and the way they interact.

According to Efiong (2005, in Caraballe, 2015), it is believed that young people all over the world have their own individual variations in the modes of perceiving, remembering, and thinking and the ways of taking on, storing, transforming, and solving problems. They also have varied ways of learning.

Just as students have individual learning styles, teachers have preferred teaching styles that work best for them. Gaining knowledge on students' learning styles can be very helpful for both teachers and learners.

Affective issues play a central role in the process of learning and teaching (Demetriou et al., 2009). When pessimistic students encounter negative events, they are likely to exhibit a constellation of helpless behaviors including cognitive deficits, passivity, sadness, lowered self-esteem, assertiveness and competitiveness (Chang et al., 2003). On the other side, optimism is believed to be associated with positive learning or teaching styles.

Definition and classification of a learning style

In order to apply a learning styles theory of medical learning and teaching we have to know what a learning style is. A learning style takes place when a change of a learner's behavior resulting from what has been experienced is observed. Therefore, students' characteristic learning style is an indicator of how a student learns and likes to learn. Additionally, learning styles refer to how students process, focus and make information meaningful, and gain new information in order to translate it into building new skills (Dunn & Griggs, 2000).

Among Grasha's initial findings, most university medical students had developed abstract thinking or independent abilities (Grasha, 2002). Subsequently, his studies showed that the students' preferences are a product of their previous experiences and that the adaptation of their learning styles is in accordance with the way the professor structures and the classmates communicate between them.

Learning style was defined by Grasha (2002, p. 127) as "personal qualities that influence a student's ability to acquire information, to interact with peers and the teacher, and to participate in learning experiences". He proposes a learning styles classification based on three categories of analysis: students' attitudes toward learning; perception of classmates and professors; and reaction to teaching styles in class. From this categorization the following learning styles are defined and explained, because they will be covered in the research part.

Competitive style: Students compete with other peers and prefer teacher-centered classroom with activities.

Collaborative style: These students tend to share knowledge and are cooperative with peers and professors.

Avoidant style: This group of students is not willing to cooperate with teachers and other students.

Participatory style: These students are interested in participating in activities and prefer the lectures and discussion.

Dependent style: They would prefer to work alone, especially in topics they are highly interested in, and would tend to get clear and unambiguous instruction.

Independent style: Students think independently, they participate in independent projects and tend to determine their goals and learning process.

Teaching styles

Every person has particular distinctive styles of thinking, preferences and ways of doing things which influence their behavior. In an educational environment, teachers' personal qualities and the attitudes that they employ in their teaching refer to their teaching styles.

According to Jarvis (2004, p. 40), a teaching style "includes the implementation of philosophy; it contains evidence of beliefs about values related to and attributes toward all elements of the teaching-learning exchange". In Grasha's view (1996), a teaching style is the consistent behavior of teachers in their relationships with their students. In the same line of inquiry, Grasha identified typical orientations and categories teachers use in their classes: expert, formal authority, personal model, facilitator and delegator. Teachers with an expert teaching style have the knowledge that students need and are concerned with transmitting correct information to students. Teachers with a formal authority style are considered an expert in their field of study. Being the center of the class, they emphasize an acceptable standard, provide positive and negative feedback, establish learning goals for students, and supervise students with critical views towards standard practices and procedures. Teachers with a personal teaching style consider themselves models for their students and students are expected to emulate their approaches. On the other hand, teachers with a facilitator style focus on student-teacher interaction. Teachers attempt to encourage their students to make informed decisions. Delegator teachers are characterized as resourceful persons who are available at the request of students. Fostering autonomy in learners is of primary importance for the delegator teaching style (Kazemi & Soleimani, 2013).

Optimism and pessimism

There are no universally agreed definitions of dispositional optimism and pessimism. However, researchers have often related definitions that involve biases in generalized positive and negative expectations for future events. Optimism has been defined as a tendency to expect positive outcomes or the belief that positive events will prevail over negative ones, while pessimism has been defined as a failure expectancy or an anticipation of bad outcomes (Kassinove & Sukhodolosky, 1995).

Positive or negative emotions, such as optimism and pessimism, penetrated into every aspect of the teaching and learning process, thus, an understanding of the nature of emotions within a school or a university context is of great importance. According to cognitive and social psychologists, optimism and pessimism affect and shape students' cognitions (Sutton & Whearley, 2003). Positive emotions and feelings make the student's perception of self-efficacy better and make them ready to deal with life and educational problems. Negative emotions and pessimism are negatively related to learning and teaching styles. Thus, the main aim of our paper was to introduce the relationship between optimism-pessimism and teaching and learning styles among medical students.

Research methods

Participants

The analysis was conducted through a correlation study including a population of 160 medical university students who enrolled in a learning theory and practice course at the Faculty of Medical Science in Tetova. The population consisted of 80 girls (50%) and 80 boys (50%), with an average age of 20.32 years, within the range from 19 to 22 years of age, and a standard deviation of 2.46.

Instruments

Children's Attributional Style Questionnaire-Revised (CASQ-R)

The scale revised by Kasiow and Nolen-Hoeksema (1991) was developed by the participants. The CASQ-R includes 48 items, half addressing positive outcomes and half addressing negative outcomes. It is a two-point Likert-type scale. The minimum and maximum scores for each domain were 24 and 48, respectively, with an overall score ranging from 48 to 96. Cronbach's Alpha for the 46 of 48 items were .756, which represents a good correlation between items.

Grasha-Reichmann Student Learning Styles Scale Inventory (GR-SLSSI)

Grasha-Reichmann Student Learning Styles Scale Inventory (Grasha & Reichmann, 1975) is a self-report Likert-type test of 60 items, with five answer options from 1 to 5. The 60 items are classified into six categories, ten in each category in order to assess the competitive, collaborative, participatory, dependent, avoidant and independent learning style. Cronbach's Alpha for the 57 of 60 items were .832, which represents a good correlation between items.

Grasha's Teaching Style Inventory (TSI)

Grasha's Teaching Style Inventory (1996) includes 40 items on a 7-point Likert-type scale ranging from strongly disagree to strongly agree. The participants are supposed to respond to each of the items in terms of how the teachers teach. Each 8 items identify one of the basic teaching styles defined by Grasha regarding the expert, formal authority, personal model, facilitator and delegator teaching style. Cronbach's Alpha for the 37 of 40 items were .784, which represents a good correlation between items.

Data procedure and data analysis

Tests were administered by the researchers during the winter semester of the academic year of 2019-2020. They were applied to the students in a classroom setting, with the permission of the researchers. The duration of the time for answering the scale was 50 minutes. Statistical analysis of the results obtained in the study was conducted with SPSS 20.0 for the Windows package program.

Results

The percentage and frequency of each teaching style subscales were calculated. The highest percentage is related to the facilitator style (33.75%). The delegator style (26.85%) had the second highest percentage among the other teaching styles. The three other styles have lower percentages as follows: expert (23.78%), formal authority (11.25%) and personal style (4.37%).

Among the six domains of learning styles, collaborative (35.00%), competitive (30.05%) and participatory (15.00%) are the most dominant learning styles among students. The other learning styles have lower percentages: dependent (11.85%), independent (4.35%) and avoidant (3.75%).

The results indicated that there was a positive and a significant relationship between optimism and facilitator (r=.421, p<.01), delegator (r=.364, p<.01) and expert (r=.204, p<.05), but negative correlation between optimism and formal authority (r=.214, p>.05) and personal style (r=.412, p>.05). Also there was a strong negative relationship between pessimism and facilitator (r=.463, p>.01), and delegator (r=.456, p>.01), but positive correlation between pessimism and expert (r=.603, p<.05), formal authority (r=.406, p<.05) and personal style (r=.417, p<.05).

Regarding the relationships between optimism and learning style subscales, the following results are presented: optimism and collaborative (r=.506, p<.01), competitive (r=.706, p<.01), participatory (r=.604, p<.05), independent (r=.407, p<.05), dependent (r=.452, p>.01) and avoidant model (r=.431, p>.05). There are strong negative relationships between pessimism and collaborative (r=.421, p>.01), competitive (r=.585, p>.01), independent (r=.515, p>.05) and participatory model (r=.797, p>.01), but a positive relationship between pessimism and dependent (r=.604, p<.05) and avoidant model (r=.431, p<.05).

In our study, we observed that there were significant differences between the score of optimism and pessimism among the girls and the boys. The girls had higher scores of pessimism (M=33.14, SD=6.12), and optimism (M=33.14, SD=6.12), while the boys had lower scores of pessimism (M=21.12, SD=4.34), and optimism (M=24.16, SD=4.08). There was a positive relationship between the level of optimism, pessimism and gender ($F_{159,1}$=32.16, sig=.008, p<.01). Also, the results showed that there was a positive correlation between gender and collaborative, competitive and participatory learning style, but a negative correlation between gender and dependent, avoidant and independent style. At the same time the results confirmed that there was a positive relationship between gender and facilitator, delegator and expert teaching style, but negative correlation between gender, formal authority and personal model.

Discussion

In this study the results demonstrated that of all teaching styles, facilitator, delegator and expert were the most preferred teaching styles among students. The obtained results are similar to the results obtained by other researchers (Ahmed, 2013). Teachers who have a facilitator model teaching style tend to focus on activities in the classroom. This finding further explains that most teacher respondents emphasize student-centered learning and their overall goal is to help students develop independent action, initiative and responsibility (Eken, 2000). The teachers with delegator and expert style are also concerned with developing the students' autonomous and independent learning.

Based on the results, the dominant learning styles of students in general were collaborative, competitive and participatory style. Attending class activities and a competition for the best student are generally accepted and favored in our society. Furthermore, the results showed that positive emotions such as optimism were highly correlated with student-centered styles (facilitator and delegator), while pessimism was highly correlated with teacher-centered styles (expert, formal authority and personal model). It can be concluded that teachers with facilitator and delegator styles are more flexible and adaptive to regulate negative emotional

experiences in order to provide a non-threatening learning environment for the learners.

In addition, the results demonstrated that the dominant learning style of optimistic students is the collaborative, competitive, independent and participatory style, while the pessimistic students tend to choose the dependent and avoidant learning style. Students who have developed pessimistic cognitive frameworks did not participate in the activities and tend to be anonymous. Therefore, it can be concluded that students with positive emotions express the need of flexibility within the classroom (Osborne & Ireland, 2000).

In our study we found that girls had higher level of optimism and pessimism than boys. Existing literature reveals the same information about these parameters in female students (Miller et al., 2001). One of the reasons for the increasing levels of optimism-pessimism of female students may be due to the biological and psychological differences between boys and girls. More than half of the students preferred the collaborative, competitive and participatory learning style, and the delegator, facilitator and expert teaching style.

Conclusion

Overall, the research findings have successfully shown the relationship between a learning style, a teaching style and emotions among medical students. Understanding student's unique learning style preferences and instructional needs can assist teachers in developing a more favorable view of all students' abilities and stimulate the development and implementation of differential instructional practices and the provision of intention and personalized intervention.

Gender plays an important role in influencing students' emotions towards learning, and it was found that female students feel more optimistic and enjoy learning when they were competing with peers. Therefore, there is only a little or no difference between favorable teaching styles that both genders almost feel the same in regard to the way professors delivered their lessons. Students also prefer the teaching styles that include two-way communication and are likely to engage in learning when teachers suggest them the outcomes of some tasks.

From our study we can conclude that there is need to adapt the medical curriculum and the teaching practice in a flexible manner so that students with different learning backgrounds and styles will be able to overcome difficulties during the learning process. Nevertheless, this research only involved medical students from the first year of studies at the University of Tetova. Thus, future researchers are advised to do the research on a large scale of respondents, to involve several universities and extend the scope of the area.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to express their gratitude to all participants who took part in this study.

References

Ahmed, K. A. (2013): Teacher-centered versus learner-centered teaching style. *The Journal of Global Business Management*, 9(1), 22-34.

Caraballe, R. S. (2015): The relationship between students' learning styles and teachers' teaching styles to students' achievement. *Asia Pacific Higher Education Research Journal*, 2(2), http://po.pnuresearchportal.org/ejournal/index.php/apherj/article/view/105/96

Chang, E. C., Sanna, L. J. & Yang, K. M. (2003): Optimism, pessimism, affectivity, and psychological adjustment in UK and Korea: A test of a mediation model. *Personality and Individual Differences*, 34, 1195-1208.

Demetriou, H., Wilson, E. & Winterbottom, M. (2009): The role of emotion in teaching: Are there differences between male and female newly qualified teachers' approaches to teaching? *Educational Studies*, 35(4), 449-473.

Dunn, R. S. & Griggs, S. A. (2000): *Practical approaches to using learning styles in higher education.* Westrport, CT: Greenwood Publishing Group.

Eken, D. K. (2000): Through the eyes of the learner: Learner observation of teaching and learning. *ELT Journal*, 53(4), 66-80.

Fullarton, S. (2002): *Student engagement with school: Individual and school-level influences. Longitudional surveys of Australian youth. Research report Number 27*. Camberwell, Victoria: Australian Council for Educational Research.

Grasha, A. F. (1996): *Teaching with style: A practical guide to enhancing leaning by understanding teaching and learning style*. Pittsburgh: Alliance Publishers.

Grasha, A. F. (2002): The dynamics of one-on-one teaching. *College Teaching*, 50, 139-146.

Grasha, A. F. & Reichmann, S. W. (1975): The Grasha-Reichmann student learning style scales. In W. Berquist (Ed.) *Handbook for faculty development* (pp. 154-162). Washington, D.C.: CASC.

Heibert, B. (2002): Listening to students: Empowering life direction. *The Alberta Counsellor*, 27(2), 27-31.

Jarvis, P. (2004): *Adult education and lifelong learning: Theory and practice*. London: Routledge.

Kasiow, N. J. & Nolen-Hoeksema, S. (1991): Children's Attributional Questionnaire-Revised. Unpublished manuscripts. Atlanta, GA: Emory University.

Kassinove, H. & Sukhodolosky, D. G. (1995): Optimism, pessimism, and worry in Russia and American children and adolescents. *Journal of Social Behavior and Personality*, 10, 157-168.

Kazemi, A. & Soleimani, N. (2013): On Iranian EFL teachers' dominant teaching styles in private language centers: teacher centered or student-centered? *International Journal of Language Learning and Applied Linguistics World*, 4, 193-202.

Miller, L., Richards, P. S. & Keller, R. R. (2001): Foreword. In E. C. Chang (Ed.) *Optimism and pessimism: Implications for theory, research, and practice* (pp. 345-376). Washington, D.C.: American Psychological Association.

Osborne, G. & Ireland, S. (2000): Yes, we are listening: Listening to student voice. In Proceedings Australian Association for Research in Education Annual Conference, Sydney. http://www.aare.edu.au/00pap/gro00435.htm (Accessed 12 March, 2009).

Riad, S. A. (2015): Learning styles and visual literacy for learning and performance. *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 176, 538-545.

Sutton, R. & Whearley, K. (2003): Teachers' emotions and teaching: A review of the literature and direction for future research. *Educational Psychology Review*, 15(94), 327-358.

Corresponding author:
Prof. Dr. Gordana Stankovska, University of Tetova, Republic of North Macedonia

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Part 5
Law and Education

Elizabeth Achinewhu-Nworgu

Examining How Students Are Engaging in Their Teaching and Learning Activities: A Case Study of Higher Education Students in a London University, London Campus

Abstract

This research project examines how international students are engaging with teaching and learning activities at a London based University. The research is at its pilot stage and will be focusing on one of the Business modules, namely MSc Human Resource Management, offered at the London University Campus. The project will seek to explore students' views on different teaching and learning activities of the module and how these have engaged and motivated them in their learning, and to identify areas for improvement. The main aim and purpose of this initial research is to find out which of the teaching and learning activities students found most helpful in their learning and to make suggestions on areas for improvement. A literature review and initial investigations identified 11 key teaching and learning activities mapped on this programme that are used according to the topics delivered each week: lectures, seminars, case studies, discussions, videos, debates, group work, individual work, class tests, quizzes, and guest speakers. The implementation of these activities will be investigated using variety of research methods, including quantitative surveys to explore the views of students doing this module, through on-line questionnaires, and in-class completion of questionnaires. It is anticipated that this pilot research will inform future research across other London University modules to promote the sharing of good practice and to fully support, engage and motivate students in their programme of studies. Recommendations will be made based on the students' feedback.

Keywords: students, engaging, motivation, internationalisation, retention, achievement, teaching and learning activities, implementation, good practice

Introduction

Student engagement and motivation are crucial in academic achievement. Examining classroom activities and how students at a London based University feel they have impacted their learning, can help us understand how this engagement and motivation can be strengthened. The London based University is currently in partnership with five universities. The majority of the students are foreign, with English as their second language. For the purposes of this project, the focus is on the Business students studying an MSc Human Resource Management module, based at

one of the London Campuses. This study will investigate how students are engaging with, and motivated by, the teaching and learning activities of this programme, and their perceptions of how these have helped to enhance their learning on this module. The key objectives will be to:

- examine how learning activities engage MSc HRM students;
- explore other dimensions of student engagement, such as behavioural, emotional or cognitive, that help to identify each student's ways of responding to classroom activities and how these have enabled them to be engaged in their studies;
- analyse students' perceptions on how they are engaging and motivated with the learning activities on their MSc HRM module;
- suggest other activities relevant to engaging students that can help them complete their programme for this module.

Literature review

Student engagement and motivation to learn

Much research has been carried out into the causes of students' engagement and motivation to study, highlighting the multi-faceted nature of engagement with learning activities, and the consequences – disengagement, demotivation, and ultimately drop-out – if students are not fully engaged with learning activities. The University for this study is presented as X University in the UK. The University recruits students from abroad, indicating that majority of the students are international, for whom English is a second language, with different ways of learning in their home countries. This presents potential challenges for them in adapting to studying in a British university. When students come to study from abroad, it is particularly important to engage them with rich learning activities as most of them come to study abroad to gain good and quality education that may not be the same as in their home countries. Therefore, most of the students expect enriched learning activities from their lessons. Failure to fully engage students in a classroom can lead to non-completion or drop-out (Achinewhu-Nworgu, 2008), although other factors can affect students' disengagement from their studies such as financial constraints (Martinez & Munday, 1998), the learning environment (Achinewhu-Nworgu, 2008; Tinto, 1988).

This subject is of pivotal importance to the X University as an international recruiter of foreign students. One of the University's aims is to develop a strategy to fully support student's engagement and to widen participation for the London Campus students. Looking in detail at the effectiveness of different classroom activities, and how well they engage international students in their learning, can play a key part in this. An overview of the literature in this area points us towards the key issues that may impact on students' levels of classroom engagement. Exploring other dimensions of student engagement, such as behavioural, emotional or cognitive engagement (Fredricks, Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004) helps to identify a student's way of responding to classroom activities and how these have enabled them to be engaged in their studies. Although, many of the action research projects on student engagement and motivation tend to focus on cognitive dimensions of student engagement, all three of these dimensions have provided useful explanations

as to how students can be engaged in their learning based on these factors (Fredricks, Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004).

Behavioural, emotional and cognitive engagement

Behavioural engagement consists of school related conduct, involvement in learning, attendance, participation and related activities. Behavioural engagement as defined by Fredricks, Blumenfeld and Paris (2004), is the active participation in school in general as well as in classroom related activities or work. The assumption here presents the facts that students who are behaviourally engaged would always attend their lessons, follow the lectures or teachers' instructions, participate in classroom activities and complete their assignments.

Emotional engagement, on the other hand, encompasses positive and negative reactions in the class, relationships with the teachers, peers and school in terms of either belonging or connectedness (Appleton, Christenson & Furlong, 2008; Fredricks, Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004; Christenson, Reschly & Wylie, 2012; Tinto, 2007).

Cognitive engagement consists of self-regulated learning, whether learning is perceived as relevant and deep learning strategies for comprehensive or complex ideas (Fredricks, Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004; Wang & Degol, 2012). It encompasses self-regulated learning such as school course work (Achinewhu-Nworgu, 2008).

Other dimensions of student engagement

Other factors linked to student engagement include academic background (Tinto, 1988; Appleton, Christenson & Furlong, 2008), social engagement (Finn & Zimmer, 2012; Fredricks et al., 2016), as well as agentic engagement. Agentically engaged students, as identified by Reeve (2012), are architects of their own motivation, proactively trying to personalize and enhance their learning context by offering input, making suggestions, expressing preferences, and more. As they constructively contribute to their education, agentically engaged learners' behaviours affect their learning positively. The work of Hu and Kuh (2001) has centred around how educationally purposeful activities can influence students and institutions. Online and general campus-based student engagement has also been found to contribute to students' academic engagement (Coates, 2007).

The relevance of these factors is confirmed by my own experiences and observations as a lecturer. There are clearly different components to a student's engagement, which are present both within and outside the classroom, with these different types of engagement having the potential to be mutually reinforcing to either enhance or diminish a student's motivation to learn. Biggs and Tang (2007) identify that one of the problems teachers face is getting students motivated to engage in learning. Student motivation to learn helps them to be fully engaged; the findings of my own research have concluded that students will remain to complete their programme of study if they have effective teaching and learning as well as motivation (Achinewhu-Nworgu, 2008). The range of learning activities provided within each module brings these different types of engagement together and ensuring they complete their programme of study. However, the question remains: how relevant are these dimensions to international students at a London based X University dominated by international students? How applicable are the three

dimensions of behavioural, emotional and cognitive engagement for international students in this context?

The impact of enriched learning activities

Enriched learning activities can help engage students in their learning which may present positive outcomes on retention and achievement. This is particularly pertinent for international students studying in London X University institutions. Firstly, because they already faced challenges in adjusting to different styles of teaching and learning to that which they are used to in their home countries, with the additional factor that English is often not their first language. Secondly, because of the significant fees paid by international students to gain a foreign education, there may be an increased expectation of enriched learning activities within their programmes of study and the ability of the teachers and the institutions to provide students with enriched learning activities and conducive learning environment, students will be more happy to fully be engaged in the programme of studies as the case may be with the international students on the MSc International HR programme.

Student's engagement in their learning is helpful in developing lifelong skills useful for their future employment. Engaging students fully in classroom activities has a big impact on student retention and achievement. The three dimensions of behavioural, emotional and cognitive engagement (Fredricks, Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004) **c**an enable students' development of essential skills that impact on academic achievement and adjustment as well as completion of a programme of study (Archambault et al., 2009). Behavioural, emotional and cognitive engagement, as described above, are pronounced in the life and engagement of international students studying at the X University in the UK, therefore, failure to equip them with relevant teaching activities risks them becoming disengaged, leading to demotivation and withdrawal from their programme of study without achieving.

Another key point to address is to find out why student engagement with enriched learning activities at the X University is very important to me as a Lecturer and also for the students. Engaging students with enriched learning activities (using effective teaching and learning approaches in lectures, seminars and group work) can improve motivation, academic adjustments, grade achievement, academic aspirations and completion (Achinewhu-Nworgu, 2008; Fredricks, Blumenfeld & Paris, 2004; Martinez, 1996; Hodkinson & Bloomer, 2001), attendance and persistence (Waldrop et al., 2019). Moreover, Li and Lerner (2011) provide evidence of a correlation with favourable mental health outcomes as well as reduced levels of depression and suicidal thoughts and behaviour (Marraccini & Brier, 2017) and higher life satisfaction (Lewis et al., 2012).

Engaging students with rich learning activities helps students to think positively, focus, and prevents students from bad behaviour (Fredricks et al., 2016). On the other hand, when students are disengaged, it can also lead to level of bad behaviour, hence leading them to withdraw or drop out without achieving. Engagement of students in the classroom also has wider implications for their engagement with the institution as a whole. Behaviourally, emotionally and cognitively engaged students are more likely to comply with the educational rules and regulations of the University, e.g. to attend all the scheduled classes. As a practitioner in education,

engagement becomes part of my policy implementation to ensure varied teaching activities as the findings below explain. Further to the discussion above, student disengagement can also impose stresses on the teacher (Fredricks et al., 2016). Taking all of these together, it is essential that lecturers motivate students with engaging learning activities that help to motivate them to succeed and overcome the additional challenges associated with being international students.

The paper will present the impact of four learning activities (lecture, seminar, group work, and assessment) used in teaching international students at the X University London based Campus. It will present the perceptions of students on how they are engaging with these learning activities and the relationship to the three theoretical dimensions (behavioural, emotional, and cognitive engagement) and how this impact on students' learning. The findings of the research will help to inform areas for improvement and future research.

Methodology

Due to the protocols of permission to conduct the research on current students to accomplish this study, and my focus on a specific institution, I have used the term X University students for this study that focused on completers of programme who left the University and either returned back to their home countries or were still in the UK. My original intention was to use interviews to capture the views of the current students using classroom period. However, this plan was changed to focusing on the completers-leavers at this initial stage and it is seen as very important to hear from the completers-leavers first. The mini study used both a quantitative and qualitative approach to the research. The secondary data focused on reading relevant literature around the chosen topic. Primary research was designed to involve a telephone interview with the completers-leavers. My target was to interview 30 leavers. However, I was able to get 10 students through a WhatsApp group. Participants were very happy to be part of the interview. The use of telephone interview was relevant in this research as I concentrated on completers or leavers and it was not easy to access them. The participants were over 18 years of age and were happy to participate after explaining to them the need for the research. I also reassured them of the confidentiality of the information except for the purpose of this paper for presentation and publication. Once the ethics of the research were fully observed, I went ahead with the telephone interview in the evenings after work. Some of the information gathered is discussed below.

Discussion of findings

The research findings clearly correlate with the findings of the literature presented above. I have chosen to highlight one of the comments from the participants here due to the constraints of space. However, as work in progress, also at its initial stage, the full findings will be presented in my future work. One comment from a participant, based on one of the interview questions, is presented below.

Q1. Which of the learning activities applies to your teaching and learning in this University – lecture, seminar or working in a group?

> *My teacher uses all the three in our lessons and they are all interesting activities that are engaging. However, lecture and seminar activities are my main priority if I have to choose. For instance, after the interesting lecture, the seminar session helps us to understand the lesson more as we will now put things into practice and it is then you can appreciate the lesson, for me, the enriched activities in my lecture and seminar motivate me to attend the lessons.* (R2)

Conclusion

The focus of the work was to explore how international students responded to their learning activities and the impact on their motivation, behavioural, emotional and cognitive engagement. It explored relevant and prior literature that helped the focus of the mini research. Students' comments indicate some correlation between what the students said and the literature. The most predominant links were the work of Achinewhu-Nworgu (2008), Fredricks, Blumenfeld and Paris (2004) and other literature presented above, which have all contributed to the conclusion on findings of the mini research. One could go on with transcribing the questions asked and the responses, however, due to the word limit the findings will be shared in more detailed discussion and the link to literature in my future papers. The future work will therefore progress with what emerged from the research and will aim to present full findings of the overall work at a later stage.

References

Achinewhu-Nworgu, E. (2008): Nine Key Strategies Promoting Student Retention in London Further Education Colleges. *Comparative Education, Teacher Training, Education Policy and Social Inclusion* (pp. 257-264). BCES Conference Books, Vol. 6. Sofia: Bureau for Educational Services.

Appleton, J. J., Christenson, S. L. & Furlong, M. J. (2008): Student engagement with school: Critical conceptual and methodological issues of the construct. *Psychology in the Schools*, 45(5), 369-386.

Archambault, I., Janosz, M., Morizot, J. & Pagani, L. (2009): Adolescent Behavioral, Affective, and Cognitive Engagement in School: Relationship to Dropout. *Journal of School Health*, 79(9), 408-415.

Biggs, J. & Tang, C. (2007): *Teaching for quality learning at university: What the student does*. 3rd Ed. Berkshire: Open University Press.

Christenson, S. L., Reschly, A. L. & Wylie, C. (Eds.) (2012): *Handbook of Research on Student Engagement*. New York: Springer Science and Business Media.

Coates, H. (2007): A Model of Online and General Campus-Based Student Engagement. *Assessment and Evaluation in Higher Education*, 32(2), 121-141.

Finn, J. D. & Zimmer, K. S. (2012): Student engagement: What is it? Why does it matter? In S. L. Christenson, A. L. Reschly & C. Wylie (Eds.) *Handbook of Research on Student Engagement* (pp. 97-131). New York: Springer Science and Business Media.

Fredricks, J. A., Blumenfeld, P. C. & Paris, A. H. (2004): School Engagement: Potential of the Concept, State of the Evidence. *Review of Educational Research*, 74(1), 59-109.

Fredricks, J. A., Wang, M. T., Linn, J. S., Hofkens, T. L., Sung, H., Parr, A. & Allerton, J. (2016): Using qualitative methods to develop a survey measure of math and science engagement. *Learning and Instruction*, 43, 5-15.

Hodkinson, P. & Bloomer, M. (2001): Dropping out of further education: complex causes and simplistic policy assumptions. *Research Papers in Education*, 16(2), 117-140.

Hu, S. & Kuh, G. D. (2001): Being (Dis) Engaged in Educationally Purposeful Activities: The Influences of Student and Institutional Characteristics. Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association Annual Conference.

Lewis, C. C., Perry, R. R., Friedkin, S. & Roth, J. R. (2012): Improving Teaching Does Improve Teachers: Evidence from Lesson Study. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 63(5), 368-375.

Li, Y. & Lerner, R. M. (2011): Trajectories of school engagement during adolescence: Implications for grades, depression, delinquency, and substance use. *Developmental Psychology*, 47(1), 233-247.

Marraccini, M. E. & Brier, Z. M. F. (2017): School connectedness and suicidal thoughts and behaviors: A systematic meta-analysis. *School Psychology Quarterly*, 32(1), 5-21.

Martinez, P. & Munday, F. (1998): *9,000 Voices: student persistence and dropout in further education*. FEDA Report, 2(7). London: Further Education Development Agency.

Martinez, P. (1996): *Student Retention: Case studies of strategies that work*. FEDA Paper, 1(6). London: Further Education Development Agency.

Reeve, J. (2012): A self-determination theory perspective on student engagement. In S. L. Christenson, A. L. Reschly & C. Wylie (Eds.) *Handbook of Research on Student Engagement* (pp. 149-172). New York: Springer Science and Business Media.

Tinto, V. (1988): Stages of Student Departure: Reflection on the Longitudinal Character of Student Leaving. *Journal of Higher Education*, 59(4), 438-455.

Tinto, V. (2007): Taking Student Retention Seriously. https://www.umes.edu/uploadedFiles/_DEPARTMENTS/Academic_Affairs/Content/_1-Taking%20Student%20Retention%20Seriously.pdf (Accessed 15/2/2020).

Waldrop, D., Reschly, A. L, Fraysier, K. & Appleton, J. J. (2019): Measuring the Engagement of College Students: Administration Format, Structure, and Validity of the Student Engagement Instrument–College. *Measurement and Evaluation in Counseling and Development*, 52(2), 99-107.

Wang, M. T. & Degol, J. (2012): Staying Engaged: Knowledge and Research Needs in Student Engagement. *Child Development Perspectives*, 8(3), 137-143.

Dr. Elizabeth Achinewhu-Nworgu, QAHE – in Partnership with Ulster, Northumbria, Roehampton, Middlesex & Solent Universities London & Ireland

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

André du Plessis

Statutory Curtailment of School Autonomy: Recent Movements on the Centralization-Decentralization Continuum in South African Education

Abstract

The South African education system has been perceived as a decentralised and democratized education system and the National Development Plan proposes that greater management autonomy should be granted to public school principals by recommending that principals should gradually be given more powers as the quality of their leadership improves. This paper however, argues that contrary to the objectives of the National Development Plan, recent and current amendments to legislation is indicative that the government is moving in the opposite direction and that school governance and management autonomy is being curtailed. This is evident through an analysis of the effect of relevant sections of the Education Laws Amendment Act 31 of 2007 and the draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill (2017).

Keywords: centralization, decentralization, school management, school governance, school autonomy

Introduction

The South African education system makes provision for differentiated school governance autonomy. This differentiation is expressed in two ways. Firstly, Section 21 of the South African Schools Act (RSA, 1996a) provides an avenue for differentiated decentralised autonomy in that it makes provision for school governing bodies to apply to the provincial Head of Department to be allocated additional functions pertaining to the maintenance and improvement of a school's facilities, the extra-mural curriculum of the school, the purchasing of textbooks and other educational material, to pay for services to the school, to provide an adult basic education class and other functions consistent with the provisions of the Schools Act and applicable provincial law. The second way in which differentiated school autonomy finds expression is the National Norms and Standards for School Funding (NNSSF) (RSA, 2017b) which determines that the poorest 60% of public schools are declared non-fee-paying schools, receiving all their funding from the state, whilst the 'richer' 40% of public schools are fee-paying schools, receiving substantially less from the state, which equates to non-fee-paying schools receiving approximately six times that of fee-paying schools. This not only provides so-called fee-paying schools with a substantial degree of autonomy, but also requires greater levels of accountability to the local school community. However, during the last decade there has been a steady curtailment of the autonomy levels of school governing bodies, both through official statutory regulatory channels and through repeated unlawful attempts that had to be resolved by the courts.

Statutory curtailments of school governance autonomy

An important mechanism to provide the education authorities with influence in school governing bodies was the insertion of Section 16A into the South African Schools Act by the Education Laws Amendment Act 31 of 2007. Section 16A stipulates that the principal of a public school represents the provincial Head of Department on the school governing body. In addition, Section 16A determines that a public school principal may not assist the school governing body in a manner which is in conflict with the instructions of the provincial Head of Department (HOD). The insertion of these amendments to the Schools Act has thus provided the Department of Basic Education, through the principals, a vehicle to be represented on governing bodies of public schools and as such, a means to influence governing body decisions. This is an example of how, under the pretense of decentralization, the authorities are actually centralizing the governance system.

Other examples of statutory curtailment of school governance autonomy can be found in the Section 58C of the Schools Act, inserted by means of Section 11 of the Education Laws Amendment Act of 2007 (RSA, 2007). The constraining elements and the potential for centralization contained in Section 58C can be juxtaposed against a twofold motivation for government to apply a form of selective decentralization. The first is related to the need to achieve equity and hence to utilize financial resources more effectively where needed most. However, in so doing, government must rely on school communities who can afford it, to contribute in the form of school fees, thus being forced to allow some financial decision-making autonomy. Conversely, political realities (political realism), for example the decline in legitimacy due to underperformance of the education system, are forcing the government to implement a more centralized approach. This corresponds to Lauglo's (1995) rationale of political legitimacy for the implementation of decentralization measures, which places the emphasis on "who has the right to make what decisions".

It is important that Section 58C of the Schools Act (RSA, 1996a) be read in conjunction with Section 16 of the Schools Act and sub-section 3(4) of the National Education Policy Act (RSA, 1996b) which grants the Minister of Basic Education additional powers to promulgate additional regulations. This has resulted in a number of policies and regulations being published that curtail autonomy levels pertaining to the professional management of schools and the policy-making functions of school governing bodies. It illustrates the vast extent of the Minister of Basic Education's powers to prescribe to school governing bodies how they must govern their schools and influence what is happening at local school level.

Notwithstanding the above, it is especially in matters concerning the appointment of teachers, admission policies and language policies of public schools, and the procurement and contractual ability of school governing bodies that the draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill (RSA, 2017a) provides clear signs that the government has set its sights on a course towards greater centralization.

The draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill (2017)

Firstly, the draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill (RSA, 2017a) seeks to adjust the powers of school governing bodies with regard to recommending

candidates for appointment to management positions in schools in favor of the HOD. It is argued by the memorandum of motivation that accompanied the draft Amendment Bill, that in terms of the appointment of teachers in management positions, dysfunctional school governing bodies in rural areas do not have functional governing bodies and persons with the necessary skills and necessary knowledge to conduct interview processes and to know what is required of a principal, a deputy principal or a head of department. Furthermore, the current system restricts the HOD in terms of whom he or she may appoint. However, this does not hold true for schools with well-functioning school governing bodies. This proposed amendment to the Schools Act also contradicts the recommendation of the National Development Plan (RSA, 2012) that top performing schools should be supported and not be saddled with unnecessary burdens.

Secondly, the draft Amendment Bill (RSA, 2017a) seeks to limit the powers of school governing bodies in respect of the admission policies of schools by amending section 5 of the Schools Act to provide for the provincial HOD to have the final authority to admit a learner to a public school. Should this proposed amendment be passed by Parliament, it will become a good example of the centralization of decision-making power and how education authorities are granted statutory powers to intervene at local governance level under the guise of freedoms promised by decentralization and local autonomy.

The Norms and Standards for Language Policy stipulate that school governing bodies must determine how the school will promote multilingualism in their schools. In addition, the Norms and Standards for Language Policy (RSA, 1997) stipulate that a school must provide for learners to be taught in a different language to the school's language of teaching and learning if a reasonable demand exists. This has resulted in a number of court cases – the latest being the case involving Overvaal High School. These regulations can be regarded as instruments of centralisation in an attempt to counterbalance decentralised decision-making powers of school governing bodies since the school governing bodies do not have full autonomy and a wide discretion in their decision-making power in adopting language policies for schools.

The proposed amendment in the draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill (RSA, 2017a) that the provincial HOD be empowered to centrally procure identified learning support material for public schools and that school governing bodies must seek the approval of the MEC for Education in the province to enter into lease agreements of any purpose, may not only limit the decision-making powers of capable school governing bodies, but is contrary to the recommendations of the National Development Plan (RSA, 2012) in that it will place an 'unnecessary burden' on well-functioning school governing bodies.

Therefore, instead of building on the differentiated school governance approach as initially contained in the South African Schools Act, the Department of Basic Education is following an approach of curtailing the powers of well performing governing bodies which, according to the National Development Plan, should be "recognized as national assets" (RSA, 2012, p. 303). In addition, the National Development Plan has as an objective to "develop a strong sense of community ownership" and acknowledges the need to provide additional support to school governing bodies (RSA, 2012, p. 311). Thus, instead of curtailing local governance

autonomy, means of incentivizing and rewarding school governing bodies to strive towards substantive and durable improvement must be sought. In this way the constitutional principle of co-operative governance will be strengthened. Unfortunately, according to Indicator 22 of the Department of Basic Education's *Action Plan to 2019: Towards realization of schooling in 2030* (DBE, 2015) school governing bodies are measured against minimum criteria of effectiveness which primarily means that school governing bodies need to only be "properly constituted and holding the required minimum of four meetings per year" to be deemed as effective (DBE, 2015, p. 43). Such superficial measures of effectiveness will not only not result in improvement of the effectiveness of school governance, but will also undermine governance autonomy as an "important cornerstone of democracy and accountability in the schooling system" (DBE, 2015, p. 42). Thus, governance autonomy at local school level requires school governing bodies to be meaningfully effective. In other words, without meaningful effectiveness, governance autonomy will not be possible.

Management and leadership autonomy at school level

Compared to school governance autonomy, there is less room for autonomy in terms of school management and leadership. Although public school principals are in terms of Section 16 of the Schools Act (RSA, 1996a) responsible for the professional management of their schools, Section 16A stipulates that the principal of a public school represents the provincial Head of Department on the school governing body. Therefore, discretionary powers of public school principals are limited in that they may not act in conflict with the instructions of the Head of Department, legislation or policy and that the potential for a conflict of interests between the principal and the school governing body on the one hand, and between the principal and the education authorities on the other, is very real.

Notwithstanding the above, public school principals are still expected to apply discretion in terms of disciplinary issues of learners (*Van Biljon v Crawford*), ensuring the lawfulness of school policies (*Welkom* cases), protecting and promoting the rights of learners (*Welkom*, *Pillay*, *Antonie* and *Josias de Kock* cases) and in ensuring the safety of everyone in the school (*Queenstown Girls High School* and *Tania Jacobs* cases). In exercising discretion, principals need to apply the common law principles of *in loco parentis* and *diligence paterfamilias* (prudent father) in safeguarding and promoting the well-being of everyone in the school.

An important example of a principal and his management team applying professional discretion whilst deviating from the interpretation of a national policy by district officials can be found in the *Mbilwi High School* case. However, such a deviation from national policy needs to be well justified. For example, exercise of discretion and deviation of policy must be in the best interests of a learner as demanded by Section 9 of the Children's Act (RSA, 2005).

Although the Policy on the South African Standard for Principals (RSA, 2016) envisages the application of shared or distributed leadership in South African schools, the concepts of 'management' and 'leadership' are used interchangeably in policy documents. An example is that Section 16A of the Schools Act (RSA, 1996a) expects principals to be responsible for the 'professional management' of a school, where according to the National Development Plan "the main responsibility of a

school principal should be to lead [own emphasis] the core business of the school" (RSA, 2012, p. 309). Although this may be regarded by many as semantics, organizational theory makes a clear distinction between the two and the interchangeable usage of these concepts in official documentation dilutes the individual value and importance of each concept. In addition, the Department of Basic Education is applying a strong managerialistic form of monitoring and control which makes it unlikely that leadership activity will flourish. Also, the strong emphasis on school principals being the representative of and accountable to the provincial Head of Department is not conducive to principals creating conditions in their schools for shared and collaborative leadership practices.

There appears to be a substantial discrepancy between the current relatively low levels of autonomy afforded to principals and school management teams and what is proposed in the National Development Plan (RSA, 2012). Significantly the National Development Plan proposes that the management function of principals be expanded to include functions that currently fall within the ambit of school governing bodies. The National Development Plan proposes that greater management autonomy be granted to public school principals by recommending that principals gradually should be given "more administrative powers as the quality of school leadership improves, including in financial management, the procurement of textbooks and other educational material, and human resources management" (RSA, 2012, p. 310). Firstly, leadership is being associated with 'administrative powers', once again pointing to some conceptual (con)-fusion. Secondly, financial management of schools and procurement of textbooks are governance functions specifically allocated to school governing bodies in the Schools Act. Implementing such a recommendation would require amendments to the Schools Act which are notably absent in the draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill (RSA, 2017a) in its current form. Should the Schools Act be amended to allow for these recommendations, school governance in its current form will change and contrary to the partnership-model as envisaged in the South African Schools Act (RSA, 1996a), the role of school governing bodies, especially the well-functioning governing bodies, will be radically watered down. Thirdly, such extension of the powers of principals will necessitate drastic changes to the minimum entry requirements of school principals (and other school management positions). Public school principals will not only need to have a sound knowledge of the law and be proficient in applying the law and related legal principles, but they will also have to be well (and better) -trained and proficient in school financial management. These additional competencies and knowledge are important as principals will be held accountable for functions previously allocated to school governing bodies.

Just as in the case of governance autonomy, meaningful autonomy in school management will only be possible if accompanied by capacity. Principals will have to demonstrate high levels of competence for them to be entrusted with greater levels of autonomy, a principle acknowledged by the National Development Plan (RSA, 2012, p. 310).

Conclusion

It appears as if decentralised-centralism has penetrated the South African education system at the expense of the partnership-principles as envisaged in the

pre-amble of the South African Schools Act (RSA, 1996a). Unless the system reverts to an approach which promotes support which is underpinned by a philosophy of improvement, rather than to ensure compliance, it is unlikely that the education-related objectives of the National Development Plan (RSA, 2012) will be attained. Optimal use of existing capacity is required and that implies that it must be harnessed and exploited wherever it exists within the education system. A possible manner in which this can be done is by developing and implementing a model for differentiated or earned school autonomy.

References

Department of Basic Education (DBE) (2015): *Action Plan to 2019: Towards realization of schooling in 2030*. Pretoria: Department of Basic Education.

Lauglo, J. (1995): Forms of decentralization and their implications for education. *Comparative Education*, 31(1), 5-30.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (1996a): *The South African Schools Act 84 of 1996*. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (1996b): *National Education Policy Act 27 of 1996*. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (1997): Norms and Standards for Language Policy in Public Schools. *Government Gazette*, No. 18546. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (2005): *Children's Act 38 of 2005.* Pretoria: Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (2007): *Education Laws Amendment Act 31 of 2007*. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (2012): *National Development Plan 2030: Our Future-make it work*. Pretoria: National Planning Commision.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (2016): Policy on the South African Standard for Principals. *Government Gazette*, No. 39827. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (2017a): Invitation to comment on the draft Basic Education Laws Amendment Bill. *Government Gazette*, No. 41178. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (2017b): National Norms and Standards for School Funding: Amendment. *Government Gazette*, No. 40818. Pretoria: Government Printer.

Court cases

Danielle Antonie v Governing Body, The Settlers High School and Head of Western Cape Education Department 2002 (4) SA 738.

Federation of Governing Bodies for South African schools v Member of the Executive Council for Education, Gauteng and others [2015] CCT 209 (CC).

Head of Department, Department of Education, Free State Province v Welkom High School and others and Head of Department, Department of Education, Free State Province v Harmony High School and others [2013] ZACC 25 (CC).

Francois Xander van Biljon v Neil R. Crawford and Others 2007 SA 475 (SE).

Governing Body Hoërskool Overvaal and Another v Head of Department of Education and Others 86367/2017 (Unreported).

Josias de Kock v Head of Department of Education and Others. Province of the Western Cape 1998 (3) SA 12533 (C).

Megan Tania Jacobs v The Chairman of the Governing Body of Rhodes High School and Others, unreported case, 7953:2004 (WCC).

Member of the Executive Council, Eastern Cape Province and Others v Queenstown Girls High School 1041/07/2007 ZAECHC 100.

Principal of Mbilwi High School v RM (633/2016) [2017] ZASCA 72 (1 June 2017).

Schoonbee and Others v MEC for Education Mpumalanga, and Another 2002 (4) SA 877 (T).

Dr. André du Plessis, University of Pretoria, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Sharon Thabo Mampane

Exploring Academic Promotion Practices within Higher Education Institutions: Enablers and Constraints in the Physical Space

Abstract

This paper explores academic promotion practices in higher education institutions. Promotion of faculty members of universities is one of the major mechanisms in maintaining and improving the quality and efficiency of higher education and research activities in the country. Appointment processes are therefore critical to institutional development; therefore, the study argues for the identification of successful practices by exploring the enablers and disablers within the institutional promotion process in South Africa. This qualitative conceptual paper used literature, not limited to books, articles and chapters written on higher education institutions' promotion practices. There is, however, limited research on institutional promotion practices for academic employees within the South African higher education institutions. The study argues for the identification of successful practices to ensure fair and equitable institutional promotion practices by exploring the enablers and disablers within the institutional promotion process in the South African higher education. The paper serves as a foundational piece in understanding that appointment practices can be regulated to ensure fairness and equity. The appointment practices highlight the importance of shifting academic staff profiles in ways that are more representative of a diverse democracy. The inclusion of South Africa demonstrates a gap that exists in the academic promotions within higher education institutions. Findings reveal power-play and micro-politicking within promotion practices in HEIs. The paper serves as a foundational piece in understanding the regulation of fairness and equity in academic appointment practices.

Keywords: promotion practices, higher education institution, academic staff, institutional goals, equity, fairness

Introduction

Academic promotion practices within higher education institutions in South Africa should attract and recruit qualified specialists, retain and promote academic staff members for efficiency and effectiveness of universities and higher education institutions (Teymouri et al., 2007). The pressure to create and sustain the conditions necessary for the consolidation of democracy (Thaver, 2010) are aimed at promoting academics that are more representative of a diverse democracy. This process is mediated by institutional policy reforms – Education White Paper 3 (RSA, 1997), Employment Equity Act No 55 of 1998 (RSA, 1998), National Plan for Higher Education (Ntshoe, 2002), in South Africa (Thaver, 2010). While much current thinking is at the macro-level and focused on narrow human resource aspects related to "getting the numbers right", there is limited research on what happens in the daily experiences of academic promotions. The findings are considered in terms of their implications for fairness, and equity, at the levels both of institution and society as a

whole (Teymouri et al., 2007). The scrutiny of HEIs highlights academic promotion implementations looking not only at the scholarship of research, but the scholarship of teaching also (Kivistö et al., 2019). Because of the tendency for academic to be interested more in research, or teaching only, the HEI promotion policy has created a balance in promotion requirements to allow other academic professional activities to be considered (Chabaya, 2015). Chabaya's study (2015) indicates that good researchers are not necessarily good teachers, and that holding a PhD does not translate an academic to be a good researcher.

The need for greater efficiency, productivity and quality in the higher education sector encourages fairness in promotion practices (Kenny, 2008). While a lot of current thinking is on efficiency, productivity and quality in the higher education, there is limited research on daily practices of academic promotions. HEIs are vested with academic freedom and possession of a critical mass and diversity of skills, and are therefore well positioned to develop effective policies to ensure promotion practices are well performed (Chabaya, 2015). Accordingly, without fair and equitable appointment practices in HEIs, no institution can achieve sustainable development. This paper, therefore, aims to narrow this gap by contributing to the future promotion practices of academic staff members (Marini & Reale, 2016; Woelert & Yates, 2015).

The high investment and high expectations in universities demand fair academic appointment and promotion practices, to meet the expectations of stakeholders (Abeli, 2010; Materu, 2007) to avoid conflict among academics. This paper discusses the structure of the academic profession, institutional criteria for academic promotions, equity and fairness in institutional promotions practices, requirements for academic promotion, promotion practices in HEIs, and, finally, enablers and constraints in the appointment process.

The structure of the academic profession

HEIs are undergoing significant changes due to local and global academic competitions. Academic promotions help improve institutional goals and rankings, as well as student performance. In many universities, unfair practices occur within processes of promotion (Sadiq et al., 2019). There is a global sensitivity that academic hierarchies should be demographically representative (Thaver, 2010). Most South African HEIs have four levels for academic positions, and these are lecturer, senior lecturer, associate professor and full professor. Only lecturers have a Master's degree; all other positions require a doctoral degree. Positions change on appointment to a higher promotion post. For a promotion, an academic has to comply with the required set criteria and satisfy the panel of interviewers. These academic promotion practices are important in terms of their implications for the democratisation process, at the level of both of institution and society as a whole (Sadiq et al., 2019).

Institutional criteria for academic promotions

As institutions move towards entrenching the democratic process, there is pressure manifested at the level of implementation of employment equity measures introduced in 1998. The challenge, however, is the little focus on what happens in

the daily promotion practices within the South African institutions. The criteria for promotion in South Africa are the attainment of the set Key Performance Areas (KPAs) or more (Unisa, 2018), a goal-oriented process directed towards maximising productivity of academics. Applicants have to complete an institutional application form specifying involvement in tuition, research outputs, community engagement projects, and involvement in collaborative research with local and international institutions, and any other additional achievements related to academic work.

Equity and fairness in institutional promotions practices

Internationally, academics in more junior positions, with higher qualifications enjoy a quicker promotion time, and there is no association between time to promotion and gender (Sadiq et al., 2019). In South Africa there are some differences in time to promotion associated with race, although these are not consistent. Sadiq and other scholars' study provides some quantitative evidence of the University of Cape Town's success at creating a fair system of academic advancement, however, broader demographic transformation remains a priority. Other South African institutions' promotion practices disregard equity and inevitably give rise to tensions and collisions between different forms of power (Thaver, 2010).

Promotions of academics at HEIs are conducted by a panel consisting of the institutional management members, academic experts in the discipline area, and labour representatives, across all colleges. Promotion is efficient only if the promotion activities accomplish set goals (Kotler & Keller, 2012). Anything on the contrary will result in dissatisfactions and disputes, and non-achievement of intended institutional goals (Cochran, 2003; Koch & Emrey, 2001). Promotion integrates and interweaves various activities communicated with the academic staff in terms of personal and professional requests to harmonise interest and willingness (Alonderiene & Klimavičiene, 2013). Decision-making during promotions is a process of reaching a solution with no disputes.

Requirements for academic promotion

Outputs recognised in the promotion process of the University of South Africa, are: research publications (DHET, 2015), involvement in student tuition, involvement in projects benefiting the institutional society and stakeholders, and research collaborations (Unisa, 2018). For research the academic should have published articles in accredited journals, books or book chapters, and conference proceedings in peer-reviewed books or journals. The RAD has put structures and programmes in place to support, empower and develop academics in line with national research policy directives, as well as international best practices (Unisa, 2018). Similarly, Iran's promotion of faculty members to higher ranks, is achieved by indicators determined by the Ministry of Health and Medical Education and is also based on four aspects: educational, research, executive, and cultural activities. Promotion depends on obtaining the score specified for each scientific rank and spending a specified period.

Promotion practices in HEIs

Application for promotion of academics in all colleges differs according to the level occupied by the academic. An academic who is a lecturer may apply for a promotion post to senior lecturer, and has to have a Master's degree (supervision and research output is not a requirement). A senior lecturer may apply for the position of an associate professor, and has to have a Doctoral degree, three-year teaching experience in a HEI, and to have two research outputs within three years, or three within five years. An associate professor applying for a full professorship position has to have a Doctoral degree, five-year teaching experience in a HEI, three research outputs within three years or four within five years. Supervision of post graduate students forms part of the research outputs.

Promotion committee members are important and key elements of HEIs and their practices have direct impact on HE system performance for developing the HEI sector (Tootoonchi et al., 2014). A fair promotion process is ensured through creating a well-structured interview process that reduces the likelihood of bias and increases objectivity (Loft et al., 2016). Using objective and consistent evaluation methods promotes impartiality and neutrality (Teymouri et al., 2007). Any discrepancy during the interview process may result in a dispute.

The promotion committee should practice transparency and fairness, and appropriate qualitative and quantitative indicators should be developed for measuring the activities by specialised academics in promotion committees of universities (Gilavand, 2016). A fair promotion process should involve a process of judging people on their ability and competence, and should contribute to adding credibility to the panels' decisions. Interview notes are pivotal to a panelist's case and should be stored in a secure, centralised location until a case has been lodged and closed. If it is found that the promotion committee failed in proving their unfair practice, the academic should be promoted. The labour union's role is to ensure that promotions are free from discrimination and retaliation. Reprisal for participation in the dispute process should be prohibited.

In one South African university in Pretoria, one out of four colleges within the institution had a differing promotion criterion (Unisa, 2018). All stipulations in the promotion policy were similar except for the number of research outputs for the college of education. Differences in appointment criteria practice meant unfairness and inequity across colleges. The union had to be involved for the analysis of the appointment policy, and the review of the criteria was done after meeting with management. Similarly, obstacles were also identified in a study by Karimimooneghi et al. (2014). The challenges were lack of assessing the quality of activities, lack of homogenisation in the promotion process, and lack of using expert academics in faculty committees. Unfairness results in discursive tensions about what constitutes competence and who is authorised to pronounce on it (Goldberg, 2000). Recommendations are that aspects of academic activities and the effect of research and scientific activities should be regulated.

Enablers and constraints in the appointment process

South Africa's history of inequality and the different social realities in each college have resulted in universities experiencing challenges of proper academic

promotions. A study by Chabaya (2015) revealed that South Africa lacks a fair and equitable academic promotion practice. A major factor that emerged is the intergenerational comparisons that reinforce the desire to initiate application soon, and the promotion of non-deserving candidates to promotion posts. Because many scholars overvalue their own contributions, they apply for promotion too early thinking they deserve this recognition because of several full professors who may have been promoted when academic standards used to be lower in the earlier decades (Thaver, 2010). A negative outcome at promotion time could breed lasting discontent and awkward encounters for years to come (Weyland, 2015).

Research methodology

This conceptual paper employed a descriptive research methodology using local and international literature analysis of documents as sources of information. The study focused on fairness and equity regarding academic appointments in HEIs. In recognition of the importance of proper promotion practices, the paper is conceptualised on the assumption that appointment criteria are well-structured to improve performance in departments (Gurr & Drysdale, 2013). The appointment of academics to promotional posts are intended to increase organisational efficiency. This conceptual paper therefore utilised this research methodology to get deeper understanding of academic promotion practices within higher education institutions and interpret HEIs' application of promotion practices from reviewed research in an attempt to set appropriate benchmarks for transformation (Swanepoel, 2010). The reviewed literature and databases were analysed, triangulated and the main ideas of experts summarised. Promotion indicators of HEI academics were based on regulations of faculty member promotions passed by councils of the different HEIs.

Conclusion

Universities need capable academics, therefore, promotion policies should be formulated to ensure the appointment processes and procedures are fair and equitable. Therefore, the diverse and complex ways of academic promotions should result in institutional success. Successful implementation of the university promotion policy depends on panelists being well prepared to ensure recommended candidates improve institutions. There is power-play among the different stakeholders and micro-politicking in the appointment procedures (Mampane, 2015). Policy realities and stipulations for academic promotions do not always influence reform ideals and university realities nor do promotion outcomes always match institutional expectations or promote group advancement, leading to tension and conflict (Sayed, 2002). There is a need for a fair and equitable application of academic promotions to deserving candidates (Weyland, 2015), thus the need for further studies to develop intervention models that address this gap. Unfair appointment practices, if not addressed, may impinge on academics' interaction and prospects for development.

References

Abeli, W. S. (2010): Higher Education and Development: A Critical Nexus. A paper presented to SARUA Workshop on *Investment in Higher Education for Development: New Directions*. Dar es Salaam, Tanzania.

Alonderiene, R. & Klimavičiene, A. (2013): Insights into Lithuanian students' choice of university and study program in management and economics. *Management: journal of contemporary management issues*, 18(1), 1-22.

Chabaya, R. A. (2015): Academic Staff Development in Higher Education Institutions (HEIs): A Case Study of Zimbabwe State Universities. A Doctoral thesis. South Africa: Unisa.

Cochran, C. (2003): *Customer satisfaction: tools, techniques, and formulas for success*. Chico, California: Paton Professional.

Department of Higher Education and Training (DHET) (2015): Research Outputs Policy, 2015. *Government Gazette*, No 188.

Gilavand, A. (2016): Pathology of Faculty Members' Rank Promotion in Universities and Higher Education Institutions Affiliated to the Ministry of Health and Medical Education of the Islamic Republic of Iran. *International Journal of Medical Research & Health Sciences*, 5(9S), 25-30.

Goldberg, T. (2000): Racial Knowledge. In L. Back & J. Solomos (Eds.) *Theories of race and racism: A reader* (pp. 354-380). New York: Routledge.

Gurr, D. & Drysdale, L. (2013): Middle-level secondary school leaders: Potential, constraints and implications for leadership preparation and development. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 51(1), 55-71.

Karimimooneghi, H., Jianifard, A., Jafarzadeh, H., Behnam, H. R. & Tavakol-Afshari, J. (2014): Experiences of Faculty Members in Relation to the Academic Promotion Process. *Strides in Development of Medical Education*, 11(4), 485-499.

Kenny, J. (2008): Efficiency and effectiveness in higher education. Who is accountable for what? *Australian Universities Review*, 50(1), 11-19.

Kivistö, J., Pekkola, E., Berg, L. N., Hansen, H. F., Geschwind, L. & Lyytinen, A. (2019): Performance in higher education institutions and its variations in Nordic policy. In R. Pinheiro, L. Geschwind, H. F. Hansen & K. Pulkkinen (Eds.) *Reforms, organizational change and performance in higher education: A comparative account from the Nordic countries* (pp. 37-67). Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.

Koch, N. S. & Emrey, J. A. (2001): The Internet and opinion measurement: Surveying marginalized populations. *Social Science Quarterly*, 82(1), 131-138.

Kotler, P. & Keller, K. L. (2012): *Marketing Management*. USA: Pearson.

Loft, L., Tjajadi, J. S., Thuy, P. T. & Wong, G. Y. (2016): *Being equitable is not always fair: An assessment of PFES implementation in Dien Bien, Vietnam*. Working Paper 205. Bogor, Indonesia: CIFOR.

Mampane, S. T. (2015): Procedures and Processes Followed in the Appointment of Principals for School Leadership and Management. *Journal of Social Sciences*, 42(3), 239-245.

Marini, G. & Reale, E. (2016): How does collegiality survive managerially led universities? Evidence from a European survey. *European Journal of Higher Education*, 6(2), 111-127.

Materu, P. (2007): *Higher Education Quality Assurance in Sub-Saharan Africa: Status, Challenges, Opportunities and Promising Practices*. World Bank Working Paper 124. Washington, D.C.: World Bank.

Ntshoe, I. M. (2002): Guest Editorial: National plan for higher education in South Africa: a programme for equity and redress or globalised competition and managerialism. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 16(2), 7-10.

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (1997): Education White Paper 3 of 1997: A programme for the transformation of higher education. *Government Gazette*, 386(18207).

Republic of South Africa (RSA) (1998): Employment Equity Act, No 55 of 1998. *Government Gazette*, 400(19370).

Sadiq, H., Barnes, K. I., Price, M., Gumedze, F. & Morrell, R. G. (2019): Academic promotions at a South African university: questions of bias, politics and transformation. *Higher Education*, 78(3), 423-444.

Sayed, Y. (2002): Democratising education in a decentralized system: South African policy practice. *Compare*, 32(1), 35-46.

Swanepoel, L. (2010): Quality assurance at Unisa: towards a framework to support transformation. *Progressio*, 32(2), 6-20.

Teymouri, M., Tootoonchi, M., Salehi, M. & Hassanzadeh, A. (2007): Job satisfaction among faculty members of Isfahan University of Medical Sciences. *Iranian Journal of Medical Education*, 7(2), 227-236.

Thaver, B. (2010): The Transition to Equity in South African Higher Education: Governance, Fairness, and Trust in Everyday Academic Practice. *International Journal of Politics, Culture, and Society*, 23(1), 43-56.

Tootoonchi, M., Yamani, N., Changiz, T., Taleghani, F. & Mohammadzadeh, Z. (2014): Assessment of educational criteria in academic promotion: Perspectives of faculty members of medical sciences universities in Iran. *Journal of Education Health Promotions*, 3: 29, doi: 10.4103/2277-9531.131893.

University of South Africa (Unisa) (2018): *Procedures Manual for Policy on Research Professors (RP)*. Version 2018-08-08.

Weyland, K. (2015): You Might Not Be Ready for Promotion. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, June 10.

Woelert, P. & Yates, L. (2015): Too little and too much trust: Performance measurement in Australian higher education. *Critical Studies in Education*, 56(2), 175-189.

Prof. Dr. Sharon Thabo Mampane, University of South Africa, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Queen Chioma Nworgu

A Critical Overview of the Impact of Social Media on Online Small Businesses Owned and Run by Women Entrepreneurs: A Case Study of London-based Female E-entrepreneurs

Abstract

Issues arising with social media and its influence on women entrepreneurs trigged this investigation. The research will examine the impact of social media on online small businesses owned and run by women entrepreneurs with reference to London-based female e-entrepreneurs. The work is a proposal for a PhD research and while waiting for the University for confirmation to conduct this area of investigation, I have decided to present this paper as part of my initial investigation on the issues around social media online on small businesses run by women entrepreneurs. Work used mixed research methods to investigate the impact of social media online on female entrepreneurs, their experiences and perceptions on their business activities and performance. The growth of social media as part of innovative technological development has enabled entrepreneurs to effectively carry out their business activities online, and an increasing number of female business owners are taking their businesses online and abandoning traditional, brink and mortar business model. Social media platforms such as Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, Snap chat, YouTube and LinkedIn along with other websites are incorporated into the businesses of modern-day women entrepreneurs. This research will examine, analyse and evaluate relevant theoretical framework on female entrepreneurship and social media engagement and impact on business performance. The research will develop a framework for best practice that can be used by women e-entrepreneurs across Greater London.

Keywords: women entrepreneurs, gender, social media, ICT, online and business ownership

Introduction

The journey of becoming an entrepreneur is worth reflecting and influence of social media in supporting the performance of female entrepreneurs in their journey of their business activities. The journey to a business ownership aspiration is all about determination and how to juggle responsibilities. As stated in *Determine to succeed* by Achinewhu-Nworgu (2014), there have been more opportunities available to individuals to progress in education, to make a good career for themselves and to enjoy a fulfilling family and personal life. These opportunities must be explored and utilised in one way or the other. However, in every available opportunity, there are challenges that come with it. The ambition to become a business owner can confront us with challenges and benefits. The challenges could be more pronounced as a female entrepreneur from experience of running own business with limited experience especially at a young age. The experience of being an entrepreneur has also prompted the need for this research to share the journey and

to encourage the women with similar ambitious career – which the journey is worth pursuing despite the challenges of owing and running businesses. The research will aim to progress previous work in women entrepreneurship. However, the focus for this work will be exploring the impact of social media in supporting female entrepreneurs in effectively running their own online businesses.

Literature review

There are several research studies around the influence of social media network in supporting the business activities of entrepreneurs. According to Jonsson (2015), social media helps business entrepreneurs to perform better through their network support especially in online financial support. Many previous studies, however, have investigated different support or resource types in isolation, without considering how the female entrepreneurs are responding and effectively using social media in their daily business activities. This raises a question about the extent to which social media is positively perceived and used by the female entrepreneurs to support business activities. On the other hand, diverging views have been presented about the social media and how they are used in business activities, in relation to protection of privacy and customer confidentiality.

Miller et al. (2016, p. 2) defined social media as the "colonisation of the space between traditional broadcast and private dyadic communication, providing people with a scale of group size and degrees of privacy that we have termed scalable sociality". Social media is used widely in a variety of context. Social media can open new opportunities for female entrepreneurs and encourage the creation of new businesses run by women – because of social media flexibility and attributes. Social media can support women in business to express their capabilities in networking by building virtual communities. It can also be a means to take care of personal relationships which can be relevant for women in business who, in most cases, balance private life responsibilities with work commitments (Perrons, 2003; Drew & Murtagh, 2005; Emsile & Hunt, 2009).

According to Ogunleye (2018, p. 5), entrepreneurship "in its simplest concept is the creation of business that aims to generate profit". An entrepreneur is a risk taker as there are uncertainties in making business choices; make innovations for new goods, new methods of production, new markets, and new types of industrial organization (Knight, 1921). McClelland (1961) conceptualises an entrepreneur is a business manager who has the responsibility as a decision maker and takes responsibility for the decision made in the business.

An entrepreneur has long history of being recognised as important economic sector to local, regional and national levels (Schumpeter, 1934). Studies by Edobor and Ogunleye (2015) and Ogunleye (2018) have underlined the importance of entrepreneurship, men and women entrepreneurs, to national economic development. Many women choose entrepreneurship because of a desire to own their business, or to acquire and develop business skills and competence; or a desire to become entrepreneurs because they were the main bread winners of their families – to own business for steady income, work at own time and pace, particularly in a situation of high unemployment or the fear of being unemployed or financial security (Nworgu, Achinewhu-Nworgu & Natrajan, 2019).

Theoretical framework

In examining prior work and research done in this field, it is important to examine some of the major theories that underpin entrepreneurship – especially social, network and learning theories. Social theory: is based on socio-historical process that produces psychological reasons behind the entrepreneurial disposition and gap between motivational disposition and actual behaviour. This theory will be relevant in providing an understanding of the historical process behind entrepreneurship. Network theory: explores the dynamics of firms with one another and impact on one another (Storni et al., 2015) and to understanding of the strategic entrepreneurship, collaborative innovation and creation of wealth (Storni et al., 2015). These relationships can be derived from the effective use of social media platform, which are tightly connected – and which can lead to successful innovation (Campbell et al., 2016), tight network connections help entrepreneurs to reason beyond in their business and gain access to outside world. Learning theory: focuses on ability of firms to create knowledge, base over time and use its knowledge base to achieve success and create wealth for its shareholders (Campbell et al., 2016). Other theories relevant to the proposed research include Innovation theory, Economic survival theory and Resource based theory. The research will examine these theories and the impact of social media on female entrepreneurs and business success.

Having conducted a brief review of literature around the research topic, gap remains in contemporary knowledge. First, I found no prior studies that have critically examined the impact of social media on online small businesses owned and run by women entrepreneurs with reference to London-based female e-entrepreneurs. Second, looking at many of the research studies on social media and entrepreneurship, a significant question that has not been addressed is how social media affects small female business owners in London. The mini research aimed to fill these gaps with a focus to critically examine the impact of social media on small businesses owned and run by women entrepreneurs in the UK with reference to London-based e-entrepreneurs and also to seek the perceptions of some female entrepreneurs on their businesses.

Methodology

A combination of qualitative and quantitative research paradigms were employed initially to seek the perceptions of 10 female entrepreneurs in London UK to find out how the social media has impacted on their business activities, either positive or negative and how committed they are in incorporating social media facilities in their daily business activities. Consideration was around addressing the key questions and research objectives identified. The research methodology reviewed the seven methodologies identified by Saunders, Lewis and Thornhill (2009) namely: research philosophy, research approach, research method or strategy, methodological approach, time horizon, data collection method, and data analysis method. An appropriate methodology was considered based around a combination of three methods aimed to be suitable for the data collection. Choice was made mainly from the five major research philosophies considered in research – covering

positivism, realism, interpretivism, post-modernism, and pragmatism (Saunders, Lewis & Thornhill, 2009).

In terms of sample size, the research targeted 10 female entrepreneurs as participants for this initial stage of the work and will hope to expand the target group to a large sample in the next stage. The research has used mixed methods for the data collection and analysis. In some cases, the integration of different methods within a single design framework will help to capture rich data which is my primary motive for use of mixed methodology. The value of combining methods is that it allows for the triangulation of data (Punch, 2005), recognises the similarities between qualitative and quantitative approaches (Blaxter, Hughes & Tight, 2001), less constraining than relying upon a single method (Morse, 2003) and, crucially, strengthens the findings that are produced. The three concepts provided me with decision to go for a mixed method and choice of data presentation.

Ethical considerations

The researcher observed all the ethical protocols, although, this was a preliminary investigation, the consent of participants was very important. I understand that, as Miller and Brewer (2003) rightly noted, ethical responsibility start when the researcher develops his/her research plan and continues to develop an ethical approach to dealing with the research participants, to create a mutual respect, in which participants are pleased. To this end, ethical considerations for the mini study was relevant including: providing a detailed explanation to the participants about the research aim and objectives; obtaining the consent of the participants; keeping participants identities confidential; making participation voluntary; giving an assurance that data collected will be kept securely; providing an assurance that participation in the research can be terminated at any time if a participant so wishes; providing an assurance that no participants will be harmed in any way as a result of their participation in the study.

Analysis of findings

Work is on its initial stage and therefore interviews with 10 female entrepreneurs was sufficient to reach a conclusion based on comments below.

Comments:

I have been in the clothes business for over 10 years. Since then, I have seen the increase in online demands. Online in clothing industry has become important to my business in getting access to my clients and the customers also buy mainly online from us. It is easy and very convenient as most customers prefer online shopping. For me, it has grown my business compared to when people came in to buy. (FE3)

The demand for an on line shopping has slightly the direct face to face shopping contacts that I have with most of my customers. However, it has enabled those busy customers who could not come into the shop to still shop for same products. The main problem is also that most of the goods are sent back because of wrong sizes and clothes not looking good as they appear online. In this case, you could end up with unnecessary costs of postage. (FE4)

I have a customer who came regularly to the shop to buy things. Two years ago, they moved house to Portsmouth. She now shops online and very satisfied with the goods, saves costs of travelling from Portsmouth to buy our hair products. She orders, it is

delivered within 24 hours. To her, she has not missed out on anything that directs shopping did not provide in the past nor did I lose out such important customer. (FE6)

I am very positive about on-line shopping and believe that people should have a choice of how they want to shop for the goods. For my business, it can consume time putting things on-line, need good adverts on-line, packing and assurance of delivery, failure to satisfy the customers on delivery can make you unreliable hence may lose them? Unlike shops where people come in and see what they need to buy, they can fit them here and then and can decide to either buy or not based on how it fits. (FE 8)

People's ways of shopping is individual's choice. One thing good about on-line sales is that you can save money selling on-line as you have no rent to pay, but storage can cost you money. As a female entrepreneur, I do not feel different from anyone, I am in control of my business and deliver on-line when customer orders. The nature of my business is online as we order and sell online. It has done well and I have nothing to worry abbot selling on-line. It is more convenient for me and my customers. The current trend in business is about social media to succeed, networking through social media is a key to marketing your business. (FE9)

Although, part of this work finding was reported, the bulk of the work could not be presented in this paper due to work count and also, work being on its exploratory stage for a Doctorate degree research. The findings of the mini interviews are very interesting. One would assume from the literature and theories presented that social media on-line may have negative impact on small business owners, In this case the findings point to more positive impact and increased sales to most of the participants. However, the work is on its initial stage, the future research will target large population.

Conclusion

The work explored the impact of social media online shopping, relevant literature explored that guided the focus of the study. The fact still remains that the female entrepreneur has good and bad experiences in their business since the increase in online shopping. As shared above by the participants, some have experienced increase in sales online while some have missed their customers that resulting from online shopping. The findings of this mini research is important to inform a wider scope for the future research in the field and will contribute to the body of knowledge as well as provide awareness of the challenges faced by entrepreneurs. The next stage of the work is to develop a framework for best practice that can be used by small businesses, especially entrepreneurs in the Greater London region in the United Kingdom. The most interesting aspect of the mini research is that most of the participants were very positive about the benefits of online shopping positive impact on volume of sales.

References

Achinewhu-Nworgu, E. (2014): *Determined to Succeed: Overcoming Personal, Institutional and Cultural Barriers*. 2nd Edition. London: Focus Learning Support UK Limited.

Blaxter, L., Hughes, C. & Tight, M. (2001): *How to Research*. 2nd Edition. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Campbell, E., Izquierdo, J., Montalvo, I., Ilaya-Ayza, A., Pérez-García, R. & Tavera, M. (2016): A flexible methodology to sectorize water supply networks based on social network theory concepts and multi-objective optimization. *Journal of Hydroinformatics*, 18(1), 62-76.

Drew, E. & Murtagh, E. M. (2005): Work/life balance: senior management champions or laggards? *Women Manage*, 20(4), 262-278.

Edobor, F. & Ogunleye, J. (2015): Creative Entrepreneurship: The Role of Co-operatives in Poverty Reduction. *Current Studies in Comparative Education, Science and Technology*, 2(2), 153-162.

Emsile, C. & Hunt, K. (2009): 'Live to work' or 'Work to Live'? A Qualitative Study of Gender and Work-life Balance among Men and Women in Mid-life. *Gender Work Organ*, 16(1), 151-172.

Jonsson, S. (2015): Entrepreneurs' network evolution – the relevance of cognitive social capital. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 21(2), 197-223.

Knight, F. (1921): *Risk, uncertainty and profit*. New York: Augustus Kelley.

McClelland, D. C. (1961): *The Achieving Society*. Princeton, NJ: Van Nostrand.

Miller, D., Costa, E., Haynes, N., McDonald, T., Nicolescu, R., Sinanan, J., Spyer, J., Venkatraman, S. & Wang, X. (2016): *How the World Changed Social Media*. London: University College London Press.

Miller, R. & Brewer, J. (2003): *The A-Z of Social Research*. London: Sage.

Morse, J. M. (2003): Principles of Mixed Methods and Multimethod Research Design. In Tashakkori, A. & Teddlie, C. (Eds.) *A Handbook of Mixed Methods in Social and Behavioural Research* (pp. 189-208). London: Sage.

Nworgu, Q. C., Achinewhu-Nworgu, E. & Natrajan, R. (2019): Challenges of Combining Roles as an Educator and Entrepreneur: Reflective Experience on Professional Development. In *Glocal Education in Practice: Teaching, Researching, and Citizenship* (pp. 189-195). BCES Conference Books, Vol. 17. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society.

Ogunleye, J. (2018): Women Entrepreneurs in Emerging Economics. In Chitakunye, D. & Takhar, A. (Eds.) *Examining the Role of Women Entrepreneurs in Emerging Economies* (pp. xv-xix). USA: IGI Global.

Perrons, D. (2003): The new economy and the work-life balance: conceptional explorations and a case study of new media. *Gender Work Organ*, 10(1), 65-93.

Punch, K. (2005): *Introduction to Social Research: Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches*. 2nd Edition. London: Sage.

Saunders, M., Lewis, P. & Thornhill, A. (2009): *Research Methods for Business Students*. 5th Edition. Harlow: Pearson Education.

Schumpeter, J. A. (1934): *The Theory of Economic Development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Storni, C., Binder, T., Linde, P. & Stuedahl, D. (2015): Designing things together: Intersections of co-design and actor–network theory. *Co Design*, 11(3-4), 149-151.

Queen Chioma Nworgu, MA Education, Focus Learning Support Ltd, United Kingdom

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Uchechi Bel-Ann Ordu

Entrepreneurial Leadership in Start-up Businesses

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to analyse the entrepreneurial leadership as one of the modern styles of leadership in organizations. The concept of entrepreneurship constantly increases in business organizations and in educational systems. Large and strong businesses around the globe today are borne out of the creativity and effort of start-ups. Analysing the profile of the entrepreneur and the role in organizations as entrepreneurial leaders show that there is a close relationship between the concept of entrepreneurship and the exploration of opportunities which the entrepreneurial leader bases on innovation, risk-taking and adaptability to change. To run successful organizations, managers must have both leadership and entrepreneurial skills. The main motivation of entrepreneurial leaders is in their strive to create and explore social, environmental and economic opportunities. The concept of entrepreneurial leadership is relevant to academic knowledge in that, it is a new stream being developed and written literature on this topic is increasing per year. The work will aim to employ quantitative and qualitative research methods, firstly, to gain prior knowledge and secondly, to ascertain the views of the participants on their entrepreneurial leadership styles and impact on the success of their business ventures. The findings of the research will form the basis for future research for the aspiring doctorate degree in the field.

Keywords: entrepreneurship, start-ups, leadership, economy, management

Introduction

Entrepreneurial leadership is one of the modern styles of leadership in organizations. The concept of entrepreneurship constantly increases in business organizations and in educational systems. Large and strong businesses around the globe today are borne out of the creativity and effort of start-ups. Analysing the profile of the entrepreneur and the role in organizations as entrepreneurial leaders show that there is a close relationship between the concept of entrepreneurship and the exploration of opportunities which the entrepreneurial leader bases on innovation, risk-taking and adaptability to change. To run successful organizations, managers must have both leadership and entrepreneurship skills. The main motivation of entrepreneurial leaders is in their strive to create and explore social, environmental and economic opportunities.

The concept of entrepreneurial leadership is relevant to academic knowledge in that, it is a new stream being developed and written literature on this topic is increasing per year. Entrepreneurial leadership is relevant to job creation and economic development. It is also relevant to developing new competencies, dealing with the changing business environment and ensuring the sustained survival of the businesses (Kuratko, 2007).

Leadership and management

For organizations to deal with competition and achieve business growth, they must invest in leadership and management development. Leaders and managers have a significant role to play in ensuring high performance of organizations. A distinction has been made by Day (2000) between the context of the leader, management and leadership development. According to the author, leader development focuses on self-awareness and seeing oneself as a leader; management development focuses on the manager achieving tasks through control, planning and execution; and leadership development focuses on the different dimensions of leadership using team building, interpersonal skills and commitment. Although leadership and management are both used interchangeably to focus on organizational effectiveness, management deals with organizing and planning; leadership focuses on innovation, coping with change and making sure the business adapts to unstable events. Focusing on the context of leadership and management, two dimensions exist to explain these broad terms:

- **Knowledge-based economy**. Managers and leaders are affected by the growth in the knowledge-based economy. To create an organization culture that accepts knowledge development and sharing, the managers have an important role to play. They focus on building their ideas and capital and that of the employees through learning, skills acquiring and reflexibility (Garvey & Williamson, 2002). Distinctive HR practices are also important and require managers/leaders to motivate and retain knowledge workers, provide interesting job tasks and opportunities for self-development.
- **Organization structure**. Downsizing brings significant demands on the managers. The organization structure also changes as a result of advances in information technology. Leaders and managers are expected to ensure that customer expectations are met while rewarding employee labour. This is done by responding rapidly to the changing business conditions.

Entrepreneurship, intrapreneurship and the entrepreneur

A definition given by Schumpeter (1934, p. 250) says an entrepreneur is “an agent of change, who shakes the conventional way of doing things and, when successful, causes a generalized imitation”. Another definition by Acúrcio (2005) describes an entrepreneur as one who is able to manage risk and exploits opportunities created by changes in the business environment. Some observable characteristics in an entrepreneur’s profile are the need for achievement, sociability, propensity for risk, persistence, locus of control, the need for autonomy, planning, innovation, and self-efficacy.

Being an entrepreneur means using one’s initiative to turn ideas into actions through creativity, risk-taking, managing projects to attain specified objectives. Entrepreneurship is geared towards social achievement and personal fulfilment not only competitiveness and growth. In the process of value creation, the entrepreneur must take note of the business and social environment, and political culture. However, according to Cadar and Budulescu (2015), the entrepreneurial ability manifests in large organizations. Those with the entrepreneurial ability are generally known as intrapreneurs because they are equipped with the necessary training to use

their knowledge and experience to turn innovation into success. Therefore, intrapreneurship is a business practice that acknowledges people with entrepreneurial personality in order to serve the interest of large businesses and that of the customers.

Entrepreneurial leadership

Entrepreneurial leadership is one of the effective skills of leadership as one of the core determinants of the success of any business. It merges the leadership potential with the entrepreneurial spirit. Entrepreneurial leadership is a type of leadership that combines actions taken towards the start-up of a business at the individual level, actions towards creative abilities at the organizational level and actions taken to benefit from recognized opportunities at the market level (Altuntas, 2014). Another definition by Renko et al. (2015) implies that entrepreneurial leadership seeks to achieve the organization's goals which involves cashing in on business opportunities by affecting the performance of the employees. The motivation of the employees in their attitude to work has a big effect on the growth of the organization.

Entrepreneurship education is an important aspect of business management. This is to ensure that leaders of organizations especially start-ups and small-scale businesses have the necessary qualities for self-development, business competition, success and sustainability. Seizing business opportunities and risk taking has also been known to be important for the future growth of a business (Phaneuf et al., 2016). Entrepreneurial leaders must have the skills of entrepreneurship to identify and create value opportunities for the business; protecting and dealing with innovations which pose as a threat to the business. To achieve quality entrepreneurial leadership skills, the leader must have a vision and effectively pass this vision to the employees; the leader must focus on time, energy and effective decisions in ensuring the growth and success of the business; the leader must have marketing skills to be able to convince potential clients to buy products; entrepreneurial leaders must be flexible to the changes in the progress of work; must be a good listener to get feedback and ideas from the employees and other stakeholders. Also, the entrepreneurial leader must build trust in stakeholders and customers never compromising their business vision. A reason why entrepreneurs less often do not use entrepreneurial leadership skills is because they see themselves as employees to judge their ability to behave entrepreneurial. A manager only seeks to achieve specific behaviours like risk-taking, creativity, autonomy, proactiveness to be more effective in the business environment and performance of the business. However, the entrepreneurial leader is more inside-out driven, seeking the educational attainment of the employees and their type of work-load.

Discovering an entrepreneurial leader

Studies have considered the traits of entrepreneurial leaders that differentiate them from the general business managers and make them successful (Astebro et al., 2014). These studies have focused more on high-growth settings and less on the monetary, time and individual investments made into the business. According to Kerr, Kerr and Xu (2017), discovering an entrepreneurial leader will target three

core themes: (a) the personality traits of entrepreneurial leaders as compared to other categories of leaders; (b) the entrepreneurial leader's attitude towards risk; and (c) goals and aspirations of entrepreneurs in their business pursuits.

Personality trait of the entrepreneurial leader

The personality trait of an entrepreneur provides answers to the questions: Who is an entrepreneur? What drives the entrepreneur? What trait predicts the probability of an individual to become an entrepreneur and attain success?

The Big-5 model

It measures openness, conscientiousness, extraversion, agreeableness, and neuroticism. Comparing managers and entrepreneurial leaders, both groups of individuals direct workers and are able to multi-task. Entrepreneurial leaders are more likely attracted to a dynamic, changing and challenging business environment (Kerr, Kerr & Xu, 2017) by providing creative solutions, business models and products. Managers on the other hand, with directions are only able to provide high-quality but low-variance results rather than seek lasting solutions to business problems. Entrepreneurial leaders are more achievement-oriented than managers. Therefore, they are drawn to business environments where success is attributed to the level of their efforts.

Innovativeness

Entrepreneurial leaders are able to identify new products and markets. Utsch and Rauch (2000) have examined initiative and innovativeness as mediators for achievement orientation.

Locus of control

According to Kerr, Kerr and Xu (2017), entrepreneurial leaders with internal locus of control believe that their effort, skills and ability are able to achieve outcomes rather than external forces controlling these outcomes. Individuals who are self-employed usually display a strong internal locus of control than those who are employed by others (Levine & Rubenstein, 2017). Internal locus of control has a strong relationship with business creation and venture growth because skills and experience are of more importance than personal traits.

Need for achievement

The concept of need for achievement explains that entrepreneurial leaders must have a high need for achievement in building a business venture from scratch as it demonstrates an individual's abilities to thrive in a challenging business world (Kerr, Kerr & Xu, 2017). Relationships between these variables are necessary to achieve venture success. Entrepreneurship cannot exist alone as personality traits, human capital, and environment are necessary contexts to start and operate a new business. Despite the complex and integrated nature of entrepreneurship, start-ups must be set up and operated within a favourable environment with necessary skills and experience for its sustainability.

The entrepreneurial leader's attitude to risk

For those seeking high-growth opportunities, the world of business is generally risky (Astebro et al., 2014). A clear distinction between risk and uncertainty defines the former as having less control of the already known future; and the later as being totally unaware of what the future might be. Despite the emergence of both risk and

uncertainty, entrepreneurial leaders are those who are able to properly manage their businesses.

Goals and aspirations of the entrepreneurial leader

The success of businesses is measured mainly by its survival, exit, and growth. Goals and aspirations have different meanings to different entrepreneurs in starting and operating their firms. Hurst and Pugsley (2011) classify the reasons for start-ups into five categories: to generate income, realize a business idea, lack of employment opportunities, to realize self-fulfilment, and the desire to be independent, flexible and autonomous. Sadly, a good number of these start-ups prefer to stay at their current size without intentions of being creative or expanding operations. Two categories of entrepreneurs are: growth-driven entrepreneurs that seek innovation and opportunity and the necessity-driven entrepreneurs that go into business as a result of scarcity of other options.

Transformational leadership versus entrepreneurial leadership

Significant incidents occur in the business environments of the present century like changes in industry, customers, colleagues, products and services which affect organizational performance. Therefore, leaders are to be aware of these changes, the threats, opportunities and facilities which are needed in setting up new businesses (Singh, 2008). Leadership deals mainly with interactions between the leaders and followers, influence on followers and a participation of followers in the leadership process. Transformational leaders are known to focus on developing and motivating the followers for higher performance beyond their expectations. According to Shahraki and Bahraini (2013), these leaders use three behaviours in influencing their followers:

i. Mental persuasion: Leadership process focuses more on innovation and creativity. The followers are challenged to rethink about old business problems in new ways.
ii. Idealized influence: Leaders who have inbuilt pride, charisma and respect automatically influence their followers through their behaviour.
iii. Inspirational motivation: Followers are motivated to believe that goals can only be achieved through effort and hard work.

Entrepreneurial leadership styles

Autocratic leadership

Research defines the autocratic leadership styles as not taking note of the socio-economic factors of the employees. These type of leaders force their ideas on the employees without them having a say in the organization's business strategy. This autocratic style has a negative influence on emotions and relationships and therefore, destroys bond between the leader and the employees (De Cremer, 2006). These type of entrepreneurial leaders are more result-oriented.

Situational leadership

In the business environment, some situations demand spontaneous actions especially in start-ups where quick decisions are needed without necessarily having wide knowledge background. Entrepreneurial leaders have a different way of working, therefore they are more intuitive and less analytic than non-entrepreneurial leaders (Armstrong & Hird, 2009). This is a prerequisite for a business start-up. These type of leaders create an organization culture where innovation and new ideas are expected, risk taking and learning is encouraged, failure is accepted, and continuous change is seen as a conveyor of opportunities.

Democratic leadership

A democratic entrepreneurial leader seeks the opinion of the employees by weighing them equally. By this way, the employees are able to share their ideas through effective communication and constructive conflict. In order to sustain democratic entrepreneurial leadership, the leaders must prevent the development of hierarchies by achieving healthy relationships and constructive involvement. As opposed to the autocratic entrepreneurial leaders, leaders become more democratic when the employees use their initiative to offer ideas and set goals.

Supportive leadership

The supportive entrepreneurial leader provides emotional and appraisal support to the employees considering their needs when making business decisions. The leaders plays more of a mentoring role to the employees. The supportive leadership records more outcomes in the organization because the socio-emotional support given to the employees through task-provided feedback motivates them to increase performance (Wofford & Liska, 1993).

Methodology

This research paper adopted the quantitative and qualitative research methods where random sampling was conducted. 20 people small-scale entrepreneurs were chosen representing owners of start-up business across the UK and Nigeria. Semi-structured interviews were conducted and questionnaires distributed to get information from the participants. Responses from this research confirm that entrepreneurial leaders have the responsibility of harnessing business opportunities in a bid to become a large business venture. In harsh and unstable economies like Nigeria, it is observed that entrepreneurial leaders have contributed to job creation and innovation across the country. This is a major determinant of national economic growth. The entrepreneurs also complained of the problem of sustainability. Because of inconsistency, the lack of basic entrepreneurship skills and the inability to take business risks, 80% of the entrepreneurs are not able to grow the business to exceed the level of just a start-up to a small or medium business enterprise.

Conclusion

The entrepreneurial ability of the leaders in an organization affect the growth, performance, sustainability and productivity of the organization to survive in the competitive business environment. Entrepreneurial leaders have the capacity to create new jobs by developing on the existing jobs in the business through new

ideas, innovations, and the right team to achieve the organization's goals. Uncertainties in the business environment does not discourage the entrepreneurial leader, rather he is motivated to search out possible solutions to overcome these uncertainties. The entrepreneurial leader has the responsibility to ensure that necessary infrastructure is put in place for every business project. The leader takes a background role and allows the employees to do their job, offering help when necessary. Entrepreneurial leadership has been discovered to be a step towards a more prosperous economic future. Although entrepreneurial leadership skills vary between organizations, it is assumed that the democratic style of entrepreneurial leadership leads to a higher commitment and engagement.

The need for entrepreneurial leaders is on the increase. Therefore, trainings, conferences, seminars, and work projects should be organized in companies to increase the number of entrepreneurial leaders. Before introducing a new business behaviour or idea, start-ups should adopt ideas from experienced and large organizations and learn from them in order to avoid the negative effects of business spontaneity.

References

Acúrcio, M. B. (2005): *Entrepreneurship in school*. Porto Alegre: Artmed.

Altuntas, G. (2014): The Relationship between Entrepreneurship and Strategic Management: A New Model and Test of Strategic Entrepreneurship. *Research Journal of Business and Management*, 1(2), 103-129.

Armstrong, S. & Hird, A. (2009): Cognitive Style and Entrepreneurial Drive of New and Mature Business Owner-Managers. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 24(4), 419-430.

Åstebro, T., Herz, H., Nanda, R. & Weber, R. (2014): Seeking the roots of entrepreneurship: Insights from behavioural economics. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 28(3), 49-70.

Cadar, O. & Badulescu, D. (2015): Entrepreneur, Entrepreneurship and Intrapreneurship. A Literature Review. *The Annals of the University of Oradea. Economic Sciences*, XXIV (2), 658-664.

Day, D. (2000): Leadership development: a review in context. *Leadership Quarterly*, 11(4), 581-613.

De Cremer, D. (2006): Affective and motivational consequences of leader self-sacrifice: The moderating effect of autocratic leadership. *Leadership Quarterly*, 17(1), 79-93.

Garvey, B. & Williamson, B. (2002): *Beyond Knowledge Management*. Harlow: Pearson Education.

Hurst, E. & Pugsley, B. (2011): What do small businesses do? *Brookings Papers on Economic Activity*, 43(2), 73-142.

Kerr, S., Kerr, W. & Xu, T. (2017): Personality Traits of Entrepreneurs: A Review of Recent Literature. *Foundations and Trends in Entrepreneurship*, 14(3), 279-356.

Kuratko, D. (2007): Entrepreneurial Leadership in the 21st Century. *Journal of Leadership and Organizational Studies*, 13(4), 1-11.

Levine, R. & Rubenstein, Y. (2017): Smart and illicit. Who becomes an entrepreneur and do they earn more? *Quarterly Journal of Economics*, 132(2), 963-1018.

Phaneuf, J., Boudrias, J., Rousseau, V. & Brunelle, E. (2016): Personality and Transformational Leadership: The Moderating Effect of Organizational Context. *Personality and Individual Differences*, 102, 30-35.

Renko, M., Tarabishy, A., Carsrud, A. & Brännback, M. (2015): Understanding and Measuring Entrepreneurial Leadership Style. *Journal of Small Business Management*, 53(1), 54-74.

Schumpeter, J. A. (1934): *The Theory of Economic Development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Shahraki, M. & Bahraini, Z. (2013): An examination of the relationship between transformational leadership with entrepreneurial orientation in organizations. *International Journal of Advanced Studies in Humanities and Social Sciences*, 1(4), 274-289.

Singh, K. (2008): Relationship between learning organization and transformational leadership: banking organizations in India. *International Journal of Business and Management Science*, 1(1), 97-111.

Utsch, A. & Rauch, A. (2000): Innovativeness and initiative as mediators between achievement orientation and venture performance. *European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology*, 9(1), 45-62.

Wofford, J. & Liska, L. (1993): Path-goal theories of leadership: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Management*, 19(4), 857-876.

Uchechi Bel-Ann Ordu, DBA Scholar, University of the West of Scotland, United Kingdom

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Sharon Thabo Mampane

Understanding and Application of the Institutional Performance Management System within Higher Education Institution Departments

Abstract

This conceptual paper draws on the understanding and application of institutional performance management system (IPMS) by managers in a higher education institution's department. Managers in HEIs are tasked to develop and support staff at all job levels and are accountable for their performance. The implementation of the IPMS in higher education institutions could enhance the growth and development of the department and its staff. The paper highlights practices of IPMS as well as identifies the successes and challenges in understanding and applying IPMS within HEIs, to provide a consolidated practical advice for universities in South Africa. Staff development and support are central to ensuring that commitments made, are seriously translated into relevant actions in the department. Such actions by the institution lay a strong foundation for improved performance. The purpose of the paper is to unpack and contextualise the understanding and application of institutional performance management system (IPMS) of staff, by recognising its merits depending on the context and circumstances where it is applied. This qualitative paper analysed literature studies that include books and articles written on performance management systems in higher education, to establish how performance data is used to improve institutional staff performance. Findings reveal that HEIs' performance criteria in IPMS, do not always serve to monitor and evaluate the department's progress on planned goals, objectives, and initiatives. The paper, therefore, serves as a foundational piece that highlights gaps in higher education institution managers' understanding and application of IPMS, for supporting and improving staff performance.

Keywords: institutional performance management systems, higher education institution, staff development, accountability, monitoring, evaluation

Introduction

This paper explores how managers of higher education institutions (HEIs) understand and apply the institutional performance management system (IPMS) in South Africa, using staff performance data. In particular, the paper gives attention to the capacity of IPMS as a constructive approach to assist employees in achieving performance expectations through a process of monitoring, review and improvement, in an institutional department, in the university (Ramataboe, 2015).

Performance management is a goal-oriented process that is directed towards ensuring organisational processes are in place to maximise productivity of employees, teams, and ultimately, the organisation. Staff performance 'data' refers to staff information that assists managers to gain better knowledge about their employees (Wayman, Jimerson & Cho, 2012). Therefore, data refers to any qualitative or quantitative source of information provided by the staff for

performance evaluation, for decisions about organisational and instructional improvement. Hence, institutional managers' understanding and application of IPMS using performance data, is imperative for performance evaluation. Performance management is a dynamic, ongoing, continuous process, whereas performance appraisal is a one-time event, each year (Nankervis & Compton, 2006). Performance appraisal is a system used to evaluate an individual's, or team's job performance. This paper, therefore, highlights the performance management practices for the recognition and reward of academic staff's performance in the established key performance areas.

Institutional managers who provide continuous learning and professional growth and development to staff, enhance their performance. IPMS, therefore, is a formally set, continuing, and systematic evaluation, that should operate as a process that motivates and aids individuals in developing professionally, through performance management. The work of Marishane (2015) is all about improving performance through data usage, and being accountable for decisions made in the process. He states that performance data is important, not only for examining performance, but for generating informed decisions, and planning for sustainable improvement (Marishane, 2015). The HEI's educational managers appraisal of academic staff performance, should be done on an ongoing basis, in two cycles, every year. At the beginning of the year the staff members should enter into an agreement with the departmental manager, about the outputs planned for the year. During this process managers should assist the employees in identifying their personal and professional development needs, and providing them with a supportive performance management framework and criteria. The performance commitments, deliverables, performance standards and time frames, are developed and recorded in the agreement. Once the agreement is signed, the agreement planning and formulation stage, is completed.

Key performance areas used in IPMS for staff appraisal

Higher education institutions have a comprehensive set of key performance areas (KPAs), to measure the achievement of performance activities. The KPAs differ per academic post level. This paper focuses on the IPMS of academics below the professorship, on level 6, 7 and 8, in an institution. Level 6 are associate professors, level 7 are senior lecturers, and level 8, are lecturers. All academics on post levels, 6, 7 and 8, have to satisfy the three KPAs. Associate professors (post level 6), have to also provide leadership to the academics below their level.

The IPMS focuses on these levels because these are levels that academics have to progress through, before becoming full professors. The aim of IPMS is to determine whether performance management enhances staff and institutional performance. Meeting the criteria of these KPAs, ensure employees get incentives such as a performance bonus, the following year, only if the performance score is higher than a 3, out of a score of 5. KPA 1 focuses on academic leadership, mentoring and skills' transfer to other colleagues, and, requires associate professors to provide such mentorship to their juniors. Associate professors have to transfer their research and tuition skills to upcoming colleagues in the department and across other departments, in areas such as article writing, accessing and infusing information into articles and book chapters, and guidance through research proposal writing and proposal reviews. Although academics on post levels 7 and 8 have to

identify a mentor who can guide them throughout this process, associate professors, too, should be mentored by the full professors (Camilleri & Camilleri, 2018).

KPA 2 focuses on teaching and learning done by all academics. All academics are responsible for tuition of a module (course), and provide additional support to students via e-mail, and through institutional discussion forums. Involvement in tuition differs according to the level occupied by the academic. The rating or scoring is given for participation in institutional activities. KPA 3 focuses on research outputs (articles and chapters), student supervision, and academic citizenship, locally and internationally. KPA 4 also requires academics to collaborate with other colleagues in community engagement and research projects, locally and internationally. All the above KPAs are criteria for measuring HEI staff's performance and criteria priorities, commitments, and aims, using relevant benchmarks and targets for actual performance outcomes.

The understanding and application of IPMS in institutions

HEI departmental managers utilise both qualitative and quantitative measures to evaluate their academic employees' performance in leadership, tuition, publications and community development. The identification of specific goals is the starting point for the IPMS process, and the beginning of a continuous cycle. Job expectations are established after the job analysis. The next step involves examining the actual work performed, and performance is appraised. The final step involves discussing the appraisal with the employee. A critical factor for an effective application of IPMS in institutions, is for performance agreement to be aligned with both the staff members' job description, and the particular department's operational plan. IPMS should ensure that support is provided for both institutional managers, and staff members, through the monitoring and adjustment of the implementation of performance management strategies, in order to make changes, where necessary (Nankervis & Compton, 2006). Many researchers argue that managing staff requires elements in employment relations, which lay emphasis on the employees' compliance, quantitative outputs, managers' tasks, and the development of the organisation (Barney & Wright, 1998; Lado & Wilson, 1994; Guest, 2011).

Three basic purposes are key when planning for an appraisal interview: the employee's performance, focusing on specific accomplishments; support for the employee in attaining set goals and personal development plans for the next appraisal period and the provision of suggestions on established goals that are not achieved; as well as support from the manager and the institution (Becker, Antuar & Everett, 2011). The formal appraisal interview is conducted at the end of an employee's appraisal period, and all employees know when their interview will take place. This process tends to increase anxiety, though interviews with top performers are often a pleasant experience. Supervisors are sometimes reluctant to meet face-to-face with poor performers since such an appraisal review session may create hostility, and do more harm than good to the employee–manager relationship. To minimise the possibility of hard feelings, the face-to-face meeting and the written review must aim at performance improvement, and not criticism.

Progress against the deliverables and performance indicators identified, should be recorded in the agreement document and the supervisor should provide advice and guidance to the incumbent as required. The performance conversations should

focus on the constraints and unplanned for issues, that could impact on the achievement of the deliverables required in the incumbent's performance agreement (Nankervis & Compton, 2006). Poor work performance should be dealt with proactively as soon as it occurs, and should involve a proper diagnosis of the actual causes of poor work performance, and appropriate corrective measures.

Challenges in IPMS application

Recent research, together with considerable anecdotal institutional evidence, suggests that many senior managers still regard performance management as a mechanistic, annual ritual, which is a necessary tool, though there is minimal recognition and understanding of its effect (Armstrong & Baron, 2005). Not all performance turns out as planned, nor is this always solely the result of non-performance. Sometimes, the performance targets established, cannot be achieved within required timeframes with the resources provided. In other circumstances, events change and the original performance targets are no longer valid. If this occurs, very little advantage is gained by rigidly adhering to the original performance targets and constantly identifying performance shortfalls. In these cases, a process of replanning and reformulation of 'more realistic' performance targets should be entered into. Nevertheless, if a performance shortfall does occur because the incumbent has a skill or competency limitation exposed during the review stages, then corrective actions must be taken to address the poor work performance (Williams, 2002).

Although legislation requires that appraisal systems be non-discriminatory in the programme's overall process of equity and fairness in rewards and recognition of outcome, literatures reviewed reveal a lot of biasness and favouritism, an indication that support activities are poorly performed (Armstrong & Stephens, 2005). The result may be confrontation and undermining of the goal of motivating employees. The situation may only improve when several sources provide input such as the employee's own self-appraisal. Success or failure in performance management depends on organisational philosophies, and attitudes and skills of those responsible for its implementation and administration (Hedge & Teachout, 2000). Weighting of KPAs in the performance agreement is sometimes not consistent with those in the approved job description, and staff members may complain about differing and unfair job description, performance measures, targets and standards.

Further challenges of IPMS identified were the minimal training of institutional staff about IPMS management, and where it occurs, it focused on managers and supervisors rather than employees. Regardless of the system used, employees will not trust a system they do not understand. Regular programme reviews and scrutiny of research outputs should be explored through regular surveys and questionnaires. Qualitative indicators could be evaluation of the staff's teaching, research opportunities and training, and administrative barriers in IPMS management (Noe et al., 2017).

Research design

This paper employed a descriptive research methodology wherein literature analysis of documents was done based on data extracted from secondary sources of

information. This conceptual research focused on the concept or theory explaining or describing the phenomenon, institutional managers' understanding and application of IPMS within HEIs. IPMS' constructive approach of assisting employees in achieving their performance expectations is outlined through a process of monitoring, review and improvement. The increasingly important role managers play in IPMS management, necessitates the training, development and support of managers with leadership and IPMS management skills, to evaluate staff performance in their departments (Gurr & Drysdale, 2013; Koh et al., 2011; Turner & Sykes, 2007). Managers who are knowledgeable about the departmental output requirements (DoE, 2000; DBE, 2011; Sharitha, 2013), can coordinate intervention strategies and approaches within the department to ensure staff members perform their tasks accordingly (Louis, Dretzke & Wahlstrom, 2010; Louis et al., 2010). All these skills require innovative ways of support and training for improved performance. The performance management of an organisation's employees is intended to increase organisational efficiency, and staff accountability within HEIs (Adcroft & Willis, 2005; Boland & Fowler, 2000). This conceptual paper therefore utilised this research methodology to get deeper understanding of HEI managers' understanding and application of IPMS that could enhance staff performance (Brown & Heywood, 2005). The inductive approach has allowed the researcher to interpret the managers' understanding and application of staff IPMs by analysing the institutional assessment system, the institution's assessment criteria, and staff members' support for achievement of outputs.

Implications of IPMS on staff performance

IPMS information is necessary for critical management functions, like, maintaining control of current operations and planning for future decision-making about compensations and promotions of staff (Merchant & Van der Stede, 2007). The increasing demand for greater accountability by HEIs compels emphasis of staff performance appraisal. Staff appraisal is a highly important issue to be effectively embraced by academic professionals as an essential aspect of their work (Ellett & Teddlie, 2003). Institutional managers, therefore, need to understand how to design effective systems for performance evaluation and incentive compensation. This means that managers should constantly be measuring, evaluating, compensating, designing and changing their assessment and evaluation systems. The reason is that wrong appraisal schemes can lead to inaccurate performance appraisals, low motivation, non-commitment, and staff disloyalty (Kreitner & Kinicki, 1998; Bruns et al., 1992). Reid, Barrington and Kenney (1992), state that lack of commitment and unclear aims are the main reasons why 'certain' appraisal schemes fail to realise hopes. The implication is that HEI managers should be vigilant about IPMS and particularly attentive to leadership and management practices in the general, and task performances.

Conclusion

This paper conceptualised the management practices for the recognition and reward of academic staff performance in key performance areas. Performance appraisal evaluates how well individuals perform in their duties and responsibilities,

provides an assessment of the individual's needs, and defines possible potentials for further development. The results of the evaluation can be used as either a process of control or a means of empowerment, or both. The purposes of staff evaluation, therefore, relate to improving individual performance for greater organisational effectiveness. Thus, to the institutional manager, the ultimate goal of performance appraisal is achieving staff development, professional development and organisational development. If managers understand and can apply the IPMS instrument, significant benefits may result for institution as well as personal development, and individual academics' success. Departmental managers' responsibility is to monitor and evaluate performance of duties that allow it to function and exist. Staff support in key performance areas may result in managers handling responsibilities related to institutional growth. Recommendations are for continuous training in the use of performance data for performance related tasks to make informed changes in institutions through feedback to institutional staff from measured performance.

References

Adcroft, A. & Willis, R. (2005): The (un)intended outcome of public sector performance measurement. *International Journal of Public Sector Management*, 18(5), 386-400.

Armstrong, M. & Baron, A. (2005): *Managing performance: performance management in action*. United Kingdom: CIPD publishing.

Armstrong, M. & Stephens, T. (2005): *A handbook of employee reward management and practice*. London: Kogan Page Publishers.

Barney, J. B. & Wright, P. M. (1998): On becoming a strategic partner: The role of human resources in gaining competitive advantage. *Human Resource Management*, 37(1), 31-46.

Becker, K., Antuar, N. & Everett, C. (2011): Implementing an employee performance management system in a non-profit organization. *Non-profit Management and Leadership*, 21(3), 255-271.

Boland, T. & Fowler, A. (2000): A systems perspective of performance management in public sector organisations. *Journal Public Sector Management*, 13, 417-446.

Brown, M. & Heywood, J. S. (2005): Performance Appraisal Systems: Determinants and Change. *British Journal of Industrial Relations*, 43, 659-679.

Bruns, T. D., Vilgalys, R., Barns, S. M., Gonzalez, D., Hibbett, D. S., Lane, D. J. & Sogin, M. L. (1992): Evolutionary relationships within the fungi: analyses of nuclear small subunit rRNA sequences. *Molecular phylogenetics and evolution*, 1(3), 231-241.

Camilleri, M. A. & Camilleri, A. C. (2018): The Performance Management and Appraisal in Higher Education. In C. Cooper (Ed.) *Driving Productivity in Uncertain and Challenging Times*. Conference proceedings. UK: British Academy of Management.

Department of Basic Education (DBE) (2011): *Integrated Strategic Planning Framework for Teacher Education and Development in South Africa.* South Africa: The Departments of Basic Education and Higher Education and Training.

Department of Education (DoE) (2000): *Lead and manage a subject, learning area or phase. Advanced Certificate: Education (School Management and Leadership)*. South Africa: Department of Education.

Ellett, C. D. & Teddlie, C. (2003): Teacher evaluation, teacher effectiveness and school effectiveness: Perspectives from the USA. *Journal of personnel evaluation in education*, 17(1), 101-128.

Guest, D. E. (2011): Human resource management and performance: still searching for some answers. *Human resource management journal*, 21(1), 3-13.

Gurr, D. & Drysdale, L. (2013): Middle-level secondary school leaders. Potential constraints and implications for leadership preparation and development. *Journal of education administration*, 5(1), 55-71.

Hedge, J. & Teachout, M. (2000): Exploring the concept of acceptability as a criterion for evaluating performance. *Group and Organisation Management*, 25(1), 22-44.

Koh, H. H., Gurr, D., Drysdale, L. & Ang, L. L. (2011): How school leaders perceive the leadership role of middle leaders in Singapore primary schools? *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 12(4), 609-620.

Kreitner, R. & Kinicki, A. (1998): *Organizational Behavior.* Boston: McGraw-Hill.

Lado, A. A. & Wilson, M. C. (1994): Human resource systems and sustained competitive advantage: A competency-based perspective. *Academy of management review*, 19(4), 699-727.

Loius, K. S., Leithwood, K., Wahlstrom, K. & Anderson, S. E. (2010): *Investigating the links to improved student learning. Final report of research findings.* The Wallace Foundation: Centre for Applied Research and Educational Improvement (CAREI).

Louis, K. S., Dretzke, B. & Wahlstrom, K. (2010): How does leadership affect student achievement? Results from a national US survey. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement: An International Journal of Research, Policy and Practice*, 21(3), 315-336.

Marishane, R. N. (2015): Data-informed Instructional Leadership: Improving the Instructional Program in South African Primary Schools. *International Journal of Educational Sciences*, 10(2), 192-200.

Merchant, K. A. & Van der Stede, W. A. (2007): *Management control systems: performance measurement, evaluation and incentives*. London: Pearson Education.

Nankervis, A. R. & Compton, R. L. (2006): Performance management: Theory in practice. *Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources*, 44(1), 83-101.

Noe, R. A., Hollenbeck, J. R., Gerhart, B. & Wright, P. M. (2017): *Human resource management: Gaining a competitive advantage.* New York: McGraw-Hill Education.

Ramataboe, L. T. (2015): Challenges in the implementation of the performance management system in the ministry of social development in Lesotho. Master of Administration Degree. South Africa: University of the Free State.

Reid, M. A., Barrington, H. & Kenney, J. (1992): *Training Interventions: Managing Employee Development*. 3rd Edition. London: Institute of Personnel Management.

Sharitha, L. (2013): Women middle managers in schools: Narratives about capabilities and transformational leadership. PhD thesis. South Africa: University of KwaZulu-Natal.

Turner, C. & Sykes, A. (2007): Researching the transition from middle leadership to senior leadership in secondary schools: some emerging themes. *Management & Administration Society*, 21(3), 25-31.

Wayman, J. C., Jimerson, J. B. & Cho, V. (2012): Organizational considerations in establishing the data-informed district. *School Effectiveness and School Improvement*, 23(2), 159-178.

Williams, R. S. (2002): *Managing employee performance: Design and implementation in organizations*. San Francisco, CA: Cengage Learning EMEA.

Prof. Dr. Sharon Thabo Mampane, University of South Africa, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Tebogo Jillian Mampane

School Inspectors' Role of Supporting Mathematics Educators in South African Township Schools

Abstract

The purpose of the paper is to highlight ways in which mathematics educators are supported through school inspection. The aim of this paper is to establish whether mathematics educators are adequately supported through school inspection to address mathematics problems within South African classes. For this goal to be achieved, governments have tasked district officials, hereafter known as school inspectors to ensure and guarantee the delivery of quality education to learners. Despite the belief that school inspection may have a positive impact on the teaching of mathematics, little is known about how school inspectors support mathematics educators. A critical factor in capacitating mathematics educators is to ensure that they acquire effective teaching skills to address learners' mathematics problems. The study employs a qualitative conceptual approach using literature that includes books, articles and chapters written on mathematics, locally and internationally. Due to the limited discourse on how school inspectors capacitate and supervise educators in South Africa, the text serves as a significant piece in understanding how school inspection is implemented for developing mathematics educators in South Africa. The argument posed is whether school inspectors can succeed in adequately fulfilling this task. Findings reveal that supporting mathematics educators provides opportunities that make a real and lasting difference in learners' lives. Recommendations are that the government and educational stakeholders should ensure that school inspection is regulated to ensure mathematics educators are capacitated to address difficulties in mathematics learning.

Keywords: school inspection, educator capacitation, educator supervision, improved performance, educator support, township schools

Introduction

Several scholars believe that school inspection is a school accountability system (Pashiardis & Brauckman, 2010) and is responsible for assessing performance of educators and general effectiveness of the school. Similarly, Macharia and Kiruma (2014) argue that school inspection is an accountability mechanism that governments use to ensure value for money invested in the education system. Aligned to this is the perspective of Ehren et al. (2013) that school inspection holds school managers and educators are answerable for range of goals related to student achievements. School inspection is a necessary approach of accountability for supporting educators and learners in schools, however, it is one of the most challenging aspects in education. Accountability is a universal feature of decision environments, with a distinct attribute of discernment that reminds people to act in accordance with the existing norms of a society, and provides a rationale for people to behave in conformity or contrary to the existing norms (Frink & Klimoski, 2004). It is an indispensable condition for the sustainability of any society that connects

decision makers to their society and places of work. Mathematics serves as a foundation subject for many other disciplines (Roesken, 2010) and the key to improving performance and throughput in mathematics is through capacitation, supervision and support of mathematics educators by school inspectors, to ensure effective teaching and learning occurs. This conceptual descriptive qualitative paper analysed local and international literature and official documents to highlight the role of school inspectors of supporting mathematics educators.

School inspection

School inspection is a necessary precursor to improving teaching and learning in schools if properly implemented, however, the new mathematics curriculum and teaching standards do not match the qualified and competent mathematics educators, nor do they address problems in township schools, where high-quality mathematics teaching is needed (Darling-Hammond, 2000). School inspectors are tasked to monitor schools to ensure the successful achievement of outcomes in schools (De Clercq, 2013). Through school inspection, mathematics educators can be provided with accurate information about the current state of education in schools (AlKutich & Abukari, 2018) to address mathematical challenges. School inspection, therefore, is a critical mechanism for enhancing teaching and learning in the school context, especially the township schools in South Africa to guarantee value for money in the education system. The term township refers to the underdeveloped urban living areas previously reserved, and still are residential areas for Blacks, Coloureds and Indians (Monyooe, 2017). Township and rural schools in South Africa have considerably fewer opportunities to excel in mathematics, because educators in these schools, lack knowledge, and skills in mathematics, and the schools are also under-resourced. The assumption is that mathematics educators should be supported and developed professionally to do their best work with learners, and to be retained.

Mathematics educators

According to Rogan (2004), mathematics educators have sufficient subject matter knowledge and have successfully completed a minimum teaching qualification. Mogari et al. (2009) maintain that mathematics requires a deeper understanding of content, and interpretation of mathematics concepts. This view is in line with that of the Department of Education (2000) which states that the standards set for teacher classroom performance and learner achievement should ensure teachers meet the expected standards and adapt to curriculum changes (Supovitz & Turner, 2000). According to the South African Schools Act (1996), the term learner refers to any person receiving tuition or is obliged to receive education ranging from early childhood education to adult education. In this study, the term learner refers to high school students in a secondary school.

Professional development and support of educators

Despite recognition of the importance of educator support through professional development, what is currently available for mathematics educators in South Africa, is inadequate (Borko, 2004). The competencies and abilities of mathematics teachers

do not meet learner expectations, despite school inspection being regarded as the best means to improving teaching practice (Supovitz & Turner, 2000). OECD (2009) defines educator professional development as individual teacher activities for developing skills, knowledge, expertise and other characteristics. Teaching competency requires continuous support and guidance in a particular learning area (DoE, 2000) and should be aligned with the teacher's actual job. Instead of working with the assumption that teachers have a basic knowledge of teaching mathematics, the professional development process should aim at improving the teachers' academic standing as well as competence and efficiency in discharging professional obligations inside and outside the classroom (Komba & Nkumbi, 2008). Any constraints in work performance should be dealt with proactively as soon as it occurs and should involve a proper diagnosis of the actual causes of the poor work performance and appropriate corrective measures. Mathematics educator support can be enhanced through formal structures, like courses, workshops, and informal and internal teacher collaboration that includes coaching and mentoring and external networking between different schools.

Mentoring and coaching

Mentoring and coaching are amongst the most effective means of supporting educator professional development, though in practice the quality of mentoring and coaching is extremely variable (Hobson et al., 2015). Mentoring and coaching are a goal-oriented process that is directed towards ensuring organisational processes put in place maximise productivity of educators, and ultimately, that of the school. The terms mentoring and coaching are considered as two areas of practice that have large areas of commonality and overlap. Mentors are often more effective if a coaching style adopted is appropriate (Darwin, 2000). Effective mentoring and coaching rely on wisdom and prior knowledge. Mentoring and coaching include qualities of mutual respect and valuing differences of viewpoint, acknowledgement of influences, and listening and sharing (Garvey, Stokes & Megginson, 2009). Mentoring and coaching should be an ongoing process that involves experienced educators assisting struggling educators after personal and professional development needs are identified, and this should be in line with set goals. The performance commitments, deliverables, performance standards and time frames should be developed and recorded in the mentoring and coaching programme.

Mentoring and coaching can lead to empowering educators in the workplace. During mentoring and coaching support is provided through the monitoring and adjustment of the implementation of mentoring and coaching strategies, in order to make changes, where necessary (Nankervis & Compton, 2006). The educators often receive the greatest benefit, but the mentor and coach also benefit, and may feel a sense of empowerment from the relationship established. Not all academics improve performance, nor is non-improvement solely the result of mentoring and coaching. Sometimes, the performance targets established cannot be achieved within required timeframes with the resources provided (Darwin, 2000), however, mentoring and coaching should be adopted as a source of information for capacitating educators after performance evaluation, and for making decisions about professional development. The achievement of mathematics improvement is influenced by organisational cultures and subcultures, organisational values, the physical

environments of work, social and peer associations, etc. Therefore, knowledge, understanding and application of mentoring and coaching is imperative for performance improvement.

Theoretical framework and research methodology

According to Ozga (2013), school inspection is an accountability framework that is necessary for driving educational improvement, sets targets, provides incentives, and specifies contracts and measures results. According to this scholar, school inspection needs to focus on the core business of education which is teaching, learning and pupils' behaviour. Akin to the above perspective, Frink and Klimoski (2004) consider accountability to be a means of creating formal and informal mechanisms for reporting issues in an organisation. In agreement with the above perspective, several scholars confirm that school inspection is a mechanism for demanding accountability from school educators and managers. Gagnon and Schneider (2019) in their study of school accountability in the United States of America concluded that accountability encourages efficiency and effectiveness of schools. They recommend that instead of using it to punish and stigmatise poor performing schools, it should instead be used to help understand why the schools perform poorly and design strategies on how to improve them. In a similar way, Dedering and Muller (2011) hold that school inspection is a logical way of evaluating conditions, methods and outcomes of the work of individual schools based on standardised criteria of assessment that is capable of providing objective data to be used to identify areas for development. Williams (2018) argues that accountability requires people to justify their actions, feelings and belief system. It is a way of holding leaders and managers answerable for the decisions they make; it is a force that makes people more rational, accurate and diligent in their dealings. It helps people to pay attention to details in their thoughts and dealing because of fear of disapproval.

Accountability also makes people answerable for the resources entrusted to them to improve the quality of education in the system (Erdağ, 2017; Macharia & Kiruma, 2014; Ehren et al., 2013; Figlio & Loeb, 2010; Luginbuhl, Webbink & de Wolf, 2009). School inspection should therefore provide professional guidance to educators to ensure compliance to educational standards, laws, policies and regulations (Jones & Tymms, 2014). School accountability improves the operation of schools and should be preceded by support of teaching and learning, assessment of practices, with special focus on answerability by key stakeholders of the schools (Albareda, 2013). To the above scholars, accountability is usually exercised through group norms and corporate culture manifested through monitoring and evaluation functions, employee contracts, reward systems, disciplinary procedures, supervisory leadership and training. It is therefore necessary that school inspectors evaluate mathematics educators' teaching practice, and for the mathematics educator to defend or justify teaching practices based on set standards.

Implications

Support for mathematics educators is essential for ensuring commitments made to education are seriously translated into relevant actions in schools. School

inspector's support for mathematics educators is a way of mounting pressure on school systems to ensure the teaching of mathematics provide the necessary performance, professional capabilities, rewards, punishment and performance in schools. School inspectors are accountable for improved performance, therefore accountability in the educational system is an educational management approach that aims at improving quality of the educational services in a country. It is a financial control mechanism and academic enhancement strategy (Erdağ, 2017). School inspection should result in mentoring and coaching of mathematics educators in areas of need and mentoring and coaching should be aligned to the school's planned goals, objectives, and initiatives to improve learner and school performance. Lack of commitment and unclear aims may result in the non-attainment of goals. The implication is that school inspectors should be vigilant about the educator practices in task performances. Mentoring and coaching practice in schools could enhance the growth and development of mathematics educators as well as the school. Mentoring and coaching of mathematics educators is central to ensuring support and commitment to tasks relevant to required goals in the school (Rots et al., 2007). Acquired competencies by mathematics educators will lay a strong foundation for improved performance and may enhance skills essential to address challenges experienced in mathematics teaching. The study is significant in that a consolidated practical advice to be applied to South African schools is provided, with efforts directed at improving mathematics performance.

Conclusion

School inspection is necessary for controlling current practices in mathematics, planning for the future and making decisions about educator promotions (Merchant & Van der Stede, 2007). The increasing demand for greater accountability by education departments makes it imperative for the emphasis on performance improvement. School inspection is a highly important issue that should be effectively embraced by educators as an essential aspect of their work (Ellett & Teddlie, 2003). School inspectors, therefore, need to understand how to design a more effective systems for performance evaluation and support of educators. This means that they should constantly be measuring, evaluating, designing and changing their assessment and evaluation systems. The reason is poor assessments can lead to low motivation, commitment, and loyalty by staff (Kreitner & Kinicki, 1998). Mathematics educator support should be a dynamic, ongoing, continuous process that ensures identification of individual job performance needs for achievement of school goals. School inspectors should monitor the teaching of mathematics in schools and identify areas that require educator mentoring and coaching for support. Experienced senior educators may be approached to mentor and coach educators in specific areas of need in mathematics for professional growth and development, to improve individual and institutional performance. Mentoring and coaching, therefore, should be a formally set, continuing, and systematic practice and process that motivates and aids educators. Improving individual performance and accountability should not only be for individual performance, but also for developing educators to make informed decisions about their profession and career.

References

Albareda, L. (2013): CSR governance innovation: standard competition-collaboration dynamic. *Corporate Governance*, 13(5), 551-568.

AlKutich, M. & Abukari, A. (2018): Examining the Benefit of School Inspection on Teaching and Learning: A Case Study of Dubai Private Schools. *Teaching and Learning*, 9(5), 37-48.

Borko, H. (2004): Professional development and teacher learning: Mapping the terrain. *Educational Researcher*, 24, 417-436.

Darling-Hammond, L. (2000): *Solving the Dilemmas of Teacher Supply, Demand, and Standards: How We Can Ensure a Competent, Caring, and Qualified Teacher for Every Child*. New York: Opinion Papers.

Darwin, A. (2000): Critical reflections on mentoring in work settings. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 50(3), 197-211.

De Clercq, F. (2013): Professionalism in South African education: The challenges of developing teacher professional knowledge, practice, identity and voice. *Journal of Education*, 57, 31-54.

Dedering, K. & Muller, S. (2011): School Improvement through Inspections? First Empirical Insights from Germany. *Journal of Educational Change*, 12(3), 301-322.

Department of Education (DoE) (1996): South African schools act. *Government Gazette, Notice*, (84).

Department of Education (DoE) (2000): *Norms and standards for educators. National education policy act 27 of 1996*. Pretoria: Government Printers.

Ehren, M. C., Altrichter, H., McNamara, G. & O'Hara, J. (2013): Impact of school inspections on improvement of schools – describing assumptions on causal mechanisms in six European countries. *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*, 25(1), 3-43.

Ellett, C. D. & Teddlie, C. (2003): Teacher evaluation, teacher effectiveness and school effectiveness: Perspectives from the USA. *Journal of personnel evaluation in education*, 17(1), 101-128.

Erdağ, C. (2017): Accountability Policies at Schools: A Study of Path Analysis. *Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*, 17(4), 1405-1432.

Figlio, D. & Loeb, S. (2010): School accountability. In E. A. Hanushek, S. J. Machin & L. Woessmann (Eds.) *Handbook of the Economics of Education*, Vol. 3 (pp. 383-421). Amsterdam: North Holland.

Frink, D. D. & Klimoski, R. J. (2004): Advancing accountability theory and practice: Introduction to the human resource management review special edition. *Human resource management review*, 14(1), 1-17.

Gagnon, D. J. & Schneider, J. (2019): Holistic school quality measurement and the future of accountability: pilot-test results. *Educational Policy*, 33(5), 734-760.

Garvey, R., Garvey, B., Stokes, P. & Megginson, D. (2017): *Coaching and mentoring: Theory and practice*. London: Sage publications.

Hobson, A., Maxwell, B., Stevens, A., Doyle, K. & Malderez, A. (2015): *Mentoring and coaching for teachers in the further education and skills sector in England*. UK: Education Research Centre, Sheffield Hallam University.

Jones, K. & Tymms, P. (2014): Ofsted's role in promoting school improvement: the mechanisms of the school inspection system in England. *Oxford Review of Education*, 40(3), 315-330.

Komba, W. L. & Nkumbi, E. (2008): Teacher professional development in Tanzania: Perceptions and practices. *Journal of International Cooperation in Education*, 11(3), 67-83.

Kreitner, R. & Kinicki, A. (1998): *Organisational behaviour*. Boston, Mass: McGraw-Hill.

Luginbuhl, R., Webbink, D. & De Wolf, I. (2009): Do inspections improve primary school performance? *Educational evaluation and policy analysis*, 31(3), 221-237.

Macharia, S. M. & Kiruma, N. S. (2014): What Ails School Inspection in Uganda? Reflections, Experiences and Emerging Issues. *International Journal of Education and Research*, 2(3), 1-12.

Merchant, K. A. & Van der Stede, W. A. (2007): *Management control systems: performance measurement, evaluation and incentives*. UK: Pearson Education.

Mogari, D., Kriek, J., Stols, G. & Iheanachor, O. U. (2009): Lesotho's students' achievement in mathematics and their teachers' background and professional development. *Pythagoras*, 70, 3-15.

Monyooe, L. (2017): Reclassifying Township Schools – South Africa's Educational Tinkering Expedition! *Creative Education*, 8(33), 471-485.

Nankervis, A. R. & Compton, R. L. (2006): Performance management: theory in practice? *Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources*, 44(1), 83-101.

OECD (2009): *Creating Effective Teaching and Learning Environments. First Results from TALIS*. Technical Report. Paris: OECD.

Ozga, J. (2013): Accountability as a policy technology: accounting for education performance in Europe. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 79(2), 292-309.

Pashiardis, P. & Brauckman, S. (2010): The Commonwealth's Co-LEAD Project. In *Commonwealth Education Partnerships 2010/11* (pp. 41-46). Commonwealth Secretariat: Nexus.

Roesken, B. (2010): *Hidden Dimensions in the Professional Development of Mathematics Teachers: In-Service Education for and with Teachers*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Rogan, J. M. (2004): Out of the frying pan: Case studies of the implementation of Curriculum 2005 in some science classrooms. *African journal of research in mathematics, science and technology education*, 8(2), 165-179.

Rots, I., Aelterman, A., Vlerick, P. & Vermeulen, K. (2007): Teacher education, graduates' teaching commitment and entrance into the teaching profession. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 23(5), 543-556.

Supovitz, J. A. & Turner, H. M. (2000): The effects of professional development on science teaching practices and classroom culture. *Journal of Research in Science Teaching*, 37(9), 963-980.

Williams, J. B. (2018): Accountability as a debiasing strategy: Testing the effect of racial diversity in employment committees. *Iowa Law Review*, 103(4), 1593-1638.

Ms. Tebogo Jillian Mampane, University of South Africa, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Chinuru Chituru Achinewhu

The Future of the African Child: Protecting the Right to Education of Internally Displaced Children in Nigeria

Abstract

The right of the child to education, regardless of social or environmental factors, is indispensable to the development of both the child and the society. In Africa, this right vis-à-vis the future of the child has incessantly been impeached by internal crisis and armed conflicts which often lead to the displacement of children from their homes, and away from formal educational opportunities. This paper examines the impact of internal crisis and armed conflicts on access to the right to education of internally displaced children (IDCs) in Nigeria and the effectiveness of Nigeria's legal regime in protecting these rights. It identifies structural conditions as the principal challenge truncating the right of IDCs to education. Using the best interest principle, non-discrimination rule, and the right to participate as its theoretical foundation, the paper posits that the protection of the right of uprooted children to education serves the overall future interest of both IDCs and the country. It argues that the failure of government to protect these rights through the emplacement of a robust legal regime to address the identified challenges amounts to an infringement of IDCs right to education and their right to a better future, particularly under international law. The research considers the position of Nigerian law and international human right instruments – Nigerian Constitution, Nigeria's Child Rights Act, UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, Universal Declaration of Human Rights – as the legal foundation of its argument. It recommends the emplacement of a structured legal regime to address the challenges.

Keywords: internally displaced children, right of the child to education, robust legal regime

Introduction

Internally displaced persons are individuals or groups of persons who are forced to evacuate or leave their homes, as a consequence of or to escape the impacts of armed conflict, circumstances of widespread violence, human rights violations or natural disasters and who live within their own country (UN Commission on Human Rights, 1998). Forced displacement is a worldwide problem but the largest in the world is its prevalence in the African continent. Africa estimates approximately 17.8 million displaced people as of December 2018. This number is around 40 percent of the total worldwide (Nextier SPD, 2019). Nigeria typically has around 2.2 million internally displaced persons residing nationwide in crowded internally displaced persons (IDP) camps. According to Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre (IDMC), Nigeria's causes of displacement are attributable to Northeast rebellion, outbreak of inter-communal clashes, extreme flooding among others. One of Africa's most extreme regional conflicts is the humanitarian crisis in Borno, Adamawa and Yobe states in the Northeast of Nigeria, which has spread into the Lake Chad region.

Internal displacement encounters are detrimental to everyone afflicted and especially so to children because they encounter different risks. Children are uprooted and subjected to threats at a stage in their lives when security and stability are needed most. Furthermore, several internally displaced children lack access to education and this robs them of the opportunity to learn, decreases their capacity for growth as well as provide them with the essential tool for psychosocial security.

Countries are primarily responsible for managing internal displacement, and it should be encouraged, assisted and regulated. The international community also has a part to play in fostering and strengthening efforts to ensure security and aid for IDPs when national governments are unable or otherwise reluctant to fulfill their obligations.

Armed conflict may be defined as any coordinated conflict employing the use of arms, aggression or coercion, either within or beyond national borders, and whether involving State or non-governmental actors (Kadir et al., 2018). Armed conflicts cause great destruction and have devastating effects on a country, such as deaths, population displacement and the loss of public infrastructure. Schools are often attacked in many armed conflicts, and children are very often targeted on the route into or out of school. The combat troops also use schools and educational institutions as sites for battling and recruiting children. The consequence of which is abuse of children, poor school attendance, high dropout rates, poorer educational achievement, and inadequate schooling standards. This work draws attention to the specific challenges and threats faced by internally displaced children in armed conflict in relation to access to education, and to the obligations of governments and other agencies to provide the education they need and to which they are entitled.

The impact of internal crisis and armed conflicts on access to the right to education

Internally displaced people face major challenges in exercising their right to education, ranging from limitations on infrastructure, capability and funding to severe violence, economic instability and inequality. Girls are sometimes required to stay home and take care of their siblings, thus putting pressure on them to stay off of school. There are also the obstacles of early and forced marriages which forces the girls to leave school. Boys are also always forced to work instead of going to school to support their family and usually face the possibility of forced recruitment.

The accessibility and standard of the education services vary considerably from one circumstance of displacement to another. For instance, some camps are better equipped and trained than others to support schooling for the displaced children (IDMC, 2020). Internal displacement puts tremendous strain on already poor education infrastructure and many educational structures in Northeastern Nigeria where most of the armed conflicts take place, were known to be very poor prior to the crisis. As of 2015, 23 out of 42 displacement camps across 6 states in Nigeria had no formal or informal educational facilities (Ezike et al., 2016). An educational needs study conducted in Northeastern Nigeria at the beginning of 2019 reported that 28 percent of the 260 school sites located in the area were destroyed by bombs or bullets, 32 percent had been robbed, 29 percent were near sites where terrorist groups or the military had their base and 20 percent were intentionally set ablaze (UNHCR, 2018).

Challenges of managing internally displaced people

It has been observed that IDPs are just about invisible to the government in informal settlements but accessible to NGOs and entities who are scarcely able to satisfy their requirements. One of the major reasons why informal IDPs are ignored is the inefficient model of collecting data on IDPs in their various separated settlements. This may be blamed on their scattered existence and lack of adequate institutional structures for obtaining reliable information and data. Therefore, it is rather difficult to implement sufficient planning, procurement, and implementation of social services.

Limited access to funding is yet another huge challenge for displacement management. The Nigerian government's lack of funding has impeded the management of IDPs and the funds are only limited to IDPs in formal camps (Lennard, 2016). The Nigerian government can improve the education and general wellbeing of IDPs by allocating sufficient funds to them during budgeting thereby prioritizing the IDPs. Donors should increase financial assistance to provide resources for education, as well as the procurement of learning aids and primary school materials. More equipped teachers should be engaged to educate the children in a language that they comprehend.

International treaties and humanitarian laws on the right to education

International human rights law, comprising of both treaty and domestic law, establishes certain rights on States to acknowledge, safeguard and uphold the human rights of all citizens without discrimination.

The Universal Declaration of Human Rights has identified education to be a fundamental human right for every person (Article 26, UDHR, 1948). The UN General Assembly and the UN Commission on Human Rights, the Guiding Principles define the rights of internally displaced people and the obligations of States and other humanitarian bodies towards them. Principle 23 affirms the right to education as well as emphasizes equal participation for girls. The Guiding Principles have been translated into more than 40 languages, which are widely used around the world, to particularly protect the rights of internally displaced people. Articles 13 and 14 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) (1966) provide for the right to education in its entirety. The Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) recognizes children's right to education and states that in order to steadily achieve this right and on the premise of true equality, countries are encouraged to provide mandatory and free primary education to all, increase the availability of various forms of secondary education, provide financial aid where necessary and take appropriate steps to ensure good and consistent attendance at schools to minimize rates of student drop out (Article 28, 1989). This provision is similar to Article 11 of the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child (ACRWC) (1990). The African Women's Protocol allows countries to eradicate all types of discrimination in the access to education as well as encourage the participation and retention of girls in school (Article 12, African Women's Protocol, 1990).

In cases of armed conflict, the right to education provided under these international treaties is reaffirmed because States have a duty to uphold, defend and

enforce its citizen's rights regardless of the situation (Isokpan & Durojaye, 2016). Also, The CRC expects Nations to abide by the international regulations applicable to children in armed conflicts (Article 38(1), CRC). The Fourth Geneva Convention (GCIV) mandates countries in armed conflict to provide access to education for orphaned children under the age of fifteen (Article 24(1), GCIV, 1949). The United Nations Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement (1998) mandate armed conflict affected countries to ensure the availability of free and compulsory education for internally displayed children with due regard for their language and ethnic heritage (Principle 23(3) of the Guiding Principles).

By Nigeria's ratification of some of these international conventions, it has a duty to protect the right of children to education from third-party intrusion. In the same vein, Nigeria is saddled with the task of gradually realizing the right to education for all. It can be accomplished by promoting regular attendance at classes, reducing dropout rates and continuous improvement of teaching materials.

The principle of best interest

Legislation, whether national or international requires that all child-related (including internally displaced children) actions shall be driven by the principle of best interests of the child. The best interest of the child should be of primary consideration (Article 3(1), Convention on the Rights of the Child, 1989). Internally displaced children are by far the most endangered and therefore the best interests of the child should be stressed when considering the protection and welfare of these children. United Nations Refugee Agency (UNHCR) has established guidelines on best interests of a child in collaboration with United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child and several NGO partners. UNHCR's best interest determination (BID) provides comprehensive procedural safeguards to encourage appropriate, non-discriminatory child inclusion, promote the participation of decision-makers with specific areas of expertise and incorporate all relevant factors when evaluating best options.

The right to participation is pivotal to the fundamental right of the child, however, it needs effective measures to become a realization and is necessary for the protection and performance of all other rights. Participation of children is particularly important for the right to education, as education develops innovation, inventiveness and informed decision-making.

The mechanism of acknowledging and pronouncing the human rights of children was introduced first by the United Nations in an organized manner with the implementation of the Geneva Declaration of the Rights of the Child in 1924. The move was followed by the UN Declaration of the Rights of the Child in 1959. The 1924 Geneva Declaration greatly expressed concerns regarding children's rights which were seriously abused during the First World War. It stressed the material needs of children and asserted that children must have the necessary measures for their proper development. Which included food for the starving, treatment for the ill, reasonable care for the disabled, housing, and physical as well as emotional assistance for the orphans? Article 7 of the UN Declaration of the Rights of the Child (1959) also represents the concept of the best interests of the child, which implies that the best interests of the child are the core principle of those accountable for their education and guidance.

The Nigerian government needs to implement the principle of the best interest of the child to internally displaced children in the state. It needs to provide adequate information to internally displaced children on their legal rights, educational and career opportunities, and the potential implications of different alternatives, in order for them to make informed decisions. Also, during displacement, provision should be created for family unity. Doing so would encourage families to live in the same camps where children can receive psychological support and the best possible security that their parents can give.

The position of Nigerian law on the right to education

The 1999 Nigerian Constitution (as amended) identifies the right to education by stating the basic aims and guidelines of state policy, and by specifying that the government shall channel its legislation towards securing fair and sufficient access to education at all levels (Section 18, Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, 1999). The rights provided herein, however, are unenforceable as they are simply means to direct government policies.

The Universal Basic Education Act 2004 provides that all Nigerian governments shall provide free, mandatory and universal basic education to children (Section 2, UBEA, 2004). The right to education as contained in the African Charter on Human and People's Right (African Charter) was declared binding on all Nigerians by the ECOWAS trial court. The Nigerian government has passed the Child Rights Act (CRA) in 2003. The Act adopts the principles of the UN Convention of the Rights of the Child (UNCRC), and seeks to improve the well-being of children. Under the Act, where a child is internally displaced, he is deemed to be in need. It is therefore the duty of the state governments to safeguard and promote the wellbeing and the education of such children by providing them with relevant services to cater to their needs (Olusegun & Ogunfolu, 2019). Sadly, the Act is yet to be enforced at the state level and only eight northern states have passed the Child Rights Act into law (Amnesty International, 2015). The Criminal Code Act restricts unauthorized demolition of public or private property, particularly school buildings (Section 443, CCA, 1990). There has been no evidence of convictions for alleged perpetrators of violence on schools under the aforementioned statutory provisions.

From the forgoing, it can be deduced that the current Nigerian laws are not adequate with regards to protecting the right to education of internally displaced children; therefore, Nigeria needs to improve its laws by creating efficient and enforceable laws. Using the 1998 UN Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement as a guideline, the CRA (2003) should be revised to provide appropriate protection and access to education for internally displaced children.

Conclusion: Some recommendations

In conclusion, the following recommendations can be outlined:

- Reviewing national legislation, policies or strategies applicable to IDPs to ascertain that they protect the rights of internally displaced people and implement any required changes to address legal and administrative barriers.
- Nigeria and its humanitarian and international partners seriously need to assure that children and youth who are internally displaced and refugees are

included in school reform programs, and that better data are obtained to track their situation.

- Collecting and monitoring properly defined data evaluating the situation of IDPs and upholding their rights, by defining the unique threats faced by internally displaced people including those with special challenges, and periodically updating such data.
- Mapping directed measures that aim to prevent armed conflicts leading to displacement is absolutely essential. Advance warning strategies should be implemented which will limit the armed conflict.
- Improving national governmental capacity to tackle internal displacement, by assigning a national organizational fulcrum for resolving internal displacement, with a peculiar office solely devoted to confronting the issue of internal displacement, and guaranteeing the training of all appropriate government authorities on the Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement.

References

Amnesty International (2015): *Stars on Their Shoulders, Blood on Their Hands: War Crimes Committed by the Nigerian Military*. London: Amnesty International.

Ezike, M. N., Nwoke, E. A., Amaechi, A. A., Ukaga, C. N., Nwoke, B. E. B., Ogomaka, A. I. & Iwunze, J. I. (2016): Public Health Implications of Armed Conflicts. *International Science Research Journal*, 4(4), 44-53.

Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre (IDMC) (2020): *Global Report*. http//internal-displacement.org (Assessed 10 February 2020).

Isokpan, A. J. & Durojaye, E. (2016): Impact of the Boko Haram insurgency on the child's right to education in Nigeria. *Potchefstroom Electronic Law Journal*, 19(1). http://dx.doi.org/10.17159/1727-3781/2016/v19n0a1299 (Accessed February 2020).

Kadir, A., Shenoda, S., Goldhagen, J. & Pitterman, S. (2018): The effects of armed conflict on children. *Pediatrics*, 142(6), e20182586.

Lennard, J. (Ed.) (2016): *Global report on internal displacement*. Geneva: Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre.

Nextier SPD (Security, Peace, and Development) (2019): *Forced Displacement*. https://nextierspd.com/forced-displacement/ (Assessed 12 February 2020).

Olusegun, O. & Ogunfolu, A. (2019): Protecting Internally Displaced Children in Armed Conflicts: Nigeria in Focus. *Notre Dame Journal of International & Comparative Law*, 9(2), Article 4. https://scholarship.law.nd.edu/ndjicl/vol9/iss2/4 (Accessed February 2020).

UN Commission on Human Rights (1998): *United Nations Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement*. New York: United Nations publications.

UNHCR (2018): *Guidelines on Assessing and Determining the Best Interests of the Child*. https://www.refworld.org/pdfid/5c18d7254.pdf (Assessed 10 February 2020).

African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child 1990

African Charter on Human and People's Rights 1981

African Women's Protocol 1990

Convention on the Rights of the Child 1989

Criminal Code Act 1990
Fourth Geneva Convention 1949
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 1966
The Child Rights Act 2003
The Universal Declaration of Human Rights 1948
United Nations Commission on Human Rights 1998
Universal Basic Education Act 2004

Chinuru Chituru Achinewhu, Lecturer, Rivers State University, Nigeria

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Part 6
Research Education & Research Practice

Ewelina K. Niemczyk

The Academic Research Enterprise: Current Climate Worldwide

Abstract

The effectiveness of academic research enterprise depends on several factors including talented and interconnected scholars, adequate and dependable resources, and quality research. These elements need to function in harmony in order to result in research knowledge that adds value to society. Given that research capacity and innovation are internationally recognized as main determinates of national progress and prosperity, most nations make significant investment in academic research and knowledge transfer. In addition, higher education institutions worldwide are increasingly pressured to build research capacity and to increase research activity. Meanwhile, researchers are expected to show high level of research productivity and efficiency to prove their research excellence. This exploratory research study is based on the voices of 32 respondents from 15 countries to showcase their perceptions on research productivity demands at their respective institutions. A literature review about current climate of research enterprise along with the respondents' voices clearly indicate that research productivity demands are growing and researchers find it difficult to meet expectations posed upon them. The findings lead to the conclusion that more attention needs to be dedicated to institutional policies and practices that influence researchers work and on a larger scale the effectiveness of academic research enterprise.

Keywords: higher education, research enterprise, research productivity, research capacity building

Introduction: Research enterprise

In the past few decades, competitiveness within research enterprise has intensified and research demands for scholars expanded. As a consequence, universities, researchers, administrators, and research funders were forced to position themselves in relation to the changing research system and reorganize research practice and policies according to their respective contexts.

According to the National Research Council (2014, p. 100) strong research enterprise sets on three pillars: "a talented and interconnected workforce, adequate and dependable resources, and world-class basic research in all major areas of science. To understand how these pillars interact to produce research discoveries, one must also understand how knowledge flows among domestic and global networks of individuals and institutions; how research is influenced by the

availability of scientific infrastructure, funds, and other resources; how the quality, including the usefulness, of research discoveries is affected by management, research environments, institutions, and peer review; and how all of these aspects interrelate". Furthermore, the National Research Council (2014) articulates that in order to grasp the functioning of research system one must know how the knowledge is generated; utilized by well-trained talented people; shared through networks of researchers and institutions; influenced by external factors and how it is applied for economic gain and other social benefits.

Since the research capacity and innovation are considered key determinates of national progress and prosperity, higher education institutions and researchers worldwide are pressured to prove their research excellence. Li, Millwater and Hudson (2008, p. 3) state: "Given the central role university research plays in a nation's competitive capacity in the world's market and the prominent position it occupies in the nation's overall research efforts, research becomes an important component of a university's mission and a key indicator of its performance".

It is an international practice to assess university's scientific productivity based on quantitative performance metrics, which lead to higher rankings. However, as indicated by Edwards and Roy (2016), the quantitative measures can be misleading, manipulated and even counterproductive. In addition, they state that: "Quantitative metrics are scholar centric and reward output, which is not necessarily the same as achieving a goal of socially relevant and impactful research outcomes" (Edwards & Roy, 2016, p. 52). On that note, increasingly, researchers are being asked to show not only research productivity but also the research impact of their projects and outputs. As explained by Cooper, Rodway and Read (2018, p. 2): "The rationale behind impact movements is that publicly funded research should have tangible benefits for citizens and governments need to demonstrate a return on investment in relation to research". Some scholars suggest (Cooper, Rodway & Read, 2018; Smith, 2010) that in order to demonstrate the impact, researchers should direct their publications not exclusively at academic communities but also making them accessible to audiences outside academia Yet, most universities still mainly focus on publications for academic circles.

Huenneke et al. (2017, p. 423) report that research development within research institutions is often implemented through strategies such as adding faculty members to existing units, providing mentoring, revision of institutional policies and infrastructure, and systemic prioritization of research for administrators as well as for individual faculty members. Although the research agenda of universities depends on factors specific to each nation, overall there are many similarities since their research agendas evolved in interaction with other nations. For instance, to maximize research prominence universities worldwide established research entities, management structures, and research-incentives. All these with the expectancy that researchers generate knowledge meant to solve complex social issues and provide value to society.

The study and its findings

This section describes the research study addressing the focus of this particular chapter along with the emerging findings. The key findings are linked to

international scholarly literature to place respondents' voices in the broader relevant literature.

The paper is based on a larger exploratory research study about research capacity and research productivity. For the purpose of this chapter, a selection of data from the larger study is considered in order to showcase respondents' perceptions specifically on research productivity demands at their respective institutions. The qualitative data was collected via SurveyMonkey software from 32 international scholars representing 15 countries across five continents. At the time of the data collection, 2018, the respondents were affiliated with the Comparative Education Society in Europe.

Respondents provided a list of research productivity demands placed on researchers at their respective universities. The list included the following common points: publishing in high-impact journals, securing research funding, engaging in international research projects, participating in conferences, supervising postgraduate students. Publishing and securing funding was definitely high up on the reported list. The following voices of two scholars represent the responses of the majority of respondents:

> *Publish, publish, publish and then PUBLISH in accredited journals – preferably in internationally accredited, ISI-journals – ad nauseam! Nothing else even comes close to this demand.* (South Africa)

> *Research productivity is measured by a number of grant applications, PhD supervisions, publications, subjects delivered, courses (non-standard) delivered, money brought in, international collaborations, co-authored publications and multi-institutional grants.* (Australia)

Olesen, Amin and Mahadi (2018, p. 272) state that in the competition for limited academic positions and research funds, publications are used as the main indicator of research capabilities. The current "culture of 'publish or perish' means that a researcher's career advancement is heavily dependent upon the quantity rather than the quality of publications. As a result, some individuals may attempt to tread at the edge of unethical authorship practices or even indulge in research misconduct to amplify their publication".

While researchers are dedicated to generate knowledge and expand frontiers of their field, it is evident that the desired research productivity measurable through quantity of outputs does not always align with the quality of the outputs. As evident from literature (Niemczyk & Rossouw, 2019, p. 311), researchers pressured to produce research outputs may compromise their ethical decision making and "(a) become co-authors, even in instances where they do not substantially contribute to a written piece, (b) produce an abundance of articles based on a modest dataset, (c) excessively use students' datasets instead of conducting their own original studies or (d) compromise quality of the research process at the expense of getting data in an expedited way".

Besides pressures to publish, securing external research funding was reported by respondents as extremely competitive process, time consuming and difficult. As one of the respondents stated:

> *External funding is difficult due to the competitive nature of the process.* (Cyprus)

Altbach (2015, p. 7) echoes respondents' responses stating that in "most disciplines funding is difficult to obtain and the available resources are quite

limited". Respondents also highlighted that competing with colleagues for excellence and funding affected their sense of professional success, because securing funding is seen as a measure of accomplishment. In regard to social science researchers, McGinn et al. (2019) clearly state that: "The current research climate has heightened expectations for social science researchers to secure research grant funding at the same time that such funding appears to be more competitive than ever. As a result, researchers experience anxiety, confusion, loss of confidence, second guessing, and a lack of trust in the system and themselves".

As indicated by Li, Millwater and Hudson (2008) government funding and international ranking and status drive higher education institutions to strive for research excellence. It is nothing new or surprising that governing bodies are concerned with rankings when evaluating universities' performance. Similarly, higher education institutions assessing research productivity of individual scholars take into account the ability to obtain research funding. McGinn (2012, p. 5) reported that "research that is supported through external grants is rated higher than research that does not require such funding. Large-scale collaborations involving huge grants are seen as particularly favourable".

It is important to add that the respondents in the study reported the difficulty to meet the research productivity demands. Main factors identified as limiting or preventing achieving level of research productivity expected by their institutions included: lack of time allocated to research activity, teaching overload, long peer-review process, lack of mentorship for professional development, and tension between international criteria and national context. One respondent added that meeting institutional expectations in terms of research productivity is not only difficult but also dangerous as it may affect researchers' personal well-being.

> *... most academics who take these instructions [to be productive] seriously, are getting sick/ill sooner than ever before in the history of mankind – especially cancer and cancer-related illnesses.* (South Africa)

The overall results of the research study pointed out to the fact that institutional policies and practices greatly influence productivity of researchers (Harkavy & Hartley, 2012; Kyvik & Aksnes, 2015). Therefore, indicating that more attention needs to be dedicated to an "institutional approach based on social justice and holistic human development. Such an approach should be about equity, inclusion and a responsibility towards well-being. To ensure that the above-mentioned principles are respected, research managers and universities as institutions need to provide the necessary support to ensure that high research productivity demands can be accomplished without compromising researchers' professional and personal well-being" (Niemczyk & Rossouw, 2019, p. 312).

Connecting the dots

Considering that academic research enterprise relies on talented scholars, adequate resources, and quality research, it is essential to pay attention to the effectiveness and harmony of these elements. Special attention needs to be directed to those who are involved in research activities, namely researchers. National Research Council (2014, p. 46) accurately states that well-trained researchers, "their talent, abilities, knowledge, skills, and experience and the networks of professional

connections they have made – is one of the most valuable products of the system of research".

As stated earlier, researchers are expected to show high level of research productivity. At the same time, the findings of the reported study indicate that scholars across nations find it difficult to meet research productivity demands, which heavily rely on "quantitative performance metrics, including publication count, citations, combined citation-publication counts (e.g., h-index), journal impact factors (JIF), total research dollars, and total patents" (Edwards & Roy, 2016). The Goodhart's Law seems to be of essential consideration: "When a measure becomes a target, it ceases to be a good measure" (Koehrsen, 2018). Translating to our context, the narrow objective to showcase a quantitative performance may result in researchers making decisions that compromise their integrity and quality of their work.

It is evident in the reported research findings that researchers find it challenging to meet expectations to publish and secure funding for their research projects. The pressure to publish may in fact affect their ethical decision making. As reported earlier, this may result in overproduction of articles based on a modest dataset or excessive use of projects conducted by students. Researchers whose potential to get employed, get promoted, secure tenure, or achieve successful professional appraisal depend on record of tangible outputs may feel trapped in the research productivity race (Rónay & Niemczyk, 2020). Olesen, Amin and Mahadi (2018, p. 277) add that "not only is the number of publications and authorship order used to evaluate a researcher's career, but the journal impact factor is also important for review and promotion. At the same time, the available incentives and reward for these achievements indirectly enhance and encourage some researchers to engage in authorship misconduct… Pressure to publish, coupled with a heavy workload, and reward systems that are obsessively and disproportionately focused on quantity rather than quality of publication, is a breeding ground for unethical authorship practices". Along those lines, Edwards and Roy (2016, p. 51) warn that "… the combination of perverse incentives and decreased funding increases pressures [that] can lead to unethical behavior. If a critical mass of scientists become untrustworthy, a tipping point is possible in which the scientific enterprise itself becomes inherently corrupt and public trust is lost…".

It is fair to deduct that current research productivity pressures are not conducive to a healthy research culture. Shore and Wright (2004, p. 114) state that such circumstances, when individuals are under pressure and do not meet the expected criteria for success, may create "a culture of blame". In such culture of blame researchers in order to avoid low performance and low assessment of themselves may compromise their professional integrity. In addition, this can compromise their well-being, personal lives and relationships with colleagues (Niemczyk & Rossouw, 2019).

It is time to acknowledge that some researchers may never meet the research productivity expectations set by their institutions. In fact, not all scholars are able to maintain a balance between teaching – supervising – researching – producing research outputs – fundraising – providing service to academic and local community. This ideal combo of multi-roles creates many tensions and may require changes in terms of scholarly appointments and promotions criteria.

Edwards and Roy (2016, p. 51) advice that: "Academia and federal agencies should better support science as a public good, and incentivize altruistic and ethical outcomes, while de-emphasizing output". On that note, it would be advisable for institutions to moderate influence of metrics in decision-making and to introduce multiple measures of research excellence. The need to find alternative ways of assessing scientific research outputs gained momentum in San Francisco in 2012. After annual meeting at The American Society for Cell Biology, a group of editors and publishers of scholarly journals developed a set of recommendations, referred to as the San Francisco Declaration on Research Assessment (DORA). DORA (2013) aims to promote "real change in research assessment. One of the keys to this is the development of robust and time-efficient ways of evaluating research and researchers that do not rely on journal impact factors. We are keen to gather and share existing examples of good practice in research assessment, including approaches to funding and fellowships, hiring and promotion, and awarding prizes, that emphasize research itself and not where it is published".

In addition, we need to be reminded that quality leadership at every institutional level is important to encourage and support a balanced approach to research productivity. In their book, Hamel and Prahalad (1994) talk about sense of direction and discovery as a strategic intent to succeed. Although their book was written in 90s and directed towards business field, it is also relevant nowadays in case of HEI as organization. In terms of direction, the message indicates that most organizations are over-managed and under-led meaning that more effort goes into the exercise of control than into the provision of direction. Possibly, it is time to evaluate current sense of direction of academic research enterprise and ask the following questions: Are the incentives serving the desired purpose or potentially stimulate unethical behaviour in a highly competitive research environment? Are we sacrificing quality for quantity? Are the evaluation criteria of research and researchers fair and effective?

Conclusion

As stewards of the academic profession we have the responsibility to re-evaluate the effectiveness of academic research enterprise. This work provides evidence that more attention needs to be dedicated to institutional policies and practices that influence researchers' work and well-being.

References

Altbach, P. G. (2015): What counts for academic productivity in research universities? *University World News*. https://www.universityworldnews.com/post.php?story=20140715105656393 (Accessed January 2020).

Cooper, A., Rodway, J. & Read, R. (2018): Knowledge Mobilization Practices of Educational Researchers Across Canada. *Canadian Journal of Higher Education*, 48(1), 1-21.

DORA (2013): Good practices. https://sfdora.org/good-practices/funders/ (Accessed January 2020).

Edwards, M. A. & Roy, S. (2016): Academic Research in the 21st Century: Maintaining Scientific Integrity in a Climate of Perverse Incentives and Hypercompetition. *Environmental Engineering Science*, 34(1), 51-61.

Hamel, G. & Prahalad, C. K. (1994): *Competing for the Future*. Boston, Mass.: Harvard Business School Press.

Harkavy, I. & Hartley, M. (2012): Integrating a commitment to the public good into the institutional fabric: Further lessons from the field. *Journal of Higher Education Outreach and Engagement*, 16(4), 17-36.

Huenneke, L. F., Stearns, D. M., Martinez, J. D. & Laurila, K. (2017): Key Strategies for Building Research Capacity of University Faculty Members. *Innovative Higher Education*, 42(5-6), 421-435.

Koehrsen, W. (2018): Unintended Consequences and Goodhart's Law. https://towardsdatascience.com/unintended-consequences-and-goodharts-law-68d60a94705c (Accessed February 2020).

Kyvik, S. & Aksnes, D. W. (2015): Explaining the increase in publication productivity among academic staff: A generational perspective. *Studies in Higher Education*, 40, 1438-1453.

Li, B., Millwater, J. & Hudson, P. (2008): Building research capacity: Changing roles of universities and academics. In P. Jeffery (Ed.) *Proceedings of the Australian Association for Research in Education (AARE) 2008 International Education Research Conference* (pp. 1-13). Australia: The Australian Association for Research in Education.

McGinn, M. K. (2012): Being academic researchers: Navigating pleasures and pains in the current Canadian context. *Workplace: A Journal for Academic Labor*, 21, 14-24.

McGinn, M. K., Acker, S., Vander, K. M. & Wagner, A. (2019): Dear SSHRC, What Do You Want? An Epistolary Narrative of Expertise, Identity, and Time in Grant Writing. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 20(1), Art. 8. http://dx.doi.org/10.17169/fqs-20.1.3128 (Accessed January 2020).

National Research Council (2014): *Furthering America's Research Enterprise*. R. F. Celeste, A. Griswold & M. L. Straf (Eds.). Committee on Assessing the Value of Research in Advancing National Goals, Division of Behavioral and Social Sciences and Education. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press.

Niemczyk, E. K. & Rossouw, J. P. (2019): Drives towards research productivity: International trends. In J. P. Rossouw & E. de Waal (Eds.). *Human rights in diverse education contexts* (pp. 283-312). Cape Town: AOSIS.

Olesen, A., Amin, L. & Mahadi, Z. (2018): Unethical authorship practices: A qualitative study in Malaysian higher education institutions. *Developing World Bioethics*, 48(1), 271-278.

Rónay, Z. & Niemczyk, E. K. (2020): Institutional and Individual Autonomy in Relation to Research Productivity in Hungarian and South African Higher Education Contexts. In N. Popov, C. Wolhuter, L. de Beer, G. Hilton, J. Ogunleye, E. Achinewhu-Nworgu & E. Niemczyk (Eds.) *Educational Reforms Worldwide* (pp. 240-247). BCES Conference Books, Vol. 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society.

Shore, C. & Wright, S. (2004): Whose accountability? Governability and the auditing of universities. *Parallax*, 10(2), 100-116.

Smith, K. E. (2010): Academic treadmills and the squeeze on imaginative, intellectual spaces. *The British Journal of Sociology*, 61(1), 176-195.

Prof. Dr. Ewelina Kinga Niemczyk, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Franciska Bothma

Accountability as a Mechanism towards Professionalizing Teaching in Higher Education

Abstract

In the sphere of higher education (HE) globally the tensions between academic autonomy and accountability, and the research vs teaching debate have been ongoing for decades. Zumeta (2011, p. 133) notes one of the reasons for such tensions to be the view of accountability as a social construct, resulting in its definition varying from context to context and time to time. While professionalism in the higher education context is closely associated to research status of academics, the question addressed in this paper is whether accountability in teaching-related work, if clearly defined and practiced, can be used as mechanism towards professionalizing higher education teaching. The findings of the qualitative study clearly indicate a correlation between the characteristics of teaching-related accountability and professionalism in higher education, underscoring the notion that an accountable and excellent higher education teacher should be able to rise to the coveted position of a professor.

Keywords: academic accountability, accountability characteristics, higher education, professionalism, research, student learning, teaching practice, teaching quality

Introduction and background

In the modern day, accountability expectations within HE have become more diverse and demanding than ever before (Bothma & Rossouw, 2019; Stanley, 2012, p. 3), especially for the spending of ever-dwindling public funds (Altbach, 2013) with a concomitant augmented expectation that lecturers are responsible for successful student learning achievements (Altbach, Reisberg & Rumbley, 2009, p. 90). An over-emphasis on answerability and the ever-changing demands for social responsiveness as time and context require (Teelken, 2012, p. 274), coupled by the obligation of greater student access and teaching quality for student success (DHET, 2013, p. 31), necessitate a balancing act to not lose sight of academic autonomy and freedom, concepts that are already a certainty within the research environment (Stensaker & Harvey, 2011, p. 1).

Unfortunately, the academe is also known for brilliant professors with impressive research track records that passionlessly read their own densely populated slides during valuable undergraduate student contact time (death by power point and all that). Ebersole (2015) cautions not to be overly critical of such poor teaching practices as the regular classroom lecturer (though a brilliant researcher) has had no formal training in the art of teaching. The teaching vs research debate surrounding professionalism in higher education and the criteria to advance towards professorship or tenure has grown old. Yet professionalism as such is always associated with diverse accountability expectations from different stakeholders (Cheng, 2012, p. 790) – a phenomenon as relevant to teaching quality as to research outputs (Bothma & Rossouw, 2019, p. 46).

According to Schuck, Gordon and Buchanan (2008, p. 541), professionalism implies "the ability to take responsibility for our own actions – to make decisions and judgements based on transparent and sound thinking, reflection and knowledge of the context in which we are operating". The Business Dictionary (2020) defines accountability as "the obligation of an individual or organisation to account for its activities, accept responsibility for them, and to disclose the results in a transparent manner…". The correlation between professionalism and accountability is thus an obvious one. These concepts can be attributed to both teaching and research in HE, underscoring the importance of a clear career path for both teaching and research as separate foci towards the coveted position of professor within the academe. Weimer (2010) states that while studies regularly fail to demonstrate any relationship between teaching effectiveness and research productivity, these remain the two distinct yet essential pillars on which HE rest. The nature of accountable scientific enquiry may and can differ – whether the lecturer is responsible to determine the best way to teach and assess for different learning styles and with appropriate technology, or responsible for systematic inquiry into specific subject matter, it remains research in the HE domain. Accountability within the teaching pillar may thus need to be more firmly established to ensure that a lecturer excelling therein can receive his or her due promotion.

Research aim

The discussion above indicates a lack of clarity surrounding the matter of teaching-related accountability of lecturers that negatively impacts the professional recognition and promotion opportunities of an excellent teacher in the HE environment. The findings presented in this paper forms part of a larger research project towards improving lecturer accountability and professional security in South African (SA) HE (Bothma & Rossouw, 2019; Bothma, 2019). The question addressed here pertains only to the characteristics of lecturer teaching-related accountability within SA HE – only one of a number of themes that emerged during the larger study which indicates that HE teaching, when done in an accountable manner, is as professional in nature as the much more coveted career path of a recognised HE researcher.

Research design

An interactive qualitative methodology grounded in the interpretive paradigm was employed to study personal context-specific lecturer experiences of the characteristics of teaching-related accountability, and to deduce meanings attributed to those experiences (Creswell, 2009, p. 13). Understanding of these phenomena is thus located within a particular context not to be randomly generalized.

Face-to-face semi-structured individual and focus group interviews were employed to generate data via a semi-structured interview schedule of which the broader themes and initial questions had been pre-determined during the review and analysis of existing literature, and of legal sources that form the foundation for lecturer accountability. Through the method of non-probability purposive sampling, and for maximum variation in data, the participants were lecturers from various

institutions and disciplines, but all in permanent positions, in possession of at least a Master's degree, and involved in undergraduate teaching.

Through in-depth inductive analysis and interpretation, knowledge and understanding were developed of the context-specific multiple realities that the participants attach to their teaching-related accountability. Atlas.ti was used for support in the management, coding, exploring, and comparing of the raw data. Subsequently, the main findings of the inquiry are reported.

Research findings

Three categories of required characteristics of lecturer teaching-related accountability, also associated with professionalism (Schuck, Gordon & Buchanan, 2008), emerged during the analysis of the data, namely answerability, clear task requirements, and clear consequences for accountability negation.

The first category identified by many of the participants comprises the concept of answerability, "the responsibility we have to answer for the things we're supposed to do, the decisions that we make which affect other people". This is in keeping with the view of Hall et al. (2006, p. 88) that accountability is only evident when an employee is answerable to someone for the fulfilment of stated responsibilities as derived from an employment contract. The analysis of participant responses revealed three different sub-categories for answerability, namely (i) the existence of an account-giving relationship, (ii) transparency in decisions and behaviours, and (iii) context as determinant for accountability.

Hall et al. (2007, p. 408) identify "accountability intensity" (the degree to which an individual is held accountable to multiple persons and/or for multiple outcomes in the same organisation) as one of the four main elements of felt accountability that is indicative of how accountable an employee feels in the workplace. According to their definition, the accountability intensity of lecturers is significant in that, as evident from the participant perspectives, the accounters (stakeholders) of lecturers in their teaching-related work are numerous:

- A number of participants identified faculty management or line managers as one group of accounters with high expectations, especially for student through-put rates. One participant stated that "if I sign my task agreement, my line manager expects of me to deliver on my promises, as I then agree to the duties stated therein".
- Students were mentioned by a majority of the lecturers as their primary accounters, not only in terms of what they learn, but also in terms of their "professional development and personal growth". One of the participants added that "I'm also accountable to treat students equitably and fairly", clearly linking the account-giving relationship to the expectation of professional and ethical conduct.
- Other accounters identified were future employers, industry or the broader public where "students will one day work and demonstrate what we as lecturers taught them", neatly summarized by a participant who said that "we have a responsibility to society to deliver graduates who can perform their work role effectively and in a professional manner since we use public funds and resources".

- Participants also perceived colleagues as accounters in their teaching-related work, referring to the importance of "collegiality" and the "establishment of communities of practice" that hold their members accountable. Especially the focus group participants mentioned collegial accountability as effective for maintaining teaching quality since they believe that "peers know and understand what teaching is about". This is in keeping with the notion of peer review as the accountability mechanism of choice for research.
- Professional bodies as accounters for the requirements of curriculum content and graduate outcomes were mentioned by a few lecturers teaching in professional degrees.
- Self-accountability, also referred to as personal or ethical accountability (closely related to professionalism), was noted by many participants as a main motivator for taking their responsibilities seriously.

The issue of transparency was identified as "non-negotiable" for determining accountability. One lecturer noted that transparency is not only about demonstrating commitment to teaching, but also to demonstrate "openness to accept critique, to grow and to honestly assess my own work". Transparency and self-accountability were often used inter-changeably, one participant stating that true accountability means that you are transparent in what you do "even when no one is looking".

The final sub-category that emerged for the concept of answerability as an accountability element was the participants' perceptions that answerability is usually context-specific. Focus group participants especially alluded to the importance of context for the expectation of answerability, one noting that "in some departments lecturers are being held to account for everything from office hours to student through-put. In others lecturers are only answerable to themselves and for their research outputs… accountability is something that is micro-managed and not standardised". Another lecturer added an appropriate example of the context-dependency of accountability definitions, explaining that "it would mean something different for a doctor than it would for me. In my context, the outcomes of my teaching determine if I'm accountable or not. A doctor is responsible for physical life of a patient. I guess a lecturer is responsible for the intellectual life of a student".

A number of lecturers noted that accountability of lecturers was ultimately linked to the quality of their teaching practices, one participant stating that "you need a clear definition of what quality teaching is if you want to measure a lecturer's teaching practice and judge accountability in those terms". This is aligned to global perspectives on the importance of a uniform institutional definition of teaching quality to determine accountability (Devlin & Samarawickrema, 2010, p. 115).

The second category that emerged from the interview data to represent another essential characteristic of accountability in the eyes of most of the participants, is clear task requirements, with two associated sub-categories, (i) clear responsibilities and standards for task performance, and (ii) the importance of consensus between the lecturer and his accounters in terms of expected tasks.

Participant responses gave evidence that lecturers were unsure as to which specific tasks they had to account for in their teaching-related work, especially for promotional purposes. Many of them viewed through-put rate in their respective courses (unfairly) as the primary standard against which their teaching effectiveness was measured. Others alluded to the fact that they would rather be measured against

standards for effective use of technology, student participation in classes and even participation of students on their online teaching platforms rather than classroom attendance. “Times are changing, students don’t want to sit in classes all day. Yet teaching effectiveness seems to still require talk and chalk or interactive PowerPoint slides.”

A number of participants felt that clear expectations in teaching-related work were lacking while “the only thing that is always clearly stated is the number of publications that you have to deliver”. The focus on research outputs was further debated in the focus group, one participant saying: “We are here to teach, right? Yet we are more responsible for research outputs than for teaching quality.” The research vs teaching debate clearly still an issue.

The issue of consensus between a lecturer and line manager regarding teaching work is a legal requirement for the validation of an employment contract (Van Niekerk et al., 2008, p. 106). A few of the participants mentioned the importance of consensus as an essential element for the determination of lecturer accountability. In the focus group interview a number of participants indicated that workload and teaching allocations were planned with their line managers, but as one participant pointed out “you agree to certain tasks and goals for the coming year, but every single year you do a lot more than was initially agreed on”.

A clear delineation of teaching-related task requirements in the form of clear standards to measure the quality of task completion, and consensus between the lecturer and his or her line manager regarding these expectations, would have a positive impact on lecturer accountability and professionalism in teaching.

The last category that emerged for this theme, is clear consequences for negation of accountability expectations. The data analysis revealed two sub-categories that are related to clear consequences: (i) transparency of disciplinary penalties, sanctions for offences or inadequate performance, and (ii) consistent enforcement of appropriate penalties, thus in line with general labour law principles.

The significance of clear consequences for accountability expectations is underscored by the following utterance by one of the participants: “Accountability is about regulation, but also about development… They want us to be accountable, but there are no incentives for adherence to expectations, no clear consequences for inadequate performance, and certainly no motivation for development. I feel that there’s a conflict there, which means that accountability mostly makes us weary and distrustful of one another. If I know what I’m accountable for, and to whom I must account, and what the sanctions or rewards will be, there will seldom be a problem with my accountability.”

From many of the participant responses on the issue of penalties for neglect of duty or more serious offences, it was evident that although they were aware that serious misconduct like “inhumane treatment of students” or “sexual harassment claims” may lead to dismissal, they were unsure of consequences for less serious offences. Most of them alluded to verbal warnings for first time offenders, and written warnings if “bad behaviour continues”, but they mostly agreed that with regards to teaching per se, “lecturers in permanent positions are not sufficiently held to account, as long as you are publishing”. There thus seems to be an absence of clear institutional consequences for disregard or repudiation of teaching-related responsibilities.

In the focus group discussion a few of the lecturers mentioned that they thought continuous negative student evaluations or complaints of bad teaching practices would negatively affect their chances of merit bonuses, and ultimately negatively affect their chances of promotion. Yet others had strong opinions to the contrary in that "if you are excellent in research and you have a good publications list, then they'll keep you in the system at all costs, irrespective of how badly you teach".

The analysis of the participant data demonstrates the presence of characteristics of accountability that can be closely aligned to professionalism. It also clearly validates that the tension between the recognition of research vs teaching excellence for promotional purposes is still alive and problematic.

Conclusion

In conclusion, although context specific, the findings clearly voice required action on the part of national and institutional bodies to reconsider the status of teaching as a focused career path for academics. The study offers some clarity on the matter of teaching-related accountability of lecturers that can be associated with the characteristics of professionalism.

As further reading is recommended the findings and conclusions of the larger research project towards improving lecturer accountability and professional security in SA HE (Bothma & Rossouw, 2019; Bothma, 2019).

References

Altbach, P. G. (2013): *The International Imperative in Higher Education (Global Perspectives on Higher Education)*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Altbach, P. G., Reisberg, L. & Rumbley, L. E. (2009): *Trends in Global Higher Education: Tracking an Academic Revolution*. Report Prepared for the UNESCO 2009 World Conference on Higher Education. New York: UNESCO.

Bothma, F. (2019): Towards Improving Lecturer Accountability and Professional Security in South African Higher Education. In J. Pool & M. Fernandes-Martins (Eds.) *A Scholarly Approach to Student Success in Higher Education* (pp. 1-20). South Africa: Ivyline Academic Publishers.

Bothma, F. & Rossouw, J. P. (2019): The accountability and professional security of the South African higher education lecturer. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 33(2), 29-51.

Business Dictionary (2020): Accountability. http://www.businessdictionary.com/definition/accountability.html (Accessed 15 January 2020).

Cheng, M. (2012): Accountability and Professionalism: a Contradiction in Terms? *Higher Education Research and Development*, 31(6), 785-795.

Creswell, J. W. (2009): *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. 3rd Edition. London: Sage.

DHET (Department of Higher Education and Training) (2012): The Higher Education Qualifications Sub-Framework (Notice 1040). *Government Gazette*, 36003, 14 December.

DHET (Department of Higher Education and Training) (2013): *White Paper for Post-School Education and Training: Building an Expanded, Effective and Integrated Post-School System*. Pretoria: Department of Higher Education and Training.

Devlin, M. & Samarawickrema, G. (2010): The Criteria of Effective Teaching in a Changing Higher Education Context. *Higher Education Research and Development*, 29(2), 111-124.

Ebersole, J. (2015): A Discussion on Higher Education Accountability. https://www.forbes.com/sites/johnebersole/2015/02/23/a-discussion-on-higher-education-accountability/#3615ec97717b (Accessed 4 December 2019).

Hall, A. T., Bowen, M. G., Ferris, G. R., Royle, M. T. & Fitzgibbons, D. E. (2007): The Accountability Lens: a New Way to view Management Issues. *Business Horizons*, 50, 405-413.

Hall, A. T., Royle, M. T., Brymer, R. A., Perrewé, P. L., Ferris, G. R. & Hochwarter, W. A. (2006): Relationship between Felt Accountability as a Stressor and Strain Reactions: the Neutralizing Role of Autonomy Across Two Studies. *Journal of Occupational Health Psychology*, 11(1), 87-99.

Schuck, S., Gordon, S. & Buchanan, J. (2008): What Are We Missing Here? Problematizing Wisdoms on Teaching Quality and Professionalism in Higher Education. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 13(5), 537-547.

South African Qualifications Authority (2012): Level Descriptors for the South African National Qualifications Framework. *Government Gazette*, 35548, 586, 27 July.

Stanley, G. (2012): Challenges in the quest to create global qualifications and standards are driving change in education systems. In W. Bienkowski, J. C. Brada & G. Stanley (Eds.) *The University in the Age of Globalization: Rankings, Resources and Reforms* (pp. 3-25). London: Palgrave Macmillan.

Stensaker, B. & Harvey, L. (2011): Accountability. In B. Stensaker & L. Harvey (Eds.) *Accountability in Higher Education: Global Perspectives on Trust and Power* (pp. 1-22). New York: Routledge.

Teelken, C. (2012): Compliance or Pragmatism: How do Academics Deal with Managerialism in Higher Education? A Comparative Study in Three Countries. *Studies in Higher Education*, 27(3), 271-290.

Van Niekerk, A., Christianson, M. A., McGregor, M., Smit, N. & Van Eck, B. P. S. (2008): *Law@Work*. 6th Edition. Durban: LexisNexis.

Weimer, M. (2010): Moving Past the Old 'Teaching vs. Research' Debate. https://www.facultyfocus.com/articles/faculty-development/moving-past-the-old-teaching-vs-research-debate/ (Accessed 10 December 2019).

Zumeta, W. M. (2011): What Does It Mean to Be Accountable? Dimensions and Implications of Higher Education's Public Accountability. *The Review of Higher Education*, 35(1), 131-148.

Dr. Franciska Bothma, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Zoltán Rónay & Ewelina K. Niemczyk

Institutional and Individual Autonomy in Relation to Research Productivity in Hungarian and South African Higher Education Contexts

Abstract

As scholars we navigate in the fast changing and demanding research environment. The pressure to produce tangible outputs, secure funding, and undertake international collaborations has high implications on individual researchers' work and well-being. The issues brought forefront in scholarly literature showcase the impact of research pressures on other academic duties such as teaching, scholarly service and community engagement. The attention is also drawn to the ways in which the above mentioned pressures influence choices researchers make regarding their research agenda. In this reflective paper we take the academic discourse a step further to explore how demands of research productivity intertwine with institutional and individual autonomy in our respective countries, Hungary and South Africa. Our conceptual framework is informed by commonly recognized levels of autonomy in HEIs, which relate to research activities. The three levels include: individual researcher, collaborative research teams and the institution at large. Considering the complexity of the topic and length restriction for this paper, we narrow our focus to how institutional and individual researcher's autonomy converge with two research productivity activities, namely dependence on funding and selection of outlets for research outputs.

Keywords: institutional autonomy, individual researchers' autonomy, research productivity, research outputs, Hungarian higher education, South African higher education

Introduction

Institutional autonomy and individual autonomy have a controversial history. The literature informs (Kori, 2016) that for centuries, the state, church, and other civil authorities influenced and often restricted researching as well as teaching. Till nowadays, institutional and individual autonomy is not promoted in all parts of the world. In fact, in some places academic freedom is suppressed and penalized.

> *Universities often function as centres of political and intellectual dissent, and regimes are thus reluctant to allow institutions the freedom and autonomy that may contribute to instability.* (Kori, 2016, p. 47)

As indicated by scholarly literature (Etomaru et al., 2016) the notion of autonomy can be considered at institutional and individual level. Individual autonomy as an intellectual freedom (Moshman, 2017) refers to freedom of individual academics, meanwhile institutional autonomy accounts for the entire higher education institution (Armbruster, 2008). Institutional autonomy can be also viewed as the right of institutions to make independent decisions without external interference on academic matters. Etomaru et al. (2016) further clarify that institutional autonomy has to do with institution's decision to make independent

decisions, to exercise academic freedom and self-governance with regard to internal activities. This in turn implies freedom from interference by the state or any other external governing bodies on institutional organization, governance, funding arrangement, the generation of income for its sustainability, recruitment of its staff, admission of students as well as teaching and researching.

Scholars (Kori, 2016) warn that presence of institutional autonomy does not assure presence of individual autonomy. Having said that, autonomous HEIs need to follow professional standards and be accountable to public bodies and own communities. Meanwhile autonomy of individual researchers needs to be framed by scientific standards and ethical conduct (ALLEA, EUA & Science Europe, 2019).

Although, there are many principles framing institutional autonomy and individual researchers' autonomy, often these principles are not as evident or functional in practice which have implications for researchers. The reality that research enables societies to progress through the advancement of knowledge, scientific discoveries and technological development impacts the expectations placed on researchers. In fact, nowadays scholars navigate in the fast changing and demanding research environment where they are faced with pressures to engage in international and interdisciplinary research projects; secure external funding; and generate knowledge in tangible outputs.

Scholars (Barnes, 2019) warn about the consequences of publishing pressure on academics, which lead to choosing topics for publications that are more desired and have potential to gain more citations. According to Te'eni (2019), choosing topics, methods, levels of analysis, and collaboration belong to academic freedom, which can be restricted by various gatekeepers. Aberbach and Christensen (2017) bring attention to dependencies from external sources, which can strongly affect the research productivity. Based on the interests of funders, some research activities and projects can be privileged and others ignored by external sources.

Achieving the above mentioned expectations is more complex and challenging than it is often perceived (Niemczyk & Rossouw, 2019). Yet, scholars are being mainly assessed based on their performance of different research activities, which closely connects to the level of institutional and their own autonomy (Steinmetz, 2018). As indicated by McGinn (2012, p. 15) researchers are held increasingly more accountable for their research performance.

> *In assessments related to research accountability, particular kinds of research are rated as more valuable than other kinds of research. Peer-reviewed publications in top-tier scholarly journals and academic presses are seen as the "gold standard" and perceived as essential to academic success; publications in lesser-known or more professionally focused outlets gain limited favour. Similarly, research that is supported through external grants is rated more highly than research that does not require such funding…*

Shore and Wright (2004) bring attention to the fact that in the past universities were mainly conceived as autonomous public institutions whose role was to pursue knowledge and provide social critique independent of the State. Although nowadays, many universities define themselves as independent institutions, the accountability practices tell a different story.

This work

The purpose of this comparative paper is to offer a reflective piece on research productivity pressures intertwined with institutional and individual autonomy within two countries in which the authors operate, Hungary and South Africa. The discussion of our work is grounded in the review of relevant international scholarly literature and personal reflections.

Our conceptual framework is informed by three levels of autonomy in HEIs (Moshman, 2017; Steinmetz, 2018): the individual researcher, the collaborative research teams, and the institution. Within the institution, every activity on upper levels impacts and can restrict the lower level of individuals' autonomy, i.e., institutional and team activity can restrict the autonomy of individual researchers. Strategy and funding are both moral and financial supports for research activities (Aberbach & Christensen, 2017; Steinmetz, 2018).

Due to space constraints we are able to explore only a drop in the ocean on this topic. To that end, we devote our attention to the linkage of institutional and individual researcher's autonomy to two research activities: dependence on funding and selection of outlets for research outputs. We anticipate that this paper will stimulate further academic discourse and potential research studies.

Hungary

In the context of Hungary, the debate on approaching autonomy and academic freedom mentioned afore is not only theoretical but practical. The former Hungarian constitution declared both academic freedom and institutional autonomy. It stated that the republic respects and supports the freedom of scientific life, education, and teaching; on the other hand, declared that only scientists have the right to decide on the issue of scientific truths and to determine the scientific value of research. Although the new constitution stepped forward in the case of academic freedom, declaring that the state shall have no right to decide on questions of scientific truth and only scientists shall have the right to evaluate scientific research, and so, it seems like a stronger regulation if we look at the rules of autonomy, we can recognise a weaker description. Namely, the new constitution misses declaring the government's obligation of support. It only states that Hungary shall ensure the freedom of scientific research, learning, and, within the framework laid down in an Act, the freedom of teaching.

Furthermore, the law declares the higher education institutions' autonomy only in terms of the content and the methods of research and teaching but delimits their freedom to decide in their organisation. They have the right to it only in the frameworks of an Act. Moreover, the law secured the right for the government to lay down the rules governing the management of public institutes of higher education and shall supervise their management within the framework of the Acts. According to Öniş and Kutlay (2017) with these arrangements the Hungarian government demolishes step by step the constitutional guarantees which in other countries ensure censorless research and saving researchers from political influences.

Institutional autonomy was previously untouchable in Hungary, which can be seen in this principle's strict interpretation by the Hungarian Constitutional Court. After 2010, the Hungarian government re-defined the constitutional term of

autonomy and has narrowed it to the teaching and scientific autonomy, and after it has been stepping forward with newer arrangements restricting that freedom, like the reorganisation of the state universities' management, the case of Central European University, the termination of gender studies, and the establishment of direct government control above the former research institutions of the Hungarian Academy of Science and with it restricting the financial conditions of the Academy (Rónay, 2018, 2019; Ziegler, 2019).

In connection with the current Hungarian situation, scholars note that the regulations and government orders clearly show the leading power's relationship to values is linking strongly to academic autonomy and freedom. As explained above, there is a consent between scholars that academic freedom, the individual level of the university's autonomy, cannot be imagined without the full emergence of institutional autonomy. With the new frameworks, the Hungarian regulations ensure that the state during the newly established legal institutions like chancellor and consistory (Rónay, 2018) can practice indirect influences on academic work within the university. Besides this, free speech, pluralism, free, and critical thinking are continuously in the crosshair of the government (Scheiring, 2019), which affects the position of universities and narrows the possibilities of academics. In Hungary, the larger part of external sources is under the direct control of the government. While previously, funding agencies operated more or less independently from the government, today, all of them (except the directly available EU funding) belong to the government. So, the government can favour some themes while ignoring others. Moreover, the system of state institutions' financial support is not transparent. The regulation ensures freedom for the government, neglecting the detailed description of the support system of the scientific activity.

To sum up, the Hungarian system of funding and subsidies is contrary to the internationally required freedom of scientific life. Furthermore, the government used not only financial tools but direct political arrangements to influence academic activity when the State stigmatized universities addressing political interventions against them (Benková, 2019). Ziegler (2019) also reports phenomena like banning academic programmes, and direct political attacks against professors, which he assessed as an attack against the freedom of thought and the limitation of free speech.

South Africa

South Africa like many other colonized nations experienced a difficult journey to democracy. Institutional and individual researchers' autonomy and South African higher education need to be understood within the context of post-apartheid realities. Post-apartheid, after 1994 the educational system was restructured and new educational framework introduced. The developed framework was grounded on cooperative governance in higher education which allowed for institutional autonomy (Kori, 2016).

In order to provide a framework for the post-apartheid transformative agenda for higher education system, Education White Paper 3 (CHE, 1997) was published. The paper was guided by values of democracy and social justice as well as commitment to quality education, institutional autonomy, and academic freedom (Bothma, 2015). The White Paper 3 (CHE, 1997, p. 12) defines institutional autonomy as follows:

> *The principle of institutional autonomy refers to a high degree of self-regulation and administrative independence with respect to student admissions, curriculum, methods of teaching and assessment, research, establishment of academic regulations and the internal management of resources generated from private and public sources.*

As reported by Bothma (2015, p. 66), the transformative agenda required changes in several areas including government funding; transformed institutional governance; increased access to education for all students regardless of race, gender, (dis)ability; and policy changes to reconceptualise the government-higher education-society relationships. Bothma (2015) also indicated that current South African HEIs are over regulated and the state interference limits institutional autonomy. Other scholars (Du Toit, 2000) add that such constraints on institutional autonomy can be external, state interference related as well as internal.

As indicated by Akor and Roux already in 2006, higher education in South Africa was confronted with diminishing state funding and increased interference by government in terms of management and administration.

> *Government's policies on increased access and participation rates and meeting the developmental needs of the country may be in jeopardy as a result of the steady decline in the funding of higher education.* (Akor & Roux, 2006, p. 423)

Habib, Morrow and Bentley (2008) claim that:

> *Higher education must be supported by diverse income streams…* (p. 147)
>
> *State financing of higher education enhances the power of state bureaucrats and political elites. While public funding will inevitably comprise a sizeable component of the university system, it is important that managers tap other income streams (apart from student fees) to support their institutions and that this be seen as providing opportunities, where necessary, to speak with an independent voice. This means accessing resources – as some already do successfully – from the private sector, individual benefactors and domestic and foreign foundations.* (p. 149)

The reality is that in recent years South Africa's research at universities has experienced significant underfunding due to political and economic struggles. For instance, the National Research Foundation (NRF) accounting for the largest government support for research done at universities and development of researchers was highly hindered by cuts to its research budgets. Scholars warn that cuts of research funds go beyond damage to the prosperity of universities. As reported by Bikwani (2016), State subsidy to universities is divided into block and earmarked grants. Block grants are consolidated into a single transfer and the funds can be used for any legitimate university purpose. However, universities have a responsibility to use subsidies raised from all taxpayers in South Africa wisely and be accountable to society. In terms of subsidy for research outputs, the Department of Higher Education annually awards universities for "number of research publications in DHET-approved journals as well as the proportional contribution of authors from the university" (Harley et al., 2016). Overall, the subsidy serves as a financial incentive to increase research outputs within the country. It is worth noting that the subsidy system does not consider research quality or impact (other than specifying that journals must be DHET accredited).

Conclusion

It is noteworthy that Hungary and South Africa share similar challenges. In both contexts, the government strongly influences academic activities and limits institutional autonomy. As evident in the text, the level of freedom depends on the level of the democratization of a given country and whether its constitution guarantees the universities' and researchers' autonomy (Rónay, 2018). As Marginson (2019) states, even in an EU member democratic country like Hungary the autonomy can be under suppression, which is also the case in other countries including South Africa. Akor and Roux (2006, p. 423) warn that:

> *The extent of government involvement in higher education's autonomy and academic freedom may also lead to the loss of universities' identity and ability to determine their directions, roles and functions.*

It is also evident in both contexts that institutional autonomy and individual researchers' autonomy are conditioned by funding. The funding is becoming limited and processes are very competitive. The universities are in a vicious cycle of fundraising and producing research outputs in order to secure a desired ranking. Meanwhile, researchers' autonomy is increasingly restricted due to the interference of funding agencies. Although multiple funding streams may enhance autonomy, it is essential to be vigilant not to solely service the agenda of a specific funder.

It is our stand that quality research productivity is not possible in the absence of institutional and individual researchers' autonomy. Researchers whose performance appraisal and promotion highly depend on publication record may feel trapped in the research productivity race. Since the institutional and individual autonomy intertwine and to a great extent institutional autonomy impacts individual autonomy, it is essential to promote institutional practices and regulations that support academic freedom.

References

Aberbach, J. D. & Christensen, T. (2017): Academic Autonomy and Freedom under Pressure: Severely Limited, or Alive and Kicking? *Public Organization Review*, 18(4), 487-506.

Akor, E. U. & Roux, N. L. (2006): State of higher education funding in South Africa: Policy implications for institutional autonomy and academic freedom. *Journal of Public Administration*, 41(2.2), 423-433.

ALLEA, EUA & Science Europe (2019): Academic freedom and institutional autonomy: Commitments must be followed by action. http://allea.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/academic-freedom-statement-april-2019.pdf (Accessed 4 May 2020).

Armbruster, C. (2008): Research universities: Autonomy and self-reliance after the entrepreneurial university. *Policy Futures in Education*, 6(4), 372-389.

Barnes, P. (2019): Academic independence, freedom and 'enlightenment': The case of accounting research. *Accounting History*, 24(4), 591-600.

Benková, L. (2019): Hungary-Orbán's project towards "illiberal democracy". Austria Institut für Europa und Sicherheitspolitik, *Fokus*, 2. https://www.aies.at/download/2019/AIES-Fokus-2019-02.pdf (Accessed 18 January 2020).

Bikwani, M. (2016): *Institutional Autonomy, Social Responsiveness and Public Accountability in the South African University sector.* The Commission of Inquiry into

Higher Education and Training. https://www.justice.gov.za/commissions/FeesHET/hearings/set3/set3-17Oct2016-Bikwani-Submission.pdf (Accessed 18 January 2020).

Bothma, F. (2015): A juridical foundation for accountability to enhance the security of the higher education lecturer in South Africa. Unpublished doctoral thesis, North West University.

Council on Higher Education (CHE) (1997): *Education White Paper 3: a programme for the transformation of higher education*. http://www/che.ac.za/media_and_publications/legislation/education-white-paper-3-programme-transformation-higher-education (Accessed 19 February 2014).

Du Toit, A. (2000): From autonomy to accountability: academic freedom under threat in South Africa? *Social dynamics: a journal of African studies*, 26(1), 76-133.

Etomaru, I., Ujeyo, M. S., Luhamya, A. & Kimoga, J. (2016): Institutional Autonomy: Implications for Teaching and Research in Public Universities in Uganda. *International Research in Higher Education*, 1(2), 133-142.

Habib, A., Morrow, S. & Bentley, K. (2008): Academic freedom, institutional autonomy and the corporatized university in contemporary South Africa. *Social Dynamics*, 34(2), 140-155.

Harley, Y. X., Huysamen, E., Hlungwani, C. & Douglas, T. (2016): Does the DHET research output subsidy model penalise high-citation publication? A case study. http://www.scielo.org.za/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S0038-23532016000300020 (Accessed 5 February 2020).

Kori, E. (2016): Challenges to academic freedom and institutional autonomy in South African universities. *International Journal of Teaching & Education*, IV (1), 45-53.

Marginson, S. (2019): The Kantian University: Worldwide triumph and growing insecurity. *Australian Universities' Review*, 61(1), 59-70.

McGinn, M. K. (2012): Being academic researchers: Navigating pleasures and pains in the current Canadian context. *Workplace: A Journal for Academic Labor*, 21, 14-24.

Moshman, D. (2017): Academic Freedom as the Freedom to do Academic Work. *Journal of Academic Freedom*, 8, 1-14.

Niemczyk, E. K. & Rossouw, J. P. (2019): Drives towards research productivity: International trends. In J. P. Rossouw & E. de Waal (Eds.) *Human rights in diverse education contexts* (pp. 283-312). Cape Town: AOSIS.

Öniş, Z. & Kutlay, M. (2017): Global Shifts and the Limits of the EU's Transformative Power in the European Periphery: Comparative Perspectives from Hungary and Turkey. *Government and Opposition*, 54(2), 226-253.

Rónay, Z. (2018): Centralizations and Autonomies: The Delimitation of Education by the Hungarian Government. In N. Popov, C. Wolhuter, J. M. Smith, G. Hilton, J. Ogunleye, E. Achinewhu-Nworgu, E. Niemczyk (Eds.) *Education in Modern Society* (pp. 177-182). BCES Conference Books, Vol. 16. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society.

Rónay, Z. (2019): Academic Freedom and Strong State Control: Two Samples to Illustrate the Consequences. In N. Popov, C. Wolhuter, L. de Beer, G. Hilton, J. Ogunleye, E. Achinewhu-Nworgu, E. Niemczyk (Eds.) *Glocal Education in Practice: Teaching, Researching, and Citizenship* (pp. 175-180). BCES Conference Books, Vol. 17. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society.

Scheiring, G. (2019): Dependent development and authoritarian state capitalism: Democratic backsliding and the rise of the accumulative state in Hungary. *Geoforum*, 5 September. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2019.08.011 (Accessed 30 January 2020).

Shore, C. & Wright, S. (2004): Whose accountability? Governability and the auditing of universities. *Parallax*, 10(2), 100-116.

Steinmetz, G. (2018): Scientific Autonomy, Academic Freedom, and Social Research in the United States. *Critical Historical Studies*, 5(2), 281-309.

Te'eni, D. (2019): Managing and maintaining academic freedom. *Journal of Information Technology*, 34(2), 181-183.

Ziegler, T. D. (2019): *Academic Freedom in the European Union – Why the Single European Market is a Bad Reference Point*. Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law & International Law, Research Paper No 2019-03. http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3317406 (Accessed 18 January 2020).

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Zoltán Rónay, Eötvös Loránd University, Hungary

Prof. Dr. Ewelina Kinga Niemczyk, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

JP Rossouw

Developing a Faculty Research Culture in Higher Education: A South African Perspective

Abstract

An increase in research productivity is of vital importance in the development of countries worldwide. However, when research outputs are measured, many higher education faculties neither meet the expectations regarding quality nor quantity despite the increasing drive towards publications. This paper examines how academic managers can reform a prevailing weak or average research culture. Research and innovation managers such as deans, research directors and research professors may benefit from implementing the principles of the innovation value chain to transform a specific research culture characterised by low morale and a lack of outputs. Based on the author's experience and relevant scholarly literature, it is argued in this paper that a general passive or negative attitude amongst faculty members who are expected to produce research outputs, can be converted to a vibrant environment characterised by positive attitudes and increased research productivity.

Keywords: research culture, research productivity, innovation value chain, research management

Introduction

After pointing out the global demand in higher education towards increased research productivity, Niemczyk and Rossouw (2019, pp. 309-310) found that "research production requirements have an impact on individual scholars as well as institutions who are ranked according to their research performance". Findings of the above mentioned authors' inquiry indicate that "the majority of the participants were aware of the demands placed upon them in terms of research productivity; however, not all recognised the benefits associated with it". These findings show the discrepancy between the need for increased research productivity on the one hand, and the reluctance or inability of many scholars to meet such intensified demands.

It is, however, not necessarily reluctance or inability among staff members that hampers research productivity. Higher education institutions that more recently made a shift from a focus on teaching and learning to research did not have time to establish an effective research culture (Pratt, Margaritis & Coy, 1999). Sunder (2008, p. 81) added that "in many emerging economies, there are few universities and even fewer business schools with a robust tradition of research". Referring to teacher education institutions, Hill and Haigh (2011) pointed out that in countries such as South Africa, Australia and New Zealand academics involved in teacher training have only recently become part of higher education institutions with an established focus on the research. This shift "placed pressure on teacher educators to become 'research active'" (Hill & Haigh, 2011, p. 1). These authors believe that teacher educators "can increase and deepen their research productivity with support in ways that build on, rather than break down, their existing identities".

In this paper the potential benefits for the research manager embedded in the theoretical framework of the innovation value chain strategy, as proposed by Hansen and Birkinshaw (2007), is explored. The possible implementation of the value chain approach to successfully establish a research culture in a higher education setting is considered. To test the viability of employing and applying the innovation value chain principles in research management, the core tasks are juxtaposed against the six critical tasks associated with the innovation value chain strategy. The author draws from his personal experience as past director of a research entity in a faculty of education in South Africa.

Building a research culture in higher education

In many higher education institutions, "research activity and performance are coming under greater pressure and scrutiny" (Billot, 2010, p. 37). The institutional management creates the drive to accomplish increased research outputs, and the question asked by Billot is whether "the strategic intent of the institution resonates through the institution in alignment with the development of a supportive research culture". There is a need for a basic institution-wide research culture before the culture can be effectively developed on faculty or research entity level. Marchant (2009) went further by specifying the importance of governments to develop research and a research culture at university level.

Building a research culture needs a carefully planned strategy. In order to build a research culture and infrastructure, McRoy, Flanzer and Zlotnik (2012) distinguished four aspects that are of central importance to succeed: the building of research capacity, the creation of an essential infrastructure, the building of collaborations through community partnerships, and the funding of research.

McRoy, Flanzer and Zlotnik (2012, pp. 153-170) concluded their work by pointing out the importance of sustaining the infrastructure, capacity and culture. These aspects are consistent with that identified by Marchant (2009). Over and above the importance of national support, Marchant (2009) regarded the following as important elements towards the development of a research culture:

- Specialised research leadership and administration, which includes support from the Vice Chancellor, and a powerful head of research steering a centralised research office;
- Local or sub-unit factors characterised by strong leaders with research and management skills;
- Human resource management policy, procedure and processes, which (a) give value to research by means of rewards, (b) provide internal, unattached or open research funding, (c) offer specific assistance with grant applications and publications, (d) reduce teaching and administrative workloads, and (e) foster collegiality and a positive group atmosphere through frequent communication and teamwork.

The research manager needs to follow a set process and a specific strategy in order to eventually succeed in developing a research culture in a faculty or a research entity.

The innovation value chain

Hansen and Birkinshaw (2007, p. 1) conducted an extensive survey amongst executives and nonexecutive employees in order to develop the innovation value chain, which is primarily a business oriented model. In the innovation value chain, the focus on innovation revolves around the sourcing, selection, development and spread of ideas in order to produce better products and facilitate an advantage over competitors. According to the innovation value chain approach, innovation is a sequential process during which managers perform six critical tasks, each representing a link in the chain:

- internal sourcing of ideas;
- cross-unit sourcing of ideas;
- external sourcing of ideas;
- selection of ideas;
- development of ideas; and
- companywide spread of the idea.

While many companies act in various creative ways to bring about innovation, not all are successful. Generally, they have no shortage of ideas, however, not all experience the expected success to eventually create and market a new product. In the analysis of innovative processes in a large number of companies, Hansen and Birkinshaw (2007) identified a variety of challenges and obstacles, one of them being the approach where the internal prerogatives and priorities prevent members to consider external ideas. The "not invented here" syndrome may prevent innovation when engineers are convinced that external ideas were inferior to their own. Hansen and Birkinshaw (2007, p. 1) also reported an insular culture instead of "sourcing ideas externally".

For successful production and innovation an adequate number of ideas have to be generated. However, one counterproductive approach found was to try develop too many ideas into products at the same time. "Because managers did not screen the ideas properly – funding the best ones and killing the others – few ideas took hold, and new ones just kept coming." It appears that the ideal approach is to spend all the necessary time and energy on a limited number of well selected ideas. Such an approach requires proper strategic planning.

The research manager's duties and challenges

Central to the challenge of creating or developing a research culture, stands the research manager, particularly the dean of the faculty who, in the final instance, is held responsible for research productivity in the faculty. Pratt, Margaritis and Coy (1999, p. 43) found that, besides decentralised university management, that "strong leadership at the dean level" is critical in developing a research culture. Deans appoint deputy deans for research, research directors and research professors, who have as their core duties the facilitation of processes to ensure a well-developed research culture. The dean of a faculty however, is involved in a variety of other academic components of the faculty, with research being one of them. The discussion in this paper will focus on the research entity level within the faculty, managed by a research director.

The core research related duties of research managers were identified through an analysis of the official task agreements of research directors in a faculty of education in a large South African university:

- innovation within the research program;
- development of a strategic research program for the entity;
- procuring adequate external funding;
- coordinating the utilisation of resources;
- marketing of expertise;
- recruiting of collaborating researchers;
- planning of staff structures;
- quality assurance; and
- promotion of the entity's image.

These tasks are next juxtaposed against the six critical tasks associated with the innovation value chain strategy. The author builds the discussion on his personal experience as research manager in a faculty of education.

Innovation

Hansen and Birkenshaw (2007) advocated that innovation lies at the heart of their strategy. A comparison between the six value chain tasks and the established core tasks show the potential for the utilisation of innovation value chain principles by the research manager. In cases of a lack of a vibrant research culture, significant innovative changes will be necessary to develop and institute such a culture. The first duty of research managers in the faculty is specified as innovation. It can be rightly stated that an innovative approach will be essential for the success of any action taken by a research manager, irrespective of which core duty is at stake. This is true in a context where a research culture has already been established, and even more so when the prevailing research culture is absent or unhealthy.

Internal and cross-unit sourcing

The first two innovative value chain tasks for the manager are internal sourcing and cross-unit sourcing of ideas. The development of a strategic research program for the entity, as one on the tasks to be performed by a research director, should ideally be done by tapping into the sources within the entity – the creativity of the members. The development of a strategic program should include the evaluation of and building upon the previous annual cycle, especially regarding research outputs. Project groups within the entity, while functioning with relative autonomy, meet during strategic planning in order to share ideas while working through the previous year's strategic plan. Advice from more experienced scholars is requested. During such a session targets should be set for the next year, which includes Master's and PhD study supervision and publishing scholarly articles in reputable journals.

During strategic planning, roles and responsibilities of members are also considered and finalised, as part of the manager's task of utilisation of resources and planning of staff structures. The research director should facilitate the proper involvement and buy-in of the members by creating an enabling environment and an atmosphere conducive to voicing ideas, which may include criticism of previous

practices. The challenge for the leadership during strategic planning is not to be overly sensitive for criticism and to stay open for new ideas, even if they do not correlate with personal preferences.

External sourcing

Hansen and Birkinshaw (2007, p. 1) warned against an institution maintaining an insular culture or developing a "not invented here" attitude, precluding the institution to benefit from external influences. In a research entity such external sourcing will include human resources as well as research funding without which such an entity cannot achieve its goals. Two core tasks of a research director is to procure adequate external funding and recruit collaborating researchers. Put into practice, entity leadership should make it possible for individual members and project groups to move beyond internal processes and a focus on the local, to an external national and international vision.

The primary outward movement is to develop an international network, from which external sourcing of ideas can emerge. Members are encouraged to utilise national and international conferences and other meetings to establish solid scholarly networks. As part of the movement to utilise external sources, international scholars should be invited to become part of the entity activities, bringing in fresh ideas and new approaches based on their international experience. This forms part of the promotion of the entity's image, which is one of the manager's core tasks.

Project groups should receive seed money and mentorship, which enables them to develop a project to such a level where external funders may become interested in putting available large amounts for research.

Selection

While many excellent ideas may be generated during strategic planning, all cannot be developed or pursued. Careful selection processes and setting of priorities are of crucial importance. While a research entity as a whole is not in the same way as businesses dependent on the generation and selection of new ideas, the basic principle is still valid: the setting of priorities. During scholarly discourses members from other project groups get the opportunity of voicing their perceptions about scholarly ideas currently being developed within the project groups. This kind of feedback enables the principal investigators in each of these projects to determine or reconsider their priorities when tough choices have to be made.

The director has to make decisions as to how the budget and other resources such as time and energy can be spent best to ensure the maximum research outputs. In South Africa the relative weight of outputs regarding state subsidy generated often determines the priority given to such an effort.

Hansen and Birkenshaw (2007, p. 4) warned against the effect of tight budgets, but a limited budget does not need to stand in the way of reaching research targets. Careful selection and prioritising of needs within the budget should be done, and funding should be distributed evenly among the project groups. Only those research ideas that meet criteria associated with high quality scholarship should be funded, encouraged and supported by the entity.

Development

Once the selection process, characterised by the elimination of less viable ideas, has been completed, the development of these ideas should be done in a focused way. From all the tasks associated with the value chain, this is the one that takes up the most time. The research manager should stay involved to ensure quality control and simultaneously show trust in the project groups' ability to progress with reasonable autonomy. Quality is normally ensured by requiring project groups to submit well developed project applications, where the research design, parameters and intended outputs are agreed upon in the approval phase, after which the project group proceeds with the activities as planned. A director should, in collaboration with the entity leadership, ensure that the development of research ideas, as portrayed in project applications, demonstrate scientific rigour and are worth researching. Proper quality control in the selection and development phase is also a core task of research director. Without quality control, some ideas laboriously developed into draft papers do not stand a chance of being published in a reputable journal, irrespective of the effort put into the development and researching of such ideas.

Entity-wide spread of ideas

Hansen and Birkenshaw (2007, p. 5) pointed out that, especially in large companies, concepts

> *... that have been sourced, vetted, funded, and developed still need to receive buy in – and not just from customers. Companies must get the relevant constituencies within the organization to support and spread the new products.*

This diffusion process might be one of the major challenges, seeing that not all members or groups are equally ready for innovation or innovative ideas. If resistance to change is wide-spread, the proper development of a new product may be seriously hampered. The spread of the idea or concept is also an important element of marketing, which is the ultimate test for the original idea.

In the research entity, ideas nominated during the selection process should be taken back to project groups for further development to the extent that they will fit into the established focus or vision of that project group. This feedback from the strategic planning to the group can be integrated with the selection process: the project group might have the specialised knowledge to best decide which ideas are the most suitable to pursue, and which ideas should be eliminated or postponed.

Conclusion

Hanson and Birkenshaw (2007) affirmed the established truth: that the company's capacity to innovate is only as good as the weakest link in its innovation value chain. An entity should be aware of the tendency to neglect the weakest link and to focus too much on the strong links. Hansen and Birkinshaw (2007, p. 6) explained: "Indeed, our research suggests that a company's capacity to innovate is only as good as the weakest link in its innovation value chain", which suggests that the ideal strategy is to identify shortcomings in the system and to focus on strengthening those. The already strong links will "look after themselves".

In the academic context one major obstacle can be a narrow-minded approach, where little room is left for innovation, and those involved in the leadership are satisfied with the status quo. To the other extreme, innovation can be overemphasized just because it is an important element in creating an improved research climate. The research director has to balance the influx of new ideas with approaches that have been established and have proven themselves to be successful. Members may be more productive and find more fulfilment in the maintenance of their already well-developed foci, making progress with their products in a more conventional fashion.

In conclusion, a research manager in higher education can fruitfully employ the innovation value chain as a strategy towards the development of a vibrant and productive research climate.

References

Billot, J. (2010): The changing research context: implications for leadership. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, 33(1), 37-46.

Hansen, M. T. & Birkinshaw, J. (2007): The Innovation Value Chain. *Harvard Business Review*, June. https://hbr.org/2007/06/the-innovation-value-chain (Accessed 21 January 2017).

Hill, M. F. & Haigh, M. A. (2011): Creating a culture of research in teacher education: learning research within communities of practice. *Studies in Higher Education*, 37(8), 971-988.

Marchant, T. (2009): Professional Doctorate Research in Australia: Commentary and Case Studies from Business, Education and Indigenous Studies. *Griffith Research Online*. http://dps.scu.edu.au/index.php/9/ (Accessed 2 February 2020).

McRoy, R. G., Flanzer, J. P. & Zlotnik, J. L. (2012): *Building Research Capacity and Infrastructure*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Niemczyk, E. K. & Rossouw, J. P. (2019): Drives towards research productivity: international trends. In J. P. Rossouw & E. de Waal (Eds.) *Human rights in diverse education contexts* (pp. 283-309). Pretoria: AOSIS.

Pratt, M., Margaritis, D. & Coy, D. (1999): Developing a research culture in a university faculty. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, 21(1), 43-55.

Sunder, S. (2008): Building research culture. *China Journal of Accounting Research*, 1(1), 81-83.

Prof. Dr. JP Rossouw, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Nataša Matović & Emina Hebib

Engagement of Teachers in School Practice Research in Serbian Context

Abstract

The idea of teachers as researchers emerges from the belief that teachers are a key factor in the development of school work practice and that teacher professional development should be based on the concept of reflective practice. Teachers are given valuable opportunities for learning and development through involvement in various research activities into school practice. The aim of the empirical research presented in this paper is to examine frequency, reasons and satisfaction of teachers engaged in school practice research. A specific task of the research activity was meant to determine if there were differences between classroom teachers and subject teachers in relation to the selected questions. The research was conducted in four primary schools on the basis of a sample of 129 teachers. The instrument which represents a combination of survey questions and a descriptive rating scale was used for data collection. The research results indicate that the teachers on average state that they rarely engage in research and that they rate their satisfaction of the experienced engagement in research with an average grade of M=3.33 (on a scale of 1 to 5). Statistically significant differences were registered between the classroom teachers and the subject teachers regarding the frequency of their engagement in research conducted by students, as well as regarding the assistance in solving problems encountered at work as a reason for their engagement in research. The possible direction for further research in this area is provided based on the analysis of the results.

Keywords: school practice research, engagement in research, teachers as researchers, reflective practice, classroom teachers, subject teachers

Introduction

The development of school practice can be understood as a complex process of ongoing changes with the aim of achieving a higher level of school work quality. Development interventions, that is, actions that lead to a change in school practice should be based on previously conducted systematic monitoring and analysis of all segments of school work. School practice research is initiated and conducted in order to get to know and understand the practice better as well as to change both the practice itself and the conditions in which it is implemented (Kemmis, 2004). Therefore school practice research can represent a path to the development of school practice (Hebib & Matović, 2012), and have a practical value by reflecting positively on the learning and teaching process at school (Wang, Kretschmer & Hartman, 2010).

Recently, an increasingly popular attitude developed towards the so-called research-based approach to work, which became important in practical activities at school, i.e., this approach has an informative and formative function for practitioners themeselves and for their professional development (Jurić, 2004). Through the

research-based approach to work, practitioners directly contribute to changing and developing school practice and conditions in which it is implemented (Pešić, 2004). Indirectly, practitioners contribute to the development of pedagogical theory by following theoretical and research findings as well as by applying and testing them in practice and by identifying research problems (Vogrinc & Valenčič Zuljan, 2009). Through applying the acquired theoretical knowledge and putting it into practice, practititioners broaden their own knowledge and experience (Check & Schutt, 2012). In adition, they make decisions about their professional work and school work as a whole and become agents of change (Cochran Smith & Lytle, 2009) in functioning of the school.

The research-based approach to work in accomplishing the role of a teacher at school does not imply new or specific teacher activities. The approach, essentially refers to a specific transformation of this professional role (Hammersley, 1993). Teachers who consistenly apply and practice the research-based approach to work explore the link between their own classroom activities and specific academic and non-academic outcomes of the learning and teaching process (Marzano et al., 2019). In addition, to transforming the primary role of the teacher, the research-based approach implies changes in understanding of the function and the nature of the teacher education process as well as the teaching profession, which should be based on the following principles: reflective practice, research-based practice, cooperation, and autonomous professional actions (Radulović, 2013).

The idea of teachers as researchers investigating their own work and school work emerges from the belief that practititoners can be agents of change and contributors to the development of school practice (Stanković et al., 2015). Teachers 'become' researchers in a situation when they systematically include research methods and adhere to basic research principles when reflecting on their own professional experience and improvement of their own work as well as school work practice. Teachers − researchers are those teachers who are committed to their work, who are curious and ready to learn on ongoing basis (Stanković et al., 2015).

Teachers who 'practice' the reseach-based approach to work and who are ready to incorporate research into their own work practice as well as school work can be referred to as reflective practitioners. Namely, research in this context implies specific self-reflection, connecting thinking and acting (referring to reflecting on one's own actions), as well as reviewing own professional experience (Radulović, 2011).

Engagement of teachers in school practice research is of particular importance for the development of school practice, as well as the development and application of the research-based approach to teachers' work. For the development of teachers as researchers / reflective practitioners it is very important that research is initiated and conducted by practitioners themselves. Practitioner research is research in which practitioners: a) select and define the problem and the subject matter of the research, b) select methodological design they are going to apply and use in the research, c) analyse the collected data within their professional knowledge, and d) exchange research data with colleagues, while at the same time they review starting points and change their own practice (Kemmis, 2004). Practitioner research is considered to be a healthy way of developing practitioners' capacities to independently make decisions in relation to their own professional actions (Lankshear & Knobel, 2004).

This group of school practice research represents a key pre-requisite for the development of reflective practitioners, because the primary purpose of practitioners' research is to change practice, that is, to search for solutions to problems and difficulties encountered at work (Krnjaja, 2014). Nevertheless, practitioners are given valuable opportunities to broaden their professional knowledge and experience by engaging in research that is not initiated, designed and conducted by school employees but other individuals or institutions (such as researchers – associates at research or scientific institutions, educational authorities, national or international research institutions, non-governmental organisations, etc.). When conducting this group of school practice research, practitioners often assume the role of a coordinator and data collector in the school environment in addition to the role of a respondent data source. They can also have an equal role with the so-called professional researchers or experts, i.e., the role of members of author teams on research projects. It is indisputable that through engagement in research practice, practitioners broaden their own research knowledge and experience. Through this process, practitioners become more qualified to ensure the transfer of research results and theoretical knowledge to the practice of their own work and the entire school work.

The importance of practitioners' engagement in school practice research has been analysed in this paper. The following section presents analysis and results of the research conducted with the aim of examining the engagement of primary school teachers in different groups of school practice research: frequency, reasons and satisfaction with engagement. Special attention has been paid to examining the differences between the classroom teachers (those who work with elementary school students from the first to the fourth grade) and the subject teachers (those who work with students from the fifth to the eight grade) in relation to the selected questions.

Method

The research study was conducted in four primary schools, two schools in Belgrade and two schools in Šabac. A total of 129 teachers were included in the sample, out of whom 41.9% were classroom teachers and 58.1% were subject teachers. Women were more represented in the sample (75.2%) than men (24.8%). The sample included teachers with different length of service: up to 10 years − 32.0%; from 11 to 20 years − 29.7%; from 21 to 30 years − 25.0%; over 30 years − 13.3%. One part of the sample of subject teachers consists of the teachers who teach different subjects: socio-linguistic group of subjects (35.7%), the group of subjects comprised of Math and natural sciences (37.1%), subjects in the field of arts, physical education, and technical education (24.3%).

The surveying and scaling technique was used for the purpose of data collection and accordingly the instrument consisted of survey type questions and a descriptive rating scale. In addition to frequencies and percentages, the following procedures were applied in data processing: an arithmetic mean and a standard deviation to describe variables; a t-test for independent samples to test the hypothesis on significance of differences between arithmetic means; a chi-square test to test the hypothesis on significance of differences in distributions of category variables and Cramer's V to determine their correlation.

Research results

The interviewed teachers evaluated the frequency of involvement in different groups of research into school practice by using a four-point scale: never, very rarely, occasionally and often. The obtained arithmetic mean values indicate that the teachers are on average most often involved in research conducted by students for the purpose of writing various papers (e.g. doctoral dissertations, master's theses, as well as pre-exam obligations, practical work) (M=2.50, SD=.77), as well as in research that teachers, independently or in cooperation with colleagues, design and implement within the school where they work (M=2.46, SD=.76). Less frequently the teachers engage in research initiated and conducted by scientific institutions and their employees (e.g. faculties, institutes) (M=2.07, SD=.87). Very rarely the teachers engage in research supported by educational authorities, by initiating and funding them (e.g. national testing, international student assessment testing − PISA, TIMSS) (M=1.77, SD=.84), then in research undertaken by non-governmental organizations (M=1.41, SD=.62) and international organizations of which Serbia is a member and with which it has signed cooperation agreements (e.g. UNICEF) (M=1.32, SD=.63). In order to see if there is heterogeneity in terms of research in which the teachers are engaged, the number of research groups in which they have engaged so far has been registered. Based on the results obtained in this research, it can be assumed that the teachers on average engage in about three different research groups (M=3.48, SD=1.56).

Most teachers report assisting colleagues with their work (59.4%) and solving problems they encounter in their daily work (49.5%) as reasons why they engage in research. In addition, the motive for their engagement in research is acquiring new knowledge, gaining new experience and making new acquaintances (39.6%), as well as the significance, topicality, interestingness of the problem that is being looked into (36.6%). About ¼ of the teachers reports that they engage in research just because it is a kind of work obligation which cannot be (always) refused (25.7%).

The teachers evaluated satisfaction with the engagement in research so far by using a five-point Likert (Likert-type) scale. Most teachers state that they are satisfied (39.6%), that is, undecided on the matter (35.6%). Far fewer of them are not satisfied (14.9%), while very few teachers opt for extreme poles of the scale: I am very satisfied (6.9%) and I am not satisfied at all (3.0%). The registered value of the arithmetic mean is M=3.33 (SD=.92). A small number of teachers, 31 in total, made suggestions that could contribute to their being even more satisfied with their own engagement in research. Among them are the following suggestions: encouraging a higher level of interest and motivation of teachers to take part in research projects as well as a greater engagement of teachers in research activities (6); providing more opportunities for engaging teachers in different research groups (4). In addition to the above, the teachers stated that it was necessary to work on making assumptions for the obtained research results to be put into practice (5), that is, to investigate current problems for which solutions can be applied by teachers in their work (4).

When the classroom teachers and the subject teachers are compared in terms of frequency of engagement in the selected research groups, the obtained arithmetic mean values indicate that the classroom teachers engage more often in research undertaken by employees in the school where they work, students and educational

authorities, whereas the subject teachers engage more often in research conducted by scientific institutions, non-governmental and international organisations. However, statistically significant differences between these two groups of teachers were registered only in relation to the research whose initiators and implementers are students ($t_{(101)}$=2.49, p=.015). The results show that the classroom teachers engage more often in this research (M=2.72, SD=.67) in relation to the subject teachers (M=2.35, SD=.80).

Differences were also registered between the classroom teachers and the subject teachers regarding the reasons for engagement in research. More classroom teachers state that their motive to engage in research is solving problems they encounter in their own work, assisting colleagues in their work, as well as the attitude that it is a work obligation which cannot be (always) refused. In contrast, a larger number of subject teachers states that their motives include acquiring new knowledge, gaining new experience, making new acquaintances as well as the significance, topicality, interestingness of the problem that is being looked into. Statistically significant differences were registered only in relation to the reason – solving problems they encountered in their work ($\chi^2(1)$=6.23, p=.013, Cramer's V=.25). A much larger number of classroom teachers (63.6%), in comparison to the subject teachers (38.6%), states that reason.

According to the obtained arithmetic mean values, the subject teachers are more satisfied with their own engagement in research than the classroom teachers. However, the registered difference is not statistically significant ($t_{(99)}$=-.17, p=.864).

Conclusion

The frequency of engagement in different research groups has been assessed by the teachers with average grades ranging from M=1.32 to M=2.50. On this basis, and at the same time given that the theoretical range of the scale is from 1 (never) to 4 (often), it can be concluded that the grades obtained concentrate around the frequency category marked on the scale as – very rarely. On the other hand, the teachers are moderate when assessing satisfaction with their own engagement in research. The result that just around ⅓ of the teachers is very satisfied (5.4%), that is, satisfied (31.0%), provides a basis for assuming that their expectations have not been met in this respect. Most of them think that teachers lack motivation, interest and willingness to be engaged in the research.

The fact that approximately half of the teachers (49.5%) recognise the potential of research as a starting point in solving the problems they encounter in work is encouraging. This is also indicated by the results of the related research done by practitioners in school (Van Katwijk et al., 2019). However, based on the results obtained in this research, differences were registered between the classroom teachers and the subject teachers in this regard. The aforementioned reason indicates a considerably higher number of classroom teachers (63.6%) in relation to the subject teachers (38.6%). The explanations for such difference can be the following: classroom teachers and subject teachers complete initial education at different institutions and accordingly they attend different study programmes; classroom teachers teach several subjects in one class, while subject teachers teach the same subject in several classes; then, their beliefs about a teacher as a researcher or their attitudes towards the function of school practice research, etc., may differ.

In this research, different statistical values were recorded for the classroom teachers and the subject teachers in relation to frequency, reasons and satisfaction with engagement in research. However, the existence of statistically significant differences, in addition to the reason stated for engagement in research, was indicated just in relation to the frequency of their engagement in research undertaken by students (the classroom teachers − M=2.72, SD=.666; the subject teachers − M=2.35, SD=.799). Such results demonstrate that research about determinants which shape teachers' behaviour in relation to engagement in research requires involvement of a wide variety of factors (Griffioen, 2019).

Acknowledgments

This paper is the results of the projects *Models of evaluation and strategies for improvement of education quality in Serbia* (No 179060), financially supported by the Ministry of Education, Science, and Technological Development of the Republic of Serbia.

References

Check, J. & Schutt, R. K. (2012): *Research Methods in Education*. Boston: University of Massachusetts.

Cochran Smith, M. & Lytle, S. L. (2009): *Inquiry as Stance: Practitioner Research for the Next Generation.* New York: Teachers College Press.

Griffioen, D. M. (2019): The influence of undergraduate students' research attitudes on their intentions for research usage in their future professional practice. *Innovations in Education & Teaching International*, 56(2), 162-172.

Hammersley, M. (1993): On the Teacher as Researcher. *Educational Action Research*, 1(3), 425-445.

Hebib, E. & Matović, N. (2012): Istraživački rad školskog pedagoga. *Nastava i vaspitanje*, 61(1), 67-83.

Jurić, V. (2004): *Metodika rada školskog pedagoga*. Zagreb: Školska knjiga.

Kemmis, S. (2004): *Becoming Critical*. London: Routledge Farmer.

Krnjaja, Ž. (2014): Pedagog kao istraživač. U *Januarski susreti pedagoga / Nacionalni naučni skup: Identitet profesije pedagog u savremenom obrazovanju*, *Zbornik radova*. 31.01. – 01.02. 2014 (str. 8-15). Beograd: Institut za pedagogiju i andragogiju Filozofskog fakulteta Univerziteta u Beogradu i Pedagoško društvo Srbije.

Lankshear, C. & Knobel, M. (2004): *A Handbook for Teacher Research: From Design to Implementation*. New York: Open University Press.

Marzano, R. J., Parsley, D., Gagnon, D. J., Jennifer, S. & Norford, J. S. (2019): Teacher as Researcher. https://www.marzanoresearch.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/Teacher-as-Researcher_12.19.2019.pdf (Accessed 20 January 2020).

Pešić, M. (2004): Istraživanja praktičara. In M. Pešić (Ed.) *Pedagogija u akciji* (str. 58-74). Beograd: Institut za pedagogiju i andragogiju Filozofskog fakulteta Univerziteta u Beogradu.

Radulović, L. (2011): *Obrazovanje nastavnika za refleksivnu praksu*. Beograd: Filozofski fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu.

Radulović, L. (2013): Teacher research: From theoretically-conceptual framework to the landmarks for practice. In M. Despotović, E. Hebib & B. Németh (Eds.) *Contemporary*

Issues of Education Quality (pp. 439-455). Belgrade: Institute for Pedagogy and Andragogy, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Belgrade and Faculty of Adult Education and HRD, University of Pécs.

Stanković, D., Radišić, J., Buđevac, N., Jošić, S. & Baucal, A. (2015): *Nastavnik kao istraživač – priručnik za nastavnike*. Beograd: Ministarstvo prosvete, nauke i tehnološkog razvoja Republike Srbije.

Van Katwijk, L., Berry, A., Jansen, E. & Van Veen, K. (2019): "It's important, but I'm not going to keep doing it!": Perceived purposes, learning outcomes, and value of pre-service teacher research among educators and pre-service teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 86. https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0742051X18317293 (Accessed 20 January 2020).

Vogrinc, J. & Valenčič Zuljan, M. (2009): Action Research in School: An Important Factor in Teachers' Professional Development. *Educational Studies*, 35(1), 53-68.

Wang, Y., Kretschmer, R. E. & Hartman, M. C. (2010): Teacher as Researcher: Theory into Practice. *American Annals of the Deaf*, 155(2), 105-109.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Nataša Matović, University of Belgrade, Serbia

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Emina Hebib, University of Belgrade, Serbia

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Klara Skubic Ermenc

Approaches to Inclusive Education in Slovenia from a Comparative Angle

Abstract

Many countries change their education systems in order to make them more inclusive. Yet, the way inclusion is understood and implemented, varies greatly. This paper describes key elements of inclusive policy in Slovenia. The policy is evaluated against Haug's three stages of the development of the concept of inclusion and Opertti, Walker and Zhang's four core approaches that prevail in the international arena. Research method adopted is document analysis. The analysis builds on Olivera's concept of the second-degree use of the comparative data. The findings indicate that Slovenian policy primarily reflects a human rights-based understanding of inclusion, focused on students with special needs. The author aims to provide a foundation for further comparative research on inclusion.

Keywords: inclusive education, inclusive policy in Slovenia, integration, students with special needs, marginalised groups

Introduction

Opertti, Walker and Zhang (2014) stated: "Countries at large are becoming increasingly aware of the need to revamp the educational system as they attempt to make inclusion truly effective" (p. 151). However, the way it is implemented and how inclusion is understood vary largely (Arduin, 2015; Florian, 2014; Mitchell, 2015). Haug (2017) identified three stages of the concept's development, while Opertti, Walker and Zhang (2014) described four core approaches that prevail in the international arena and reflect the development of inclusive education. Both these classifications will serve as methodological tools for analysing and evaluating the Slovenian approach to inclusion in education. This paper is divided into three sections. The first section provides a brief discussion on both classifications, the second section explains the methodology framework, and the third one presents and discusses the main findings.

Theoretical background

Haug (2017) identified three stages of the development of the concept of inclusion: (1) integration, (2) a narrow understanding of inclusion, and (3) a broad understanding of inclusion. Integration started in the 1960s, when some countries began to include students with special needs (SEN students) in mainstream schools. This phase was primarily connected to the placement of SEN students in mainstream schools and the organisation of education (Lesar, 2009; Florian, 2014). A narrow understanding of integration appeared in the USA in the 1970s. This type of understanding devotes specific attention to the pedagogical process. Based on this understanding, SEN students should be educated alongside their peers from their

local area, while simultaneously having access to differentiated and individualised support, adapted programmes and adapted assessment in accordance with their abilities and interests. Finally, a broad understanding of inclusion is based on fundamentally different premises than the previous ones in that it proceeds from the belief that a school has to accept diversity as the positive starting point for its activity. In a broad understanding, inclusion is no longer tied merely to SEN students. Rather, it applies simultaneously to all students facing disabilities in learning and participation (Lesar, 2009) and to students in general, since it is the responsibility of the school to establish learning conditions for all children and to teach them to live with diversity.

Establishing broad understanding is a major challenge that requires the coherent functioning of the entire system (from legislation, programmes and learning materials to school organisation and the level of instruction and relationships). It also requires a change in existing mentality and pedagogical practices; the idea of high-quality teaching is in the foreground of a broad understanding of inclusion. The teacher must, above all, accept diversity as a positive value and be sensitive and responsive to differences between children (Ermenc, Jeznik & Mažgon, 2019). As pointed out by Lesar and Žveglič Mihelič (2018):

> *The ongoing re-examination of all pedagogical processes in light of inclusion/exclusion of every child and his/her subsequent learning, social and personal development is crucial […]. Adaptations to teaching and/or upbringing are therefore not subject to a fixed formal status (e.g., student with SEN), which the child acquires outside his/her school; instead (pre)school teachers first try to solve—by themselves and in collaboration with the child and his/her parents—the difficulty or the problem that has appeared.* (p. 3)

Opertti, Walker and Zhang (2014) identified the following four core approaches that have prevailed in the international education arena:

1. **Human rights-based perspective**. This perspective has its roots in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The rights-based approach (i.e., all humans have the right to education; all children have the right to receive an education that does not discriminate on the basis of disability, ethnicity, religion, language, gender, capabilities or any other reason) built the foundation for the development of inclusive education and pedagogy.
2. **Response to children with special needs**. Since the adoption of the World Declaration on Education for All in 1990, an overall vision of universal access to education for all children, youth and adults, as well as equity among all, has been promoted. The Salamanca Statement and Framework for Action on Special Needs Education (1994) was particularly important to this perspective because of "the focus it brought to mainstreaming students with special needs into regular schools, along with the prioritization of targeted excluded groups linked to ethnic, gender, cultural, socio-economic, and migrant factors" (Opertti, Walker & Zhang, 2014, pp. 152-153). This approach views inclusion from the deficitarian perspective (e.g., from the perspective of students' problems/handicaps).
3. **Response to marginalised groups**. After 2000, particularly with the adoption of the Dakar Framework for Action, more emphasis was placed on expanding the notion of inclusive education; more groups began to be considered marginalised, while the issue of quality education for all

simultaneously moved to the foreground of the discussion. Governments have been encouraged to allocate more resources to certain excluded groups.

4. **Transforming the education system**. Ten years after the adoption of the Dakar Framework, the UNESCO EFA Monitoring Report emphasized the role of inclusive education as a condition for developing more inclusive societies. The report supported the idea of linking equity and quality policies and explained inclusion as a "continually evolving process (a journey) to respect, understand, address and respond to learners' diversities, entailing changes in the educational system at large" (p. 157). Such a perspective can be called transformative, provided that it is implemented alongside a global vision of education and a holistic perspective of the education system.

Research approach

Research aim and questions

This paper attempts to describe key elements of inclusive policy in Slovenia as well as to evaluate this policy against Haug's (2017) three stages of development and Opertti, Walker and Zhang's (2014) comparative framework. For these purposes, the following research questions were selected:

1. Does an official or prevailing definition of inclusion exist in Slovenia? Are any specific target groups defined?
2. Does the country provide separate programmes for typical and SEN students, or one integrative programme/curriculum?
3. How is the placement of SEN students in mainstream or special schools regulated?
4. How is teacher education organised? Does it separate mainstream teachers from special teachers? What is the prevailing understanding of inclusion among faculty?
5. How are schools prepared to work in inclusive environments?

Research method and sources

Document analysis was adopted as the research method. The data were gathered through primary or secondary sources. Primary sources comprise first-hand data (Olivera, 1988), that is, legal documents and national data as well as already existing data (e.g., research findings conducted by Slovenian researchers). The analysis built on Olivera's (1988) concept of the second-degree use of the comparative data:

> *What is compared are not the groups (systems) as such, trait by trait or in their total and unique reality but the corresponding abstract models or relational patterns, which make comparison possible by transcending the uniqueness of individual systems.* (p. 180)

This paper aims to provide a foundation for further comparative research on inclusion, which would bring about deeper understanding beyond the differences arising from particular societal conditions.

The research context

After Slovenia gained independence from Yugoslavia in 1991, it undertook a reform of its entire education system, guided by principles based on human rights

and the rule of law. The reformers' aim was to develop a system in which people could achieve high education standards comparable to European ones (White Paper, 1996). Then, the education system focused on SEN children as well; the system supported the integration of SEN children into mainstream schools, and targeted provision or resources were put in place to benefit this group of students (e.g., disabled person's assistants, additional specialised assistance, aids, architectural adaptations, etc.). The last major changes were introduced in 2000, with the adoption of the Placement of Children with Special Needs Act (hereinafter: The Act), which has since undergone several amendments (Placement of Children, 2012).

Following international recommendations, Slovenia has introduced an integration model of education for pupils with SEN:

> *Slovenia did reform the former two-track into a multi-track school system …, but it retained the categorisation of children and the medical and professional discourse both in legislation and in professional documents.* (Lesar & Žveglič Mihelič, 2018, pp. 2-3)

As is typical of liberal policies, the Slovenian policy advocated the need to establish a system that would allow all participants, regardless of circumstances, to achieve optimum learning outcomes (White Paper, 1996). Despite this, little attention was paid to other marginalised groups besides SEN children, such as Roma, immigrants and children facing poverty (Lesar, 2017). After 2004, when Slovenia joined the EU, the educational authorities began to pay additional attention to students from immigrant backgrounds, and the Strategy for the Integration of Children from Migrant Backgrounds into the Education System was adopted in 2007 (Strategija vključevanja, 2007). However, the measures the strategy introduced have not been incorporated into a more universal, inclusive approach.

The findings

Definition and targeted groups

No universal inclusion policy exists in Slovenia that unifies policy measures targeted at all at-risk or identity groups (Lesar, 2017). In official documents, the term 'inclusion' is not used; instead, the term 'integration' is adopted. However, this term is used only in relation to SEN students. The Act defines the following groups as SEN students: children with learning difficulties, blind and visually impaired children, deaf and hearing impaired children, children with speech and language disorders, physically handicapped children, chronically ill children, children with deficits in specific areas of learning, children with autistic disorders and children with emotional and behavioural disorders who require the adapted provision of education programmes with additional specialised assistance or adapted education programmes/special education programmes (Article 2).

The programmes

The Act distinguishes between several types of education programmes (multi-track system):

- Education programmes with adapted provision and additional specialised assistance aimed at SEN students for whom adaptations in the provision of

the programme, which is otherwise identical to the mainstream primary curriculum, are sufficient.

- Adapted education programmes with equivalent performance criteria. These programmes include adaptations to the actual programmes for various groups of SEN students (e.g., deaf children). For example, lesson organisation, assessment methods, etc., are adapted. Additional specialised assistance is also provided.
- Adapted education programmes with lower performance criteria particularly aimed at students with mild learning difficulties.
- Special education programmes for students with moderate and severe learning difficulties.
- Education programmes aimed at students with behavioural and personality disorders.

The first two types of programmes are provided in mainstream schools, while the others are, as a rule, provided in specialised schools. An individual school can offer multiple programmes simultaneously, but in the case of lower performance criteria, these programmes are always provided in separate classes. The school prepares an individualised curriculum for every pupil enrolled in one of the above programmes that contains all the adaptations the student requires to participate equally in lessons and to achieve optimal learning objectives.

The Act also allows the enrolment of children with mild intellectual disabilities in mainstream schools and thus provides for the integration of standard and adapted programmes. However, this practice has not taken off because the basic conditions for the coordination of two or more programmes within a single class have not been met (Ermenc, Jeznik & Mažgon, 2019; Šelih, 2013).

The placement of SEN students

The Act provides that the decision on the manner of inclusion of pupils with SEN in the education system is made by the appropriate expert panel. During the placement process, this panel defines the special needs of the pupils in question and places them in one of several education programmes for SEN pupils in accordance with their needs. Lesar and Žveglič Mihelič (2018) argued that the placement and integration of SEN students in Slovenian education is still marked by the special educationists' viewpoint, a psycho-medical paradigm, professional discourse and assimilation of the child into a rigid, everyday school-life.

Teacher education and faculty attitudes

Future teachers follow a two-track system of study that separates the study of special and rehabilitation pedagogy from general pedagogical programmes (Ermenc, Jeznik & Mažgon, 2019). The education of SEN pupils receives more attention in pedagogical programmes than does the education of other vulnerable groups of learners (Messner, Worek & Peček, 2016). However, both types of teacher education programmes are still largely characterised by the medical deficit approach to special educational needs and discourses of inability/incapability. One group of experts has proved that SEN students do not perform as well in mainstream schools (Rovšek, 2013; Slavec Gornik, 2016), while another group has proved the opposite (Seničar & Kobal Grum, 2012; Lesar & Smrtnik Vitulič, 2014). Among some

university teachers, there is a movement towards a pedagogical discourse that views everyone as being capable of learning and participating (Lesar, 2009; Rutar, 2016).

School involvement

A five-stage model of learning support has lately challenged the "mainstream–special" divide. Instead, schools are encouraged to grade the level of support according to the individual student's needs: (1) support provided by teachers (remedial and supplementary lessons), (2) support provided by school counsellors, (3) individual or group additional learning support, (4) support provided by external experts, and (5) inclusion of a student in the education programme with adapted provision and additional specialised assistance. However, since schools must find their own resources, the model has not been fully implemented (Lesar & Žveglič Mihelič, 2018).

Conclusion

Slovenian policy primarily reflects a human rights-based understanding (Opertti, Walker & Zhang's first approach), and a narrow understanding of inclusion (Haug) focused on students with special needs (Opertti, Walker & Zhang's second approach). Students with official SEN status are subject to specific rights, yet these rights are based on the diagnosis of their deficits. More groups have begun to be considered marginalised, particularly students from migrant backgrounds (Opertti, Walker & Zhang's third approach), yet the categorisation of children and the medical and professional discourse, psycho-medical paradigm and assimilation of a child into a rigid everyday school-life still prevail.

Thus, Slovenia combines both approaches, the first and second and is gradually moving towards the third one. The transformative approach is currently recognised by some researchers who claim that inclusion should ultimately be a synthesis of human rights and transformative approaches. The classical liberal discourse gives priority to protecting individual rights, including special rights for everyone in a disadvantaged position (Rawls, 1971). However, it simultaneously overlooks the importance of establishing an inclusive society based on solidarity (Kymlicka, 2005). Implementing measures for specific disadvantaged groups assumes the deficitary nature of these individuals or groups who, therefore, enjoy special assistance (Thomas, 2013). In contrast, a broad or transformative understanding of inclusion places in the foreground the values of the common good, equality, coexistence and cooperation, and it is inseparably connected to a different view of the child or the student. In this understanding, the student is no longer understood through the prism of a deviation from the 'normal', but as a person capable of learning (Reindal, 2016) who brings a new quality to the life of the community.

Acknowledgements

The author acknowledges that the project P5-0174 *Pedagogical and andragogical studies - Learning and education for a good quality life in community* was financially supported by the Slovenian Research Agency.

References

Arduin, S. (2015): A review of the values that underpin the structure of an education system and its approach to disability and inclusion. *Oxford Review of Education*, 41(1), 105-121.

Ermenc, K. S., Jeznik, K. & Mažgon, J. (2019): *Inclusion - a general pedagogical concept*. Integrationspädagogik in Forschung und Praxis, Bd. 24. Hamburg: Verlag Dr. Kovač.

Florian, L. (2014): What counts as evidence of inclusive education? *European Journal of Special Needs Education*, 29(3), 286-294.

Haug, P. (2017): Understanding inclusive education: ideals and reality. *Scandinavian Journal of Disability Research*, 19(3), 206-217.

Kymlicka, W. (2005): *Sodobna politična filozofija. Uvod*. Ljubljana: Krtina.

Lesar, I. (2009): *Šola za vse? Ideja inkluzije v šolskih sistemih*. Ljubljana: Pedagoška fakulteta.

Lesar, I. (2017): Mapping inclusive education within the discipline of Pedagogy. Comparative analysis of new study programmes in Slovenia. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, DOI: 10.1080/13603116.2017.140237

Lesar, I. & Smrtnik Vitulič, H. (2014): Self-esteem of deaf and hard of hearing students in regular and special schools. *European Journal of Special Needs Education*, 29(1), 59-73.

Lesar, I. & Žveglič Mihelič, M. (2018): Beliefs of university staff teaching in pedagogical study programmes on concept(s) of inclusiveness – the case of Slovenia. *International Journal of Inclusive Education*, DOI: 10.1080/13603116.2018.1488186

Messner, E., Worek, D. & Peček, M. (Eds.) (2016): *Teacher education for multilingual and multicultural settings*. Graz: Leykam.

Mitchell, D. (2015): Inclusive education is a multi-faceted concept. *CEPS journal: Center for Educational Policy Studies Journal*, 5(1), 9-30.

Olivera, C. E. (1988): Comparative education: towards a basic theory. *Prospects. Quarterly Review of Education*, 18/2, 167-185.

Opertti, R., Walker, Z. & Zhang, Y. (2014): Inclusive education: From targeting groups and schools to achieving quality education as the core of EFA. In L. Florian (Ed.) *The SAGE handbook of special education*, 2nd Edition, Vol. 1 (pp. 149-169). London: SAGE.

Placement of Children With Special Needs Act (2012): Uradni list RS, no. 58/11, 40/12 – ZUJF in 90/12.

Rawls, J. (1971): *A theory of justice*. Cambridge, MA: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.

Reindal, S. M. (2016): Discussing inclusive education: An inquiry into different interpretations and a search for ethical aspects of inclusion using the capabilities approach. *European Journal of Special Needs Education*, 31(1), 1-12.

Rovšek, M. (2013): Značilnosti usmerjanja otrok in mladostnikov z motnjami v duševnem razvoju (doktorska disertacija). Ljubljana: Univ. v Ljubljani, Pedagoška fakulteta.

Rutar, S. (2016): Dynamic interaction of literacy development, positive recognition and child participation – a pathway towards a high-quality teacher education and educational process. In E. Messner, D. Worek & M. Peček (Eds.) *Teacher education for multilingual and multicultural settings* (pp. 42-51). Graz: Leykam.

Šelih, A. (2013): The legal obligations of the Republic of Slovenia arising from integrating children with special needs, especially children with mental development disorders, into regular schools. *Sodobna pedagogika*, 64(2), 64-74.

Seničar, M. & Kobal Grum, D. (2012): Self-concept and social support among adolescents with disabilities attending special and mainstream schools. *Croatian review of rehabilitation research*, 48(1), 73-83.

Slavec Gornik, A. (2016): Students with Special Needs and Their Attainment in the National Mathematics Examination. *Matematika v šoli*, XXII (3/4), 21-40.

Strategija vključevanja otrok, učencev in dijakov migrantov v sistem vzgoje in izobraževanja v republiki Sloveniji (2007): Ljubljana: MŠŠ RS, Kolegij ministrstva.

The Salamanca statement and framework for action on special needs education (1994): Adopted by the World Conference on Special Needs Education: Access and Quality. Salamanca, Spain, 7-10 June.

Thomas, G. (2013): A review of thinking and research about inclusive education policy, with suggestions for a new kind of inclusive thinking. *British Educational Research Journal*, 39(3), 473-490.

White paper on education in the Republic of Slovenia (1996): Ljubljana: Ministry of Education and Sport.

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Klara Skubic Ermenc, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Oliver Tafadzwa Gore

Capabilities That Matter Most for Disadvantaged Students in South African Universities

Abstract

Inequality and inequity of outcomes persist in South African higher education despite policies to redress the effects of apartheid, which segregated black people from accessing good quality education. Policy in higher education uses the concept 'historically disadvantaged' in its interventions aimed to address inequality but the desired outcomes have not been achieved as higher education institutions particularly universities seem to struggle to create conducive environments for all students to participate successfully. Lack of clarity on what needs to be addressed and prioritised could be blamed for the ineffective interventions. Using the capability approach as advanced by Amartya Sen and Martha Nussbaum, the paper identifies the most significant capabilities for student disadvantage, which universities should focus on in their interventions. This paper draws from semi-structured qualitative interviews from 26 diverse students from one South African university to argue that when students lack the financial income, affiliation and personal tenacity and hard work capabilities, their lives were affected the most. To that end, it is recommended that higher education institutions should prioritise to address these capabilities to ensure equal access, participation and success for all students.

Keywords: capabilities, disadvantage, higher education, equality, social justice, South Africa

Introduction

The South African higher education experiences persistent inequalities despite policy interventions aimed to create equal access, participation and success of students. The post-1994 democratic governments introduced reforms to redress the effects of apartheid's policies that segregated the non-white races from accessing good quality education and participating in the economy. In doing so, higher education policy uses the concept 'historically disadvantaged', a term that has never been defined in policy documents, in its interventions to address these disparities. This is through widening participation of black students in universities, offering academic support programmes to underprepared black students and providing financial support to deserving but financially disadvantaged black students (Department of Education, 1997). While such strategies have been adopted, the interventions have not achieved the desired results. Participation and success of students is skewed in favour of white students, for example participation rate is at 16% for African compared to 50% of white students while completion rates stood at 55% for African and 65% for white students in the three-year degree programmes in 2016 (Council on Higher Education, 2018). This raises questions on the appropriateness of the strategies adopted, especially those seeking to redress historical 'disadvantage' by policy. Despite the frequent use of 'disadvantage' by policy, there is lack of clarity on the meaning of the term. As a result, some

universities prioritise addressing what policy did not intend to focus on when others and faculties within same universities adopt different definitions of the term (Leibowitz & Bozalek, 2015). This contributes to ineffective interventions in universities and hence perpetuates the existing inequality and social injustices in higher education.

The capability approach

This paper adopts the capability approach as advanced by Amartya Sen (1999) and Martha Nussbaum (2000) to understand disadvantage in higher education and identifies the critical dimensions that interventions need to concentrate on. Central to the capability approach is that when measuring interpersonal advantage, we do so using the opportunities individuals have to achieve in higher education and not through their income. This is due to the fact that the income is a means to an end, which is wellbeing; and therefore does not show the quality of life one has (Sen, 1999). Key to the capability framework are 'capabilities' which are the 'freedoms' or 'effective opportunities' students have, and 'functionings, the achievements made from the opportunities' (Robeyns, 2017, p. 39). The individuals' abilities to turn the resources into accomplishment is influenced by the conversion factors, that is the personal and environmental factors enabling or constraining individuals from achieving what they have a reason to value (Robeyns, 2017).

Another aspect of the capability approach is agency which refers to one's ability to make autonomous decisions to act and effect change (or not act) to achieve certain goals (Sen, 1999). Advantage is when students have a wider set of capabilities and agency to convert resources into functionings, and the converse is true. The capability approach has been adopted in this paper for it focusing on individual students' wellbeing and not their income, recognising student diversity such as race, gender and socio-economic status and how these interact together; and paying attention to constraining or enabling factors affecting students' lives (Robeyns, 2017). The approach enables us to have a multidimensional and complex understanding of disadvantage through showing how students' lives are affected through lacking certain effective opportunities.

Literature review

Using the capability approach, studies have investigated students' experiences in higher education to promote equity and social justice in South Africa. For example, in her study on student transition from schooling and access to university Wilson-Strydom (2015) establishes the following capabilities that students value: being able to think reasonably and critically in one's studies; being able to learn and apply knowledge to different situations; having educational resilience; having social relations and networks; treating others with respect and dignity and recognition, language competence and confidence; and having emotional health. Mutanga (2019) reveals that students with disabilities value being able to move freely in the classrooms, being treated with dignity and recognition, and having their identity, culture and voice recognised. Although these studies use the capability approach in understanding students' experiences, they do not focus specifically on defining disadvantage. In his study Gore (2018) demonstrates that disadvantage is complex

and multidimensional and constitutes the following capability dimensions: financial income; being able to think critically about knowledge, being able to participate in class and having ones' voice heard, having mental and emotional health, having self determination to work hard and rebounding despite the hardships, being able to get employment after graduating, having empathy and appreciating diversity, and being able to move safely to and from the campus. These capabilities are important for student disadvantage and what needs to be emphasised is that they intersect to improve or worsen students' lives at the university.

While Gore's (2018) study presents a general list of capabilities that disadvantage students, these capabilities are not weighted and do not tell us which capabilities do matter most for students to have equal opportunities to succeed at the university. This paper fills this gap and attempts to identify the most significant capabilities for student disadvantage, which universities ought to prioritise and promote to ensure equal participation and success of students. The argument presented in this paper is that it might be difficult for universities to provide all the capabilities that students value at the same time. This is especially true considering the context of South Africa which has high inequality in its society but limited resources. Identifying the most important capabilities for student disadvantage is therefore pertinent for targerted and effective interventions to promote equal participation and fairer outcomes among diverse students.

Methodolody

The findings in this paper are based on empirical data from semi-structured qualitative interviews obtained from 26 honours and final years students from diverse backgrounds in one South African middle ranked and historically white university. The study drew students from four university departments which were selected to ensure diversity. The semi-structured interviews were fully transcribed before coding, thematic and conceptual analysis and identification of all the capabilities that students valued and these have been listed above (Gore, 2018). The weighting of the capabilities in this paper is based on what participants indicated that they valued in higher education, that is, all the capabilies that emerged from students experiences. A further evaluation of these capabilities was done to establish the most significant ones, which when not present, students lives are affected the most.

The most significant capabilities for student disadvantage

The financial income, affiliation, and personal tenacity and hard work emerged as the most significant capabilities that students value for equal participation and success.

Financial income capability

The evidence from the data shows that without the capability of financial income, students cannot access and participate effectively in university activities. Botle, who is an orphan explains:

> *I struggled to register at the university because my grandparents [who took care of me] did not have money. I got accepted by the university in 2010 soon after my matric but I could not enroll because I did not have the tuition money. So instead, I*

> *got a job until 2012 when I was awarded a bursary by the Department of Education.* (Botle, black, female, Honours in Education)

Botle's case, shows us how disadvantage plays out when students do not have sufficient finances for their studies. Given that the National Student Financial Aid Scheme bursary was not adequately funding all deserving students at that time, Botle could not access university when she completed her schooling in 2010, and only managed to secure funding two years later. This means that without this capability she would not have accessed the university at all, since her family could not afford to pay for her to attend university. Her case represents that of many black students from low-income backgrounds who meet the entry requirements for university but fail to enrol due to lack of funding. The point to be emphasised here is that without the capability, students cannot access the university environment to develop other capabilities. Even when they accessed university, most students from low-income and the emerging black middle class experienced financial hardships when their parents could not afford basic needs such as accommodation, transport fees, food, clothing, textbooks, airtime and toiletries. During their undergraduate studies, the findings show that some students also dropped out of university because they could not afford university tuition, meaning that lacking the capability of adequate finance disadvantages students.

Although the new policy on free university education introduced in South Africa in 2018 exempts low-income students whose families earn below R350 000 per annum from paying university tuition, the funding only benefits those who enrolled since the beginning of that year, to the exclusion of those who had already registered. Finally, financial income is a meta-capability because it also fosters the capability of socio-psychosocial and mental health. The results reveal that students tended to be stress free when the financial income capability was present but were often worried during its absence, which diminished their opportunities to succeed.

Affiliation capability

In addition to the above, affiliation seems to be vital to students' success. The evidence suggests that the capability helps students to develop other capabilities. Students tended to perform better when they were affiliated with social and religious groups and when they had open relationships with their lecturers. These social interactions created conditions for students to receive academic, emotional and psychological support, along with enhancement of their confidence. Hendrick felt comfortable to approach lecturers and peers, which helped him to perform better in his studies:

> *I had good relationships with my lecturers and I visited them especially when I needed information on assignments and what to expect on the oncoming tests. I approached lecturers to ask them what they thought were important areas for the module and they indeed helped me.* (Henrick, white, male, Honours in Agricultural Economics)

The point to make here is that when students have social and academic support from family, peers, and lecturers, they are better prepared to overcome the conversion factors that make them vulnerable to poor academic performance and dropping out. The capability remains crucial in their learning, consequently positioning it as one of the essential capabilities. As social interactions inherently

characterise teaching, universities should foster the development of this capability amongst the students. To be lacking in the affiliation capability implies that students cannot achieve the primary goal of attending university, which is to acquire knowledge and develop critical thinking skills. This positions the affiliation capability as architectonic in higher education and in our understanding of disadvantage.

Personal tenacity and hard work capability

The data from the interviews demonstrate that most of the low-income black students experienced the clustering of disadvantages. What makes the capability critical for disadvantage is that these students overcame the difficulties that threatened their opportunities to progress and graduate. Additionally, it matters most because of its emphasis on students' abilities to recover and complete their studies after failing some of their first and second-year modules. Unarine who attended a township school that offers poor quality education accounts:

> *My first year was a bad one. I wasn't performing well. At some point I thought that I should just quit varsity because I was failing my modules. I repeated two or three modules before passing them. I didn't know much about lecture consultation hours and the importance of tutorials. I slowly got used to the system in my department and received the second-year best student award in my second year.* (Unarine, black, female, Honours in Education)

This is related to the agency students had, that is the self-efficacy and beliefs they had in accomplishing the things thay have a reason to value. Bandura (1994) asserts that individuals with a high sense of self-efficacy are likely to accomplish the things they have a reason to value because they attribute their failure to insufficient effort and lack of knowledge. This results in them working hard as personal accomplishments reduce their stress and contribute to their greater wellbeing. This means that after failing their modules, these students rebounded and worked harder, resulting in them passing their modules.

The low-income (black) students' success is attributed surprisingly partly to their low-income backgrounds, responsibilities to take care of siblings, and the need to improve their situations and future lives. Palesa observes:

> *The hardships from my family background helped me to become strong and I knew that I had to work hard. I knew that I had a brother and a sister to take care of. So, I wanted to graduate so that I can change their lives too. When I was growing up, I learnt that things are not going to come to me but I had to fetch them. So far, I have reached the level that I wanted to be.* (Palesa, black, female, Honours in Psychology)

Students' determination to succeed can be formidable and is certainly admirable. The capability is closely related to being able to aspire when students envisage better lives in their futures. Bandura (1994) explains this through role modelling, that is when one sees other people with similar backgrounds succeeding through their efforts. For example, Katleho a black male student enrolled for the BEd programme because teachers were respected in his community. He believed that it was through working hard and graduating that he would attain the same level of respect as his teachers.

Conclusion

The findings suggest that universities should foster the capability of personal tanacity among the low-income groups so that they can overcome the challenges they face in the university environment they are unfamilar with. Lessons can therefore be drawn from the experiences of low-income black students who successfully completed their degree programmes, and these skills can be enhanced to other low-income students in their first year of university. Equally important, universities should enhance the economic capability for students to access, participate and succeed in their studies through financial support to the needy students. Finally, the affiliation capability should be fostered through universities promoting students to participate in university social events such as sporting activities and religious groups so that they establish social network for support. Pedagogical practices that promote interactions between the students themselves and with lecturers are also key aspects of affiliation which universities should promote. This can be accomplished through encouraging students to be open-minded and value different views; employing teaching practices that promote peer learning and group work amongst diverse students; and promoting interactive learning.

In conclusion, this paper has identified the effective freedoms students valued, which the university ought to address for equal participation namely; economic stability, affiliation and personal tenacity. Although other capabilities are important as reflected in the literature, this paper highlighted the capabilities that when students do not have them, they are most affected and are unlikely to graduate and achieve what they have a reason to value in higher education. It has also recommended on how the universities should foster these most significant capabilities among all students. In this paper, the capability approach has allowed us to examine disadvantage beneath the surface, and more particularly to establishing which areas should university prioritise for interventions. The paper also shows that the capability approach deviates from the deficit approach, which conceptualises students as lacking, through recognising the role of students' agency to make decisions and employ strategies to overcome the clustered disadvantages.

Acknowledgements

This research was funded through the South African Research Chair Initiative of the Department of Science and Technology and the National Research Foundation of South Africa (grant number 86540).

References

Bandura, A. (1994): Self-efficacy. In I. V. S. Ramachaudran (Ed.) *Encyclopedia of human behaviour* (pp. 71-81). New York: Academic Press.

Council on Higher Education (2018): *The National Plan for Higher Education (2001) targets: Have they been met?* Pretoria: Council on Higher Education.

Department of Education (1997): Education White Paper 3: A Programme for the Trasformation of Higher Education. *Government Gazette*, 386 (18207).

Gore, O. T. (2018): Students' experiences of and perspectives on (dis)advantage: a case study at a South African university. Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of the Free State.

Leibowitz, B. & Bozalek, V. (2015): Foundation Provision – a social justice perspective. Part 1: A leading article. *South African Journal of Higher Education*, 29(1), 08-25.

Mutanga, O. (2019): *Students with Disabilities and the Transition to Work: A Capabilities Approach*. London: Routledge.

Nussbaum, M. (2000): *Women and Human Development.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Robeyns, I. (2017): *Wellbeing, Freedom and Social Justice*. Cambridge: Open Book Publishers.

Sen, A. (1999): *Development as Freedom.* New York: Knopf.

Wilson-Strydom, M. (2015): *University Access and Success: Capabilities, Diversity and Social Justice*. New York: Routledge.

Dr. Oliver Gore, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

Dairai Darlington Dziwa & Louise Postma

Building Creative Capacities through Art Teacher Education in Zimbabwe

Abstract

The human capital in the Zimbabwean labour market lacks the capacities to critically and creatively address technological, economic and industrial challenges. The new education policy, Education 5.0 requires graduates to design solutions to these problems. This conceptual paper demonstrates that the required creative and critical skills necessary for innovation are currently not learnt and developed in higher education. Creative and critical thinking skills form the core objectives of art education, but are neglected and negated by stakeholders. A fluidity of skills rooted in basic and advanced competencies which are grounded in abilities such as critical thinking, communication, and creativity have been characteristic of Zimbabwean art teacher education programs and can be seen as transferable in addressing other challenges.

Keywords: creativity, critical thinking, transferability, innovation, problem solving

Introduction

Education aims to equip learners for the future (Winthrop & McGivney, 2016). Hunter communities taught children survival skills like crafting tools, tracking animals, distinguishing edible from poisonous plants, and how to negotiate with others. We now require education that can prepare children for a world of rapid change in technology, products and value (ibid). That is, education not fixed and bound by time and space but endowed with skills which are transferable. In this paper we argue that the knowledge and skills taught in art are relevant to meet contemporary and future challenges in various fields and disciplines including science and technology. Winthrop and McGivney (2016) suggest that education should provide skills that can enable students to be agile learners, able to adapt and learn in a fast-changing environment. This paper draws evidence from literature to argue that the skills valued at the core of art which are creativity, problem solving and critical thinking are the prerequisite skills for innovation and industrialisation (Riley, 2013; Festa, 2009; Reid et al., 2009). Artists have the unique ability to form novel, intuitive, imaginative ideas and produce creative and desirable innovative solutions to address economic, social, technical and industrial challenges.

Background

The goals of the Ministry of Higher and Tertiary Education, Science and Technology Development (MHTESTD) in Zimbabwe have been reformed in response to the hyper transformations which have affected the economy and industry in many negative ways (MHTESTD, 2019, *Strategic Plan*, p. 17). MHTESTD has therefore set new objectives to transform the ministry into an innovation and

industrial hub in order to change the economy by 2030. The strategic plan aims at developing innovative graduates with industrialisation drive who can think scientifically, analyse problems objectively and apply facts to problems in society (MHTESTD, 2019, *Strategic Plan*, p. ii). This implies reforming education goals to provide essential education needed for developing human capital of creative thinkers to solve problems within the socio-economic context of Zimbabwe. Creativity is channelled towards and limited by the need to solve socio-economic problems, while artistic creativity is negated and seen as non-essential.

Creativity is a complex feature which can be conceptualised from various perspectives. Beaty (2018) and Haridy (2018) agree that creativity is defined as the ability to come up with new and useful ideas. Therefore, novelty is the hallmark of creativity (Festa, 2009). Creative thinking calls for non-traditional thinking, different from the ordinary day to day practices (Wallas, in Sadler-Smith, 2016). The aims of art education enshrined in the UNESCO *Road Map* (2006) and the *Seoul Agenda* advance the core function of art education in human survival. UNESCO *Road Map for Arts Education* was a major outcome of the First World Art Conference held in Lisbon, Portugal, in 2006. The *Road Map* (2006) offered an important theoretical and practical framework that provided guidance for advancing the qualitative development and growth of arts education. A central goal of the Seoul Conference (2010) was to reassess and encourage further implementation of the *Road Map*. The *Seoul Agenda* (2010) is a concrete plan of action that integrates the substance of the *Road Map* within a structure of three broad goals, each accompanied by a number of practical strategies and specific action items. Among other things art aims to uphold the cultural participation and developing individual creative capabilities. Three broad aims from the *Seoul Agenda* (2010) reiterate that, firstly, art education is the foundation for balanced creative, cognitive, emotional, aesthetic and social development of children, youth and life-long learners. Secondly, the arts develop skills that are responsive to local needs, infrastructure and cultural contexts. The third goal states that applying art education principles and practices contribute to resolving the social and cultural challenges facing today's world.

The aim of this paper is to demonstrate how creative activities, critical and creative thinking that are inherent in art are key to innovation and industrialisation to support the education reforms in Zimbabwe higher education. Reid et al. (2009) illustrate how the process of thinking employed in design can be applied to the urban realm in order to find creative solutions to social issues within communities which would, in turn, facilitate the sustainable regeneration of an area. Creative thinking skills can become a personal aptitude which develops when dealing with changing social, technological, and economic demands even outside art education. Beaty (2018) indicates that people who did better on creative tasks also tended to have more creative hobbies and achievements. Exposing art students to creative activities enhances their ability to think creatively (ibid). Artistic creative skills are transferable to the fourth industrial revolution where creative and innovative solutions to social and economic issues in 21st century are demanded.

Paradoxical education 5.0 in Zimbabwe

Ever since Zimbabwe attained its independence in 1980, three key result areas for higher education (known as Education 3.0) namely, teaching, research and

community service were indicative of performance. To date, two more indicators, innovation and industrialization have been added to create a new doctrine called Education 5.0 meant to turn around the challenging economic and technological deficits (MHTESTD, 2019, *Strategic Plan*). To achieve this goal, tertiary education must now produce graduates who can think scientifically and analyse problems objectively (ibid, p. 11). Education 5.0 develops human capital that can apply the repository of knowledge to produce contextualised technological innovations for industry. The doctrine of heritage guides the new education policy by utilising indigenous resources to solve indigenous problems (ibid, p. ii).

Maths and Science have traditionally been envisioned as significant drivers of technology, innovation and productivity (Winthrop & McGivney, 2016; Friedman, 2014; Riley, 2013). Riley (2013) argues that science on its own cannot address these challenges. The STEM to STEAM movement has been consolidated in recent years as a positive mode of action to meet the demands of innovation, technology and industrialisation (Riley, 2013). STEM is an acronym for an educational approach to learning basing on Science, Technology, Engineering and Maths. STEAM is an educational approach which integrates STEM with Arts as access points which guide students to inquiry, critical thinking and problem solving (Riley, 2013).

STEM alone misses several key components that many employers, educators, and parents have voiced as critical to thrive in the present and future (Friedman, 2014). Riley (2013) argues that, while STEM initiatives are a wonderful start into the exploration of these four areas of study, they are still ritualistic. STEAM removes ritualised limitations and replaces them with wonder, critique, inquiry, creativity, imagination and innovation. According to Friedman (2014) Google currently employs people with high learning ability and advanced leadership skills, while content knowledge is rated lowly. Winthrop and McGivney (2016) allude to a study of technical and vocational students in Nigeria which showed that the socio-behavioural skill of self-efficacy was positively and significantly predictive of career adaptability. Strong skill foundations are important for developing advanced cognitive skills, socio-behavioural skills, and skills predictive of adaptability. Across the developing world higher-order thinking, social skills, and self-motivation are "highly valued by employers" (Friedman, 2014). The World Economic Forum 2018 reports that creativity and innovation are the skills of choice in the labour market. Innovation and industrialisation require application, creation and ingenuity (Friedman, 2014) instead of an understanding of subject content.

The *National Critical Skills Audit* (MHTESTD, 2018, *ZNCSA*, pp. vi-vii) summary emphasises the rejuvenation only of the science and technology sector to meet innovation and industrialisation demands. The questions arise whether and how innovation can be achieved in a curriculum that does not expose learners to creative thinking. In this paper we argue that exposing learners from all disciplines to art skills will enhance much required creative and innovative abilities within their distinctive fields of study.

The higher education system which has now been synchronised with the advent of a national qualifications framework should be geared in unison to produce critical and innovative graduates for industrialisation (MHTESTD, 2018, *ZNQF*). The horizontal comparability of education and training qualifications aligns all qualifications through minimum bodies of knowledge (MBKs). This level of content

planning omits and denies opportunities for the development of creative and critical thinking skills. All programs and qualifications in principle carry the mandate to drive Education 5.0 to success. The applied arts and humanities should leverage multi-dimensional creativity, entrepreneurship and technological innovation (MHTESTD, 2018, *ZNCSA*). Innovation is a critical drive for growth and prosperity but without art exposure it is ironically denied to Zimbabwe higher education graduates.

Creativity and creative thinking

The term creativity takes many forms in its definition and application. Creativity can be conceptualised as a product, process, personality or condition of environment (Wallas, 1926). It is a product when we see a new physical product of awe, distinction or novelty (Torrance, 1965). Sadler-Smith (2016) conceptualised creativity as a personality trait or individual ability to role taking, risk taking, facing challenges and bringing change. Eisner (2002) contends that creativity implies a condition of the environment for doing things differently, anew or significantly improved practice. Creativity is also viewed as a sensitisation to problems and solutions, deficiencies, gaps in knowledge, missing elements and disharmonies (Sadler-Smith, 2016). As a thinking process, creativity entails inventing new ideas and solutions (Beaty, 2018). Drucker (2002) from a business perspective defines innovation as the effort to create purposeful, focused change in an enterprise's economic or social potential. The innovation and industrialisation challenges of Zimbabwe are hinged on developing creative solutions.

There are several scientific explanations to the neurological processes of creative thinking. Beaty (2018) holds that the default, executive control and the salience brain networks are involved in creativity. The default network is a set of brain regions that activate when people are engaged in spontaneous thinking, such as mind-wandering, daydreaming and imagining. This network may play a key role in idea generation or brainstorming and finding solutions. The executive control network is the logical reasoning mind which plays a key role in idea evaluation or determining whether brainstormed idea actually work and modifying them to fit the creative goal. The salience network plays a key role in alternating between idea generation and idea evaluation. According to Beaty creative thinking only occurs when the three networks are activated and connected simultaneously. Cavdarbasha and Kurzek (2017) hold that the frontal cortex, hippocampus, basal ganglia and white matter support creative thinking. White matter, similar to the salience network, connects various brain structures during creative thinking (Beaty, 2018). The better connected the areas are, the better and faster the brain can process information and think creatively.

In the neurological creative thinking process, a well-connected brain may connect ideas quicker. Beaty (2018) and Cavdarbasha and Kurzek (2017) agree that these systems' synchrony seems to be important for creativity. Beaty (ibid.) postulates that the frequently creative thinking brain is better able to engage the different brain systems that don't typically work together. Haridy (2018) and Beaty (2018) found that people who often invent creative ideas and activities are better enabled to engage these brain networks and structures. Art students who by nature of

their discipline stretch their minds to regularly think creatively are better equipped to engage in creative thinking and solving problems outside art.

Creativity in art education aims

An activity's objective describes its inherent value and benefit (Reid et al., 2009; Festa, 2009). The aim of arts education is to assist the development of creativity, critical thinking and communication skills, and the nurture of aesthetic sensitivity and cultural awareness (UNESCO, 2006, *Road Map*, pp. 3-4; UNESCO, 2010, *Seoul Agenda*).

In art communication is mediated through visuals between the sender and receiver. The ability to develop visual literate students promotes sensitivity to the physical environment as one is more enabled to interpret visual stimuli. Visual literacy provides vehicles for the exploration of new alternatives in human relations and communications in science, technology and industrialisation which demand a pertinent visual problem-solving skill (Lanier, 1972). The new demands of our societies require that art education aims to cultivate a broad set of skills.

Another intrinsic value of the study of art is in the form of aesthetic experience (Lanier, 1972). Aesthetic experience implies the recognition of the character and importance of visual elements and principles in the environment (ibid). This aesthetic experience can create critical consciousness to search for new art experiences, seeing the relationships between the arts and the environment (Reid et al., 2009).

Critical thinking in art activities

Art students vacillate between the roles of artist as creator and reader-viewer during production and criticism respectively when reflecting on their own work or that of others. In both roles, the art activities provoke abundant opportunities for imagination, creative thinking and reconciliation with socio-cultural experiences.

Designer projects, painting and sculpture activities all demand high imagination and creativity, uniqueness and ingenuity from the artist. Art as a discipline lends itself to the development of problem awareness and the creation of innovative solutions.

Critical studies and discipline-based art education are art curriculum models which have components of engaging students in art reflection, appreciation, perception and criticism. When art students assume the reader-viewer position, they develop a critical awareness of the relationships between personal imagination, collective experience, and socio-cultural contexts (Reid et al., 2009). Festa (2009) argues that the critical engagement with a work of art as a viewer, acknowledges the contention of experience and interpretation between subjective response and objective reality. For instance, the ramification of such a relational engagement with a work of art such as *Mona Lisa* swings the mind between highly academic content and deep democratic emotions, the principles of balance and tonal values and the emotional presence of the gaze. Thus, art criticism, reflection, appreciation and perception practiced by the reader–viewer serve as opportunities for developing critical thinking not only for its own sake but for any other future visual engagements even outside the field of art (Eisner, 2002; Gardner, 2004).

Conclusions and recommendations

In order to achieve the Education 5.0 goals, higher education ought to be redirected towards developing creative and critical thinking capabilities. Higher level abilities including skills in self-directed learning, collaborative problem solving, and team building meet the innovation and industrialisation goal. Creativity and critical thinking are transferable skills and abilities, which can be applied to a wide range of different jobs and industries. Developing creativity and critical thinking skills moulds active learners who seek to disrupt ordinary thinking and practice and are courageous to understand complex subject matter.

Education systems need to develop participants who are dynamic, adaptive and able to transfer skills creatively and innovatively to respond to the needs of the workforce and industry. Jobs requiring analytical or creative and innovative skills are on the rise.

Therefore, education goals are recommended to focus on:

(1) development of citizens whose response to the whole spectrum of the visual arts is disruptive, critical, flexible and adaptable;
(2) engagement of art student teachers with critical art pedagogy to raise awareness of challenges and opportunities in their environment.

As new courses and programs are being introduced, the focus should be on student centered learning.

References

Beaty, R. (2018*)*: *New study reveals why some people are more creative than others.* https://theconversation.com/new-study-reveals-why-some-people-are-more-creative-than-others-90065 (Accessed 26 January 2020).

Cavdarbasha, D. & Kurzek, J. (2017): Connecting the dots: Your brain and creativity. *Frontiers for young minds*, 5(19), 1-10.

Drucker, P. F. (2002): The Discipline of Innovation. Entrepreneurship. *Harvard business review*. https://hbr.org/2002/08/the-discipline-of-innovation (Accessed 26 June 2019).

Eisner, E. (2002): *The Arts and the Creation of Mind.* New Haven: Yale.

Festa, A. (2009): Teaching Critical Thinking to Freshman Writers by Engaging Contemporary Artists' Work. *Human Architecture: Journal of the Sociology of Self-Knowledge*, 7(1), 115-136.

Friedman, T. L. (2014): How to Get a Job at Google. *The New York Times*, 23 February. http://www.nytimes.com/2014/02/23/opinion/sunday/friedman-how-to-get-a-job-at-google.html (Accessed May 16, 2016).

Gardner, H. (2004): *Frames of mind: The theory of multiple intelligences*. New York: Basic Books.

Haridy, R. (2018): The neuroscience of creativity: How the brains of innovators are wired differently. *New Atlas*, 17 January. https://newatlas.com/creative-throught-brain-activity-networks/53025/ (Accessed 26 January 2020).

Lanier, V. (1972): Objectives of Teaching Art. *Art Education*, 25(3), 15-19.

Ministry of Higher and Tertiary Education, Science and Technology Development (MHTESTD) (2019): *Strategic Plan 2019-2023: The Doctrine, Modernisation and Industrialisation of Zimbabwe.* Harare: Government of Zimbabwe.

Ministry of Higher and Tertiary Education, Science and Technology Development (MHTESTD) (2018): *Zimbabwe National Critical Skills Audit Report (ZNCSA).* Harare: Government of Zimbabwe.

Ministry of Higher and Tertiary Education, Science and Technology Development (MHTESTD) (2018): *Zimbabwe National Qualifications Framework (ZNQF).* Harare: Government of Zimbabwe.

Reid, I., Wood, B., Harrison, D. & Clements, M. (2009): *Applying Design Thinking to Regeneration*. International Conference on Engineering and Product Design Education.

Riley, S. (2013): Pivot Point: At the Crossroads of STEM, STEAM and Arts Integration. *Edutopia*, 18 December. https://www.edutopia.org/blog/pivot-point-stem-steam-arts-integration-susan-riley (Accessed 3 November 2019).

Sadler-Smith, E. (2016): Wallas' four-stage model of the creative process: More than meets the eye? *Creativity Research Journal*, 27(4), 1-32.

Torrance, P. E. (1965): Scientific Views of Creativity and Factors Affecting its Growth. *Creativity and Learning*, 94(3), 663-668.

UNESCO (2006): *Road Map for Arts Education*. Lisbon: UNESCO.

UNESCO (2010): *Seoul Agenda: Goals for the Development of Arts Education*. Seoul: UNESCO.

Wallas, G. (1926): *The art of thought*. London: Jonathan Cape.

Winthrop, R. & McGivney, E. (2016): *Skills for a changing world: Advancing quality learning for vibrant societies*. Brookings Institution. LEGO Foundation.

Dr. Dairai Darlington Dziwa, North-West University, South Africa

Dr. Louise Postma, North-West University, South Africa

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

List of Contributors

O

Obed Mfum-Mensah 70
Oliver Tafadzwa Gore 270

P

Piero Espino 135

Q

Queen Chioma Nworgu 191

R

Ruvejda Braha 163

S

Sandra-Yarely Rojas-Garcia 135
Sergio-Esteban Rodriguez-Ramirez 135
Sharon Thabo Mampane 184, 205
Svetlana Pandiloska Grncharovska 163

T

Tebogo Jillian Mampane 212
Teresa Almeida Patatas 109
Toni Maglica 122

U

Uchechi Bel-Ann Ordu 197

V

Vera Spasenović 34
Vesselina Kachakova 77
Vimbi Petrus Mahlangu 115

Y

Yolanda Franco 135

Z

Željana Vukadin 122
Zoltán Rónay 240

BCES Conference Books, 2020, Volume 18. Sofia: Bulgarian Comparative Education Society
ISSN 1314-4693 (print), ISSN 2534-8426 (online), ISBN 978-619-7326-09-3 (print), ISBN 978-619-7326-10-9 (online)

BCES Conference Books

Volume 1, 2002:

Comparative Education in Teacher Training

Volume 2, 2003:

Comparative Education in Teacher Training

Volume 3, 2005:

Comparative Education in Teacher Training

Volume 4, 2006:

Comparative Education and Teacher Training

Volume 5, 2007:

Comparative Education, Teacher Training and New Education Agenda

Volume 6, 2008:

Comparative Education, Teacher Training, Education Policy and Social Inclusion

Volume 7, 2009:

Comparative Education, Teacher Training, Education Policy, Social Inclusion and Child Psychology

Volume 8, 2010:

Comparative Education, Teacher Training, Education Policy, School Leadership and Social Inclusion

Volume 9, 2011:

Comparative Education, Teacher Training, Education Policy, Social Inclusion, History of Education

Volume 10, 2012:

International Perspectives on Education

Volume 11, 2013:

Education in One World: Perspectives from Different Nations

Volume 12, 2014:

Education's Role in Preparing Globally Competent Citizens

Volume 13, 2015:

Quality, Social Justice and Accountability in Education Worldwide

Volume 14, 2016:

Education Provision to Every One: Comparing Perspectives from Around the World

Volume 15, 2017:

Current Business and Economics Driven Discourse and Education: Perspectives from Around the World

Volume 16, 2018:

Education in Modern Society

Volume 17, 2019:

Glocal Education in Practice: Teaching, Researching, and Citizenship

Volume 18, 2020:

Educational Reforms Worldwide